

A Companion to the Philosophy of Literature

Edited by
Garry L. Hagberg
and
Walter Jost



WILEY-BLACKWELL

A John Wiley & Sons, Ltd., Publication

A Companion to the Philosophy of Literature

Blackwell Companions to Philosophy

This outstanding student reference series offers a comprehensive and authoritative survey of philosophy as a whole. Written by today's leading philosophers, each volume provides lucid and engaging coverage of the key figures, terms, topics, and problems of the field. Taken together, the volumes provide the ideal basis for course use, representing an unparalleled work of reference for students and specialists alike.

Already published in the series:

1. The Blackwell Companion to Philosophy, Second Edition
Edited by Nicholas Bunnin and Eric Tsui-James
2. A Companion to Ethics
Edited by Peter Singer
3. A Companion to Aesthetics, Second Edition
Edited by Stephen Davies, Kathleen Marie Higgins, Robert Hopkins, Robert Stecker, and David E. Cooper
4. A Companion to Epistemology
Edited by Jonathan Dancy and Ernest Sosa
5. A Companion to Contemporary Political Philosophy (two-volume set), Second Edition
Edited by Robert E. Goodin and Philip Pettit
6. A Companion to Philosophy of Mind
Edited by Samuel Guttenplan
7. A Companion to Metaphysics, Second Edition
Edited by Jaegwon Kim, Ernest Sosa, and Gary S. Rosenkrantz
8. A Companion to Philosophy of Law and Legal Theory
Edited by Dennis Patterson
9. A Companion to Philosophy of Religion
Edited by Philip L. Quinn and Charles Taliaferro
10. A Companion to the Philosophy of Language
Edited by Bob Hale and Crispin Wright
11. A Companion to World Philosophies
Edited by Eliot Deutsch and Ron Bontekoe
12. A Companion to Continental Philosophy
Edited by Simon Critchley and William Schroeder
13. A Companion to Feminist Philosophy
Edited by Alison M. Jaggar and Iris Marion Young
14. A Companion to Cognitive Science
Edited by William Bechtel and George Graham
15. A Companion to Bioethics, Second Edition
Edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer
16. A Companion to the Philosophers
Edited by Robert L. Arrington
17. A Companion to Business Ethics
Edited by Robert E. Frederick
18. A Companion to the Philosophy of Science
Edited by W. H. Newton-Smith
19. A Companion to Environmental Philosophy
Edited by Dale Jamieson
20. A Companion to Analytic Philosophy
Edited by A. P. Martinich and David Sosa
21. A Companion to Genetics
Edited by Justine Burley and John Harris
22. A Companion to Philosophical Logic
Edited by Dale Jacquette
23. A Companion to Early Modern Philosophy
Edited by Steven Nadler
24. A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages
Edited by Jorge J. E. Gracia and Timothy B. Noone
25. A Companion to African-American Philosophy
Edited by Tommy L. Lott and John P. Pittman
26. A Companion to Applied Ethics
Edited by R. G. Frey and Christopher Heath Wellman
27. A Companion to the Philosophy of Education
Edited by Randall Curren
28. A Companion to African Philosophy
Edited by Kwasi Wiredu
29. A Companion to Heidegger
Edited by Hubert L. Dreyfus and Mark A. Wrathall
30. A Companion to Rationalism
Edited by Alan Nelson
31. A Companion to Ancient Philosophy
Edited by Mary Louise Gill and Pierre Pellegrin
32. A Companion to Pragmatism
Edited by John R. Shook and Joseph Margolis
33. A Companion to Nietzsche
Edited by Keith Ansell Pearson
34. A Companion to Socrates
Edited by Sara Ahbel-Rappe and Rachana Kamtekar
35. A Companion to Phenomenology and Existentialism
Edited by Hubert L. Dreyfus and Mark A. Wrathall
36. A Companion to Kant
Edited by Graham Bird
37. A Companion to Plato
Edited by Hugh H. Benson
38. A Companion to Descartes
Edited by Janet Broughton and John Carriero
39. A Companion to the Philosophy of Biology
Edited by Sahotra Sarkar and Anya Plutynski
40. A Companion to Hume
Edited by Elizabeth S. Radcliffe
41. A Companion to the Philosophy of History and Historiography
Edited by Aviezer Tucker
42. A Companion to Aristotle
Edited by Georgios Anagnostopoulos
43. A Companion to the Philosophy of Technology
Edited by Jan-Kyrre Berg Olsen, Stig Andur Pedersen, and Vincent F. Hendricks
44. A Companion to the Philosophy of Literature
Edited by Garry L. Hagberg and Walter Jost

Also under contract:

- A Companion to Latin American Philosophy, Edited by Susana Nuccetelli, Ofelia Schutte, and Otávio Bueno
A Companion to Schopenhauer, Edited by Bart Vandenabeele
A Companion to Relativism, Edited by Steven D. Hales

A Companion to the Philosophy of Literature

Edited by
Garry L. Hagberg
and
Walter Jost



WILEY-BLACKWELL

A John Wiley & Sons, Ltd., Publication

This edition first published 2010
© 2010 Blackwell Publishing Ltd

Blackwell Publishing was acquired by John Wiley & Sons in February 2007. Blackwell's publishing program has been merged with Wiley's global Scientific, Technical, and Medical business to form Wiley-Blackwell.

Registered Office

John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, United Kingdom

Editorial Offices

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA

9600 Garsington Road, Oxford, OX4 2DQ, UK

The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services, and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell.

The right of Garry L. Hagberg and Walter Jost to be identified as the author of the editorial material in this work has been asserted in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book. This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

A companion to the philosophy of literature / edited by Garry L. Hagberg and Walter Jost.

p. cm. – (Blackwell companions to philosophy)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4051-4170-3 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Literature—History and criticism. 2. Literature—Philosophy. I. Hagberg, Garry, 1952–
- II. Jost, Walter, 1951–

PN501.C626 2010

801–dc22

2009018607

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Set in 10/13pt Photina by Graphicraft Limited, Hong Kong

Printed in Singapore

01 2010

Contents

Notes on Contributors	viii
Acknowledgments	xiii
Introduction	1
<i>Garry L. Hagberg and Walter Jost</i>	
Part I Relations between Philosophy and Literature	5
1 Philosophy as Literature and More than Literature	7
<i>Richard Shusterman</i>	
2 Philosophy and Literature: Friends of the Earth?	22
<i>Roger A. Shiner</i>	
3 Philosophy and Literature – and Rhetoric: Adventures in Polytopia	38
<i>Walter Jost</i>	
4 Philosophy and/as/of Literature	52
<i>Arthur C. Danto</i>	
Part II Emotional Engagement and the Experience of Reading	69
5 Emotion and the Understanding of Narrative	71
<i>Jenefer Robinson</i>	
6 Feeling Fictions	93
<i>Roger Scruton</i>	
7 The Experience of Reading	106
<i>Peter Kivy</i>	
8 Self-Defining Reading: Literature and the Constitution of Personhood	120
<i>Garry L. Hagberg</i>	

CONTENTS

Part III Philosophy, Tragedy, and Literary Form	159
9 Tragedy and Philosophy <i>Anthony J. Cascardi</i>	161
10 Iago's Elenchus: Shakespeare, <i>Othello</i> , and the Platonic Inheritance <i>M. W. Rowe</i>	174
11 Catharsis <i>Jonathan Lear</i>	193
12 Passion, Counter-Passion, Catharsis: Flaubert (and Beckett) on Feeling Nothing <i>Joshua Landy</i>	218
Part IV Literature and the Moral Life	239
13 Perceptive Equilibrium: Literary Theory and Ethical Theory <i>Martha C. Nussbaum</i>	241
14 Henry James, Moral Philosophers, Moralism <i>Cora Diamond</i>	268
15 Literature and the Idea of Morality <i>Eileen John</i>	285
16 Styles of Self-Absorption <i>Daniel Brudney</i>	300
Part V Narrative and the Question of Literary Truth	329
17 Narration, Imitation, and Point of View <i>Gregory Currie</i>	331
18 How and What We Can Learn from Fiction <i>Mitchell Green</i>	350
19 Literature and Truth <i>Peter Lamarque</i>	367
20 Truth in Poetry: Particulars and Universals <i>Richard Eldridge</i>	385
Part VI Intention and Biography in Criticism	399
21 Authorial Intention and the Varieties of Intentionalism <i>Paisley Livingston</i>	401

22	Art as Techne, or, The Intentional Fallacy and the Unfinished Project of Formalism <i>Henry Staten</i>	420
23	Biography in Literary Criticism <i>Stein Haugom Olsen</i>	436
24	Getting Inside Heisenberg's Head <i>Ray Monk</i>	453
	Part VII On Literary Language	465
25	Wittgenstein and Literary Language <i>Jon Cook and Rupert Read</i>	467
26	Exemplification and Expression <i>Charles Altieri</i>	491
27	At Play in the Fields of Metaphor <i>Ted Cohen</i>	507
28	Macbeth Appalled <i>Stanley Cavell</i>	521
	Index	541

Notes on Contributors

Charles Altieri teaches modern poetry and literary theory at the University of California, Berkeley. His two most recent books are *The Particulars of Rapture* and *The Art of Modernist American Poetry*. He is working on a book on Wallace Stevens.

Daniel Brudney is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Chicago. He is the author of *Marx's Attempt to Leave Philosophy*. His work in philosophy and literature includes "Lord Jim and Moral Judgment: Literature and Moral Philosophy," in *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, and "Marlow's Morality," in *Philosophy and Literature*.

Anthony J. Cascardi is Director of the Townsend Center for the Humanities and Margaret and Sidney Ancker Professor of Comparative Literature, Rhetoric, and Spanish at the University of California, Berkeley. His publications on literature, philosophy, and aesthetics include *The Subject of Modernity*, *Consequences of Enlightenment*, and *Literature and the Question of Philosophy*. Since 1995 he has been General Editor of the Penn State Press series of books on literature and philosophy.

Stanley Cavell is the Walter M. Cabot Professor Emeritus of Aesthetics and the General Theory of Value, Harvard University. He is the author of many influential and groundbreaking books, including *The Claim of Reason*, *Cities of Words*, and *Philosophy the Day After Tomorrow*. His work has been the subject of numerous books, edited volumes, and journal issues.

Ted Cohen is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Chicago. In addition to a series of widely influential articles in philosophical aesthetics, he published *Jokes: Philosophical Thoughts on Joking Matters* a few years ago, and *Thinking of Others: On the Talent for Metaphor* recently. He is a past president of the American Society for Aesthetics and of the Central Division of the American Philosophical Association.

Jon Cook is Professor of Literature and Dean of the Faculty of Arts and Humanities at the University of East Anglia. His recent publications include *Hazlitt in Love* and *Poetry in Theory*. He has taught at universities in the United States, Europe, and India, most recently as a Hurst Visiting Professor at Washington University in St Louis.

Gregory Currie teaches philosophy at the University of Nottingham. Before that he taught in New Zealand and Australia. He was a Fulbright Fellow, and more recently a British Academy/Leverhulme Research Fellow. He has held visiting positions at Cambridge, the Australian National University, Maryland, and Oxford. His latest book, *Narratives and Narrators: A Philosophy of Stories*, is due to appear with Oxford University Press in 2010. His current project, on aesthetics and the sciences of mind, is supported by a grant from the Arts and Humanities Research Council.

Arthur C. Danto is Johnsonian Professor Emeritus in Philosophy at Columbia University. He is the author of numerous books, including *Nietzsche as Philosopher*, *Mysticism and Morality*, *The Transfiguration of the Commonplace*, *Connections to the World: The Basic Concepts of Philosophy*, and *Encounters and Reflections: Art in the Historical Present*, a collection of art criticism which won the National Book Critics Circle Prize for Criticism, 1990. Among his most recent books are *Unnatural Wonders: Essays from the Gap Between Art and Life* and *Andy Warhol*.

Cora Diamond is the William R. Kenan Jr. Professor of Philosophy at the University of Virginia and Professor of Law at its law school. Diamond's scholarly interests are in Wittgenstein, Frege and the philosophy of language, moral and political philosophy, and philosophy and literature. She is the author of *The Realistic Spirit: Wittgenstein, Philosophy, and the Mind* and the editor of *Wittgenstein's Lectures on the Philosophy of Mathematics and Intention and Intentionality*.

Richard Eldridge is Charles and Harriett Cox McDowell Professor of Philosophy at Swarthmore College. He is the author, among other volumes, of *Literature, Life, and Modernity* and *The Persistence of Romanticism*, and he is the editor of *The Oxford Handbook of Philosophy and Literature* and *Stanley Cavell*.

Mitchell Green is the NEH/Horace W. Goldsmith Distinguished Teaching Professor at the University of Virginia. His research is in the philosophy of language, aesthetics, and the philosophy of mind. Major publications include *Self-Expression* and *Moore's Paradox* (co-editor). He has held grants from the National Endowment for the Humanities, the American Council of Learned Societies, and the National Science Foundation. He is currently working on empathy, the epistemic value of literature, and the evolution of language.

Garry L. Hagberg is the James H. Ottaway Professor of Philosophy and Aesthetics at Bard College, and has in recent years held a Chair in the School of Philosophy at the University of East Anglia. He writes at the intersection of aesthetics and the philosophy of language, and is the author of *Meaning and Interpretation: Wittgenstein, Henry James, and Literary Knowledge* and *Art as Language: Wittgenstein, Meaning, and Aesthetic Theory*. He has recently completed *Describing Ourselves: Wittgenstein and Autobiographical Consciousness* for Oxford University Press and an edited volume, *Art and Ethical Criticism*, for Wiley-Blackwell, and is presently writing on literature and self-formation. He is joint editor of the journal *Philosophy and Literature*.

Eileen John is an Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Warwick. She has written on art and knowledge, and on moral and aesthetic value, and has a special interest in philosophical questions arising from literature. She is co-editor of an anthology, Wiley-Blackwell's *Philosophy of Literature: Contemporary and Classic Readings*.

Walter Jost is Professor of English at the University of Virginia. He is the author of *Rhetorical Thought in John Henry Newman* and *Rhetorical Investigations: Studies in Ordinary Language Criticism*, and editor or co-editor of six previous books, including *A Companion to Rhetoric and Rhetorical Criticism*.

Peter Kivy is Board of Governors Professor of Philosophy at Rutgers University, New Brunswick, and a past president of the American Society for Aesthetics. He has published numerous books and articles on the philosophy of art, in the sub-fields of eighteenth-century British aesthetics, aesthetic concepts, philosophy of music, and philosophy of literature. His most recent book, from Oxford University Press, is *Antithetical Arts: On the Ancient Quarrel Between Literature and Music*.

Peter Lamarque is Professor of Philosophy at the University of York. He was editor of the *British Journal of Aesthetics* from 1995 to 2008 and is author of *Truth, Fiction, and Literature* (with Stein Haugom Olsen), *Fictional Points of View*, and *The Philosophy of Literature*. He edited the *Concise Encyclopedia of Philosophy of Language and Aesthetics* and the *Philosophy of Art: The Analytic Tradition: An Anthology* (with Stein Haugom Olsen).

Joshua Landy is Associate Professor of French at Stanford University, where he co-directs Stanford's Initiative in Philosophy and Literature. He is author of *Philosophy as Fiction: Self, Deception, and Knowledge in Proust*; editor, with Claude Bremond and Thomas Pavel, of *Thematics: New Approaches*; and editor, with Michael Saler, of *The Re-Enchantment of the World: Secular Magic in a Rational Age*. He is currently completing a second book, *How to Do Things With Fictions*.

Jonathan Lear is the John U. Nef Distinguished Service Professor at the Committee on Social Thought and in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Chicago. He works primarily on philosophical conceptions of the human psyche from Socrates to the present. His books include *Aristotle and Logical Theory*, *Aristotle: The Desire to Understand*, *Love and its Place in Nature: A Philosophical Interpretation of Freudian Psychoanalysis*, *Open Minded: Working out the Logic of the Soul*, *Happiness, Death and the Remainder of Life*, *Therapeutic Action: An Earnest Plea for Irony*; *Freud*, and *Radical Hope: Ethics in the Face of Cultural Devastation*.

Paisley Livingston is Chair Professor of Philosophy and Academic Dean of Humanities at Lingnan University, Hong Kong. Author of a number of volumes in philosophical aesthetics, his most recent book is *Cinema, Philosophy, Bergman: On Film as Philosophy*.

Ray Monk is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Southampton. He is author of the award-winning biographies *Wittgenstein: The Duty of Genius*, *Bertrand Russell: The Spirit of Solitude 1872–1921*, and *Bertrand Russell: The Ghost of Madness 1921–1970*, and he is presently working on a biography of Robert Oppenheimer. He has also

written on Wittgenstein's philosophy of mathematics, an introduction to Wittgenstein's philosophy, *How to Read Wittgenstein*, and on philosophical issues in biography.

Martha C. Nussbaum is the Ernst Freund Distinguished Service Professor of Law and Ethics, appointed in the Philosophy Department, Law School, and Divinity School at the University of Chicago. Her many publications include *The Fragility of Goodness: Luck and Ethics in Greek Tragedy and Philosophy*, *Love's Knowledge*, *The Therapy of Desire*, *Cultivating Humanity: A Classical Defense of Reform in Liberal Education*, *Sex and Social Justice*, *Women and Human Development*, and *Upheavals of Thought: The Intelligence of Emotions*.

Stein Haugom Olsen, having held chairs at the University of Oslo, Norway, and Lingnan University, Hong Kong, is head of the Department of Linguistic, Literary, and Aesthetic Studies at the University of Bergen, Norway. He has written books and articles on problems in literary theory, literary criticism, and aesthetics. He is currently working on a book on the origin of academic literary criticism.

Rupert Read is Reader in Philosophy at the University of East Anglia, where he specializes in Wittgenstein, in literature and philosophy, and in environmental and political philosophy. His *Applying Wittgenstein* has recently appeared with Continuum Press, and his *There is No Such Thing as Social Science* with Ashgate. Perhaps his most famous book remains *The New Wittgenstein*, a Routledge edited collection of essays.

Jenefer Robinson is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Cincinnati. She is author of *Deeper than Reason: Emotion and its Role in Literature, Music, and Art*, editor of *Music and Meaning*, and Area Editor for Aesthetics, *Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Her articles have appeared in numerous books and journals including *Journal of Philosophy*, *Philosophical Review*, *Australasian Journal of Philosophy*, *Erkenntnis*, *Philosophy*, *Philosophical Quarterly*, *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, *Emotion Review*, and *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*.

M. W. Rowe is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of East Anglia. He is particularly interested in aesthetics, the intersections between philosophy and literature, Shakespeare, Larkin, and nineteenth-century music, and his recent publications include *Philosophy and Literature: A Book of Essays* and *Heinrich Wilhelm Ernst: Virtuoso Violinist*. He is currently finishing a book entitled, *Philip Larkin: Art and Self*.

Roger Scruton is currently a resident scholar at the American Enterprise Institute in Washington. He taught philosophy at Birkbeck College, University of London, until 1990 and then, after a brief spell at Boston University, pursued a career as a writer and in business. His books include *The Aesthetics of Architecture*, *The Aesthetics of Music*, and *Beauty*. He has tried to explain himself in *On Hunting*, *News from Somewhere*, and *Gentle Regrets*.

Roger A. Shiner taught aesthetics and philosophy of law at the University of Alberta for 35 years, and is now Adjunct and Visiting Professor at the University of British Columbia Okanagan. He has published numerous articles in aesthetics and philosophy

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

of law. He is the author of *Legal Institutions and the Sources of Law*, *Freedom of Commercial Expression*, and *Norm and Nature: The Movements of Legal Thought*. He is a former Secretary-Treasurer of the American Society for Aesthetics.

Richard Shusterman is the Dorothy F. Schmidt Eminent Scholar in the Humanities at Florida Atlantic University and directs its Center for Body, Mind, and Culture. His authored books include *Surface and Depth*, *Performing Live*, *Practicing Philosophy*, *T. S. Eliot and the Philosophy of Criticism*, *The Object of Literary Criticism*, *Pragmatist Aesthetics* (translated into 12 languages), and most recently *Body Consciousness*. He also edited *Analytic Aesthetics* and *The Range of Pragmatism and the Limits of Philosophy*.

Henry Staten is Lockwood Professor in the Humanities and Adjunct Professor of Philosophy at the University of Washington. He is the author of *Wittgenstein and Derrida*, the first book-length study in English of the philosophical pertinence of deconstruction, *Nietzsche's Voice*, and *Eros in Mourning*. His current work focuses on the theory of "art as techné."

Acknowledgments

First and foremost we editors are extremely grateful to each of the contributors to this volume, for his or her willingness to support and participate in the original idea, for the willingness to revise in the light of suggestions, and not least for the cheerful and supportive patience they showed during the extended process of getting all the pieces finished and fitted together. Jeff Dean at Wiley-Blackwell has been a model of wise counsel and indefatigable support from the beginning, giving the project his unique blend of steadfast confidence, discernment, and expert advice; we all have benefited much from having him at the editorial helm throughout the process. We benefited much from a good number of hardworking anonymous readers of the plans for this volume at the early stages. We are also very grateful to Tiffany Mok, to Claire Creffield, and to Barbara Duke, all at Wiley-Blackwell, for playing their parts so effectively, and we thank Jeanette McDonald at Bard College and Elizabeth Leis at the University of Virginia for their precise work in assembling the final manuscript. We also thank the University of East Anglia for much-valued research support and both its School of Philosophy and its School of Literature for providing such an engaging environment for a project of this kind; and the University of Virginia for a Sesquicentennial research award during which the project was initially launched. And special thanks to Liz Granger for preparing a thoroughly useable comprehensive index. We hope that these sustained efforts on the part of everyone involved combine to make this Companion – well, a good companion.

Text Credits

The editors and publisher gratefully acknowledge the permission granted to reproduce the copyright material in this book:

Chapter 4: Arthur C. Danto, “Philosophy and/as/of Literature,” originally appeared in the *Proceedings and Addresses of The American Philosophical Association* 58:1 (September 1984).

Chapter 8: Lines from Virgil, *The Aeneid*, trans. Robert Fitzgerald (New York: Random House, 1983).