Wittgenstein and His Interpreters

Essays in Memory of Gordon Baker

Edited by Guy Kahane,
Edward Kanterian,
and Oskari Kuusela

Blackwell
Publishing

Wittgenstein and His Interpreters

Wittgenstein and His Interpreters

Essays in Memory of Gordon Baker

Edited by Guy Kahane,
Edward Kanterian,
and Oskari Kuusela

Blackwell
Publishing

© 2007 by Blackwell Publishing Ltd

Chapter 7, Part II adapted from Adrian Moore, *Points of View* pp. 126–36. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997. By permission of Oxford University Press.

BLACKWELL PUBLISHING
350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA
9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, UK
550 Swanston Street, Carlton, Victoria 3053, Australia

The right of Guy Kahane, Edward Kanterian, and Oskari Kuusela to be identified as the Authors of the Editorial Material in this Work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs, and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs, and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

First published 2007 by Blackwell Publishing Ltd

1 2007

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Wittgenstein and his interpreters : essays in memory of Gordon Baker / edited by Guy Kahane, Edward Kanterian, and Oskari Kuusela.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-4051-2922-0 (hardback : alk. paper)
1. Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 1889–1951. I. Kahane, Guy, 1971–
II. Kanterian, Edward. III. Kuusela, Oskari.
B3376.W564W5545 2007
192–dc22

2007001491

A catalogue record for this title is available from the British Library.

Set in 10/12.5pt Galliard
by SNP-Bestset Typesetter Ltd, Hong Kong
Printed and bound in Singapore
by Markono Print Media Pte

The publisher's policy is to use permanent paper from mills that operate a sustainable forestry policy, and which has been manufactured from pulp processed using acid-free and elementary chlorine-free practices. Furthermore, the publisher ensures that the text paper and cover board used have met acceptable environmental accreditation standards.

For further information on
Blackwell Publishing, visit our website:
www.blackwellpublishing.com

Contents

Notes on Contributors vii
Acknowledgements xi
List of Abbreviations xii

Introduction 1
Guy Kahane, Edward Kanterian, and Oskari Kuusela

1 Perspectives on Wittgenstein: An Intermittently Opinionated Survey 37
Hans-Johann Glock

2 Wittgenstein's Method: Ridding People of Philosophical Prejudices 66
Katherine Morris

3 Gordon Baker's Late Interpretation of Wittgenstein 88
P. M. S. Hacker

4 The Interpretation of the *Philosophical Investigations*: Style, Therapy, *Nachlass* 123
Alois Pichler

5 Ways of Reading Wittgenstein: Observations on Certain Uses of the Word 'Metaphysics' 145
Joachim Schulte

6 Metaphysical/Everyday Use: A Note on a Late Paper by Gordon Baker 169
Hilary Putnam

7 Wittgenstein and Transcendental Idealism 174
A. W. Moore

8 Simples and the Idea of Analysis in the *Tractatus* 200
Marie McGinn

9 Words, Waxing and Waning: Ethics in/and/of the *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus* 221
Stephen Mulhall

10 The Uses of Wittgenstein's Beetle: *Philosophical Investigations* §293 and Its Interpreters 248
David G. Stern

11 Bourgeois, Bolshevist or Anarchist? The Reception of Wittgenstein's Philosophy of Mathematics 269
Ray Monk

12 Wittgenstein and Ethical Naturalism 295
Alice Crary

Bibliography 320
Name Index 345
Subject Index 350

Notes on Contributors

Alice Crary is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the New School for Social Research. She has published articles on moral psychology, ethical theory, meta-ethics, philosophy and literature, feminist theory, animals and ethics, J. L. Austin, Wittgenstein and other issues and figures. She is author of *Beyond Moral Judgment* (2007). She is also co-editor of *The New Wittgenstein* (2000) and *Reading Cavell* (2006) and editor of *Wittgenstein and the Moral Life: Essays in Honor of Cora Diamond* (2007). She is currently writing a book on ethics and animals.

Hans-Johann Glock is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Zurich. Prior to that he was Professor of Philosophy at the University of Reading and Junior Research Fellow at St. John's College, Oxford. He also held visiting positions at Queen's University, Kingston, the University of Bielefeld and Rhodes University, Grahamstown. Glock is the author of *A Wittgenstein Dictionary* (Blackwell 1996), *Quine and Davidson* (2003) and *What is Analytic Philosophy?* (2007). He has edited *The Rise of Analytic Philosophy* (Blackwell 1997), *Wittgenstein: A Critical Reader* (Blackwell 2001), *Strawson and Kant* (2003) and is the co-editor of *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations* (1991), *Wittgenstein and Quine* (2005) and *Wittgenstein and Analytic Philosophy* (2009).

P. M. S. Hacker is a Fellow of St John's College, Oxford. He co-authored five books with Gordon Baker: the first two volumes of the monumental multi-volume *Commentary on the Philosophical Investigations* (Blackwell 1980, 1985), *Frege: Logical Investigations, Language, Sense and Nonsense* (Blackwell 1984), and *Scepticism Rules and Language* (Blackwell 1984). In addition, he has written *Insight and Illusion* (Blackwell 1972/1986), *Appearance and Reality* (Blackwell 1987) and

the remaining two volumes of the *Commentary* (Blackwell 1990, 1996), as well as the epilogue *Wittgenstein's Place in Twentieth Century Analytic Philosophy* (Blackwell 1996). More recently, he has written, together with Max Bennett, *Philosophical Foundations of Neuroscience* (Blackwell 2003). His next book is entitled *Human Nature: The Categorial Framework*.

Guy Kahane is Deputy Director of the Oxford Uehiro Centre for Practical Ethics at Oxford University. He works in meta-ethics, value theory, practical ethics, and the philosophy of neuroscience. He holds D. Phil. and B. Phil. degrees in Philosophy from Oxford University and a B.A. degree in Philosophy and Psychology from Tel Aviv University.

Edward Kanterian is a lecturer in philosophy at Trinity College and Jesus College, Oxford. Previously he held lecturerships at St Catherine's College, Oxford and the University of Reading. He works in semantics and metaphysics, is the author of *Analytic Philosophy* (2004) and has a forthcoming book on Frege. He holds a D. Phil. degree from Oxford University and an M.A. degree from Leipzig University.

Oskari Kuusela is an Academy of Finland Postdoctoral Fellow at the Department of Philosophy, University of Helsinki. His research interests include Wittgenstein, ethics and a variety of 'metaphilosophical' topics. He has published articles on Wittgenstein and Kant and is the author of *Wittgenstein and the Concept of Philosophy* (forthcoming). He holds a D. Phil. in Philosophy from Oxford University.

Marie McGinn is a senior lecturer in the Philosophy Department at York University. She is the author of *Wittgenstein and the Philosophical Investigations* (1997) and *Elucidating the Tractatus: Wittgenstein's Early Philosophy of Logic and Language* (2006).

Ray Monk is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Southampton. He studied philosophy at the universities of York and Oxford, writing his postgraduate thesis on Wittgenstein's philosophy of mathematics. He has written biographies of Wittgenstein (1990) and Russell (1999) and is working on a biography of the physicist Robert Oppenheimer. He is also the author of the book *How to Read Wittgenstein?* (2005). His current philosophical research interests are the philosophy of biography and Wittgenstein's philosophy of mathematics.

A. W. Moore is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Oxford and a Fellow of St Hugh's College, Oxford. He is the author of *The Infinite* (2nd edition 2001), *Points of View* (1997) and *Noble in Reason, Infinite*

in Faculty: Themes and Variations in Kant's Moral and Religious Philosophy (2003). He is also the editor of *Meaning of Reference* (1993), *Infinity* (1993) and Bernard Williams' posthumously published anthology *Philosophy as a Humanistic Discipline* (2006).

Katherine Morris is a supernumerary fellow in philosophy at Mansfield College, Oxford University, where she has been since 1986; she completed an M. Phil. in Medical Anthropology at Oxford in 2005. She is the co-author, with Gordon Baker, of *Descartes' Dualism* (1996) and the editor of *Wittgenstein's Method: Neglected Aspects* (Blackwell 2004), a collection of the later Baker's essays on the later Wittgenstein. She has written numerous articles on Sartre and Merleau-Ponty and is writing a book on Sartre for Blackwell's Great Minds series.

Stephen Mulhall is Fellow and Tutor in philosophy at New College, Oxford. He was previously a Prize Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford, and a Reader in Philosophy at the University of Essex. His research interests include Wittgenstein, Heidegger and Kierkegaard. He is the author of *On Being in the World: Wittgenstein and Heidegger on Seeing Aspects* (1990), *Inheritance and Originality: Wittgenstein, Heidegger, Kierkegaard* (2001), *Philosophical Myths of the Fall* (2005) and *Wittgenstein's Private Language: Grammar, Nonsense and Imagination in Philosophical Investigations, 243–315* (2006).

Alois Pichler is the Director of the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen. He has co-edited with the Wittgenstein Archives *Wittgenstein's Nachlass: The Bergen Electronic Edition* (2000), and with Georg Henrik von Wright Wittgenstein's *Vermischte Bemerkungen/Culture and Value* (1994; Blackwell 1998). His other publications are mainly in the field of Wittgenstein scholarship: *Wittgenstein's Philosophische Untersuchungen: Vom Buch zum Album* (2004) and *Wittgenstein: The Philosopher and His Works* (2006), co-edited with Simo Säätelä, and in the field of Humanities Computing, where he relates his work on Wittgenstein to the digital turn, as in 'Encoding Wittgenstein: Some remarks on Wittgenstein's *Nachlass*, the Bergen Electronic Edition, and future electronic publishing and networking' (2002).

Hilary Putnam is Cogan University Professor Emeritus in the Department of Philosophy at Harvard University. He has written extensively on issues in metaphysics and epistemology, philosophy of science, philosophy of language, and philosophy of mind. In recent years he has also written extensively on the relations between scientific and non-scientific

knowledge and on American pragmatism. His book *Ethics Without Ontology* (2004) deals with many of these topics.

Joachim Schulte teaches at the University of Zurich. He has published a number of articles and four books on the philosophy of Wittgenstein: *Experience and Expression* (1993), *Wittgenstein: An Introduction* (1992), *Chor und Gesetz: Wittgenstein im Kontext* (1990) and *Wittgenstein: Leben Werk Wirkung* (2005). He is co-editor of critical editions of Wittgenstein's *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus* (1989) and *Philosophical Investigations* (2001). In recent years, he has chiefly worked on Wittgenstein's middle period.

David G. Stern is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Iowa. He is the author of *Wittgenstein's Philosophical Investigations: An Introduction* (2004) and *Wittgenstein on Mind and Language* (1995), and co-editor of *Wittgenstein Reads Weininger*, with Béla Szabados (2004) and *The Cambridge Companion to Wittgenstein*, with Hans Sluga (1996).

Acknowledgements

This volume is dedicated to the memory of Gordon Baker, distinguished interpreter of Wittgenstein and our former supervisor at Oxford. We are indebted to Katherine Morris for encouraging us to pursue this project and for much helpful advice. We are also grateful to P. M. S. Hacker and Rupert Read for useful comments on the introduction as well as to Jakob A. Bertzbach, William Child, Steven Hall, and Jonathan Witztum for their advice and assistance. We also want to thank our publisher, in particular Nick Bellorini and Gillian Kane.

Abbreviations

Works by Wittgenstein

The following abbreviations are used to refer to Wittgenstein's published works, listed in chronological order.

TLP	*Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*. Translated by Ogden, C. K. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1951.
BB	*Preliminary Studies for the "Philosophical Investigations," Generally Known as the Blue and Brown Books*. Edited by Rhees, R. Oxford: Blackwell, 1958.
NB	*Notebooks 1914–1916*. Edited by Anscombe, G. E. M. and von Wright, G. H., translated by Anscombe, G. E. M. Oxford: Blackwell, 1961.
TLP	*Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*. Translated by Pears, D. F. and McGuinness, B. F. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1961.
RFM	*Remarks on the Foundations of Mathematics*. Edited by Anscombe, G. E. M., Rhees, R., and von Wright, G. H., translated by Anscombe, G. E. M. Oxford: Blackwell, 1956. 2nd edition 1967, 3rd revised edition 1978.
Z	*Zettel*. Edited by Anscombe, G. E. M. and von Wright, G. H., translated by Anscombe, G. E. M. Oxford: Blackwell, 1967.
EPB	"Eine Philosophische Betrachtung." In *Schriften*, Vol. 5, 117–282. Edited by Rhees, R. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1970.
PT	*Prototractatus, An early version of Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1971.
PG	*Philosophical Grammar*. Edited by Rhees, R., translated by Kenny, A. Oxford: Blackwell, 1974.

PR *Philosophical Remarks*. Edited by Rhees, R., translated by Hargreaves, R. and White, R. Oxford: Blackwell, 1975.

RPPi *Remarks on the Philosophy of Psychology*, Vol 1. Edited by Anscombe, G. E. M. and von Wright, G. H., translated by Anscombe, G. E. M. Oxford: Blackwell, 1980.

BBB *Das Blaue Buch, Eine Philosophische Betrachtung (Das Braune Buch)*. Edited by Rhees, R. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1984.

OC *On Certainty*. Edited by Anscombe, G. E. M. and von Wright G. H., translated by Anscombe, E. and Paul, D. Oxford: Blackwell, 1993.

LE "Lecture on Ethics." *Philosophical Review* 74 (1965): 3–12. Reprinted in PO, pp. 37–44.

PO *Philosophical Occasions 1912–1951*. Edited by Klagge, J. and Nordmann, A. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing, 1993.

DB *Denkbewegungen, Tagebücher 1930–1932/1936–1937*. Edited by Somavilla, I. Innsbruck: Haymon, 1997.

PI *Philosophical Investigations*, 2nd edition. Edited by Anscombe, G. E. M. and Rhees, R., translated by Anscombe, G. E. M. Oxford: Blackwell, 1997.

CV *Culture and Value*, revised edition. Edited by von Wright, G. H. in collaboration with Nyman, H., revd. edn. by Pichler, A., translated by Winch, P. Oxford: Blackwell, 1998. First edition 1980.

PIKr *Philosophische Untersuchungen, Kritisch-genetische Edition*. Edited by Schulte, J., Nyman, H., von Savigny, E. and von Wright, G. H. Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 2001.

BT *Big Typescript: TS 213*. Edited by Luckhardt, C. G. and Aue, M. Oxford: Blackwell, 2005.

Wittgenstein's *Nachlass*

References to Wittgenstein's *Nachlass* (as cited in the von Wright catalogue; von Wright 1982/1993a) are by MS or TS number followed by page number.

BEE *Wittgenstein's Nachlass, The Bergen Electronic Edition*. Edited by the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen. Copyright by Oxford University Press, the University of Bergen, the Wittgenstein Trustees, 2000.