

THEORETICAL AND APPLIED MATHEMATICS

THE IMPOSSIBLE QUINTIC

Made as Simple as Possible

DAVID ABRAHAM KAULT
GRAEME SNEDDON
SAM KAULT

NOVA

Theoretical and Applied Mathematics



No part of this digital document may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means. The publisher has taken reasonable care in the preparation of this digital document, but makes no expressed or implied warranty of any kind and assumes no responsibility for any errors or omissions. No liability is assumed for incidental or consequential damages in connection with or arising out of information contained herein. This digital document is sold with the clear understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, medical or any other professional services.

Theoretical and Applied Mathematics

A Closer Look of Nonlinear Reaction-Diffusion Equations

L. Rajendran, R. Swaminathan and M. Chitra Devi (Authors)

2020. ISBN: 978-1-53618-257-6 (Hardcover)

2020. ISBN: 978-1-53618-356-6 (eBook)

A Closer Look at Boundary Value Problems

Mustafa Avci, PhD (Editor)

2020. ISBN: 978-1-53617-857-9 (Hardcover)

2020. ISBN: 978-1-53617-861-6 (eBook)

Mathematical Modeling for the Solution of Equations and Systems of Equations with Applications. Volume IV

Ioannis K. Argyros, PhD and Santhosh George (Authors)

2020. ISBN: 978-1-53617-474-8 (Hardcover)

2020. ISBN: 978-1-53617-475-5 (eBook)

Understanding Probability Models

Carlos Narciso Bouza-Herrera (Editor)

2020. ISBN: 978-1-53616-995-9 (Hardcover)

2020. ISBN: 978-1-53616-996-6 (eBook)

More information about this series can be found at

<https://novapublishers.com/product-category/series/theoretical-and-applied-mathematics/>

**David Abraham Kault
Graeme Sneddon
and Sam Kault**

The Impossible Quintic Made as Simple as Possible



Copyright © 2023 by Nova Science Publishers, Inc.

<https://doi.org/10.52305/DDVG1060>

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means: electronic, electrostatic, magnetic, tape, mechanical photocopying, recording or otherwise without the written permission of the Publisher.

We have partnered with Copyright Clearance Center to make it easy for you to obtain permissions to reuse content from this publication. Please visit copyright.com and search by Title, ISBN, or ISSN.

For further questions about using the service on copyright.com, please contact:

Copyright Clearance Center

Phone: +1-(978) 750-8400

Fax: +1-(978) 750-4470

E-mail: info@copyright.com

NOTICE TO THE READER

The Publisher has taken reasonable care in the preparation of this book but makes no expressed or implied warranty of any kind and assumes no responsibility for any errors or omissions. No liability is assumed for incidental or consequential damages in connection with or arising out of information contained in this book. The Publisher shall not be liable for any special, consequential, or exemplary damages resulting, in whole or in part, from the readers' use of, or reliance upon, this material. Any parts of this book based on government reports are so indicated and copyright is claimed for those parts to the extent applicable to compilations of such works.

Independent verification should be sought for any data, advice or recommendations contained in this book. In addition, no responsibility is assumed by the Publisher for any injury and/or damage to persons or property arising from any methods, products, instructions, ideas or otherwise contained in this publication.

This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information with regards to the subject matter covered herein. It is sold with the clear understanding that the Publisher is not engaged in rendering legal or any other professional services. If legal or any other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent person should be sought. FROM A DECLARATION OF PARTICIPANTS JOINTLY ADOPTED BY A COMMITTEE OF THE AMERICAN BAR ASSOCIATION AND A COMMITTEE OF PUBLISHERS.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

ISBN: 979-8-88697-972-5(eBook)

Published by Nova Science Publishers, Inc. † New York

Contents

Preface	vii
1 Introduction to Galois' Proof	1
1. Radicals and Symmetry	1
2. Book Outline	3
2 Theorems Related to Symmetry	5
1. Vandermonde Determinants	5
2. Symmetric Expressions	8
3. Resolvents	14
3 Euclid's Algorithm and Shared Roots	21
1. Euclid's Algorithm	21
2. Roots Shared with an Irreducible Polynomial Equation	23
4 Galois' Proof, Stage 1	25
1. The Resolvent Equation	25
2. Introducing the Galois Group (First Stage of Galois' Proof, Part 1)	27
3. The Galois Set of Arrangements (First Stage of Galois' Proof, Part 2)	28
4. Permutations, Presentations and Groups	31
5. Groups and Subgroups, Modern and Galois	37
6. Presentations and Subgroups	39
7. Normal Subgroups	43
8. Proof that the Galois' Set Determines a Group (First Stage of Galois' Proof, Part 3)	47
9. Automorphisms	49

10.	Continuing the Proof that the Galois' Set Defines a Group (First Stage of Galois' Proof, Part 4)	52
5	Galois' Proof, Stage 2	55
1.	Fields of Numbers	55
2.	Roots of Unity	56
3.	Expanding the Field of Numbers using Radicals (Second Stage of Galois' Proof, Part 1)	57
4.	Using Alternative Roots of Unity	58
5.	Adjoining Radicals Implies Normal Subgroups Second Stage of Galois' Proof, Part 2	60
6.	Indirect Permutation Specification	69
7.	Completing Galois' Proposition 2 (Second Stage of Galois' Proof, Part 3)	70
6	Final Steps to the Impossible Quintic	75
1.	Listing the Steps	75
2.	Proof the Galois Group of Irreducible Quintics Contains a 5-Cycle	76
3.	Proof That Some Galois Groups Associated with Irreducible Quintics Contain a 2-Cycle: Permutations of Complex Conjugacy	81
4.	Group Generated by a 5 Cycle and a 2 Cycle	82
5.	The Group of All Permutations of 5 Objects S_5 , does not have a Normal Subgroup of Index 5	83
6.	Specifying an Irreducible Quintic with Exactly Two Complex Roots	89
7.	Factorisation over Rationals	90
8.	An Insoluble Quintic	92
7	Summary	95
	Appendix	97
	Index	111
	About the Authors	113

Preface

About 4000 years ago the ancient people of Iraq could solve quadratic equations. The next step in complexity - the solution of cubic equations - took more than 3000 years, but was solved in the early 1500's. The solution of the quartic (an equation with an x^4 term) came only a few years later. The race was on to find a solution to the quintic (an equation with an x^5 term), but with no result despite 300 years of effort. Everiste Galois was born in 1812 and in his late teenage years submitted a paper to a major mathematics journal in which he showed that the reason there had been no solution to the quintic was that a solution was absolutely impossible. He gave a proof of this impossibility. A mathematician a few years earlier had already shown this – but Galois put his proof of the insolubility of the quintic into a more general framework – a framework which is now valuable in quantum physics and coding theory. Unfortunately, Galois' proof was too abbreviated for other mathematicians to understand and the paper was sent back to Galois for revision. Meanwhile Galois had got into some sort of trouble and was challenged to a duel. He rewrote the paper the night before the duel. Fearing the worst, he asked his friends to persist in presenting it to mathematicians. He died from the duel. The paper was not recognised as the work of a genius, until 14 years later.

This book presents a simple version of Galois' proof. It is largely based on an excellent book "Galois Theory" by H M Edwards [1]. However, Edwards' book covers a wider area of mathematics than is required for a proof of the insolubility of the quintic and doesn't actually complete the insolubility proof. Unfortunately, most books on this area of mathematics seem to replicate to some degree the initial problem encountered by Galois. Galois, the cleverest of mathematicians, left gaps in reasoning. To him the steps to fill in those gaps were obvious, even trivial. He had trouble understanding that more ordinary mathematicians would have difficulty

bridging the gaps and would need the details spelt out. This problem in Galois theory continues. Mathematicians who write on Galois theory may be so far ahead of their readership, that gaps are left that are hard for ordinary readers to bridge. Edwards' book follows an older, less abstract approach to Galois theory, but despite this, it too is not always easy to understand. A simpler proof of the insolubility of the quintic could be of interest to many people who have no more than university entrance level mathematics. Hopefully, this book will be of use to those people.

A proof that something cannot exist, seems beguiling. One can imagine the following conversation:

“There is no formula to give the roots of a quintic.”

“No-one has found one yet?”

“No, it can't be done.”

“Perhaps in future, better mathematicians with modern methods will come up with a formula?”

“No! If someone ever suggested a formula, we would know straight away that it is wrong – because it would be in contradiction of a logical proof that such a formula cannot exist.”

“How can that be?”

It is the task of this book to answer that last question as simply as possible.

Chapter 1

Introduction to Galois' Proof

1. Radicals and Symmetry

What Galois showed was that in general it is not possible to express the solution to the quintic with square roots, cube roots, fourth roots and fifth roots of terms involving the coefficients of the quintic. In mathematical language, we say the general quintic is not solvable by radicals. In other words it is not soluble by using the coefficients and combining them somehow using the simple operations of arithmetic – add/subtract and multiply/divide, together with the taking of various roots/radicals. The roots of the quintic exist and can be approximated numerically, but are not expressible by a formula. By contrast the two roots of the quadratic are given by the radical expression $\frac{-b \pm \sqrt{b^2 - 4ac}}{2a}$ and roots of the cubic are given by a more complex radical expression containing several radical terms including

$$\sqrt[3]{\left(\frac{-b^3}{27a^3} + \frac{bc}{6a^2} - \frac{d}{2a}\right) + \sqrt{\left(\frac{-b^3}{27a^3} + \frac{bc}{6a^2} - \frac{d}{2a}\right)^2 + \left(\frac{c}{3a} - \frac{b^2}{9a^2}\right)^3}}$$

There is an even more complex radical expression for the solution of the quartic equation. There is no radical expression for the roots of the quintic. We will show that this is not because it is so complex that it has not yet been discovered. However, since the five roots of the quintic exist, we will call them r_1, r_2, r_3, r_4, r_5 . We will

exclude cases where roots are equal*. For the time being, we will also require the coefficients of the x^i terms of the quintic to be rational.

In a sense, it is somewhat arbitrary to say a quintic is not soluble in terms of the coefficients. We are happy to say a quantity like $\sqrt{2}$ is a solution of $x^2 = 2$, when, although it can be calculated to as many decimal places as we wish, we cannot define it more precisely than by saying it is the positive solution to $x^2 = 2$. Likewise, just as we can calculate $\sqrt{2}$, we could calculate any root of any quintic as accurately as we like using numerical methods, but in general the answer we obtain would not be absolutely precise. The difference here from the situation of $x^2 = 2$ having a solution $\sqrt{2}$, is that we don't have a symbol for a root of a general quintic, whilst we have a symbol $\sqrt{n}$ for the solution of $x^2 = n$. In that sense, it could be regarded as somewhat arbitrary to say that we cannot generally solve a quintic whereas we can always solve a quadratic. However, it is of interest that our intuition that the quintic could be solved in terms of the coefficients just by adding in operations such as $\sqrt[3]{}$, $\sqrt[4]{}$ and so on, turns out to be wrong in general.

It turns out that the reason the solution to a general quintic cannot be expressed in terms of square, third, fourth and fifth roots, has something to do with symmetry – the symmetry of arithmetic expressions that involve the roots of the quintic. A tenuous hint in this direction is obtained by considering the two roots ($+i$ and $-i$) of the equation $x^2 + 1 = 0$. If we perform the elementary operations of arithmetic (plus/minus, multiply/divide) on an arithmetic expression involving these two roots, it does not matter whether we swop the roots around (taking the complex conjugate) before or after performing the arithmetic operations – we get the same answer. There is something in the idea here which can be used as a strategy to obtain the quadratic formula. Rather than explore this in the context of the quadratic, we will proceed directly to study the symmetries involved in proving that there is no formula possible to solve the general quintic.

The overall proof of the insolubility of the quintic given here is intended to be accessible to anyone with good university entrance level mathematics. As in the paragraph above, it does require the reader to be aware of the existence of complex numbers. Awareness of the mathematical idea of a group may also be helpful. Matrices and determinants are used, including Cramer's rule, something that might not be encountered until second year university mathematics. However, matrices,

*Our aim is to show only that there are at least some quintics whose solutions are not given by a radical expression

determinants and Cramer's rule are covered in the appendix.

Since Galois, an approach to the subject using abstract algebra beyond group theory has become mainstream and the subject area has developed further. Many texts giving the modern approach to Galois theory are available of which the book by the Maxfields is perhaps the easiest [2]. However, Galois' original approach requires us to gain familiarity with fewer abstract constructs and so may be more memorable. Galois' original approach also impresses most dramatically with the astounding brilliance of his ideas.

2. Book Outline

The mathematics starts in the next chapter with a proof about the expansion of a construct called a Vandermonde determinant. This proof is used just in the following two initial theorems, but it illustrates the power of symmetry. The first of the theorems following the proof about the expansion of Vandermonde determinants, is a generalisation of the idea that all symmetric expressions in a and b , such as $a^n + (ab)^m + b^n$ can be expressed in terms of what are called elementary symmetric multinomials. (For two variables, these elementary symmetric multinomials are $a + b$ and ab). This result follows from a long and messy proof that shows that there exists a theoretical, but unwieldy, process for building expressions like $a^n + (ab)^m + b^n$ from the elementary symmetric expressions. The proof could seem intimidating but should be less so when one realises that it is intended only as a proof of principle and the lengthy manipulations are not required in practice. If one can accept the plausible result that all symmetric expressions can be expressed in terms of elementary symmetric multinomials, then this preliminary proof could be omitted on first reading. Much the same applies to the second initial proof – the theorem by Lagrange about resolvents. The resolvent is an amalgam of irrational roots formed in such a way that the process is able to be reversed so that each of the roots can be obtained from the resolvent. The definition of a resolvent and the result that they can always be found, needs to be understood. Unlike the previous proof on symmetric polynomials, the result is not immediately plausible. However like the previous proof, it is a long and messy proof and could also be omitted at first reading.

The following chapter goes back nearly 2400 years to Euclid's algorithm for finding greatest common divisors. This theorem is then generalised to finding