A Reader on International Media Piracy

MediaMatters is a series published by Amsterdam University Press on current debates about media technology and practices. International scholars critically analyze and theorize the materiality and performativity, as well as spatial practices of screen media in contributions that engage with today's (digital) media culture.

For more information about the series, please visit www.aup.nl

A Reader on International Media Piracy

Pirate Essays

Edited by
Tilman Baumgärtel

Amsterdam University Press

Table of Contents

The Aesthetics of Piracy

Conclusion

Acknowledgements

1.   Media Piracy

An Introduction

The Democracy of the Pirate Market

The MRT train arrives at the above-ground Carriedo station and the doors open, a rush of hot air blows into a cabin packed with people that the creaking air con barely cools. I push my way through the crowd to the door, bumping into an elbow here, shoving a backpack aside there, mumbling "*Pinagsisisihan*." Tagalog for "Sorry." The doors slam shut behind me, just when I have finally made it to the platform. A mass of people pushes me down the concrete stairs, two stories to the street, past vendors with baskets full of candy, coconuts, soft drinks, and cigarettes. Once I enter the Avenida Rizal, I have to shelter my eyes against the glaring tropical midday sunlight. An old man sells small towels from a makeshift table – just what I need. I buy one and wipe the sweat from my face.

The Avenida Rizal once was the fanciest shopping street of Manila with its modern department stores, restaurants, and cinemas. It was the main thoroughfare of Quiapo, one of the first suburbs outside of the walls of the historic city center Intramuros, an affluent neighborhood, where the emerging upper class of Manila built their villas and mansions from 1900 onward. Twenty cinemas lined the Avenue in the 1950s: the Avenue Theater, designed by National Artist Juan Nakpil in the 1930s, seated over a thousand patrons; the Scala Theater, with its tea rose marble floors and its curved wall made out of glass blocks, was designed by Pablo Antonio, another National Artist for Architecture; and the modernist Ever Theater, which was supposedly praised by German Bauhaus architect Walter Gropius, when he visited Manila in the 1950s. Most of these cinemas have been closed, or – like Nakpil's Art Deco-style Avenue – torn down and replaced by a parking lot. The ones that remain, the Jennets and the Lords, show scratched prints of sleazy, violent Filipino soft porn flicks from the 1980s and 1990s and serve as cruising areas for adventurous gay men.

The middle and upper class have long moved on to gated communities in boroughs further and further away from the historic city center, leaving Quiapo to the urban poor. One reason for the decline of the Avenida and the whole neighborhood of Quiapo was the very LRT train that just spit me out onto the simmering pavement of the boulevard. The tracks of the elevated train cover the street for its entire length, making the Avenida

dark and murky. When it opened in 1984 – it was the first metropolitan rail system in Southeast Asia – it scared away the shoppers and amblers that once animated the streets. Most shops moved into the shopping malls that started to mushroom all around Metro Manila. Today, one of the most historic neighborhoods of the capital of the Philippines has turned into a gigantic slum, and its remarkable wooden townhouses, proud villas, and once grand boulevards have been taken over by those who are too poor to live anywhere else.

There are many such dilapidated neighborhoods in Manila, but Quiapo's name still has a special ring to it – not just because of the historic churches like the Quiapo church or the iron San Sebastian church, the private homes that national hero Jose Rizal used to frequent and that he immortalized in his novel *Noli Me Tangere*, or the amazing market on Evangelista Street, where you can find Betel nuts, herbal folk medicine, uncanny statues of the Infant Jesus, magical talismans, and green jade crucifixes in street stalls next to the desks of fortune tellers. When Manileros hear the name Quiapo, they think of one thing in particular: pirated movies.

I turn into busy Carrideo Street and walk toward Plaza Miranda, passing the boarded-up building that still has the remnants of a rotating restaurant on its top floor. Down the stairs I go to what was once the first underpass in Manila under Quezon Boulevard and is now a noisy flea market, and then up to Hidalgo Street, once one of the most elegant addresses in town.

As soon as I surface from the underpass, I am in pirate land. It is not as obvious as it used to be, when pirated DVDs and CDs were sold from ramshackle carts right on the street. But if you know what door to open, you end up in a veritable video warehouse. Loud music is blasting, so one almost does not hear the "DVD DVD Sir" calls from the vendors. They stand in small stalls, with piles and piles of DVDs stacked up to the ceiling. The latest Hollywood blockbusters, some of which have not even opened in the US. European art house classics. US cult series like *Mad Men* and *Breaking Bad* in neat boxed sets. Korean telenovalas, Chinese martial arts films and, under the table, pornography galore – a whole audiovisual cosmos opens up in front of me. Forty pesos – less than a dollar – per disk is the asking price, but the more you buy, the more generous the discounts.

Children in torn T-shirts run through the dark aisles, an old woman sits on the floor of her stall, putting DVDs from a large stack into jewel cases from another large stack, then passes them on to another old woman, who puts covers into the jackets. Every stall has a TV set, and they seem to be in a competition to discover which one can drown out the others with the thundering sounds of Dolby Surround-enhanced fisticuffs and gun battles

from American action movies. Some vendors slouch in their plastic deck chairs and watch their films and others sleep, while the most motivated greet potential customers with their mantra of "DVDs DVDs."

Apart from music and movies, there are also heaps of pirate software disks: operating systems, installers, anti-virus programs, browsers, text editors, spread sheets, audio- and video-editing programs, which often cost thousands of dollars in their original versions. They have all become subjects to the democracy of the pirated market, where every disk, regardless of their content, costs a dollar. That also goes for the computer games, from PC games to console games to game cartridges for handheld consoles like the Nintendo DS, that are piling up at specialized stalls.

Enterprising pirates have put together enticing collections of their own design: a CD with cracked versions of all major DVD-burning programs, for instance, or a garden variety mixture of many small utilities that the average Windows user might find useful. On pirated DVDs, you might find other examples of pirate curating: all the films with Bruce Lee or a collection of super hero movies, the most popular blockbusters of the last year or a condensed retrospective of the films by Jim Jarmusch, all squeezed on one Dual Layer DVD in blurred, highly compressed versions. If you do not want all these disks, there are obliging entrepreneurs who will load MP3 tracks of your choice directly onto your cell phone or iPod, or copy a whole music library onto a flash drive in seconds. If you have more time, they will even search for the file you want on the Internet and download it for you to their antique desktop computer.

In a country where broadband Internet is still the privilege of the rich, Quiapo is not the only market for pirated media in Manila, but it is the most notorious one. Pirated disks are also openly on sale on the sidewalks, in the markets, and even in upscale shopping malls in the business districts of Makati and Ortigas. But Quiapo has become almost synonymous with the sale of pirated goods. While the streets around Hidalgo are the place to look for pirated DVDs and CDs, other neighborhoods are famous for other illicit goods: on G. Puyat Street you can find pirated versions of consumer electronics, and Carriedo Street and the Divisoria area are famous for knockoffs of designer clothes, shoes, and perfumes.

The "Pirates of the Avenida," as Manileros jokingly call the vendors in the streets of Quiapo in allusion to the popular pirate movies starring Johnny Depp, have taken over the quarter where in the past glamorous movie houses showed big screen feature films. And therefore, even bourgeois and upper-class film buffs, who do not leave their air-conditioned homes and offices as long as it is not absolutely necessary, will on a regular basis

squeeze themselves into a Jeepney (the popular mini-buses of the Philippines) and spend a sweat-drenched afternoon in the sweltering streets of Quiapo on the look out for rare cinematic gems. The pirated movies from Quiapo are not just for the slum dwellers who live in the neighborhood. An anonymous blogger from the Philippines puts it like this:

> All sectors of Filipino society patronize the pirate's lair. From students from MLQU, to priests from San Sebastian Church, to nurses and doctors, to SM employees, to rich SOBs riding their FORD F150, to *barong*-clad personnel from Malacañang, to DVD resellers coming from the provinces, to Caucasian and Korean tourists in shorts and *puka*-shell necklaces. No one is exempted. (Idiotboard 2006)[1]

For years, I was one of those who religiously and regularly traveled to Quiapo. Soon after I moved to the Philippines in 2004, I discovered this seemingly boundless source of cinematic pleasures. I found Chinese silent films from the Shanghai of the 1930s, that I had never heard of, and that have since become part of my pantheon of favorite silent movies next to those by Papst, Murnau, Dovzhenko, Sjöström, and Von Stroheim. When I got hired the following year to teach film at the University of the Philippines, I celebrated by availing myself with a neatly packaged, faux leather boxed set that supposedly contained all the Oscar-winning movies since 1929, but was really a collection of a hundred classic movies, including *Battleship Potemkin* and *The Bicycle Thieves*, but not *Gone with the Wind*.

The multiplex cinemas of the Philippines show almost exclusively US blockbusters and local mainstream movies. There are no art house cinemas in Manila and you cannot buy off-beat or classic films on DVDs. (Imagine: A country where neither *Citizen Kane* nor *Sunset Boulevard* were ever officially available!) Hence, it was a relief that I could still partake in the development of world cinema via pirated DVD. The Japanese horror films post-*Ringu* that were all the rage then, the works of Apichatpong Weerasethakul, Wong Kar-Wei, Lars von Trier, or Park Chan-wook, the strangely entertaining films of the Pang Brothers and the new Asian martial art movies starring Jet Lee, Donnie Yen, or Tony Jaa, and many of the latest award-winning films from the festivals in Berlin, Cannes, or Venice, came to Manila on pirated disks.

Then there were film classics from Eisenstein's *October* to Godard's *Contempt* to the collected works of Fassbinder to the shorts of Maya Deren and the ethnographic films of Jean Rouch. And cult films like Seijun Suzuki's *Branded to Kill*, Monte Hellman's *Two Lane Black Top*, or the complete works of Alejandro Jodorowsky or Jean Rollins. The films that Western film

aficionados rediscovered, lovingly restored, and rereleased in opulent editions with many special features on DVD labels such as Criterion Collection, Rialto, Kino, or Masters of Cinema for a lot of money inevitably appeared sooner or later in Quiapo for a dollar.

And it wasn't just me. When I joined the Film Institute of the College of Mass Communication at the University of the Philippines in 2005, all of my colleagues were avid collectors of pirated DVDs and swapped tips and success stories over lunch or during coffee breaks. Every other week a somewhat shady character named Ronnie showed up at our department with a plastic bag full of classic and cult films that he had procured in Quiapo and resold them at a slightly higher price, saving us the trouble of going there ourselves.

When I arrived at the Film Institute, its film collection consisted mostly of VHS copies of the canonic classics, from *Workers Leaving the Factory* to *The Matrix*. But in the following years the film collection grew uncontrollably as everybody brought their latest finds into the Film Institute to have them copied for the use and benefit of our students. The workshop of our technician Ric turned into a pirate's den in its own right, where the disk drive of his ageing computers was always noisily copying newly purchased DVDs brought in by the professors. When the department moved in 2010 to a new building, one would have been forgiven for thinking that this was because we needed more space for all those DVDs.

We all knew that buying those discs was technically illegal, but nobody cared. First of all, the chance of actually getting caught in the act of buying them was close to zero, as the raids were infrequent and the more good-natured of the always well-informed DVD vendors would warn their customers when one was in the offing. And everybody was doing it: as my former University of the Philippines colleague Rolando Tolentino has argued, pirated media allow the Filipinos – somewhat awkwardly – to access the globalized consumer and media culture that they desire so badly (Tolentino 2008/2009).

The Manila Police and the Optical Media Board of the Philippines regularly conduct raids in Quiapo. These raids are often spectacular affairs where whole buildings are padlocked and containers full of disks are confiscated and destroyed with bulldozers and steamrollers. These activities are typically performed in front of television cameras and the media dutifully report on them. None of them, however, has actually stopped Quiapo from serving as the unofficial media superstore of Manila. The frequent raids might have forced the pirate vendors from the sidewalks into less easily visible shops and the mayor, Alfredo Lim, has taken credit for having "erased" piracy in

the downtown of Manila. But if you know where to look, the stalls are all still there, and they are doing brisk business.

The ominous raids, however, have enabled the Philippines to remove itself from the permanent "watch list" of countries that are infamous for disregarding the intellectual property rights that is maintained by the Office of the United States Trade Representative. The content industry of the United States has – in close cooperation with government institutions – established a wide-ranging and relatively effective regime to coerce Third World countries into (at least feigned) recognition of the Western notion of intellectual property rights that often has no equivalent in local traditions or current cultural practice: "Some respondents in our... survey did not understand the concept of piracy, obliging the researcher to explain the term," observed Primo and Lloyd (2011, 121) when they were conducting a study of DVD piracy in a township in South Africa.

However, industry trade groups such as the Business Software Alliance (BSA) or the Motion Picture Association of America (MPAA) have – through insistent lobbying, by exerting downright pressure, or by providing "logistical support" for policy raids and other law enforcement activities – managed to get many countries in Asia and Africa to cooperate in their attempts to "stamp out" piracy. The BSA, for instance, claims on its website that it has anti-piracy enforcement programs in over 60 countries worldwide and that in 2012 alone it investigated over 15,000 reports of software piracy across the globe (BSA 2015). The raids and operations that these organizations conduct frequently are organized with the participation of the press, which is able to take spectacular footage of raided stalls or steamrollers driving over piles of pirated disks.

This kind of piracy has often been associated with large-scale organized crime or even terrorism.[2] While these publications are typically based on newspaper accounts or the reports of nameless law enforcement agents, the on-the-ground reports compiled in the global study *Media Piracy in Emerging Economies* (Karaganis 2011) paint a picture that is far less grim. A conclusion of the researchers that looked at piracy in Mexico states:

> Piracy is not organized to a significant degree by gangs, drug cartels, or other large organizations, even in notorious markets such as Tepito, but instead is carried out primarily by networks of smaller family-based producers and vendors. There are consequently few "ringleaders" whose arrest could have a significant impact on the pirate economy. This is what makes targeted investigations of piracy ineffective and larger, sweeping enforcement actions relatively high risks for social unrest. (Cross 2011, 306)

The Underbelly of Globalization

To me, digital media piracy is the outcome of the very properties of the digital technology with which they are produced: The proliferation of relatively cheap computers, scanners, and DVD burners has turned the pirating of digital media into a cottage industry in the Third World, whether it is the production of pirated DVDs or the printing of covers. In the West, where the kind of street-level piracy that I encountered in the Philippines never existed to the same extent, a similar process could be observed on the Internet. Here, enterprising pirates created websites for the online distribution of pirated material via torrents or by streaming that also had the characteristics of small-scale companies: The German website kino.to, which was accessed four million times a day during 2010 before it was closed down by the police, was run by a group of four people. One of the members of the group admitted to having uploaded 120,000 film files in one year (Patalong 2012).

I have argued elsewhere that piracy is a kind of "globalization from below" (Baumgärtel 2006). The type of media piracy that has developed from the second half of the 1990s onward is a result of the technological development – but also of the economic and political globalization – of the last two decades. The deregulation of national markets after the neoliberal reforms that began under Thatcher in the United Kingdom and Reagan in the United States and that has had a significant impact on the economic policies in many other countries in the West, in the postcommunist countries of Eastern Europe, and in countries such as China, Vietnam, Laos, and Cambodia, was partly responsible for the globalized media piracy of today.

Many countries have cut back on law enforcement and reduced border patrols. At the same time, the spread of access to the Internet and the proliferation of comparatively cheap and powerful technologies enabling digital reproduction on a large scale also supported the raise of networks that aided media piracy. The creative, do-it-yourself aspects of digital media, which have been hailed by many educators and thinkers (see Lessig 2004; Benkler 2006), also allow for the mass production of illegal media products. The flexibility provided by these new technologies grant creators of pirated material a crucial advantage over governments. In many respects, piracy is the illicit underbelly of globalization. In this type of globalization, the participants are not multinational corporations anymore, but smugglers, small-time crooks, and criminal gangs. Their organization is flexible, fast, and efficient, and it crosses national boundaries.

Such organizations have a ready market for their product: In many countries of the Third World piracy is the only way for access to much-needed material (be it school books or business software) that often is not available on the local market at all or only at prohibitively high prices. Countries like China – and to a lesser degree India – have used piracy to level the playing field in international commerce and to compensate for the relative underdevelopment of their economies.

Creating Knowledge

Piracy also plays an important part in the cultural education in many countries (Story et al. 2006). As I have shown elsewhere (Baumgärtel 2012), the boom of independent films in some of the countries of Southeast Asia was partly triggered by the film literacy that many young directors gained from watching pirated versions of art films that were not available in any other way in their countries. The young Filipino director John Torres even went so far as to offer one of his films to the DVD pirates in Manila, since he felt their organization would allow for a much better distribution of his film than any legitimate company (Torres 2012).

The home-grown film industry of Nigeria, that has become known under the moniker "Nollywood", also made use of the distribution structures that emerged to facilitate the sale of pirated VHS tapes (see Brian Larkin's essay in this volume). In Russia, piracy provides for many intellectuals "access to the world of non-blockbuster media goods – independent music, art-house films, and much Western media. Such access is not a luxury for members of this group, but in many cases the basis of their professional activities as musicians, writers, editors, and producers. Piracy – not the licit market – enables them to participate in the international cultural arena. Consequently, it is also the condition of their survival and renewal as a professional class." (Sezneva/Karaganis 2011)

When China opened up to Western capitalism in the 1980s and 1990s, pirated movies were instrumental in creating a whole generation of film critics, who shaped the perception of cinema for the whole country, writes Angela Xiao Wu: "The first generation of Chinese film critics emerged as the Internet fuelled the piracy market. Typically born in the 1970s, these new critics were either working in an unrelated profession – for example, Weixidi was a structural engineer – or were college students majoring in film-related areas during the movie forums' heyday (1998-2004). Five to ten years later, these people became influential critics and editors of domestic

mass media, or graduate students in film (usually at overseas institutions), while still maintaining active online presences. Besides the most renowned figures, the Internet also gave birth to numerous amateur film critics and everyday-life film reviews." (Wu 2012) She mentions a remark from film director Jia Zhangke, who frequently refers to his own dealings with pirated movies and how he mingled with cinephiles, who worked as airplane repairmen and bill stickers in their day jobs.

For a whole generation of film makers in Third World countries, the pirate market seemed to serve a function similar to the French or the German film clubs of the 1950s and 1960s. These amateur organisations screened classical films that had disappeared (or were erased) from the collective memory during the Second World War. They started their own publication and began the research on film makers out of which much of Western film studies developed. At the same time, these film clubs were the breeding ground of a new generation of film makers who were knowledgeable cinéastes. Film movements such as the *Nouvelle Vague* in France or the *Neuer Deutscher Film* in Germany developed directly out of this cinematographic grass roots movements. Today, pirated films are to a great extent responsible for creating a knowledge of world cinema in countries where there are no legitimate channels for the distribution of this kind of material. To a large extent, this goes for music or literature as well.

Some writers have even attributed a certain degree of originality to the work of the media pirates. A number of studies have looked at subtitling as a way of how movie pirates add value to the materal they are bootlegging (Hu 2004, Dwyer/Uricaru 2009, Hu 2010) or can be read as cultural assimilation of foreign media (Pang 2007, 63-79). According to Monique Vandresen, Brazilian subtitling groups have become so efficient that they can release a subtitled version of the American show "Lost" on the same day that the show has been aired in the United States (Vandresen 2012).

This example is just one of the instances that show how piracy has the potential to change the expectation that an international audience has in terms of media consumption. Internet piracy has created an environment where a breathtakingly wide selection of movies, music, books, and other artistic productions can be found. This has forced the media industry into a situation where their consumers expect to find the material they want on the net – immediately and without artificially high restrictions. Piracy is very much ahead of what the legitimate media industry is offering in terms of the speed and ease of use that the audience has come to expect – including being able to see their favorite US shows outside of the United States on the very same day it was aired.

Previously, movie studios and television stations had often employed meticulous strategies of "windowing" the release films and television shows. The internet has put an end to this strategy: a good number of the most highly anticipated Hollywood movies are available on the internet and on the streets of many countries with lax law enforcement even before they have been released theatrically in the US, as the example of the American movie *Slumdog Millionaire* shows. Even though the film was shot in India and was highly anticipated there, it did not fare very well upon its release: A Indian distributor explained: "By the time (Slumdog Millionaire) came to India, it was already out in the market on pirated discs and the majority of people had downloaded and seen the English movie." (Liang/Sudaram 2011) In other instances, material that was not ready for release appeared on the internet via P2P-services – famous examples include a demo of the song "I Disappear" by Metallica in 2000 to a unfinished rough cut of "X-Men Origins: Wolverine" in 2009 without the digital special effects.

Politicizing Piracy

The first reaction of the media industry against this type of piracy has been using the legal system to punish internet music and film pirates. In the late 90s, the American media industry filed spectacular cases against individual file sharers and later against companies like Napster, Pirate Bay or Megaupload that facilitated the downloading of copyrighted material. At the same time, industry groups lobbied national governments to pass stricter anti-piracy laws, and a good number of countries have introduced new legislation or have made existing laws more severe: Recent examples include the HADOPI law in France,[3] that makes a three strikes policy against file-sharers possible.

The case against the Pirate Bay was of particular significance here, as it was the beginning of the politicisation of a segment of its users that resulted in the foundation of the first Pirate Party in Sweden. This website came out of a debate on the merits of copyright that had been initiated by a group called "Piratbyrån" (Pirate Bureau). The group advocated the unrestricted sharing of information and intellectual property, that lead to the setting up of Pirate Bay.

Similar Pirate Parties were founded in more than 40 countries, and some – such as Swedish Piratpartiet and the German Piratenpartei – were able to win significant numbers of votes in local or even national elections. While it remains to be seen whether this political movement will have staying

power, it should be noted that issues related to piracy or copyright – until recently a rather insignificant issue in politics – have mobilized significant numbers of activists and protesters on a global level in the last decade. The international protests against the Stop Online Piracy Act (SOPA) in 2011 or the Anti-Counterfeiting Trade Agreement (ACTA) in 2012 were the most visible examples of international resistance against the tightening of intellectual property regulations. In Germany, protests against the German performance rights organisation GEMA[4] were also examples of the mobilizing force of copyright regimes that were considered stifling by music fans. These demonstrations were joined by thousands in the major German cities, and an anti-GEMA-online-petition was signed by more than 285 000 people.

Piracy has been an important force in the massive changes in the distribution of media that has taken place over the last two decades. Arguably, piracy has forced book publishing houses as well as music and film companies to offer consumers new ways of accessing their products that the media industry was previously reluctant to explore – often precisely because of the fear of having their product pirated. While the actual impact of piracy on the sales of DVDs, CDs and legitimate MP3s has never been conclusively proven, it is safe to say that piracy had a significant impact on the way that media are consumed and distributed today.

Writers such as Lawrence Lessig (Lessig 2004) and Yochai Benkler (Benkler 2006) have even argued that piracy has even facilitated certain forms of creative expressions. Art forms such as Remixes, Mash-Ups or Bastard Pop have indeed often been initially based on the appropriation of copyrighted material. Lessig has not only criticized the often excessive restrictions that copy-right owners impose on their intellectual property via Digital Right Managements schemes and other measures, but established an alternative scheme to licenses content that provides a flexible range of protections and freedoms for authors, artists, and educators. The Creative Commons license system has been an important foundation of the "Copyleft" movement that has started to re-think of the role of the "commons" and of the Public Domain in the information age.

This book, however, is not a book in defence or versus piracy. It takes piracy as a phenomenon that is a given in current net culture, and looks at some of the peculiarities that other recent studies of piracy (such as Johns 2009 or Karaganis 2011) have not paid attention to. Tony Tran and Yonatan Reinberg look at the specific cultures of piracy in Vietnam, and Brazil respectively. Mirko Tobias Schaefer looks at another pirate culture, the scene of Mod Chip hackers, while Jonas Andersson addresses the specific ethics of internet media pirates. Three last essays of the book address the subject

of piracy from a more theoretical point of views: Stefan Meretz discusses the issue of copy protection from the point of view of a political scientist, while Jonathan Marshall and Francesca da Rimini place the issue of piracy in a historical discussion of concepts of property, ownership and theft. The book concludes with Jens Schröter's discussion of some of the basic concepts of media theory in relation to piracy: Reproducibility, Copy, Simulation.

All these essays were written specifically for this book. I have included two essays that have been published previously elsewhere, because they I feel that they add greatly to the understanding of the history and the cultural significance of piracy: Brian Larkin's study about the VHS piracy in Nigeria that has lead to the emergence of the "Nollywood" film industry in Nigeria and an essay on the subtitling practise of Romanian movie pirates by Tessa Dwyer and Ioana Uricaru. The book concludes with an essay by myself that summarizes the most recent development of media piracy on the internet.

Conclusion

The battle over piracy is far from over: While the media industry was in some countries of the West to some extent successful in curbing peer-to-peer piracy, new sites that screen pirated movies and television shows have taken their place. A growing number of downloads happen via Virtual Private Networks, encrypted with the Tor software or in "Darknets" that are only accessible to a small number of users, making it difficult to detect for law enforcement agencies.

At the same time, some industry representatives have expressed their dissatisfaction with the way piracy has been handled in the past that might anticipate a radical change in the industry tactics against piracy. Adobe's Anti-Piracy chief Richard Atkinson has publicly said: "Everyone is tired of the entire concept and term 'Anti-Piracy', even the term 'Content Protection' too." (Ernesto 2013 a) And David Kaplan, the Anti Piracy Chief of Warner Brothers, has even argued: "We view piracy as a proxy of consumer demand." (Ernesto 2013 b) And David Petrarca, director of the successful *Games of Thrones* television series, has recently downplayed the damage that piracy has done to the financing of the show (Sottek 2013). So far, these are only individual opinions, not a shared point of view of the media and software industry as such. But it might be a sign that a growing numbers of companies are reconsidering their heavy-handed approach towards piracy.

In the meanwhile, the industry that makes a living out of fighting piracy, already has its eyes on the next battleground: The American company OpSec

has identified 3D printing as "the new challenge in anti-counterfeiting". "What should stop consumers from printing branded shoes, spare parts, action figures, or jewelry?", asks the company on its website. "Much like what the digital industry had to face over past years as software, music and film was shared and downloaded for free over the internet, online libraries are springing up where people can share object files for 3D printing. One can only imagine how these libraries will grow once more consumers own 3D printing devices." (Imkamp 2013)

Notes

1. MLQU is the Manuel L. Quezon University, SM is the biggest chain of shopping malls in the Philippines, Malacañang is the palace of the Philippine president, and the *barong* is the traditional Philippine shirt for men.
2. See, for instance, Naím 2005, Phillips 2005, or, most notoriously, a report from the RAND Corporation (Treverton et al. 2009).
3. Haute Autorité pour la diffusion des œuvres et la protection des droits d'auteur sur internet (Law promoting the distribution and protection of creative works on the Internet).
4. Gesellschaft für musikalische Aufführungs- und mechanische Vervielfältigungsrechte.

Bibliography

Alford, William. 1995. *To Steal a Book is an Elegant Offense*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.
Baumgärtel, Tilman. 2006. "The Culture of Piracy in the Philippines." In Kim Shin Dong and Joel David, eds., *Cinema in / on Asia*, Gwanju 2006 (Asian Culture Forum). Available online at: http://www.asian-edition.org/piracyinthephilippines.pdf.

Baumgärtel, Tilman. 2012. "The Piracy Generation: Media Piracy and Independent Film in Southeast Asia." In Ingawanji/McKay, 195-208

Benkler, Yochai. 2006. *The Wealth of Networks: How Social Production Transforms Markets and Freedom*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

BSA. 2015. "Enforcement" BSA, The Business Software Alliance website. http://www.bsa.org/anti-piracy/enforcement.

Cross, John C. 2011. "Mexico." In Joe Karaganis, ed., *Media Piracy in Emerging Economies*. New York: Social Science Research Council.

Danaher, Brett, and Joel Waldfogel. 2012. "Reel Piracy: The Effect of Online Film Piracy on International Box Office Sales." *Social Science Research Network*, 16 January. http://ssrn.com/abstract=1986299.

Dwyer, Tessa, and Ioana Uricaru. 2009. "Slashings and Subtitles: Romanian Media Piracy, Censorship, and Translation." *The Velvet Light Trap* 63: 45-57.

Ernesto. 2013a. "Tired of the 'War on Piracy,' Adobe Hopes to Turn Pirates into Customers." *TorrentFreak*, 25 June. http://torrentfreak.com/tired-of-the-war-on-piracy-adobe-hopes-to-turn-pirates-into-customers-130625/.

Ernesto. 2013b. "Warner Bros: Pirates Show Us What Consumers Want." *TorrentFreak*, 24 June. http://torrentfreak.com/warner-bros-pirates-show-us-what-consumers-want-130624/.

Ertuna, Irmak. 2009. "Digital Pirates and the Enclosure of the Intellect." *darkmatter* 5:16-22. http://www.darkmatter101.org/site/2009/12/20/digital-pirates-and-the-enclosure-of-the-intellect/.

Hu, Brian. 2010. "Korean TV Serials in the English-Language Diaspora: Translating Difference Online and Making It Racial." *The Velvet Light Trap* 66: 36-49.

Hu, Kelly. 2004. "Chinese Re-makings of Pirated VCDs of Japanese TV Dramas." In Koichi Iwabuchi, ed., *Feeling Asian Modernities: Transnational Consumption of Japanese TV Dramas*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 205-226.

Idiotboard. 2006. "Pirate's Lair." The Idiot Board blog, 2 September. idiotboard.blogspot.com/2006/09/pirates-lair-2006.html.

Imkamp, Mecky. 2013. "3D Printing – The New Challenge In Anti-Counterfeiting." Opsecurity.com, 24 June. http://blog.opsecsecurity.com/3d-printing--the-new-challenge-in-anti-counterfeiting.

Ingawanij, May Adadol, and Benjamin McKay, eds. 2012. *Glimpses of Freedom: Independent Cinema in Southeast Asia*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell Southeast Asia Program Publications.

Johns, Adrian. 2009. *Piracy: The Intellectual Property Wars from Gutenberg to Gates*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Karaganis, Joe, ed. 2011. *Media Piracy in Emerging Economies*. New York: Social Science Research Council.

Larkin, Brian. 2008. "Pirate Infrastructures." In Joe Karaganis, ed., *Structures of Participation in Digital Culture*. New York: Social Science Research Council, 74-87.

Lessig, Lawrence. 2004. *Free Culture: How Big Media Uses Technology and the Law to Lock Down Culture and Control Creativity*. New York: Penguin.

Liang, Lawrence, and Ravi Sundaram. 2011. "India." In Joe Karaganis, ed., *Media Piracy in Emerging Economies*. New York: Social Science Research Council, 339-398.

Mattelart, Tristan, 2009. "Audio-visual Piracy: Towards a Study of the Underground Networks of Cultural Globalization." *Global Media and Communication* 5 (2009): 308-326

Naím, Moisés. 2005. *Illicit: How Smugglers, Traffickers and Copycats are Hijacking the Global Economy*. London: William Heinemann.

Pang, Laikwan. 2007. *Cultural Control and Globalization in Asia: Copyright, Piracy and Cinema*. London: Routledge.

Patalong, Frank. 2012. "Razzien in fünf Bundesländern: Werbevermarkter von kino.to ver-
    haftet." *Der Spiegel*, 13 April. http://www.spiegel.de/netzwelt/netzpolitik/razzien-in-fuenf-
    bundeslaendern-werbevermarkter-von-kino-to-verhaftet-a-827344.html.

Phillips, Tim. 2005. *Knockoff: The Deadly Trade in Counterfeit Goods*. London: Kodan Page.

Primo, Natasha, and Libby Lloyd. 2011. "South Africa." In Joe Karaganis, ed., *Media Piracy in
    Emerging Economies*. New York: Social Science Research Council, 99-148

Sarai Media Lab. 2006. *Contested Commons/Trespassing Publics: A Public Record*. Delhi: Sarai
    Media Lab. http://archive.sarai.net/files/original/b6fe93e8dbe6d3cc655aa00f11d743f8.pdf.

Sezneva, Olga, and Joe Karaganis. 2011. "Russia." In Joe Karaganis, ed., *Media Piracy in Emerging
    Economies*. New York: Social Science Research Council.

Sottek, T. C. 2013. "'Game of Thrones' Director David Petrarca Shrugs Off Piracy, Says It Doesn't
    Hurt the Show." *The Verge*, 27 February 27. http://www.theverge.com/2013/2/27/4035390/
    game-of-thrones-director-piracy

Story, Alan, Colin Darch, and Debora Halbert, eds. 2006. *The Copy/South Dossier: Issues in
    the Economics, Politics, and Ideology of Copyright in the Global South*. The Copy/South
    Research Group, May 2006. http://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/sites/default/files/
    csdossier_20060613.pdf

Rolando B. Tolentino. 2008/2009. "Piracy Regulation and the Filipino's Historical Response to
    Globalization." Social Science Diliman 5, Nos. 1-2 (2008-2009): 1-25

Torres, John. 2012. "Piracy Boom Boom." In May Adadol Ingawanij and Benjamin McKay, eds.,
    Glimpses of Freedom: Independent Cinema in Southeast Asia. Ithaca, NY: Cornell Southeast
    Asia Program Publications, 63-73

Treverton, Gregory F., et al. 2009. *Film Piracy, Organized Crime, and Terrorism.* Santa Monica,
    CA: RAND Corporation.

Vandresen, Monique, 2012. "'Free Culture' Lost in Translation." *International Journal of Com-
    munication* 6: 626-642.

Verzola, Roberto. 2004. *Towards a Political Economy of Information: Studies on the Information
    Economy*. Quezon City, Philippines: Foundation for Nationalist Studies.

Walton, Zach. 2013. "Music Piracy Rates Down As More Turn to Streaming Services." *WebProNews*,
    26 February 26. http://www.webpronews.com/music-piracy-rates-down-as-more-turn-to-
    streaming-services-2013-02.

Wu, Angela Xiao. 2012. "Broadening the Scope of Cultural Preferences: Movie Talk and Chinese
    Pirate Film Consumption from the Mid-1980s to 2005." *International Journal of Communica-
    tion* 6: 501-529.

Case Studies