

Joel Westerdale

**Nietzsche's Aphoristic Challenge**

# **Monographien und Texte zur Nietzsche-Forschung**

---

Begründet von  
Mazzino Montinari, Wolfgang Müller-Lauter  
und Heinz Wenzel

Herausgegeben von  
Günter Abel (Berlin) und  
Werner Stegmaier (Greifswald)

## **Band 64**

Joel Westerdale

# **Nietzsche's Aphoristic Challenge**

---

DE GRUYTER

*Anschriften der Herausgeber:*

Prof. Dr. Günter Abel  
Institut für Philosophie  
TU Berlin, Sekr. TEL 12/1  
Ernst-Reuter-Platz 7, D-10587 Berlin

Prof. Dr. Werner Stegmaier  
Ernst-Moritz-Arndt-Universität  
Institut für Philosophie  
Baderstr. 6–7, D-17487 Greifswald

ISBN 978-3-11-032393-1  
e-ISBN 978-3-11-032432-7  
ISSN 0174-4410

**Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

A CIP catalog record for this book has been applied for at the Library of Congress.

**Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek**

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.dnb.de> abrufbar.

© 2013 Walter de Gruyter GmbH, Berlin/Boston  
Druck: Hubert & Co. GmbH & Co. KG, Göttingen  
⊗ Gedruckt auf säurefreiem Papier  
Printed in Germany

[www.degruyter.com](http://www.degruyter.com)

---

Das Ma a s s ist uns fremd, gestehen wir es uns;  
unser Kitzel ist gerade der Kitzel des Unendlichen, Ungemessenen.

*Jenseits von Gut und Böse*  
aus Aphorismus 224

*Measure* is alien to us, let us admit it;  
our thrill is the thrill of the infinite, the unmeasured.

*Beyond Good and Evil*  
from aphorism 224



## Acknowledgements

Academics are like aphorisms in that despite all appearances they don't really work in isolation. Thus I extend thanks to my colleagues at Smith College for their professional, intellectual, and emotional support, particularly Gertraud Gutzmann, Judith Keyler-Mayer, Jocelyne Kolb, Joseph McVeigh, Hans Vaegt, Michael Gorra, Dawn Fulton, and Craig Davis. Thanks also go to Peter J. Burgard, Michel Chaouli, Judith Ryan, Gerhard Neumann, and Robert Lemon, who supported the initial research for this project during my doctoral studies at Harvard University. More recently Patrick Fortmann, Anthony K. Jensen, and Werner Stegmaier have been generous with their comments on the manuscript, greatly improving the final product. I am grateful for Natalia Ermolaev's meticulous analyses and persistent demands for clarity, and the reader should be, too. Thanks also to Christoph Schirmer at De Gruyter for painlessly ushering the book through the publishing process. Marion Macdonald and Ashley Achauer provided valuable assistance with editing and indexing. Halina Hackert and Jana Lubasch, librarians at the Zentrum für Literatur- und Kulturforschung in Berlin, saved me much time and effort tracking down resources during my stay there hosted by Sigrid Weigel and funded by the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation. Generous financial support for the project was also provided by the Whiting Foundation, the Fulbright Foundation, and the Minda de Gunzburg Center for European Studies in Cambridge, Massachusetts. Lastly, I'd like to express my heartfelt gratitude to my friends and family, particularly the Berlin contingent—my esteemed Oheim Tom and his daughter, my dear cousin Lara Day.





# Contents

Acknowledgements — VII

List of Abbreviations and Sources — XI

Timeline of Key Publications Discussed and their Publishers — XV

Introduction. The Challenge — 1

## Part One. Nietzsche and the German Aphoristic Tradition

Chapter One. “They’re aphorisms!” — 11

*Sentenz* and *Aphorismus* — 19

Lichtenberg’s *Aphorismen* — 24

Chapter Two. Aphoristic Pluralism — 34

Diverse Forms — 34

Undefining the Genre — 48

## Part Two. The Turn to the Aphorism

Chapter Three. The Aphoristic Option — 59

An Opportunity — 60

Literature and Science — 71

Chapter Four. An Anarchy of Atoms — 85

The Collection — 86

Aphorisms and Fragments — 90

## Part Three. Re-Reading the Aphorism

Chapter Five. An Art of Exegesis — 99

What Does an Art of Exegesis Mean? — 100

Cross-Textual Interpretation — 111

The Limits of Interpretation — 116

Chapter Six. The *Nietzsche* Function — 123

Peeking into the Pot — 124

A Wretched Minor Fiction — 130

**Part Four. The Aphoristic Paradigm**

**Chapter Seven. Excess and Ephexis — 141**

Aphoristic Excesses — 142

The Ephectic Bent — 151

**Bibliography — 164**

**Index — 174**

# List of Abbreviations and Sources

## Abbreviations of Nietzsche's Works

References to the *Kritische Studienausgabe* of Nietzsche's works (KSA) will be made according to volume and page (for example, KSA 6:365 means page 365 of volume 6), except in the case of those books composed of texts numbered according to a single continuous sequence (*The Birth of Tragedy*; *Human, All Too Human*; *Assorted Opinions and Maxims*; *The Wanderer and his Shadow*; *Daybreak*; *The Gay Science*; *Beyond Good and Evil*; *The Antichrist*), which are referred to according to section number preceded by an abbreviated title of the work in which they appear. References to the preface and three treatises of *On the Genealogy of Morals* consist of "Preface" or the Roman numeral I, II or III, followed by the section number.

Where no reference to a published English translation is provided, the translation is my own.

A	<i>The Antichrist</i> , PN 565–656.
AC	<i>Der Antichrist</i> (The Antichrist), KSA 6:165–254.
AOM	<i>Assorted Opinions and Maxims</i> . In: <i>Human, All Too Human</i> . Translated by R. J. Hollingdale. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996, 215–299.
BAW	<i>Historisch-kritische Gesamtausgabe. Werke</i> . 5 vols. Edited by Hans Joachim Mette and Karl Schlechta. Munich: Beck, 1933–44.
BGE	<i>Beyond Good and Evil</i> , BWN 179–435.
BT	<i>The Birth of Tragedy</i> , BWN 1–144.
BT Self-Criticism	Attempt at a Self-Criticism
BWN	<i>Basic Writings of Nietzsche</i> . Edited and translated by Walter Kaufmann. New York: The Modern Library, 1992.
CV 1	"Ueber das Pathos der Wahrheit" (On the Pathos of Truth), KSA 1:755–760.
CW	<i>The Case of Wagner</i> , BWN 601–645.
D	<i>Daybreak</i> . Translated by R.J. Hollingdale. Edited by Maudemarie Clark and Brian Leiter. Cambridge Texts in the History of Philosophy. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
D Preface	Daybreak, Preface
DS	David Strauss (= <i>Unfashionable Observations</i> , First Piece).
EH	<i>Ecce homo: How One Becomes What One Is</i> , BWN 671–791.
EH Clever	Why I Am So Clever
EH HH	Human, All Too Human
EH Destiny	Why I Am a Destiny
EH Wise	Why I am So Wise

EH Zarathustra	Thus Spoke Zarathustra
EH	<i>Ecce homo. Wie man wird, was man ist</i> , KSA 6:255–374.
EH klug	Warum ich so klug bin
EH MAM	Menschliches, Allzumenschliches
EH Schicksal	Warum ich ein Schicksal bin
EH weise	Warum ich so weise bin
EH Zarathustra	Also sprach Zarathustra
FW	<i>Die fröhliche Wissenschaft</i> (The Gay Science), KSA 3:343–651.
GD	<i>Götzen-Dämmerung</i> (Twilight of the Idols), KSA 6:55–161.
GD Alten	Was ich den Alten verdanke
GD Sokrates	Das Problem des Sokrates
GD Sprüche	Sprüche und Pfeile
GD Streifzüge	Streifzüge eines Unzeitgemässen
GM	<i>On the Genealogy of Morals</i> , BWN 437–599.
GM Preface	On the Genealogy of Morals, Preface
GM	<i>Zur Genealogie der Moral</i> , KSA 5:245–412.
GM Vorrede	Zur Genealogie der Moral. Vorrede
GS	<i>The Gay Science</i> . Translated by Walter Kaufmann. New York: Vintage, 1974.
GT	<i>Die Geburt der Tragödie</i> (The Birth of Tragedy), KSA 1:9–156.
GT Versuch	Versuch einer Selbstkritik
HH I	<i>Human, All Too Human (I)</i> . Translated by Gary Handwerk. In: <i>The Complete Works of Friedrich Nietzsche</i> , vol. 3. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1995.
JGB	<i>Jenseits von Gut und Böse</i> (Beyond Good and Evil), KSA 5:9–243.
KGB	<i>Briefwechsel. Kritische Gesamtausgabe</i> . Edited by Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari. Berlin/New York: De Gruyter, 1975–.
KGW	<i>Werke. Kritische Gesamtausgabe</i> . Edited by Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari. Berlin/New York: De Gruyter, 1967–.
KSA	<i>Sämtliche Werke. Kritische Studienausgabe</i> . Edited by Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari. 15 vols. Munich/Berlin/New York: DTV/De Gruyter, 1999.
KSB	<i>Sämtliche Briefe. Kritische Studienausgabe in 8 Bänden</i> . Edited by Giorgio Colli and Mazzino Montinari. 8 vols. Munich/Berlin/New York: DTV/De Gruyter, 1986.
M	<i>Morgenröte</i> (Daybreak), KSA 3:9–331.
M Vorrede	Morgenröte, Vorrede von 1886
MA I	<i>Menschliches, Allzumenschliches I</i> (Human, All Too Human I), KSA 2:9–366.
NL	Nachlass (writings from Nietzsche's literary estate), KSA vols. 7–14.

PN	<i>The Portable Nietzsche</i> . Edited and translated by Walter Kaufmann. New York: Penguin, 1982.
PT	"On the Pathos of Truth (1872)," in: <i>Philosophical Writings</i> . Edited by Reinhold Grimm and Caroline Molina y Vedia. New York: Continuum, 1995, 83–87.
RWB	Richard Wagner in Bayreuth (= <i>Unfashionable Observations</i> , Fourth Piece).
SE	Schopenhauer as Educator (= <i>Unfashionable Observations</i> , Third Piece).
TI	<i>Twilight of the Idols</i> , PN 463–563.
TI Maxims	Maxims and Arrows
TI Ancients	What I Owe to the Ancients
TI Socrates	The Problem of Socrates
TI Skirmishes	Skirmishes of an Untimely Man
TL	"On Truth and Lying in an Extra-Moral Sense (1873)," in: <i>Friedrich Nietzsche on Rhetoric and Language</i> . Edited and translated by Sander L. Gilman, Carole Blair and David J. Parent. Oxford/New York: Oxford University Press, 1989, 246–257.
UB	<i>Unzeitgemäße Betrachtungen I–IV</i> (Unfashionable Observations I–IV), KSA 1:157–510.
UO	<i>Unfashionable Observations</i> . Translated by Richard T. Gray. In: <i>The Complete Works of Friedrich Nietzsche</i> , vol. 2. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1995.
VM	<i>Vermischte Meinungen und Sprüche</i> (Assorted Opinions and Maxims), KSA 2:367–534.
WA	<i>Der Fall Wagner</i> (The Case of Wagner), KSA 6:9–53.
WL	"Ueber Wahrheit und Lüge im aussermoralischen Sinne" (On Truth and Lying in an Extra-Moral Sense), KSA 1:873–890.
WP	<i>The Will to Power</i> . Edited by Walter Kaufmann. Translated by Walter Kaufmann and R. J. Hollingdale. New York: Vintage, 1968.
WS	<i>The Wanderer and His Shadow</i> , In: <i>Human, All Too Human</i> . Translated by R. J. Hollingdale. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996, 301–395.
WS	<i>Der Wanderer und sein Schatten</i> (The Wanderer and His Shadow), KSA 2:534–704.
Z	<i>Thus Spoke Zarathustra</i> , PN 103–439.
Z I Despisers	On the Despisers of the Body
Z I Reading	On Reading and Writing
Z I Prologue	Zarathustra's Prologue
Z I Women	On Little Old and Young Women
Z II Self-Overcoming	On Self-Overcoming
Z III Gravity	On the Spirit of Gravity

Z III Return	The Return Home
Z III Tablets	On Old and New Tablets
Z	<i>Also sprach Zarathustra</i> (Thus Spoke Zarathustra), KSA 4.
Z I Lesen	Vom Lesen und Schreiben
Z I Vorrede	Zarathustra's Vorrede
Z I Verächtern	Von den Verächtern des Leibes
Z I Weiblein	Von alten und jungen Weiblein
Z II Selbst-Ueberwindung	Von der Selbst-Ueberwindung
Z III Heimkehr	Die Heimkehr
Z III Schwere	Vom Geist der Schwere
Z III Tafeln	Von alten und neuen Tafeln

## Abbreviations of Works by Georg Christoph Lichtenberg

All quotations from Lichtenberg's *Waste Books* (Sudelbücher) are from Georg Christoph Lichtenberg, *Schriften und Briefe*. Edited by Wolfgang Promies. 3 vols. Munich: Carl Hanser, 1980. Passages are identified by the abbreviation "Sudel-", followed by a letter and a number indicating notebook and passage respectively, e.g., Sudel-F 1219. Notebooks A through L (except G) appear in Volume I. Passages from Sudel-G and those marked with the subscript <sub>II</sub> appear in volume II. All English translations are my own.

# Timeline of Key Publications Discussed and their Publishers

7 May 1878	<i>Menschliches, Allzumenschliches. Ein Buch für freie Geister</i> (Human, All Too Human. A Book for Free Spirits); published by Ernst Schmeitzner, Chemnitz.
20 March 1879	<i>Menschliches, Allzumenschliches. Ein Buch für freie Geister. Anhang: Vermischte Meinungen und Sprüche</i> (Human All Too Human. A Book for Free Spirits. Supplement: Assorted Opinions and Maxims); Schmeitzner, Chemnitz.
18 December 1879	<i>Der Wanderer und sein Schatten</i> (The Wanderer and his Shadow); Schmeitzner, Chemnitz.
Late July 1881	<i>Morgenröte. Gedanken über die moralischen Vorurtheile</i> (Daybreak. Thoughts on Moral Prejudices); Schmeitzner, Chemnitz.
10 September 1882	<i>Die fröhliche Wissenschaft</i> (The Gay Science, Books I–IV); Schmeitzner, Chemnitz.
End of August 1883	<i>Also sprach Zarathustra. Ein Buch für Alle und Keinen</i> (Thus Spoke Zarathustra. A Book for All and None); Schmeitzner, Chemnitz.
Late 1883/early 1884	<i>Also sprach Zarathustra. Ein Buch für Alle und Keinen</i> , 2; Schmeitzner, Chemnitz.
10 April 1884	<i>Also sprach Zarathustra. Ein Buch für Alle und Keinen</i> , 3; Schmeitzner, Chemnitz.
Early May 1885	<i>Also sprach Zarathustra. Ein Buch für Alle und Keinen. Vierter und letzter Theil</i> (Fourth and Final Part); printed by C. G. Naumann, Leipzig.
4 August 1886	<i>Jenseits von Gut und Böse. Vorspiel einer Philosophie der Zukunft</i> (Beyond Good and Evil. Prelude to a Philosophy of the Future); C. G. Naumann, Leipzig.
31 October 1886	<i>Die Geburt der Tragödie. Oder: Griechenthum und Pessimismus. Neue Ausgabe mit dem Versuch einer Selbstkritik</i> (The Birth of Tragedy. New Edition with the Attempt at a Self-Criticism); printed by E. W. Fritzsche, Leipzig.
31 October 1886	<i>Menschliches, Allzumenschliches. Ein Buch für freie Geister. Erster Band. Neue Ausgabe mit einer einführenden Vorrede</i> (Human, All Too Human. A Book for Free Spirits. First Volume. New Edition with an Introductory Preface); Fritzsche, Leipzig.
31 October 1886	<i>Menschliches, Allzumenschliches. Ein Buch für freie Geister. Zweiter Band. Neue Ausgabe mit einer einführenden Vorrede</i> (Human, All Too Human. A Book for Free Spirits. Second Volume. New Edition with an Introductory Preface); Fritzsche, Leipzig. NB: volume comprised of VM and WS.

Late 1886	<i>Also sprach Zarathustra. Ein Buch für Alle und Keinen. In drei Theilen</i> (Thus Spoke Zarathustra. A Book for All and None. In Three Parts); Fritzsche, Leipzig.
24 June 1887	<i>Morgenröte. Gedanken über die moralischen Vorurtheile. Neue Ausgabe mit einer einführenden Vorrede</i> (Daybreak. Thoughts on Moral Prejudices. New Edition with an Introductory Preface); Fritzsche, Leipzig.
24 June 1887	<i>Die fröhliche Wissenschaft. Neue Ausgabe mit einem Anhang: Lieder des Prinzen Vogelfrei</i> (The Gay Science. New Edition with a Supplement: The Songs of Prince Vogelfrei); Fritzsche, Leipzig. NB: this edition includes Books I–V.
16 November 1887	<i>Zur Genealogie der Moral. Eine Streitschrift</i> (On the Genealogy of Morality. A Polemic); C. G. Naumann, Leipzig. <sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> For a more comprehensive account of Nietzsche's publication history, see Schaberg, *The Nietzsche Canon*, which serves as the immediate source for this timeline.



## Introduction. The Challenge

In 1878 Nietzsche published his first collection of aphorisms, *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches* (Human, All Too Human). Years later he would portray this event as a challenge, claiming that he sent two copies to Richard Wagner at the same moment that Wagner was sending him the libretto for his own most recent project, *Parsifal*. According to Nietzsche's account, when the two texts crossed in the mail he heard an ominous sound: "Did it not sound as if two swords had crossed?" (EH HH 2; BWN 744).<sup>1</sup> Though this event may not have unfolded exactly as Nietzsche so dramatically depicts it in *Ecce homo* (he actually received his copy of *Parsifal* several months before *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches* appeared<sup>2</sup>), nevertheless conceptual swords did cross, and once they had, there would be no reconciliation between the philosopher and his former idol. A new phase of Nietzsche's career had begun. A cold scientific tone replaced the heated rhetoric of his earlier writings, a tone matched with a new scientific approach that contrasted the Wagnerian romanticism of those earlier works.

But *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches* presents a challenge to more than Wagner. Its aphoristic structure can be seen as a formal challenge to the dominant mode of *Systemphilosophie*. In presenting his philosophy in aphorisms, Nietzsche refused to subject his own views to the formal constraints imposed by systematic discourse. The aphorism collection, one might say, is a formal manifestation of Nietzsche's later vow in *Götzen-Dämmerung* (Twilight of the Idols, 1888) to "mistrust all systematizers and [...] avoid them" on the grounds that the "will to a system is a lack of integrity" (TI Maxims 26; PN 470).<sup>3</sup> The aphoristic volumes deliberately shun the formal conventions of academic writing, forgoing sustained argumentation in favor of an array of isolated texts ranging in length from a single sentence to several pages. Though numbered consecutively and at times loosely organized into thematic sections, the aphorism books of Nietzsche's so-called Middle Period, which include not only *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches*, but also *Vermischte Meinungen und Sprüche* (Assorted Opinions and Maxims, 1879), *Der Wanderer und sein Schatten* (The Wanderer and His Shadow, 1879), *Morgenröte* (Daybreak, 1881), and *Die fröhliche Wissenschaft* (The Gay Science, 1882), often come across as *dissecta membra* collected together without any necessary order. Erecting no edifice of sober argumentation leading to a unified conclusion, but instead providing a compilation of discrete statements that the reader must interpret and assemble without any assurance of eventual resolution, Nietzsche's aphorism collections openly challenged the formal conventions of the systematic philosophical treatise. "I don't write treatises," he

---

1 "Diese Kreuzung der zwei Bücher – mir war's, als ob ich einen ominösen Ton dabei hörte. Klang es nicht, als ob sich Degen kreuzten?" (EH MAM 2; KSA 6:327)

2 Nietzsche received Wagner's libretto to *Parsifal* in January; *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches* did not appear until May of 1878; see Schaberg, *The Nietzsche Canon*, 58.

3 "Ich misstraue allen Systematikern und gehe ihnen aus dem Weg. Der Wille zum System ist ein Mangel an Rechtschaffenheit" (GD Sprüche 26; KSA 6:63).

would write in a note from 1885; “they’re for jack-asses and magazine-readers.”<sup>4</sup> Instead, he offered *Aphorismenbücher* – books of aphorisms.

Yet even as *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches* presented a challenge to Wagner and to the conventions of philosophical method, its aphoristic form also poses a significant challenge for Nietzsche’s reader. The author later conceded in the preface to *Zur Genealogie der Moral* (On the Genealogy of Morals, 1887) that “the aphoristic form causes difficulty” (die aphoristische Form [macht] Schwierigkeit; GM Preface 8; GM Vorrede 8). With interconnections by and large withheld, contextual orientation is suspended, denying the reader even the pretense of the argumentative coherence and demonstrated development that characterizes more conventional academic and philosophical writing. Such a structure thwarts hermeneutic habit, unleashing a cascade of questions: What kind of text is this? What leads Nietzsche to write this way? How do these discrete statements fit together? How are they to be navigated? Does it matter where we start? What exactly are we supposed to do with such texts? The more one reflects on the form, the more the questions proliferate. Without recourse to the standards and expectations of academic convention, the reader must develop new rules of engagement to approach these works. Nietzsche acknowledged that the aphoristic form causes difficulty, but the difficulty, he contended, derives from the fact “that this form is *not taken seriously enough*” (dass man diese Form nicht schwer genug nimmt; GM Preface 8; GM Vorrede 8). The current study aims to remedy this situation, not only by itself taking the form seriously, but by investigating exactly why Nietzsche did, and what it means to do so.

The years since Nietzsche decried this neglect have done little to improve the treatment of the aphorism in Nietzsche scholarship. There are remarkably few book-length studies dedicated primarily to the works of Nietzsche’s Middle Period at all, for scholars tend to read these works in isolated excerpts or simply as forerunners of Nietzsche’s more mature philosophy.<sup>5</sup> Though there are notable exceptions,<sup>6</sup> these too invariably manage to circumscribe the issue of the aphoristic form rather than address it directly. There are those who openly disregard the aphorism, seeing it as a notion applicable only to a very narrow selection of Nietzsche’s writings, despite the emphasis he

---

4 “Abhandlungen schreibe ich nicht: die sind für Esel und Zeitschriften-Leser” (NL 37[5], 1885; KSA 11:579).

5 Though the subtitle of Strobel, *Das Pathos der Distanz* (namely “Nietzsche’s Decision in Favor of the Aphoristic Style”) suggests that the study would address Nietzsche’s initial turn to the aphorism, it focuses primarily on those works produced after *Also sprach Zarathustra*, particularly *Jenseits von Gut und Böse*, devoting only eight pages to a work associated with the Middle Period (and that is the fourth book of *Die fröhliche Wissenschaft*, i.e., a book on the cusp of Nietzsche’s mature philosophy).

6 Most recently Franco, *Nietzsche’s Enlightenment*; also Abbey, *Nietzsche’s Middle Period*. A few studies focus on a single work from the period, for example Cohen, *Science, Culture, and Free Spirits*; Higgins, *Comic Relief*. Others have an even narrower focus, for instance Heller, *Von den ersten und letzten Dingen*; and the philosophical complement to Heller’s study, Claesges, *Der maskierte Gedanke*.

placed on the form.<sup>7</sup> They contend that the term *Aphorismus* applies only to a very restricted subset of Nietzsche's works, and thus the generic designation is proportionally restricted. Such an understanding is inconsistent both with Nietzsche's use of the term and with the tradition of aphoristic writing in which he participates. In order to clear up this common misunderstanding, the current study begins with an examination of the genre of the aphorism itself. Part One, "Nietzsche and the German Aphoristic Tradition," argues for a broader understanding of the genre *Aphorismus*. The genre encompasses a variety of forms, and this formal diversity itself constitutes an integral part of the German aphoristic tradition's critical stance vis-à-vis systematic discourse. Not all of Nietzsche's aphorisms enjoy the pithy concision of the well-turned *Sentenz* (maxim), but their formal multifariousness and their excess of forms constitute a crucial moment of critique that aligns his aphorism collections felicitously with the larger tradition of aphoristic writing in German letters.

Part Two, "The Turn to the Aphorism," illuminates Nietzsche's initial conversion to aphoristic writing in *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches*. As a form often situated at the crossroads of literature and philosophy, the aphorism seems particularly suitable for a writer whose works straddle these two disciplines. But Nietzsche's turn to the form coincides with his burgeoning interest in the methods of the natural sciences. This too is in keeping with the German aphoristic tradition, though the form's more prominent association with literature and philosophy has long overshadowed this aspect. The German aphorism's origin in the natural sciences, I argue, is crucial for Nietzsche's turn to aphoristic writing in *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches*. Yet Nietzsche bends the form to suit his own purposes, and as his philosophy develops, the aphorism collection becomes a formal correlate to the Death of God, confronting his reader not only with the freedoms enabled by his developing philosophy, but also with the danger of chaos and nihilism that is its potential legacy.

Augmenting both the freedom and the danger of the aphorism collection is the fact that the author himself is not univocal in his account of the form or in the approaches he prescribes. Some readers gloss over the formal challenge by simply assuming there to be a coherence behind the aphoristic works, regardless of how the structure of the works may resist such a reading.<sup>8</sup> Even Franco's exemplary study devotes very little space to justifying such a methodology, citing Nietzsche's appeal in the preface to *Morgenröte* that one read him slowly and deliberately, "looking fore and aft" (*rück- und vorsichtig*)<sup>9</sup>; Franco reads this as an invitation to seek out a coherent philosophy from behind the disjointed texts of the *Freigeist*-trilogy.<sup>10</sup> Franco is

---

<sup>7</sup> This position also emerges in one of the more recent studies dedicated specifically to the aphorism in Nietzsche's writing: Marsden, *Nietzsche and the Art of the Aphorism*.

<sup>8</sup> Kaufmann promoted such an approach; Franco is its most recent and perhaps most compelling advocate.

<sup>9</sup> D Preface 5; M Vorrede 5; KSA 3:17.

<sup>10</sup> NB: *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches* alone actually consists of three books, including *Vermischte Meinungen und Sprüche* (Assorted Opinions and Maxims, 1879) and *Der Wanderer und sein Schatten*

not alone in this assumption.<sup>11</sup> But to assume such coherence is to assume a lot. Even if one agrees with Franco's take on the preface to *Morgenröte*, one must not forget that this preface was prefixed to the collection in 1887, that is, several years after the volume's initial publication in 1881. And the intervening years were pivotal for Nietzsche's development. Though Nietzsche's perhaps most notorious declaration – that God is dead – first appeared in the original edition of *Die fröhliche Wissenschaft* (GS 108; FW 108), the aphorism collections of the *Freigeist*-trilogy largely lack the key concepts that underlie Nietzsche's mature philosophy: particularly the will to power and the eternal recurrence of the same.<sup>12</sup> Only with the publication of *Also sprach Zarathustra* (Thus Spoke Zarathustra, 1883–1885) did these terms emerge as gravitational centers of Nietzsche's writings. The aphorism collections, lacking clear argumentative structure, are particularly susceptible to such gravitational shifts.

While scholars have frequently noted the lack of apparent order in the aphorism books,<sup>13</sup> there are those who recognize a change after *Also sprach Zarathustra*. Eva Strobel, for instance, notes that the aphorism collections published after *Zarathustra*, namely Book V of *Die fröhliche Wissenschaft* and *Jenseits von Gut und Böse* (Beyond Good and Evil), are more coherent and refined.<sup>14</sup> Likewise Werner Stegmaier's comprehensive study of Book V of *Die fröhliche Wissenschaft* argues that while there may be little structure to Books I–IV,<sup>15</sup> in Book V Nietzsche allows himself no digressions or trivialities; here his art of the aphorism achieves full maturity.<sup>16</sup> This is also the time when Nietzsche would provide his most lucid and sustained discussions of aphoristic writing. After the publication of *Also sprach Zarathustra* Nietzsche developed guidelines for reading the *Freigeist*-trilogy that reflected the emerging coalescence of his thought, returning to his earlier aphoristic works and supplementing

---

(The Wanderer and his Shadow, 1880), but because Nietzsche describes these latter two as supplements to *Menschliches* (and indeed, Nietzsche would later combine them under the title, *Menschliches, Allzumenschliches II*), Franco treats them as a single work.

**11** Peter Heller, for instance, sets out to demonstrate the unity of Nietzsche's works, even if it is "the unity of dynamic antithesis" (Heller, *Von den ersten und letzten Dingen*, xi–xii); despite Heller's insistence on unity, his formulation nevertheless smacks of what Werner Stegmaier has recently criticized as the "dogma of ambivalence and contradictoriness" pervasive in Nietzsche scholarship; see Stegmaier, *Nietzsches Befreiung der Philosophie*, 77. Stegmaier himself operates on the hermeneutic principle that contradictions are not in Nietzsche's text, but result from interpretation, and the interpreter should seek to neutralize such contradictions along with ambivalences (Stegmaier, *Nietzsches Befreiung der Philosophie*, 86). Like Franco, Stegmaier gives Nietzsche the benefit of the doubt with regard to the coherence of his at times formally disjointed philosophy.

**12** The eternal recurrence of the same does make a brief appearance in the penultimate passage of *Die fröhliche Wissenschaft*'s first edition (GS 341; FW 341), but the volume does not develop the concept explicitly.

**13** Most famously by Danto, Nietzsche as Philosopher; but even Richard Schacht has described Nietzsche's works as an "assemblage of ... rather loosely connected notes" (Schacht, Nietzsche, xi).

**14** Strobel, *Das Pathos der Distanz*, 163.

**15** Stegmaier, *Nietzsches Befreiung der Philosophie*, 85, fn. 148.

**16** Stegmaier, *Nietzsches Befreiung der Philosophie*, 61.