

Cityscaping

Philologus

Zeitschrift für antike Literatur und ihre Rezeption /
A Journal for Ancient Literature and its Reception

Supplemente / Supplementary Volumes

Herausgegeben von / Edited by
Markus Asper, Sabine Föllinger, Therese Fuhrer,
Christof Rapp, Katharina Volk

Volume 3

Cityscaping



Constructing and Modelling Images of the City

Edited by

Therese Fuhrer, Felix Mundt, Jan Stenger

DE GRUYTER

ISBN 978-3-11-037682-1

e-ISBN (PDF) 978-3-11-040096-0

e-ISBN (EPUB) 978-3-11-040114-1

ISSN 2199-0255

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

A CIP catalog record for this book has been applied for at the Library of Congress.

Bibliographic Information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.dnb.de>.

© 2015 Walter de Gruyter GmbH, Berlin/Boston

Typesetting: Meta Systems Publishing & Printservices GmbH, Wustermark

Printing and binding: Hubert & Co. GmbH & Co. KG, Göttingen

☼ Printed on acid-free paper

Printed in Germany

www.degruyter.com

Preface

The papers collected in this volume are based on oral versions delivered at the conference ‘Cityscaping – Constructing and Modelling Images of the City in Literature, Film and Art’, held at Dahlem, Berlin, on 4–6 October 2012. For the generous financial support of this conference we thank the Berlin *Exzellenz-cluster* 264 ‘Topoi’. Dr. Henrike Simon supported us in all formal and practical aspects of the organisation of the conference. In the editorial preparation of the papers for publication we were greatly assisted by Maria Matei Rastel, Zippora Hintner (LMU Munich) and Yannick Spies (HU Berlin). We also thank Angelika Hermann of De Gruyter for assisting us in the production phase of this volume. Yannick Spies also took on the task of compiling the index. Translation of the introduction into English and editorial care of the English-language contributions were provided by Orla Mulholland.

Munich / Berlin / Glasgow, January 2015

Therese Fuhrer
Felix Mundt
Jan Stenger

Contents

Therese Fuhrer, Felix Mundt and Jan Stenger

Introduction — 1

Damien Nelis

Vergilian Cities

Visions of Troy, Carthage and Rome — 19

Alison Keith

Cityscaping in Propertius and the Elegists — 47

Manuel Royo

Triumphal Milestones

The *equus maximus in foro* and the Domitianic Project on the Palatine Hill — 61

Therese Fuhrer

„In jeder Stadt steckt ein großer Roman“

Hypata – eine erzählte Stadt in Apuleius’ *Metamorphosen* — 87

Lydia Krollpfeifer

Die Imagination der Stadt Rom bei Claudian

Weibliche Allegorie und Herrscherlob — 109

Jan R. Stenger

The Soul and the City

John Chrysostom’s Modelling of Urban Space — 133

Maximilian Benz

Kartâgô in Heinrichs von Veldeke *Eneasroman* — 155

Felix Mundt

Der Mensch, das Licht und die Stadt

Rhetorische Theorie und Praxis antiker und humanistischer Städtebeschreibung — 179

Catharine Edwards

Edward Gibbon and the City of Rome — 207

Christian Rivoletti

Spiel mit der Tradition und Darstellung der Gegenwart in *Le città invisibili* von Italo Calvino — 227

Katrin Dennerlein

Die erzählte Wahrnehmung der Großstadt im Kontext des modernen epischen Erzählens

Zum doppelten Beginn von Alfred Döblins *Berlin Alexanderplatz* — 247

Margrit Tröhler

Städtische Ikonographien, narrative Räume und filmische Geschichtsbilder in *Gladiator* und *Rome* — 281

List of figures — 309

Index — 311

Introduction

1 What is ‘cityscaping’?

‘Cityscaping’ – a verbalised form of ‘cityscape’, i.e. urban landscape – is the process through which an image of a city or an urban landscape is imaginatively constructed. An aesthetically ambitious design need not imitate reality, but may construct a city according to its own intentions and ideas.¹ In representations in literature, film or on the stage, this means that the city can be given such buildings, streets, squares, institutions, people, plants, and so on, as are of significance for the play, film or text, and which in a narrative or a drama – but also in an epic or lyric poem, a speech or a documentary text – have a function and (are intended to) play a role. This ‘scenography’ of a cityscape may be selective, as only a few elements may be needed to create the literary backdrop to an action or to situate some particular content: a city square or street scene, a single building, a church, a theatre or a combination of single objects. What is decisive is that the choice of elements serve the intentions and goals pursued in the text.²

In all textual genres these kinds of literary ‘city foundations’ have a relation to material reality that is multi-layered and frequently full of tensions. They often attract no special attention because they are used merely to provide a local setting in a narrative context. Someone who picks up an ancient historical work or a romantic novel is generally not looking for information about cities. Yet authors cannot omit to mention historical or fictive cityscapes, for otherwise the action would be left hanging in empty space. These techniques of constructing cities create the mere ‘effect of the real’, in Roland Barthes’ phrase, while the recipient does not notice its character as a construct.³ For example, the readers of Chariton’s novel *Callirhoe* may have accepted without reflection that the action takes place in Syracuse or Miletus, two locations with the characteristics of an ancient polis.⁴

1 The mechanisms and capacities of such a “production de l’espace” were first described by Henri Lefebvre (1974).

2 Cf. the study by Keith (in this volume) of the Rome of love elegy.

3 On the *effet de réel*, Barthes (1994).

4 See Connors (2002).

The result of these constructions is often like a fragment of a city-image, but in the process of reception such fragments can be completed by the recipients' own knowledge of urban structures – which differ with every cultural context – and by other elements, especially those permitted by the imaginative potential of the media in which they are designed. A space may also be produced for a short period only, for the duration of a particular event in a narrative or film scene; it may thus be ephemeral or occasional or just fictional. Yet even when the concept of space is dematerialised in this way, the spaces may still be linked to specific places, for example if they are localised in cities that can be identified by a toponym or by specific buildings, streets or squares or by historical events or figures. Constructions of known, and hence specific, city spaces in any media, and even the modelling of fictive cities, will only function if their elements or – to use an apt metaphor – their 'building blocks' exhibit some measure of referentiality to reality.⁵

Urban spaces as staged in the media of literature and film are often in themselves unspectacular and only take on significance when, through their presentation in literature and their 'performance' in film, they are inscribed with particular facts, narratives, experiences and emotions. City spaces staged in literature and film, with their ascriptions of meaning and significance, may then even re-model known city images, as has been demonstrated for a number of German cities in relation to the television series *Tatort*.⁶

The term 'cityscaping' is used less in urban studies⁷ than in the art scene and, especially, in image studies.⁸ There the term is linked to the idea that no image can adequately comprehend the whole of a city with its buildings, people and the events occurring in it, but also that a comprehensive documentary representation of the phenomenon 'city' would be of little interest; the object of aesthetically ambitious images and artefacts should instead be individual

5 Cf. on this Rose (2012) 42, who wishes to give more weight to 'place' as a category again, because through the specific information, the georeference, a text or, in this case, a narrative gains a reality-content that can be deployed within the fictional action; with Lusin (2007) 17–19 one could also talk of a "sekundäre Modellierung".

6 Cf. Griem / Scholz (2010): *Tatort* ('crime scene') is a long-running police detective series on German national television, with episodes set in different German cities.

7 Following Kevin Lynch's *Image of the City* (1960) [or *Stadtbild* (Lynch 2010)], this primarily concerns planning and design and, consequently, the perception and effect on viewing; cf. Wagner (2008) and Seifert (2011). Even when a city's "Eigendynamik" is discussed, it is the city as already built that is meant (cf. e.g. Löw / Steets / Stötzer 2007).

8 Translator's note: In the German-speaking world *Bildwissenschaft*, or the science of the image, is an academic discipline related to, but independent of, the scientific study of art (*Kunstwissenschaft*) and of media (*Medienwissenschaft*). See e.g. Bredekamp (2003).

spaces and significant objects, or perception from a restricted spatial perspective, which can communicate a particular message or feeling and may often imply values specific to a particular group or section of society. Key to this is the definition on which recent spatial research is based, viz. that a space is not primarily or necessarily to be understood as a material container, but must first be constructed by “intellectual, communicative and symbolic action and activity” and by interaction between agents.⁹

Further, for the most part all that is used is a selection of urban ‘props’, or reductions. This type of restricted perspective is not just aesthetically more interesting,¹⁰ but also corresponds to what is in reality possible to perceive: the movements, actions and communications of individuals in the urban space they use, and their reactions to events in the city, can only ever be a part of the whole. This partial nature of perception and of the radius of action may or must be found wanting if the goal is to reconstruct an urban space as a whole, as was indeed long the goal of classical scholars’ study of cities: the reconstructions of city plans and models, street layouts and resource networks are testimony to this. In contrast, a focus on partial urban spaces – as it were, ‘fragments’ of a city – and the events, whether documented or staged, that occur in them is interesting precisely because it corresponds to the mode of perception of individuals and groups living in a city. These persons and groups do participate in the larger area of the city, but they each experience, use, functionalise and shape no more than a ‘space within a space’. The question of how ‘city space’ is perceived, described, functionalised and connoted in pre-modern literatures and cultures will thus become all the more productive if it takes into consideration excerpts, as well as anonymous places or even merely mental ‘spaces’, though still within a space marked as urban and perhaps in an identifiable, specific city.

2 How does ‘cityscaping’ work?

To evoke an urban space in literature all that is needed, essentially, is to name one of the five elements postulated by Kevin Lynch as constitutive of the men-

⁹ Thus Rogge (2008) 10: “geistiges, kommunikatives und symbolisches Handeln und Tätigsein”.

¹⁰ As example we may take the cover image of the US weekly *The New Yorker* of March 29 1976 by Saul Steinberg and graphics designed on its model: it shows the view along a street in New York City (or, in the subsequent imitations, of any other city), from which a view opens of the wider suburban area, of the country and finally the ‘rest of the world’.

tal image of a city (paths, edges, nodes, landmarks, districts)¹¹ as the starting point, or *origo*,¹² of a topological reference system, then to give it shape and depth by means of other expressions with spatial reference, and finally to position actions and figures in this space. Everything else is left to the imagination of the recipient, who will create a personal mental image by drawing on his own lived experience of spaces that are the same or similar to those evoked in the text.¹³ Yet already in the ancient world refined techniques had been developed to guide the reader's inner eye. Both Greek and Roman orators delivered richly detailed descriptions of real cities such as Athens, Rome or Antioch in order to set a mental image of the urban landscape before the eyes of the audience assembled at a ceremonial event. The preferred rhetorical tool for this was the technique of *ecphrasis*, by which the authors pictured in words topography, buildings, streets and city squares in vivid, concrete detail.¹⁴ The rules of *ecphrasis* developed by the rhetors of the early Empire and late antiquity are essentially the same for (urban) spaces as for people or objects. Descriptive passages are to be distinguished by a high degree of vividness (*enargeia*), which is achieved through abundant detail and frequent use of terms from the semantic fields of vision and light. *Ecphrasis*, further, is a *logos perihēgematikos*, a speech in which a 'generic wanderer'¹⁵ – the intradiegetic avatar of Dennerlein's model reader – is conducted around the location like a camera. A point of view is created either by a figure who serves as focaliser or through more general formulations (an example: "For one who approaches the city from the north, the temple of Athene arises on the right-hand side."). To permit the quickest possible orientation for a reader unfamiliar with the city described, the structure of the city is compared to something well known, such as a shield or the human body.¹⁶ At the same time this gives the author the

11 These five constitutive elements of urban space, as proposed by Lynch in 1960, have had an enduring influence on modern urban studies. Nonetheless, they are no more than a plausible hypothesis, cf. Seifert (2011) 46. On applications of Lynch's theory in literary studies and linguistics, see Dennerlein (2009) 190–1.

12 On this term cf. Dennerlein (2009) 131.

13 To set aside these subjective components as far as possible and yet retain the reader function indispensable for every textual analysis, the literary scholar must draw on the abstract construct of a model reader: thus Dennerlein (2009) 90 after Fotis Jannidis.

14 On ancient *ecphrasis* see Fowler (1991) and Webb (2009).

15 "Generischer Wanderer" is the terminology proposed by Schweinfurth (2005) 49.

16 In the city-as-body metaphor, architectural theory and *ecphrastic* rhetoric meet. This is of more importance for the major theorists of architecture of the Renaissance, viz. Leon Battista Alberti, Francesco di Giorgio Martini and Antonio Filarete, than it was in antiquity: see Sennett (1994); Tiller (2005).

opportunity to embed in the reader's mental image whatever it is that he wants to communicate through his text.

Nonetheless the strongest distillation of a city into a symbol is its personification. A female city divinity such as the Dea Roma may be portrayed on coins or sculptures, but may also be integrated into the space of action in a panegyric-epic narrative, as we find for example in Claudian.¹⁷ Through this, the geographical entity 'Rome', together with the complex web of connotations commonly glossed as 'the idea of Rome', breaks free from its geographical site and is concentrated into a figure and so is able to travel abroad and interact with historical and mythical figures.

A literary text, due to its linear character, can only convey spatial impressions, such as an ensemble of buildings, in temporal sequence, whereas the medium of film can convey to the viewer even very complex constellations at a single glance. Yet because film, unlike painting, shares with literature the quality of developing over time, some analytical concepts can be applied to both media. An example is offered by the 'phantom rides', an early form of quasi-documentary capture of the reality of urban life.¹⁸ In these films the camera was attached to the engine of a train or tram in order to show the viewer the centre of a city or the entry into a station from a central, privileged point of view, which was not available in this form even to the driver of the tram or train. The name, coined for this genre of film, assumes a focaliser that is as if disembodied and not derived from a human subject, and hence a 'phantom'.¹⁹ There is an affinity here with the literary term, already mentioned, of the 'generic wanderer' in periegetic ecphrasis. In both the literary ecphrasis and the cinematic camera-journey through a city, there is more than just a wish to entertain the audience: there is always also a sense of proud affirmation of (literary or cinematic) artistry and of the significance of the city being shown.

¹⁷ On the terminology and the distinction between the forms of city god and city personification from the point of view of archaeology and art history, see Meyer (2006) 5–8; on Dea Roma Hommel (1942/1993); Bühl (1995) and Roberts (2001). On Claudian's personified Rome see Krollpfeifer (this volume).

¹⁸ Interesting examples which can be viewed at no cost online are *View from an Engine Front – Barnstaple*, Warwick Trading Co. 1898; *Electric Tram Rides from Forster Square Bradford*, Mitchell & Kenyon 1902 and *A Trip Down Market Street (San Francisco)*, Miles Brothers 1906.

¹⁹ Cf. Keiller (2007) 75.

3 Cityscaping and the reference to ‘reality’

The representation of an urban space in any medium will never offer an exact mirror of reality. Louis-Sébastien Mercier’s *Tableau de Paris*, a foundational text in the modern literature of city description, is only apparently an objective inventorialisation of life in pre-revolutionary Paris, and even the *vues* of the Lumière brothers, which give the impression that they simply capture 50 seconds of everyday, spontaneous activity in a railway station or public square, on closer analysis reveal traces of conscious staging.²⁰

When presenting space the artificiality of the medium is more obvious in literature than in film. Texts can never create an illusion of spatial reality like those of painting or film, nor do they aim to do so. Even in very minute accounts, the number of spatial elements chosen is still too small and even the most detailed writers must surrender to the reader too much power over their images.

In antiquity, the most prominent form of literary evocation of urban spaces was the genre of city panegyric, but the textual creation of urban spaces was not limited to this typical genre and could be integrated into other literary forms. Already in the Homeric epics the description of the Shield and the depiction of the Phaeacian city of Scheria provided models.²¹ Historiography and various forms of oratory presented portraits of the city of Athens and philosophical literature offered passages that sketch this central site of the Greek world, in Plato’s dialogues and in Cicero’s works.²² The travel literature of a figure like Pausanias would also be unthinkable without ecphrastic description of cities. These descriptive texts and passages all raise the question of their referentiality, even if they may seem unproblematic at first glance. For, as noted above, no text, no matter how detailed, can ever capture and communicate the visual impression of an urban landscape accurately. Unavoidably, an author must settle for a narrow segment of the overall picture perceptible to the senses, and the examples given already reveal how strongly the choice of segment is determined by contextual and generic factors. As regards Athens, Demosthenes chose to concentrate on politically significant buildings and public

²⁰ Loiperdinger (2006) 382–385. Siegfried Kracauer (1960/1985) 58 saw these films as documents which in fact depict the world around us, and to no other end than representation for its own sake. The well known subtitle of his study, “The redemption of physical reality” thus even here applies only to a staged reality.

²¹ Hom. *Il.* 18,490–608 (the Shield of Achilles); *Od.* 6,7–14 and 7,1–45 (Scheria).

²² Cic. *fin.* 5,1–6. On the mental image of Athens drawn in the prose literature of the classical period, see Stenger (2013).

squares in his home town, Pausanias put sanctuaries and works of art centre stage, while Cicero conjured up a picture of Athens as a philosophical cosmos and thus primarily a place of ideas enclosed within material structures. Anyone who described a city was expressing an individual point of view and particular interests. Far from simply reflecting an urban space, poets, writers and orators were each summoning up quite different mental images of cities.

If we drop the expectation of a true-to-life ecphrasis of a city, we gain a sharper view of the many points where textual representations of real cities like Athens or Rome merge into primarily mental images of cities, connecting to the material space of the city only in particular points. Does Homer's Ithaca map onto the real polis of the island? To what degree is the Athens constructed by Thucydides' Pericles identical to the historical city of the classical era?²³ Not even the city description *par excellence*, the city panegyric, can be pinned down in its reference to reality, because it follows the rules and commonplaces of epideictic rhetoric and through this repetition of panegyric motifs it comes to refer primarily to the idea, or rather the ideal, of the city.²⁴ This involves an idealisation of the real city that is not simply invented but which deliberately elides its less admirable aspects. In this genre orators such as Aelius Aristides were primarily aiming to express an urban identity and reinforce the values of the civic community. The audience, familiar with the conventions of the genre, expected an idealisation of this kind and not a mimetic, accurate description. Equally, the criticism of cities in satire, such as Juvenal's satirical treatment of Rome, presented a reversal of the ideal which was just as conventional and exaggerated.²⁵

Already in Homer's description of the Shield of Achilles, the point of reference was not the reality of a city but the abstract idea of the polis. Mental images such as these do not exist in isolation from historical cities, but they reconfigure and rearrange the pieces of real cities in a new way in order to summon up in the recipients' minds a mental image of a city. Evander's excursion through the topography of early Rome in Vergil's *Aeneid* is the best known example for how elements of a real city – in this case Augustan Rome – become suffused with purely invented components, even when the setting is prior to

²³ Thuc. 2,35–46.

²⁴ Classen (1986). See also Mundt (this volume).

²⁵ Cf. on this Larmour (2007), who attempts to clarify Juvenal's emotionally and nihilistically coloured portrait of Rome (the "city-text" or "mapping of Rome") with, among other things, the concepts of the *lieu de mémoire* (after Pierre Nora), the prototypical *flâneur* (after Michel de Certeau), and *abjection* (after Julia Kristeva).

the foundation of the historical city.²⁶ The Roman readers of the epic would have been able to recognise in it constitutive elements of their own lived experience, such as the Ara Maxima and the Capitol, but here they could perceive them from an unexpected point of view. In this case one might speak of a creative mimesis, which uses to the full the creative potential of the design of images. Others went a step further, as literary ‘city founders’ who, explicitly or implicitly, intended their constructions as alternatives to the real city. With his *Republic* and Atlantis, Plato twice set the standard for alternative models of the city. In each case he imagined a utopian urban ideal, situated in a distant past in the case of Atlantis, and in a utopian Nowhereland in the case of Callipolis, yet these thought-experiments transparently refer by contrast to classical Athens. They both also illustrate how an author need not be referring primarily to a city’s material form, as Plato’s interest is rather in the political, ethical and social facets of urban life. The point of reference of these types of utopias thus does not have to be the idea of a city in the strict sense. Such utopias are often dreamed up with the primary goal of depicting a religious, social or political ideal, and this is just as true of literary city designs as of the constructions of reformers like Tommaso Campanella (*La città del Sole*, 1602) and the creators of built ideal cities like the papal city of Pienza (under Pius II, from 1459) and La Valletta, the centre of the Order of Malta (from 1566), in which a humanistic and a religious idea, respectively, is inscribed.²⁷ It is for good reason that, from Plato’s Atlantis onwards, these dreamed or built ideal cities often have a regular geometrical plan, so that even their layout materialises order, harmony and perfection.²⁸

While a reference to real cities is often inherent in utopias, despite their imaginary character, in literature, visual art and film we also encounter purely fictional cities, for example in the novel or in the fantastic urban landscapes of modern paintings. Another prominent example is the board game *Monopoly*, a world-wide success, which simply by street-names, a few institutions and abstracted representations of houses creates the image of a fully monetarised community – and thus an image of the world.²⁹ In their conception, these fictive cities may seem far removed from reality, but at times they in turn affect the real world, as the unexpected history of the reception of the city Hypata in Apuleius’ *Metamorphoses* impressively illustrates.³⁰ Italo Calvino’s *Città invisibili*

26 Verg. *Aen.* 8,102–369, esp. 306–65; cf. also his description of Carthage in 1,421–49. On this see Nelis (this volume).

27 Kruft (1989); Eaton (2002).

28 Plat. *Critias* 115c–16c.

29 See on this now Tönniesmann (2011).

30 See Fuhrer (this volume).

bili are abstract conceptions of the city translated into ecphrases and so might seem to be purely intellectual constructs, but through the tradition of the early modern utopia they are linked to classical topoi, which very likely drew on experience of real cities.³¹ In Claude-Nicolas Ledoux's saltworks-city of Arc-et-Senans in the French Jura Mountains, the dreamt ideal of a city and the built reality interpenetrate each other so fully that they can hardly be disentangled.³² The analysis of images of cities in different media must consequently try to trace precisely the interdependences between constructs and historical reality.

4 The generative potential of 'cityscaping'

Just as urban spaces shape their inhabitants' lived worlds and horizons of perception, they also stimulate the literature that treats or is written by the people who act within these spaces. A city in its lived reality offers its inhabitants an identity, a guiding cultural framework, personal recognition and social and economic living space, and so its name, and hence its identity (in the sense of identifiability), can be used in a narrative created in text or film to add specific connotations to scenes in an urban setting. Connotations like this play a prominent role in discussions about social and cultural identities conducted in texts or staged in film. Conversely, by their staging in media, known places – buildings, streets, city squares – can become new "points of reference in urban discourses of identity".³³ In this there may be an interplay between the paradigmatics of the connotations, which attach to the sites and spaces in cultural memory or literary practice, and the syntagmatics of the narrative, in which the denotations of sites and spaces – the names of cities, regions, countries – are charged with further connotations, which may in turn confirm the connotations of cultural memory or literary practice, or perhaps contest or explode them. A city that is defined by its historical identity can be given additional meanings or be re-semanticised entirely by becoming the scene of actions modelled in literature or film.³⁴ The importance of this process is shown by the fact

³¹ On this see Rivoletti (this volume).

³² Cf. Vidler (1990).

³³ "Bezugspunkte städtischer Identitätsdiskurse": Diefenbach (2007), quotation on pp. 314 and 315.

³⁴ The term semanticisation is here to be understood as a linguistic concept (cf. Nünning 2009, 45f.), and so not as the structuralist concept of spatial semantics developed by Juri M. Lotman (on this discussion cf. Dennerlein 2011, 164–165).

that it operates even in present-day cities, where we can check a media image against reality.³⁵

5 ‘Cityscaping’ in changing times and media

Although there is as yet no encyclopaedia of the representation of urban spaces in textual and visual media that would embrace all the eras and genres mentioned in this volume from a diachronic perspective, there is nonetheless a near-unmanageable profusion of monographs and collections that consider particular periods, media and genres.³⁶ The great majority of literary studies have concentrated on the roughly 150 years from the late eighteenth century to the eve of World War II, and so, roughly, from Louis Sébastien Mercier’s *Tableau de Paris* to Alfred Döblin’s *Berlin Alexanderplatz*. It is not mere coincidence that this is also the period of advancing industrialisation and urbanisation and, in parallel to that, of the novel’s establishment as the leading genre of modern literature. In film, too, the key experiments in integrating urban architecture into the formal language of the medium occur in the 1920s and ’30s.³⁷

The long period from the ancient world to the early modern period may seem to lack elements that are key to the special fascination of modern artistic representations of urban space: the contrast between the modern city, with its massive industrial and residential buildings, and villages and small towns is blunter than was the case in earlier periods, but, above all, the illusion of realism seems to be missing entirely from the earlier literature. Pre-modern authors strive never to lose control over the spatial elements mentioned in their text or over the focaliser and thus the reader, whereas a distinctive feature of modernism is to regard the surrender of that control as the goal of a successful literary ‘cityscaping’. Via the intermediary of the *flâneur* in the novel of the

35 Fröhlich (2007) has shown, with the help of detailed analyses of films set in Berlin and New York and numerous interviews with audiences, how cinematic images of cities shape the perception of urban space even by viewers who live there themselves.

36 One of the few publications with a very broad temporal and geographical sweep is Galle / Klingens-Protti (2005). A very cursory overview, but one that is well suited as an introduction, of the narrated city up to the 18th century – the book’s central focus is on the subsequent period – is given by Klotz (1969) 443–461.

37 Of the 24 films discussed in Neumann (1996) as milestones, 18 are from the period before the Second World War.

romantic period and the nineteenth century,³⁸ a figure who is permitted to wander through the space of 'his' text without fulfilling any other purpose than to show how every experience of space is subjective and fulfils an aesthetics for its own sake, the author of the twentieth-century urban novel surrenders to the logic of the city itself and is subsumed by it.³⁹ Thus for Rilke it was ultimately the city of Paris that took the initiative when writing *The Notebooks of Malte Laurids Brigge*,⁴⁰ and in Döblin's *Berlin Alexanderplatz* the points of view of the author and characters merge into the city as the city itself becomes an active player.⁴¹ The language appropriate to this representational intention is no longer the strict syntax of the classics.⁴² This open discrepancy between modern and pre-modern narration of the city has led to a situation in which every attempt to span the whole period from antiquity to the present day is reduced to the minimal consensus that what links all representations of the city in literature and art across different periods is that they reflect "people's ambivalence toward their own settlements and institutions".⁴³ Yet a diachronic

38 Cf. Zimmermann (2000), who understands the romantic phantasms of cities as poetic anticipations of scholarly conceptualisations of the paradoxes of modernity; Neumeyer (1999). A good description of the modern concept of the literary *flâneur* is given by v. d. Weppen (1995) 15–25.

39 Cf. Brüggemann (2002) 564.

40 In a letter to Tora Holmström dated 29 March 1907, Rilke writes (cited from Becker 1993, 77): „Sie [sc. the city of Paris] verwandelt, steigert und entwickelt einen fortwährend, sie nimmt einem leise die Werkzeuge aus der Hand, die man bisher benutzte, und ersetzt sie durch andere, unsäglich feinere und präzisiere und tut tausend unerwartete Dinge mit einem, wie eine Fee, die Lust daran hat, ein Wesen alle Gestalten annehmen zu sehen, deren Möglichkeiten in ihm verborgen sind. Man muß Paris, wenn man es zum erstenmal um sich hat, mehr wie ein Bad wirken lassen, ohne selbst zuviel dabei tun zu wollen, als zu fühlen und es sich geschehen zu lassen.“

41 Cf. Dennerlein (this volume). Brüggemann (2002) 564 speaks of the "Auflösung der Subjekte in räumlichen, umschließenden, dynamischen Konstellationen".

42 Cf. the programmatic polemic in Filippo Marinetti's *Manifesto tecnico della letteratura futurista* (May 11 1912): "In aeroplano, seduto sul cilindro della benzina, scaldato il ventre dalla testa dell'aviatore, io sentii l'inermità ridicola della vecchia sintassi ereditata da Omero. Bisogno furioso di liberare le parole, traendole fuori dalla prigione del periodo latino! Questo ha naturalmente, come ogni imbecille, una testa previdente un ventre, due gambe e due piedi piatti, ma non avrà mai due ali. Appena il necessario per camminare, per correre un momento e fermarsi quasi subito sbuffando! Ecco che cosa mi disse l'elica turbinante, mentre filavo a duecento metri sopra i possenti fumaiuoli di Milano." (Marinetti 1990, 46; cf. Becker 1993, 149). Although Döblin opposed his own "Döblinism" to Marinetti's futurism (cf. Dennerlein, this volume, p. 270), in this he was opposing Marinetti's dogmatism rather than the debate he had begun on the poetic language appropriate to the modern world.

43 "Ambivalenz der Menschen ihren eigenen Niederlassungen und Institutionen gegenüber": Daemrich (1995) 333.

survey of the city in literature, starting from the classical world, is nonetheless valuable. Basic concepts for representing and semanticising the city that were developed in antiquity have been transmitted through the Middle Ages and Renaissance into the modern period. The old contrast between ‘city’ and ‘country’, which Horace had expressed in *Satire* 2,6 in the famous fable of the town mouse and the country mouse, was deeply felt above all in the industrial era.⁴⁴ In the metaphor of the city as person (“Berlin is poor but sexy”), which is admittedly loaded with modern conceptions of eroticism and maternity,⁴⁵ there is still something of the personification of classical cities as a female goddess. The list could be extended.⁴⁶

We have already sketched, in relation to the issue of reference to reality, the complex reciprocal relations between creative designs of cities in various media and both real cities and mental images of cities. However, cityscapes designed in literature, fine arts and film also often take their cue from creations like themselves, developing them further or departing from the image they present. Even Plato’s imagined cities in the *Republic*, *Laws*, *Timaeus* and *Critias* do not exist in isolation from each other but, quite apart from their shared engagement with contemporary Athens, they also refer to each other and, in a sense, together form a philosophical dialogue on the possibility of ideal communities. In later times, one result of the practice and theory of city panegyric was that, by establishing a homogeneous tradition and a series of repetitions down to the modern period, all these rhetorically idealised cities allude to their predecessors to some degree or other. When studying these urban constructions from the perspective of literary or cultural studies, the theory of intertextuality offers an apt heuristic tool to trace such citations, allusions and transformations. The massive diachronic range of ‘cityscaping’ in fact makes it indispensable to keep in mind at all times the intertextual or dialogic dimension.⁴⁷

⁴⁴ On the history of this motif, cf. Williams (1973) 153–164.

⁴⁵ “Berlin ist arm, aber sexy,” according to its mayor Klaus Wowereit. On the city as woman, cf. Daemmrich (1995) 335; Weigel (1988). On the *Dea Roma* from the perspective of gender, see Krollpfeifer (this volume).

⁴⁶ Hnilica (2012) does not go into much detail, but is still useful as a first overview of common metaphors for the city (the city as house, animal, nature, machine, theatre, memory and work of art).

⁴⁷ This type of dialogical dimension, incidentally, plays a role not only for media that reflect urban space, but also for the architectural and decorative design of urban space itself, as shown by Royo (this volume) with the example of the *Colossus Neronis* and the *Equus Domitiani*. Cf. also, most recently, the contributions in Nelis/Royo (2014).

Here it is essential to distinguish references to individual texts from generic references. A grand design like Plato's Callipolis or Atlantis set off an avalanche, so to speak, inaugurating an uninterrupted series of similar utopias that engage with the Platonic model, sometimes explicitly but sometimes only between the lines. Cicero's *De re publica* picks up Plato's *Republic* unmistakably, but John Chrysostom's allegorical city in *On Vainglory* would also be unimaginable without the model set up by Plato's example, to which it makes clear reference;⁴⁸ similarly, Thomas More's *Utopia* of 1516 functions as a rival that takes Plato's version as a foil.⁴⁹ These creations draw their interest and specific message from their engagement, both imitative and critical, with the model. No less important, however, is the generic reference, especially when we bear in mind the conventionality of epideictic oratory. From the praise of Athens spoken by Thucydides' Pericles through the Athenian *epitaphioi* and Libanius' *Antiochicus* and on to modern text types such as the travel brochure, textual urban spaces have repeatedly drawn from the same stock of commonplaces and motifs, and so participate in the same generic ideal of the city. It is interesting to trace how, in this web of explicit or implicit intertextual genealogies, motifs and functions are picked up, transformed, adapted or critically undercut. The ideal reader or viewer is always expected to keep the model in mind while reading or watching, and to draw comparisons based on it.

A further dimension of intertextuality is achieved when authors and creators connect not to an identifiable model or generic pattern, but rather to an established idea of a city. Perhaps the most influential idea of a city is the Rome that was constructed, especially in the Augustan period, by poets and artists as well as by political figures.⁵⁰ Manifested in far more than just built structures, the idea of Rome represented a conglomerate of images, concepts and values that ultimately exceeds the bounds of a city. What Vergil, Horace, the Roman elegists or Aelius Aristides had built, later centuries could repeatedly read, restore and rebuild all over again.⁵¹ Depending on the intention in each case, individual components could be isolated or the whole idea could be picked up, for example to suggest historical continuity or create political

⁴⁸ See Stenger (this volume).

⁴⁹ More comments explicitly on Plato: the introductory six-line poem characterises Utopia as *civitatis aemula Platonicae* (More 1995, 18), and the letter of Peter Giles also makes the comparison with Plato explicit (ibid. 24).

⁵⁰ Paschoud (1967); Fuhrmann (1968); Kytzler (1993).

⁵¹ On the images of Rome of the Augustan poets, see Edwards (1996) and Döpp (2002), further Keith (this volume); on the city of Rome in literature from the ancient world to the present, see Rehm (1960); Patterson (1982); Gaillard (1995); Tripet (2006); specifically on urban topography as a symbol of the fall of the Roman empire in Edward Gibbon, cf. Edwards (this volume).

legitimation. In these processes it also sometimes happens that ideas of cities are reduced to mere handy labels, which can then, more or less arbitrarily, be applied to other cities. One may query what affinities really link the 'Athens on the Spree' of Berlin, or the 'Athens of the North', the Edinburgh of the Enlightenment, with the Greek capital, aside from architectural reminiscences; however there is no doubt that these two cities are attempting to use this intertextual reference to design their own identity and to fix an unmistakable brand in the public mind. These intertextual techniques of 'city branding' do not simply repeat a canonical pattern, but produce adaptations to their own era, transformations and re-semanticisations, which can change the way the model itself is viewed. In the light of the questions addressed in this volume, it is worth looking more closely to see which alterations occur through these intermedial processes. How does a change of medium affect the character of a mental image of a city? What is accentuated in film and painting as opposed to literary texts? Which new meanings are taken on by literary urban landscapes when they appear in a different guise?

If we are to study these dialogic phenomena, it makes sense to adopt a very broad understanding of the notion of 'text' inherent in the concept of intertextuality, in order to do justice to changes between media. It is not only texts in the literal sense, i.e. literary images of cities, that refer or allude to other textual designs. At times media that are closely related to literature, such as film, draw on literary cityscapes, as the film genre of the classical epic vividly illustrates. Examples are legion of feature films in which visualisations of Rome are based in part on the idea of Rome, in part on Rome as imagined in literature, and current television series such as *Rome* continue to build on these images of the Eternal City.⁵² Textual urban spaces may also have a continuing productive influence in quite different media. Thus the architects Karl Friedrich Schinkel and Leo von Klenze in the Romantic period created idealising paintings of ancient Athens against the background of the classical tradition, while at the same time attempting to recreate this ideal state through new proposals in urban planning.⁵³ Similarly, the urbanistic design of Léon Krier's

52 Tröhler (this volume) explores the feature film *Gladiator* and the television series *Rome* more closely.

53 We may mention Schinkel's painting *Blick in Griechenlands Blüte* of 1824/5 and Klenze's *Ideale Ansicht von Athen* (1846) as well as the designs by both architects for King Otto's city palace in Athens. See Vogt (1985) and von Buttlar (1999) 334–359 on Klenze's plans for Athens in 1834–1841; the programmatic image *Ideale Ansicht der Stadt Athen* is reproduced on p. 310 (Abb. 406).

postmodern Atlantis on Tenerife (1988) makes explicit reference to the tradition founded by Plato.⁵⁴

Helpful here is the concept of the palimpsest, which Gérard Genette has introduced into the debate.⁵⁵ Each text, each painting, each relief or film that represents an image of the city, overwrites, to a greater or lesser degree, the previous mental representations of the city, with the result that the urban space is like a parchment that has been written upon several times. As each new model is laid over the previous ones, though without obscuring them entirely, the image of the city becomes inscribed with different layers of time and different cultural preferences and meanings. The value of the term ‘palimpsest’ is that it reminds us of the structural depth of images of cities and the simultaneous presence of diverging elements.

As our final example of the transformation of urban images across times and media, let us consider Rome’s archrival, Carthage. It had already taken a long literary process to pass from the historical city with which in the third and second centuries BC the Romans had struggled for dominance over the Mediterranean, via the early Roman epic poets, to the picture of Dido’s city drawn by Vergil.⁵⁶ The Carthage of the medieval Eneas Romances is influenced by the ancient epic, but is nonetheless a literary space in its own right.⁵⁷ The image of Carthage in the Second Punic War as shown in the early classical epic film *Cabiria* (1914), one of the first ever feature-length monumental films, is shaped by a colonial view of contemporary north Africa. The Temple of Baal in Carthage, which in this film stands symbolically for the cruelty and barbarism of Italy’s old and new opponents, in turn became the model for the mechanical Moloch in Fritz Lang’s *Metropolis* (1927) and thus a symbol of the barbaric aspects of modern industrial society. Lang’s visual language is just as mesmerising for viewers unaware of this connection: each single instance of ‘cityscaping’ has a historical, an aesthetic and a semantic dimension, each of which also functions on its own. It is only by understanding their interdependence, a project to which the present volume hopes to contribute, that the city is revealed as a powerful symbol across the ages, as a precondition and object of literary and artistic production.

⁵⁴ See Schmidt (1988).

⁵⁵ Genette (1982).

⁵⁶ On the Carthage of the *Aeneid* and the cities of Vergil, see Nelis (this volume).

⁵⁷ Mölk (1980) 204 f. and 214 denies that the French Eneas Romance had a complex or conscious engagement with the urban space of Carthage within the economy of the romance, but Benz (this volume) is able to show that the German reworking by Heinrich von Veldeke goes beyond its model in this respect.

Bibliography

- Barthes (1994): Roland Barthes, "L'effet de réel", in: id., *Œuvres complètes*, vol. 2: 1966–1973, ed. É. Marty, Paris, 479–484. [first published in: *Communications* 11, 1968].
- Becker (1993): Sabina Becker, *Urbanität und Moderne. Studien zur Großstadt Wahrnehmung in der deutschen Literatur 1900–1930*, St. Ingbert.
- Bredenkamp (2003): Horst Bredenkamp, "A Neglected Tradition? Art History as *Bildwissenschaft*", *Critical Inquiry* 29/3, 418–428.
- Brüggemann (2002): Heinz Brüggemann, *Architekturen des Augenblicks. Raum-Bilder und Bild-Räume einer urbanen Moderne in Literatur, Kunst und Architektur des 20. Jahrhunderts*, Hannover.
- Bühl (1995): Gudrun Bühl, *Constantinopolis und Roma. Stadtpersonifikationen der Spätantike*, Zürich.
- von Buttlar (1999): Adrian von Buttlar, *Leo von Klenze. Leben, Werk, Vision*, München.
- Classen (1986): Carl Joachim Classen, *Die Stadt im Spiegel der ‚Descriptiones‘ und ‚Laudes urbium‘ in der antiken und mittelalterlichen Literatur bis zum Ende des zwölften Jahrhunderts*, 2nd edn., Hildesheim / New York.
- Connors (2002): Catherine Connors, "Chariton's Syracuse and its histories of empire", in: Michael Paschalis and Stavros Frangoulidis (eds.), *Space in the Ancient Novel* [Ancient Narrative, Suppl. 1], Groningen, 12–26.
- Daemmrich (1995): Horst S. and Ingrid Daemmrich, "Stadt", in: id., *Themen und Motive der Literatur. Ein Handbuch*, 2nd ed., Tübingen / Basel, 332–337.
- Dennerlein (2009): Katrin Dennerlein, *Narratologie des Raumes*, Berlin / New York.
- Dennerlein (2011): Katrin Dennerlein, "Raum", in: *Handbuch Erzählliteratur. Theorie, Analyse, Geschichte*, Stuttgart / Weimar, 158–165.
- Diefenbach (2007): Steffen Diefenbach, *Römische Erinnerungsräume: Heiligenmemoria und kollektive Identitäten im Rom des 3. bis 5. Jahrhunderts*, Berlin.
- Döpp (2002): Siegmund Döpp, "Das Rom der Dichter. Vergil, Horaz, Ovid", in: Werner Frick (ed.), *Orte der Literatur*, Göttingen, 29–49.
- Eaton (2002): Ruth Eaton, *Ideal Cities. Utopianism and the (Un)Built Environment*, London.
- Edwards (1996): Catharine Edwards, *Writing Rome. Textual Approaches to the City*, Cambridge.
- Fowler (1991): Don P. Fowler, "Narrate and Describe. The Problem of Ekphrasis", *JRS* 81, 25–35.
- Fröhlich (2007): Hellmut Fröhlich, *Das neue Bild der Stadt. Filmische Stadtbilder und alltägliche Raumvorstellungen im Dialog*, Stuttgart.
- Fuhrmann (1968): Manfred Fuhrmann, "Die Romidee in der Spätantike", *HZ* 207, 529–561.
- Gaillard (1995): Jacques Gaillard, *Rome, le temps, les choses*, Arles.
- Galle / Klingen-Protti (2005): Roland Galle and Johannes Klingen-Protti (eds.), *Städte der Literatur*, Heidelberg.
- Genette (1982): Gérard Genette, *Palimpsestes. La littérature au second degré*, Paris.
- Griem / Scholz (2010): Julika Griem and Sebastian Scholz, *Tatort Stadt. Mediale Topographien eines Fernsehklassikers*, Frankfurt a. M. / New York.
- Hnilica (2012): Sonja Hnilica, *Metaphern für die Stadt. Zur Bedeutung von Denkmodellen in der Architekturtheorie*, Bielefeld.
- Hommel (1942/1993): Hildebrecht Hommel, "Domina Roma", in: Kytzler (1993) 31–71 [first published in: *Antike* 18, 127–158].

- Keiller (2007): Patrick Keiller, "Phantom Rides: The Railway and the Film", in: Matthew Beaumont and Michael Freeman (eds.), *The Railway and Modernity. Time, Space, and the Machine Ensemble*, Bern, 69–84.
- Klotz (1969): Volker Klotz, *Die erzählte Stadt. Ein Sujet als Herausforderung des Romans von Lesage bis Döblin*, München.
- Kracauer (1960/1985): Siegfried Kracauer, *Theory of Film. The Redemption of Physical Reality*, New York / *Theorie des Films – Die Errettung der äußeren Wirklichkeit*, Frankfurt a. M.
- Kruft (1989): Hanno-Walter Kruft, *Städte in Utopia. Die Idealstadt vom 15. bis zum 18. Jahrhundert zwischen Staatsutopie und Wirklichkeit*, München.
- Kytzler (1993): Bernhard Kytzler (ed.), *Rom als Idee*, Darmstadt.
- Larmour (2007): David H. J. Larmour, "Holes in the body: sites of abjection in Juvenal's Rome", in: David H. J. Larmour and Diana Spencer (eds.), *The Sites of Rome. Time, Space, Memory*, Oxford, 168–210.
- Lefebvre (1974): Henri Lefebvre, *La production de l'espace*, Paris, 42001 [= *Die Produktion des städtischen Raums*, transl. Franz Hiss and Hans-Ulrich Wegener, in: *ARCH+* Bd 9, Heft 34 (1977)].
- Löw / Steets / Stötzer (2007): Martina Löw, Silke Steets and Sergej Stoetzer, *Einführung in die Stadt- und Raumsoziologie*, Opladen / Farmington Hills.
- Loiperdinger (2006): Martin Loiperdinger, "'La vie prise sur le vi'. Akzente des Zufälligen in Städtebildern des Cinématographe Lumière", in: Thomas Koebner and Thomas Meder (eds.), *Bildtheorie und Film*, München, 381–392.
- Lusin (2007): Caroline Lusin, *Virginia Woolf und Anton P. Čechov. Die Semantisierung von Raum und Zeit*, Trier.
- Lynch (1960): Kevin Lynch, *The Image of the City*, Cambridge / Mass. [= *Das Bild der Stadt*, transl. Henni Korssakoff-Schröder, Basel / Gütersloh 62010].
- Marinetti (1990): Filippo Marinetti, *Teoria e invenzione futurista*, ed. by Luciano DeMaria, 2nd ed., Milano.
- Meyer (2006): Marion Meyer, *Die Personifikation der Stadt Antiocheia: ein neues Bild für eine neue Gottheit*, Berlin.
- Mölk (1980): Ulrich Mölk, "Die literarische Entdeckung der Stadt im französischen Mittelalter", in: Josef Fleckenstein and Karl Stackmann (eds.), *Über Bürger, Stadt und städtische Literatur im Spätmittelalter*, Göttingen, 203–215.
- More (1995): Thomas More, *Utopia*. Latin Text and English Translation, ed. G. M. Logan et al., Cambridge.
- Nelis / Royo (2014): Damien Nelis and Manuel Royo (eds.), *Lire la Ville: fragments d'une archéologie littéraire de Rome antique*, Bordeaux.
- Nesselrath (2002): Heinz-Günther Nesselrath, *Platon und die Erfindung von Atlantis*, München.
- Neumann (1996): Dietrich Neumann (ed.), *Filmarchitektur. Von Metropolis bis Blade Runner*, München / New York.
- Neumeyer (1999): Harald Neumeyer, *Der Flaneur. Konzeptionen der Moderne*, Würzburg.
- Nünning (2009): Ansgar Nünning, "Formen und Funktionen literarischer Raumdarstellung: Grundlagen, Ansätze, narratologische Kategorien und neue Perspektiven", in: Wolfgang Hallet and Birgit Neumann (eds.), *Raum und Bewegung in der Literatur. Die Literaturwissenschaften und der Spatial Turn*, Bielefeld, 33–52.
- Paschoud (1967): François Paschoud, *Roma Aeterna. Études sur le patriotisme romain dans l'occident latin à l'époque des grandes invasions*, Rome.
- Patterson (1982): Annabel Patterson (ed.), *Roman Images*, Baltimore / London.

- Rehm (1960): Walther Rehm, *Europäische Romdichtung*, München ²1960.
- Roberts (2001): Michael Roberts, "Rome personified, Rome epitomized. Representations of Rome in the Poetry of the Early Fifth Century", *AJPh* 122, 533–565.
- Rogge (2008): Jörg Rogge, "Wissensbestände und ihre Verwendungszusammenhänge in spätmittelalterlichen und frühneuzeitlichen Städten – eine Einleitung", in: id. (ed.), *Tradieren, Vermitteln, Anwenden. Zum Umgang mit Wissensbeständen in spätmittelalterlichen und frühneuzeitlichen Städten*, Berlin, 9–19.
- Rose (2012): Dirk Rose, "Die Verortung der Literatur. Präliminarien zu einer Poetologie der Lokalisation", in: Martin Huber, Christine Lubkoll, Steffen Martus and Yvonne Wübben (eds.), *Literarische Räume. Architekturen – Ordnungen – Medien*, Berlin, 39–57.
- Schmidt (1988): Johann-Karl Schmidt, *Léon Krier. Atlantis*, Stuttgart.
- Schweinfurth (2005): Dagmar Schweinfurth, ekphrasis topon und ekphrasis tropon. *Aspekte der topographischen Ekphraseis in der griechischen Prosa der Kaiserzeit und Spätantike*, Magisterarbeit Heidelberg, online publ. http://archiv.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/propylaeumdok/volltexte/2008/88/pdf/schweinfurth_ekphrasis_topon.pdf
- Seifert (2011): Jörg Seifert, *Stadtbild, Wahrnehmung, Design: Kevin Lynch revisited*, Basel / Gütersloh.
- Sennett (1994): Richard Sennett, *Flesh and Stone: the Body and the City in Western Civilization*, New York etc.
- Stenger (2014): Jan R. Stenger, "'Ich bin die Grenze der Agora.' Zum kognitiven Stadtbild der Athener in klassischer Zeit", in: Natalie N. May and Ulrike Steinert (eds.), *The Fabric of Cities: Aspects of Urbanism, Urban Topography and Society in Mesopotamia, Greece and Rome*, Leiden / Boston, 203–228.
- Tiller (2005): Elisabeth Tiller, "Idealstadt und Stadtutopie in der Frühen Neuzeit. Zur Interdependenz von Körper und Stadt", in: Galle / Klingen-Protti (2005) 99–128.
- Tönnemann (2011): Andreas Tönnemann, *Monopoly. Das Spiel, die Stadt und das Glück*, Berlin.
- Tripet (2006): Arnaud Tripet, *Écrivez-moi de Rome ... Le mythe romain au fil du temps*, Paris.
- Vidal-Naquet (2005): Pierre Vidal-Naquet, *L'Atlantide. Petite histoire d'un mythe platonicien*, Paris [= *The Atlantis Story. A Short History of Plato's Myth*, Exeter 2007].
- Vidler (1990): Anthony Vidler, *Claude-Nicolas Ledoux. Architecture and Social Reform at the End of the Ancien Régime*, Cambridge, Mass. / London.
- Vogt (1985): Adolf Max Vogt, *Karl Friedrich Schinkel, Blick in Griechenlands Blüte. Ein Hoffnungsbild für Spree-Athen*, Frankfurt a. M.
- Wagner (2008): Kirsten Wagner, "Die visuelle Ordnung der Stadt. Das Bild der Stadt bei Kevin Lynch", in: Cornelia Jöchner (ed.), *Räume der Stadt. Von der Antike bis heute*, Berlin, 317–334.
- Webb (2009): Ruth Webb, *Ekphrasis, Imagination and Persuasion in Ancient Rhetorical Theory and Practice*, Farnham / Burlington.
- Weigel (1988): Sigrid Weigel, "Traum – Stadt – Frau. Zur Weiblichkeit der Städte in der Schrift. Calvino, Benjamin, Paul Nizon, Ginka Steinwachs", in: Klaus R. Scherpe (ed.), *Die Unwirklichkeit der Städte. Großstadtdarstellungen zwischen Moderne und Postmoderne*, Reinbek bei Hamburg, 173–196.
- von der Weppen (1995): Wolfgang von der Weppen, *Der Spaziergänger. Eine Gestalt, in der Welt sich vielfältig bricht*, Tübingen 1995.
- Williams (1973): Raymond Williams, *The Country and the City*, London.
- Zimmermann (2000): Clemens Zimmermann, "Raum in Bewegung – Bewegung im Raum", in: Gerhart von Gravenitz (ed.), *Die Stadt in der Europäischen Romantik*, Würzburg, 17–32.

Damien Nelis

Vergilian Cities

Visions of Troy, Carthage and Rome¹

Abstract: It is well known that the city of Rome figures largely in Vergil's poetry. Study of this topic has tended to focus on its historical aspects, and special attention has been paid to the fact that the *Aeneid* is a foundation epic. As far as actual descriptions of the city are concerned, most scholars have inevitably been drawn to the famous promenade of Aeneas and Evander through the site of Rome in book 8. In this paper I would like to take a slightly different approach to Vergil's Rome, by looking at a number of passages which offer glimpses of clearly defined urban spaces, arguing that Vergil has a particular interest in depicting cityscapes throughout his career. Right from the first *Eclogue*, and again in the *Georgics*, the depiction of Rome as a physical space is clearly a matter of considerable literary importance for Vergil. Ironically, when one turns to the *Aeneid*, Carthage and Troy receive more direct attention than Rome, but the destinies of all three cities are clearly intertwined. Evocations of the cityscape of Carthage as it is being built by Dido and of Troy as it is being destroyed by the Greeks interact with Vergil's handling of the fate of Rome, and study of the poet's treatment of urban space helps to reveal some interesting aspects of his epic technique.

Vergil's *Aeneid* combines the story of a character from Homer's *Iliad* with the history of Rome.² Even before its actual publication around 19 BCE, Propertius (2,34,61–6, c. 25 BCE) could characterize it as a poem about the Battle of Actium and immediately go on to compare it directly to the *Iliad*. Servius, in the preface to his commentary on the *Aeneid*, shows his awareness of essential strands in the epic's make-up when he states that Vergil's intention was to imitate Homer and praise Augustus (*Homerum imitari et Augustum laudare a parentibus*). Modern scholarship has explored extensively the ways in which the

1 Sincere thanks are due to Th. Fuhrer, F. Mundt and J. Stenger for their invitation to speak at the splendid conference in Berlin that gave rise to this volume, and also to Bettina Bergmann, Laurent Brassous, Manuel Royo and Clifford Weber for expert guidance.

2 The bibliography on this broad topic is so vast that it is hard to know where to start; see, for example, Knauer (1981) on Homer and Rieks (1981) on Roman history; Pöschl (1977³) remains essential reading; more recently, see Hardie (1986) and (1988) 53–7.

poem's narrative combines Homeric plots and themes and Roman subject matter and discourses. As Vergil exploits, among many other models, Homer, the Epic Cycle, Naevius, Ennius, the Roman Annalists and the early decades of Livy's history, he combines the Iliadic battle for Troy, narratives of the city's fall, and the return journeys of Odysseus and other heroes with the foundation stories of Lavinium, Alba Longa and Rome. In doing so, his story of Aeneas contains references to many famous events and characters in Rome's history, right up to the Augustan present of the poem's composition and initial reception.³

This essay, however, will not focus on Vergil's epicizing histories of Rome. Instead, it will attempt to contextualize Vergilian visions of Rome, by illustrating the poet's keen interest in cityscapes.⁴ By this formulation I do not simply mean that Vergil frequently mentions Rome, the Tiber, the Palatine, the Aventine, individual landmarks and buildings, and so on; this aspect will be important, but not the immediate centre of attention.⁵ As has been frequently pointed out, the years in which Vergil was active as a poet were ones in which the fabric of the city was transformed by Octavian / Augustus, and it is not difficult to find many reflections of this urban metamorphosis in the Vergilian

³ On Vergil, the *Aeneid*, Augustus and the Augustan age see, from a massive bibliography, Binder (1971), Pöschl (1981), Cairns (1989), Stahl (1998), Thomas (2001), Powell (2008); on Vergil's interest in constructions of Roman identity see Reed (2007). On Augustan poetry and politics in general see two important collections of essays, Woodman and West (1984), Powell (1998); see also Galinsky (1996), (2005) and Labate and Rosati (2013).

⁴ For an extremely useful attempt to survey the problem of how the Romans represented to themselves the city of Rome and cityscapes more generally see Royo and Gruet (2008); see also Devillers (2013). Useful too are Cancik (1985/6) on demarcations of the city as sacred space, and La Rocca (2009) on artistic representations of landscapes, including cities, two references I owe to Bettina Bergmann. For the bird's eye view in relation to the Circus Maximus, see Bergmann (2008). On Ovid imagining Rome from Tomis see Edwards (1996) 116–25. The perambulations through the city of Ovid's book and other similar promenades through the city, especially that of Evander and Aeneas in *Aeneid* 8, have of course attracted much discussion; see for example Wiseman (1984). On landscape in Vergil see Witek (2006); more generally see Jenkyns (1998). On Servius' commentary and the city of Rome see Tischer (2012); in general there is much of interest in Fuhrer (2012), with a focus on later antiquity. On the whole question of Roman consciousness of space, with a focus on cartography, see Talbert (2012); see also Ewald / Noreña (2011). For the *Forma Urbis Romae*, the Severan marble plan of the city which enabled its contemporaries to take in the form and scope of the city at a single glance, see now the remarkable on-line collection of material at <http://formaurbis.stanford.edu/>. On 'the spatial turn' see Döring and Thielmann (2008), Warf and Arias (2009). I have not seen Holdaway and Trentin (2013).

⁵ On these topics and much more see Edwards (1996), which is essential reading; important also is Jaeger (1997). More generally, some of the best work on space in literary texts has concentrated on Greek literature: see for example Purves (2010), Thalmann (2011), De Jong (2012).

text.⁶ I intend rather to look at some passages throughout his whole œuvre, starting from the first *Eclogue*, that invite readers to imagine Rome as a cityscape, by which I mean moments in the text which invite readers to imagine a discrete and defined urban space, a unitary spatial entity seen in a single snapshot.⁷ The *Aeneid*'s first sentence, after all, ends with a mention of 'the walls of high Rome' (*altae moenia Romae*, *Aen.* 1,7). Some prefer to take this expression simply as a reference to the city's power, but there are good reasons for taking the use of the adjective *alta*, beyond its precise function as a programmatic example of enallage, or transferred epithet, that invites us to construe it with *moenia* rather than with *Romae*,⁸ as a deliberate, if fleeting, evocation of the city as a physical entity, as an invitation to the reader to delineate for a moment in the mind's eye Rome as a discrete, unified, built-up urban space.⁹ In what follows, therefore, it will not be a matter of trying to identify allusions to individual buildings, an aspect of the *Aeneid* that has attracted a considerable body of fascinating scholarship.¹⁰ Nor will we be interested primarily in the history of the city as presented by Vergil writing as a historian, nor in 'Rom als Idee', nor in the rhetorical tradition of *laudes Romae*, nor Augustus' massive building projects, nor in mentions of Rome as symbolic of her power, as expressed, for example, through implicit play on the correlation between *urbs* and *orbis*, which presents Rome as the centre of a world empire.¹¹ Rather, we will attempt to survey the ways in which Vergil, throughout his career, invites his readers to construct momentary visions of Rome.

6 See for example Favro (1996), Haselberger (2007) on Augustus' transformation of Rome and Morwood (1991) on Vergil's reaction to Augustus as builder. More generally see Scheithauer (2000).

7 According to the *Oxford English Dictionary*, usage of the term *city-scape* / *cityscape*, defined as a 'view of a city; city scenery; the layout of a city', can be traced back to 1856.

8 On Vergilian enallage see Conte (2007) chap. 3.

9 I will not discuss here the complexities involved in trying to theorize the act of reading and questions about representation and mimesis, narration and description, and so on. For a way into these topics see for example Elsner (1996), Squire (2009) and Spencer (2010), all with extensive bibliographies. From a more philosophical perspective see Gaskin (2013) on language, literature and worldly reality. On ancient ecphrasis see Webb (2009). On the city as a theme in the *Aeneid*, see Morwood (1991) and Reed (2007) chap. 5, two contributions from which I have learned much. In general on textual representations of Rome see Edwards (1996), Auvray-Assayas / Dupont (1998), Larmour / Spencer (2007); more generally, Leach (1988). On the dangers involved in assuming that ancient writers seek topographical precision see Horsfall (1985). On every aspect of writing about Rome and describing Rome see Edwards (1996).

10 See for example Harrison (2006) for discussion.

11 For these aspects of the poem see, for example, Gernentz (1918) on *laudes Romae*, Bréguet (1969) on *urbs* / *orbis*, Putnam (1975) and the collection of articles in Kytzler (1993) on „Rom als Idee“, Hardie (1986) on cosmos and *imperium*, Rehak (2006) on *imperium* and cosmos, Favro (1996) and Haselberger (2007) on Augustan adornment of the city.

1 The *Eclogues*: the view from the woods

Eclogue 1 takes the form of a dialogue between two rustics, and it is their conversation alone that permits reconstruction of their respective situations. In order to try to prevent eviction and subsequent exile, the cruel fate suffered by Meliboeus, Tityrus has been to Rome. There, the intervention of a man he describes as a god (*deus*, *Ecl.* 1,6–7) has led to his being allowed to retain his rights, and so when we first see him, in the poem's opening line, he is found reclining peacefully under the shade of a beech tree. Trees are obviously an important part of the bucolic world, and, laden with symbolic associations, can represent the bucolic world itself.¹² It is noteworthy therefore, that when Tityrus attempts to describe Rome to Meliboeus, in what is the only time the name of the city is used in the *Eclogues*, he uses trees in order to give as vivid an impression as possible of the sheer scale of the place:

*Urbem quam dicunt Romam, Meliboe, putavi
stultus ego huic nostrae similem, quo saepe solemus
pastores ovium teneros depellere fetus.
sic canibus catulos similis, sic matribus haedos
noram, sic parvis componere magna solebam.
verum haec tantum alias inter caput extulit urbes
quantum lenta solent inter viburna cupressi.*

(*Ecl.* 1,19–25)¹³

The city, Meliboeus, they call Rome,
I, simpleton, deemed like this town of ours,
whereto we shepherds oft are wont to drive
the younglings of the flock: so too I knew
whelps to resemble dogs, and kids their dams,
comparing small with great; but this as far
above all other cities rears her head
as cypress above pliant osier towers.¹⁴

The countryman reprimands himself for having imagined that Rome could resemble his local town, and after adopting terms drawn from his daily life, dogs and sheep, concludes with the picture of Rome as comparable to cypresses towering straight and tall over low-lying plants. In his recent commentary, A.

¹² Cf. for example, *Ecl.* 4,3, *si canimus silvas ...*; *Ecl.* 6,2, *nostra neque erubuit silvas habitare Thalea*.

¹³ The text used is that of R. A. B Mynors (1969), with substitution of *v* for consonantal *u*.

¹⁴ For translations of the Latin, when a precise detail in the argument is not at issue, I have used those handily available on-line at <http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/>. These are by J. B. Greenough for the *Eclogues* and *Georgics* and T. C. Williams for the *Aeneid*.

Cucchiarelli points out that the former (identified as *Cupressus sempervirens*) can reach the height of fifty metres, while the latter (identified as *Viburnum lantana*) rarely grows to more than two metres, a difference that clearly underlines the point Vergil is making: Rome towers over the towns of Italy.¹⁵ On one level, this dominance has a political aspect, and the poem suggests that events in Rome now influence what goes on in the rest of the peninsula. On another level, the mention of Rome in these lines has to be interpreted in relation to the poetics of space in the first *Eclogue* and subsequently in the rest of the collection.¹⁶ In a linear reading of the text, we move outward from the spreading beech of the first line, via Rome in line 19 to the frontiers of the Roman world in lines 59–66, where Tityrus and Meliboeus, evoking the topic of exile, mention Parthia, Germania, Scythia, Asia and Britannia, before the shadows fall from the mountains and bring the poem to a close with the onset of darkness in the last line. Much has been written in attempting to identify the landscape evoked by the first *Eclogue*, but an interesting element in that topic is the way in which Rome as a place functions in a dynamic relationship first to a single tree, then to Italy and finally to the whole world beyond, before the closing in of night from the horizon created by the high mountains of the final line. Furthermore, coming in the first poem, this reference to Rome provides a context within which to situate the references to historical events and persons which will appear in the rest of the collection, as Vergil returns at various points and in numerous ways to the concerns of Roman politics. Crucially, of course, the city of Rome is linked from the very beginning of the Vergilian oeuvre to the ‘god’, to the young man (*iuvenem*, *Ecl.* 1,42, carefully placed right at the very mid-point of the whole poem) who comes to Tityrus’ rescue there.¹⁷

Amidst all these associations and resonances, it is important to pay due attention to the physical image of the city as tall cypresses towering over smaller trees. The most immediate image to come to mind is obviously that of pre-eminent height. While clearly evoking influence and power, Tityrus’ words also conjure up a dialogue between the rural and the urban, since they imply that most country-folk can simply have no idea of the grandeur of Rome. The very brevity of the image and the lack of detail perhaps invite readers to allow their thoughts to run on a little further, and to think about a city as a tall tree may also conjure up a sense of place and fixed rootedness. The comparison of a city to a tree is one which Vergil will use again, thus making it possible to test

¹⁵ Cucchiarelli (2012) on 25.

¹⁶ On Vergil’s bucolic space see Jones (2011).

¹⁷ See Mundt (2012) 164–6; more generally on politics and the divine in the *Eclogues* see Cucchiarelli (2011).

the validity of such assumptions. But for the moment it will suffice to learn the lesson of this first occurrence of the name of Rome in Vergilian poetry. From the outset, Vergil attaches great importance to the city as a physically striking and dominant physical entity. And as the cypresses tower over the smaller trees, so the humble pastoral world constructed by these bucolic poems is overshadowed right from the outset by the towering city of Rome.

2 The *Georgics*: the view from the fields

In the *Georgics*, Rome is named twice, in two closely related passages, the closing panels of books 1 and 2. In line 466 of the first book, in an abrupt transition from a section dedicated to weather signs provided by the sun and the moon, at the death of Julius Caesar, the sun pities the city (*ille etiam extincto miseratus Caesare Romam*). There is no immediately obvious spatial or physical aspect whatsoever here, except perhaps for the fact that in the next two lines Vergil goes on to say that the sun covered itself up, thus provoking a sudden fear of eternal night (*aeternam ... noctem*, *Georg.* 1,468) and perhaps conjuring up an image of the city covered in total darkness. When Rome is named again, at *Georgics* 2,534, Vergil certainly offers his readers an image of a cityscape. The passage in question runs as follows, following a description of an idyllic rustic festival:

*hanc olim veteres vitam coluere Sabini,
hanc Remus et frater; sic fortis Etruria crevit
scilicet et rerum facta est pulcherrima Roma,
septemque una sibi muro circumdedit arces.*

(*Georg.* 2,532–5)

Such life of yore the ancient Sabines led,
Such Remus and his brother: Etruria thus,
Doubt not, to greatness grew, and Rome became
The fair world's fairest, and with circling wall
Clasped to her single breast the sevenfold hills.

In these lines, fascinating temporal strategies are in play, as troubled present and peaceful past are juxtaposed.¹⁸ But space is equally important, as a brief reading of some strands of the passage will demonstrate.

Rome's foundation, alluded to in the reference to Remus and Romulus (*Remus et frater*, *Georg.* 2,533) is placed here in relation to a rustic style of life,

¹⁸ See Putnam (1979) 158–9.

and this shift from rural to urban is extended further when the single city surrounds its seven hills with a wall and becomes the most beautiful of places. By mentioning the hills and the surrounding wall and the beauty of the city, Vergil certainly wants his readers to think in terms of a defined urban space, even if, as in the first *Eclogue*, that space is not described in any detail. In fact, it is precisely the absence of reference to any constituent elements in the urban landscape that emphasizes the importance of the urban space as a unified entity. The city stands in contrast to the countryside of the previous lines, and in addition, Rome, as in *Eclogue* 1, is described in relation to other parts of Italy, by means of the references to the Sabines and Etruria in lines 532–3. Again also, as in the earlier poem, Rome's power is clearly emphasized. But its walls and beauty also set it apart in ways which some scholars have seen as introducing troubling elements into the picture. It has been pointed out that the building of city walls is an activity that does not sit well with traditional images of the Golden Age, many of which are evoked in the preceding verses.¹⁹ In terms of the oppositions between rural and urban and peace and war in the passage as a whole, it is in fact tempting to see Rome as more closely associated with war than with peace. This interpretation fits well with the final section of book 1, where Julius Caesar's death, the city of Rome and civil war are all interconnected, and the book comes to a close in the description of the whole world caught up in an apparently endless cycle of grim violence.²⁰ At least superficially, the close of the second book of the poem seems more optimistic than that of the first, but at *Georgics* 2,495–512 Vergil very deliberately associates Rome with immoral excess, corruption and civil strife, and when it comes, the mention of the beauty of Rome and its seven hills surrounded by a wall, *rerum facta est pulcherrima Roma*, seems to recall line 498. There, among the things that are said not to trouble those who are fortunate enough to enjoy the pleasure of life in the country are 'Roman affairs and kingdoms doomed to perish' (*res Romanae perituraque regna*, *Georg.* 2,498). Scholars are divided on what this expression means, but it surely takes a lot of special pleading to maintain a complete distinction between Rome and other *regna*.²¹ Therefore, when Vergil mentions Remus and Romulus and the walls of the beautiful city of Rome in lines 533–5, it must be remembered that just 36 lines earlier he had at the very least not excluded the idea of the city's eventual destruction. The passage as a whole thus contains in one sweeping glance a vision of the whole

¹⁹ See Thomas (1988) on 2,535.

²⁰ Note in particular the way in which Vergil relates cities, *urbes*, to the world, *orbis*, by placing at line-end *orbem*, *urbes* and *orbe* within the space of seven lines (*Georg.* 1,505–11).

²¹ See Thomas (1988) on 2,498.