Reformation in the Context of World Christianity

Theological, political and social interactions between Africa, Asia, the Americas and Europe

Edited by Frieder Ludwig, Mirjam Laaser, Wilhelm Richebächer, Amélé Adamavi-Aho Ekué and Pui-Yee Pong



Harrassowitz Verlag

Studien zur Außereuropäischen Christentumsgeschichte (Asien, Afrika, Lateinamerika)

Studies in the History of Christianity in the Non-Western World

Herausgegeben von / Edited by Klaus Koschorke & Johannes Meier

Band 33 / Volume 33

2019 Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden

Reformation in the Context of World Christianity

Theological, political and social interactions between Africa, Asia, the Americas and Europe

Edited by Frieder Ludwig, Mirjam Laaser, Wilhelm Richebächer, Amélé Adamavi-Aho Ekué and Pui-Yee Pong

> 2019 Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden

Cover Illustration: Ottheinrich-Bibel, Vol. 6: Kol 3,22 - Apg 10,4; Bayerische Staatsbibliothek München, Cgm 8010(6, fol. 236v.

Publication of this book was supported by a grant of the Vereinigte Evangelisch-Lutherische Kirche Deutschlands (VELKD) and the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Missionswissenschaft (DGMW).

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über http://dnb.dnb.de abrufbar.

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the internet at http://dnb.dnb.de.

For further information about our publishing program consult our website http://www.harrassowitz-verlag.de

© Otto Harrassowitz GmbH & Co. KG, Wiesbaden 2019 This work, including all of its parts, is protected by copyright. Any use beyond the limits of copyright law without the permission of the publisher is forbidden and subject to penalty. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations, microfilms and storage and processing in electronic systems. Printed on permanent/durable paper.

Printing and binding: Memminger MedienCentrum AG

Printed in Germany ISSN 1611-0080

ISBN 978-3-447-11292-5 e-ISBN 978-3-447-19914-8

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements VII
FRIEDER LUDWIG, MIRJAM LAASER, WILHELM RICHEBÄCHER, AMÉLÉ ADAMAVI-AHO EKUÉ & PUI-YEE PONG Introduction
DAVID DANIELS Luther and Ethiopian Christianity
THOMAS KAUFMANN The Reformation as Historiographical Concept
WANDA DEIFELT Ecclesia Semper Reformanda: Intercultural and Interreligious Contributions to an Ongoing Reformation
AFE ADOGAME From European to African Reformation: African Indigenous Churches in an Age of Globalization
TTUMELENG DANIEL MOTHOAGAE The 1830–1857 Translation of the English-Setswana Bible as a Political Project
IGNATIUS SWART Mainline Churches and the Prospects of a Reviving Kairos Consciousness: Reflecting on Religious and Social Change as a Research Focus in Post-Apartheid South Africa
CHRISTINE LIENEMANN-PERRIN Public Theology Emerging in Protestant Churches in the Global South
FUK-TSANG YING State-Church Relationships in Reform China: Retrospect and Prospect
NA CHEN & LIZHU FAN Conversion as an Overlapping Development of Indigenous Tradition - Understanding the Practice of Confucian Xiao among Li Village Christians
ANDAR PARLINDUNGAN Reformation and Wider Outlook Works- Change and Challenges of the 500 Years Reformation in the Context of Indonesian Churches
OLGA KURILO The Role of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Russia in Times of Political Transition

BRADN BUERKLE "A Faith of Protest and Mere Denial?" Prospects for Lutheranism for the Post-Soviet World	193
ANDREI S. DESNITSKY Waltzing with the Kremlin: ROC and the State in Present Day Russia	207
WILLIAM O. OBAGA & MARGARET K. OBAGA North-South Church Partnerships: A Bird's-eye View from a German Context	213
FRITZ HEINRICH Between Brazilian 'Coolness' and German 'Rigorousness': Hybrid Lutheran Identities in a Dreamed up Paradise	231
FELIPE GUSTAVO KOCH BUTTELLI Religion and Transformative Development: The Social and Political Responsibility of the Protestant Churches in Brazil	243
HARTMUT LEHMANN North American Lutheranism from the Eighteenth to the Twentieth Century	259
CHARLES AMJAD-ALI US Mission: Racism, Associational Ecclesiology, Colonialism and Modernity	265
Editors & Contributors	281

Acknowledgments

In this volume, contributions of the conference "The churches of the Reformation in their social and political responsibility for the One World: Case studies and country analyses from Africa, Asia, America and Europe" are published. This conference took place on the premises of the Fachhochschule für Interkulturelle Theologie Hermannsburg from June 22 to 25, 2016.

We would like to thank all the contributors for their patience in the publication process. Originally, it was planned to publish the book in 2017, but that proved to be overoptimistic. However, as was pointed out at the conference, there are questions whether the publication of the 95 theses on October 31st, 1517, really mark the starting point for the Reformation, and in any case, the 2017 quincentenary was a badly overcrowded bandwagon. We are glad that the volume can be published now, in 2019.

We are grateful to the generous financial support of the programme *Reformations-jubiläum 2017* of the Federal Government, of the *Hanns-Lilje-Stiftung* (Hannover), of the *Evangelisch-Lutherische Missionswerk in Niedersachsen* (ELM) and its three carrier churches, the *Evangelisch-Lutherische Landeskirche Hannovers*, the *Evangelisch-Lutherische Landeskirche in Braunschweig and* the *Evangelisch-Lutherische Landeskirche Schaumburg-Lippe*. The publication of this volume was made possible by contributions towards printing costs by the *Vereinigte Evangelisch-Lutherische Kirche Deutschlands* (VELKD) and the *Deutsche Gesellschaft für Missionswissenschaft* (DGMW); we thank them as well as Prof. Dr. Klaus Koschorke and Prof. Dr. Johannes Meier for accepting this book into the series "Studies in the History of Christianity in the Non-Western World/ Studien zur Außereuropäischen Christentumsgeschichte (Asien, Afrika, Lateinamerika)".

This academic gathering which provided a kaleidoscope of a vast plurality of different cultural re-appropriations and continuations of the Reformation traditions in World Christianity could only be conducted with a strong organizational and supporting team. At the *Fachhochschule für Interkulturelle Theologie Hermannsburg* (University of Applied Sciences for Intercultural Theologie, FIT), an excellent cooperation between academic and non-academic staff has been established. The Fachhochschule was founded in 2012 with the aim to provide an interface between the different theologies of Africa, Asia, America and Europe and to meet the challenges of Christian pluralism appropriately and reflectively. One of the objectives is to train experts in the field of international diakonia which includes aspects of social work and thereby raise awareness for global problems and challenges.

The FIT is an academically autonomous institution within the framework of the ELM, and the conference was also an outcome of the cooperation between FIT and ELM: Rev. Inga Göbert, at that time head of the department "Gemeinde weltweit" encouraged us to apply to the Reformation jubilee fund. In order to strengthen the developmental dimension of the Conference, Dr. Mirjam Laaser (at that time consultant for development cooperation, ELM) and Prof. Frieder Ludwig (at that time principal, FIT) visited the Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung, BMZ (Federal Ministry for Economic

Cooperation and Development) and had a conversation with Dr. Wolfgang Stierle and Martin Mauthe (Head of Unit and Deputy Head of the BMZ). Their suggestions were very helpful for the further development of the concept.

That this conference was a special occasion was indicated by the fact that, alongside with the current director of ELM, Rev. Michael Thiel, two former directors were present: Rev. Ernst August Lüdemann, who had been director from 1989–2003, and Rev. Martina Helmer-Pham Xuan, who was the first female director from 2003–2013. It was during her era that FIT was founded. It was a privilege that the chairman of the Mission Committee (the governing body of ELM, Landesbischof Ralf Meister (Hannover), and the chairman of the Executive Committee, Rev. Rainer Kiefer, participated in the meeting. Landesbischof Dr. Karl-Hinrich Manzke (Schaumburg-Lippe) had supported the preparations and in general had been important in establishing FIT and connecting the new institution to the regional churches in Lower Saxony.

We were also privileged that Prof. Dr. Christine Lienemann (Basel), Bishop Dr. Musa Filibus (Numan, Nigeria), Prof. Dr. Thomas Kaufmann (Göttingen), Prof. Dr. Reinhard Achenbach (Münster), Prof. Dr. Andreas Nehring (Erlangen) and Dr. Kenneth Mtata (Geneva, now Harare) represented the Founding Committee and the Academic Advisory Board of FIT. These organs were and are crucial to secure the academic quality of FIT, and the members serve on a honorary basis just for the cause. We are grateful indeed to them.

The conference opened with a panel discussion "Reformation and Global Responsibility" which was chaired by Prof. Dr. Wilhelm Richebächer (FIT) and in which Landesbischof Ralf Meister (Hannover), Prof. Dr. Claudia Warning (Protestant Agency for Diakonie and Development), Prof. Dr. Elisio Macamo (Basel University), Prof. Dr. Amélé Adamavi-Aho Ekué (Ecumenical Institute, Bossey) and Dr. Cornelia Johnsdorf (Commissioner for Development Servies of the Churches in Braunschweig and Hannover) participated. The contributions focused particularly on the current debate about refugees and asylumseekers. It was pointed out that countries like Ethiopia, Kenya and Chad receive many more refugees than Germany or Austria and that therefore one should not speak of a "refugee crisis" in Europe. It was also stressed that migrant-led congregations from Africa, Asia, and Latin America contribute to the integration of the newcomers. In the interactions between them and with them, intercultural theology is becoming increasingly important.

In the concluding session, "conference impressions and summarizing votes" were shared by Dr. Kenneth Mtata (Lutheran World Federation), Prof. Dr. Kwabena Asamoah-Gyadu (Trinity Theological Seminary, Accra, Ghana), Prof. Dr. Klaus Hock (University of Rostock), Dr. Armin Triebel (Sozialwissenschaftlicher Studienkreis für Interkulturelle Perspektiven) and Prof. Dr. Dietrich Werner, Protestant Agency for Diakonie and Development /FIT). The statements highlighted the journey of the four days (which was described as "an ecumenical marathon through highly diversified landscapes of new social incarnations and cultural embodiments of reformatory dynamics at work today") and also

¹ Other members of these boards were/are Dr. Wolfgang Gern (Darmstadt), Prof. Dr. Werner Kahl (Hamburg/Frankfurt), Dr. Ben Khumalo-Seegelken (Huntlosen), Prof. Dr. Michael Nausner (Reutlingen), Prof. Dr. Kjell Nordstokke (Oslo), Prof. Dr. Cornelia Richter (Bonn), Prof. Dr. Klaus Schulz (Kassel) and Prof. Dr. Florian Wilk (Göttingen).

provided prospects and perspectives for cooperation in the future. All the contributions were enriching and we express our sincere thanks to all who helped to make this conference a success.

After the completion of his term as principal of FIT (October 2012–October 2018), Frieder Ludwig accepted a call as professor of global studies and religion at VID Specialized University, Stavanger campus (Norway). Freed from administrative burdens and the constant negotiation processes, it was possible to complete this volume. Thus, we also express our sincere thanks to VID Specialized University.

The editors, Hermannsburg/Stavanger/Bossey/Saarbrücken June 2019

FRIEDER LUDWIG, MIRJAM LAASER, WILHELM RICHEBÄCHER, AMÉLÉ ADAMAVI-AHO EKUÉ & PUI-YEE PONG

This volume is the outcome of a conference held at the Fachhochschule für Interkulturelle Theologie Hermannsburg in June 2016. The international and interdisciplinary conference took the Reformation anniversary as a starting point to reflect the role of churches in social development and transformation processes and to initiate or to intensify international discourses. It fitted well within the theme of the "Luther Decade" for the year 2016 "Reformation and the One World" and therefore was not the only event aiming to connect Wittenberg in 1517 and World Christianity in 2017. In the following, we will provide a brief overview on Reformation anniversaries and their international perspectives, before we discuss the various approaches to this topic. Then we present the idea and the outline of this book in detail.

International Perspectives of Reformation anniversaries, 1717–2017

The 500th anniversary of Luther's 95 theses in 2017 was the first such commemoration in which the global dimensions of the Reformation – including Africa, Asia, Latin America and Oceania – were a major theme. Thus, the Protestant University of Rwanda and the Faculty of Protestant Theology of the Ruhr-University Bochum cooperated in the symposium "African Christian Theologies and the Impact of the Reformation" which was held in Karongi (Rwanda) in February 2016.² The Lutheran World Federation's (LWF) Twelfth Assembly met under the 500th Reformation anniversary theme, "Liberated by God's Grace," in May 2017, in Windhoek, Namibia and celebrated the Reformation anniversary in a central worship service.³ 'African Christians and the Reformations' was the title of a workshop which war organized at Princeton Theological Seminary by Afe Adogame and David Daniels on October 31st, 2017. In December 2017, "the African church's grand celebration of the

¹ http://www.luther2017.de/lutherdekade/themenjahr-2016.

² H. BEDFORD-STROHM, T. GATWA, T. JAEHNICHEN, E. MUSEMAKWELI (Eds.), *African Christian Theologies and the Impact of the Reformation* (Wien/Zürich 2017).

³ LUTHERAN WORLD FEDERATION, Liberated by God's Grace. Assembly Report, Twelfth Assembly, Windhoek, Namibia, 10–16 May 2017, https://www.lutheranworld.org/sites/default/files/12a-assembly report en.pdf.

Reformation anniversary" took place in Addis Ababa in a three-day event. In Japan. Toshifumi Uemura, professor at the Japanese Lutheran College in Tokyo, composed a playwright entitled 'Luther' using the Noh theater, one of the most important forms of expression of Japanese culture. In India, a dialogue meeting of the Roman Catholic Church with the Orthodox Malankara Jacobite Syrian Orthodox, and the Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church Catholic Conference of Bishops in December 2017 also reflected upon the 500th anniversary of Martin Luther's attempt to reform the Church.⁶ At the Universitas Pelita Harapan in Indonesia, a group of scholars held the conference Sola Scriptura in Asia in "celebration of the continuing legacy of the Protestant Reformation". T In São Leopoldo, in Brazil, a consultation on Reformation – Education – Transformation (R-E-T) took place in November 2015; it was the first part of a study process that was continued in Halle, Germany in 2016.8 In January 2017, the Ecumenical Institute in Heidelberg organised a forum to discuss Lutheran theologies outside Europe. 9 The increasing interest in the global impact of the Reformation was also reflected by an exhibition of the German Historical Museum in Berlin. Entitled "The Luther Effect", the exhibition intended to show the diversity and history, as well as the conflict potentials of Protestantism in the world. 10 Many more events could be mentioned, and the number of publications addressing global perspectives on the Reformation is growing significantly. 11

While this field of study is recent, previous Reformation anniversaries also included international dimensions – at least to some extent. Thus, it has been said that the bicentary of the Reformation in 1717 marked the first genuine international festival of European

⁴ https://2017.lutheranworld.org/content/ethiopian-church-marks-reformation-anniversary-urging-peace-love-and-equality-131.

⁵ http://www.asianews.it/news-en/On-the-anniversary-of-the-Reformation,-Luther-becomes-a-mask-of-the-Noh-Theater-26013.html.

⁶ https://www.indcatholicnews.com/news/34038. There were, of course, also Protestant events and reflections; cf. for instance J. SEBASTIAN, "Celebrating the Dynamic Legacy of the Reformation. An Indian Perspective", in: P. D. W. KREY, *Reformation Observances* 1517-2017 (Eugene, 2017, 43-68).

⁷ Y. LEE, A. R. TALBOT, Sola Scriptura in Asia (Eugene 2018).

⁸ https://2017.lutheranworld.org/content/twin-principle-common-themes-reformation-131.

⁹ F. NÜSSEL, HANS-PETER GROßHANS (Ed.), Lutherische Theologie in außereuropäischen Kontexten. Eine Zusammenschau aus Anlass des 500. Reformationsjubiläums (Leipzig 2017). The idea of political theology has also been related to the Reformation, cf. C.-H. GRENHOLM, G. GUNNER, Lutheran Identity and Political Theology (Cambridge 2015), Introduction: "With the Reformation Jubilee in 2017 in mind, there is a need for critical evaluation of the Lutheran tradition, which has been of great importance not just within the churches but also for society and culture in general. Lutheran traditions have influenced various areas and attitudes — to work, the economy, the state and health care." One chapter tackles questions related to Lutheran perspectives on global health. Perspectives from the global South are also included in: K. FITSCHEN, M. SCHRÖTER, C. SPEHR, E.-J. WASCHKE (Ed.), Cultural Impacts of the Reformation. Documentation of the Wittenberg Conference in August 2017 (2 Volumes, Leipzig 2019).

¹⁰ DEUTSCHES HISTORISCHES MUSEUM (Ed.), *The Luther Effect*. Protestantism – 500 Years in the World (München 2017).

¹¹ D. T. IRVIN (Ed.), The Protestant Reformation and World Christianity. Global Perspectives (Grand Rapids 2017); T. A. HOWARD, M. A. NOLL, Protestantism after 500 Years (Oxford 2016); A. BURGHARDT, S. SINN, Global Perspectives on the Reformation: Interactions Between Theology, Politics and Economics (Leipzig 2017); Jahrbuch Mission 2015: Reformation: Global. Eine Botschaft bewegt die Welt.

Lutheranism. In order to demonstrate the scope – international and geographical – a splendid volume was edited and published in Leipzig by the Gotha theologian Ernst Salomon Cyprianus (1673–1745), *Hilaria Evangelica oder Theologisch-Historischer Bericht vom Anderen Evangelischen Jubel-Fest.*¹² The Hilaria is indeed an impressive survey – it starts with Denmark (including Norway and Iceland) and summarizes the celebrations in German Lutheran territories as well as in England, Holland, Sweden, Poland, Reval and Riga, Hungary, Austria and Silesia. However, the *Dänisch-Hallesche Mission* in Tranquebar (India) which had started in 1706 was not listed. While this may not be very surprising, it could have helped to counteract the argument (as developed by Cardinal Robert Bellarmini in 1585) that the "Lutheran heretics" could not be true because – unlike the Roman-Catholic Church – they had never seen Asia or Africa. ¹⁴

It also seems that vice-versa the Reformation anniversary was not of great interest in Tranquebar: There are no references to the anniversary in the reports and diaries of the missionaries. This was different 50 years later – although one still does not get the impression that the jubilee was a very important event (compared, at least, to the festivities of 2017 which usually went on for several days): The diary entry for October 31st 177616 mentions various conversations with "heathens" whom the missionaries try to convert 17, and in the last paragraph briefly summarizes the celebrations as follows:

¹² C. BACH-NIELSEN, "Christianity in 18th Century Europe" in: J.H.SCHJØRRING & N.A. HJELM, *History of Global Christianity*, Vol. I: European and Global Christianity, ca. 1500 – 1789 (Leiden/Boston 2018, 401 – 443), 424.

¹³ E.S. CYPRIANI, *Hilaria Evangelica*, Oder Theologisch-Historischer Bericht Vom Andern Evangelischen Jubel-Fest (Gotha 1719), in http://digitale.bibliothek.uni-halle.de/vd18/content/titleinfo/2380432.

¹⁴ R. BELLARMIN, *Disputationes* (Tom 1, Ingolstadt 1586, Lib. I.) 1350f.; cf. K. KOSCHORKE, "Konfessionelle Spaltung und weltweite Ausbreitung des Christentums im Zeitalter der Reformation" (*Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche* 91/1994, 10–24) 15 f.; for a discussion of Protestant reactions (which soon referred to Tranquebar) cf. F. LUDWIG, "Zur ,Verteidigung und Verbreitung des Glaubens'. Das Wirken der Jesuiten in Übersee und seine Rezeption in den konfessionellen Auseinandersetzungen Europas" (*Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte* 112, 2001/1, 59–80).

¹⁵ Der Königl. Dänischen Missionarien aus Ost-Indien eingesandter Ausführlichen Berichten, Von dem Werck ihres Amts unter den Heyden (Teil 2, Continuation 13, 1719/Berichtszeit: 1712–1718), 43–44, (Die Franckeschen Stiftungen zu Halle/Saale, Digitale Bibliothek Sign.: MISS:A 1; 121 K 1-9 http://192.124.243.55/digbib/hb.htm).

¹⁶ Der Königl. Dänischen Missionarien aus Ost-Indien eingesandter Ausführlichen Berichten, Von dem Werck ihres Amts unter den Heyden (Teil 9 Continuation 108, 1770/Berichtszeit: 1767), Diarium von der Mission zu Trankenbar im Jahr 1767, pp. 1662 – 1666 (digital: pp 86 – 90), Die Franckeschen Stiftungen zu Halle/Saale, Digitale Bibliothek Sign.:: MISS:A 1; 121 K 1–9 http://192.124.243.55/digbib/hb.htm).

¹⁷ Cf. for instance 1665, digital 89: "Da an eben dem Tag ein anderer aus uns bei Untergang der Sonne nach unserm Garten ging, und zu dem Ruhehause in der Allee gekommen war, traf er einen grossen Haufen Heiden an, die einige Kasten mit den Kleidern, Silber- und Goldschmuck des Götzen, wie auch dessen Palanquin aus Waittia-nadenkowil hieher getragen hatten, um solches in Sicherheit zu bringen, weil man besorget, dass die Marattische Reuterei, so bei Madras geplündert, auch in diese Gegend kommen würde. Man besahe die Kasten und that erst darüber einige Fragen, und hernach diese, wo der Götze selbst wäre? Einer antwortete: Er wird auch bald nachkommen. Auf meine weitere Frage: Wird er zu Fusse kommen, weil sein Palanquin hier stehet, antwortete ein anderer: Ja, hier sind seine Füsse, worauf er gehet. Er wies auf sich selbst und seine Cameraden. Weil ein Gelächter darüber unter ihnen

"Sonst fanden wir uns erweckt, diesen Abend bei Mondschein, zwischen sieben und acht Uhr, mit unseren Tamulischen und Portugiesischen Schulknaben und ihren Schulmeistern, wie auch den Stadtgehülfen, auf zween verschiedenen Altanen in der Stadt, zum Andenken der vor zweihundert und funfzig Jahren durch den Dienst des seligen Lutheri auf götlichen Trieb angefangenen Reformation, ein paar Lieder anzustimmen. Nachdem wir gesungen hatten, fielen wir mit unsern Kindern auf die Knie, und taten ein Gebet. Im Porreiarschen Missionshause ist gleichfals von den dasigen Schulkindern gesungen, und von dem Landprediger Ambros zuletzt ein Gebet gethan worden. Der Herr lasse sich unser geringes Lallen und Seufzen in Jesu Christo wolgefallen! Manches Kind konnte seine Stimme ganz gut erheben, welches in der Ferne angenem zu hören war.¹⁸

In Germany, a national and not an international focus characterized the anniversaries of 1817 and 1917. The "Wartburgfeier" of 1817 was a protest against reactionary politics and for liberty, but there were also xenophobic undertones and anti-Semitic and anti-French sentiments. ¹⁹ The 1917 celebrations took place during the fourth year of the First World War and the national propaganda found expression, for instance, in comparisions between the reformer Martin Luther and the field marshal Paul von Hindenburg (1847–1943) – according to the journal *Der Christen-Bote*, both of them had come at the right time to rescue the German people. ²⁰

However, there is of course much more that can be said about these anniversaries. The 1817 jubilee was used for ecumenical endeavors (mainly from above) – not only in Prussia, where Frederick William III issued a series of decrees that united both Lutheran and Reformed denominations, but also in the Habsburg lands, where the 1817 jubilees were especially significant because of the recent dismantling of the Counter-Reformation by Emperor Joseph II and the favorable policies for Protestants pursued by his conservative

selbst entstand, so beklagte man ihre grosse Blindheit und Torheit, und hielt ihnen das vor, was Psalm 115,4 v.f. von ihren elenden Götzen gesaget wird. Endlich füret man sie auf den waren und lebendigen Gott und dessen herrliche Eigenschaften ..."

¹⁸ Ibid. 1666, digital 90.

¹⁹ W. BEHRINGER, "Climate, Hunger, Anti-Semitism and Reform during the Tambora-Crisis 1815–1829", in: D. LEDERER (Ed.), *German History in Global and Transnational Perspective* (Basingstoke 2017, 9-42) here 16,17: "The Wartburgfeier ... an event still praised as a manifestation of liberty by the German people. The Wartburgfeier was xenophobic, a manifestation of of anti-Semitic and anti-French sentiments. Political observers – such as the Jewish intellectual Saul Ascher (1767–1822), whose books were likewise burnt at the Wartburg immediately concluded that those who burn books also burn people. And Heinrich Heine's judgment was similarly harsh."

^{20 &}quot;Luther und Hindenburg", (Der Christen-Bote, 88/1, 6. Jan 1918, 5): "Sieh da, du deutsches Volk, wie lieb dich der grosse Gott und Vater im Himmel hat: Hätte er wohl sonst vor vierhundert Jahren einen Luther auf den Plan gerufen, gerade als das teure Kleinod des Evangeliums in Gefahr war, vollends ganz unter dem Schutz menschlicher Satzung, ja sogar Gewinnsucht begraben zu werden? Und heute, da das deutsche Volk wiederum in höchster Not ist, da es für dasselbe um Sein oder Nichtsein geht, da ihm ringsum Feind erstanden sind, die auf seine Vernichtung bedacht sind: da beweist der allmächtige Gott aufs neue, dass er das deutsche Volk lieb hat... und schenkt ihm in dieser seiner Gnade einen Hindenburg."

successors. As Scott Berg argued, the Austrian government used this event to display its newfound policies of religious toleration.²¹ The jubilee was also celebrated in Scandinavia and in the USA, where German Lutherans on the one hand emphasized the connection to the traditions in their country of origin²², and on the other hand opened to other Protestant denominations: Thus, the Ministerium of the Evangelical Lutheran Synod of Pennsylvania resolved in June 1817 "that the German Evangelical Reformed Synod, the Moravians (Evangelische Brüdergemeine), the English Episcopal and Presbyterian Churches shall be invited by our President to celebrate the Reformation Festival with us."²³

For US-American Lutheranism, the Reformation jubilee 1917 represented a conscious turning point. In the middle of the preparations the United States declared war on Germany. "Most of the Lutherans in America were of recent German immigrant stock, but they quickly rallied to the support of their adopted country. In order to effectively minister to the Lutheran men in the armed services, Lutherans were forced to work more closely together, and the problems arising from the abnormal conditions created by the war called into being the National Lutheran Council of 1918." In China, too, there was a strong move towards inter-Lutheran cooperation; the General Lutheran Conference in Mount Jigong (*Kikungshan*) in August 1917 aimed to work towards an ultimate union of all the churches established by the various Lutheran missions in China, - one "*Djung-Hwa Sin I-Hwei*" - a union cutting across the mission lines and striving to become a national church. ²⁵

Despite the war, the Reformation anniversary 1917 was also celebrated in other Asian, African, and Latin American countries²⁶, and – while much more research needs to be done

²¹ S. BERG, "The Lord Has Done Great Things for Us": The 1817 Reformation Celebrations and the End of the Counter-Reformation in the Habsburg Lands (*Central European History*, 49/1, March 2016, 69–92).

²² W. FLÜGEL, *Pastoren aus Halle und ihre Gemeinden in Pennsylvania*. Deutsche Lutheraner zwischen Persistenz und Assimilation (Berlin/Boston 2019), Kap. 4.2.: "Der Verweis auf die alte Heimat ist offenkundig: Seit 1617 bilden Reformationsjubiläen einen zentralen Eckpfeiler der lutherischen Erinnerungskultur in Deutschland. Die deutschstämmigen Einwanderer, vor allem die Pastoren, deren Väter mitunter selbst Pfarrer gewesen waren, haben diese Tradition nach Nordamerika mitgebracht. Mit dem Rückgriff auf diese Tradition haben sie auch ihre Säkularfeier legitimiert": "In the year 1617 and 1717, the commencement of the Reformation was celebrated in Europe. The thirty first of October, in 1817, was again hailed as an auspicious era (...)".

²³ FLÜGEL, *Pastoren*, cf. also R. C. WIEDERAENDERS, "Reformation Anniversaries in America have been Coincidences of Crises" (*The Lutheran Standard*, September 19, 1967, 12, 13, 24).

²⁴ WIEDERAENDERS, "Reformation Anniversaries", 13, 24.

^{25 &}quot;Lutheran Union Movements in America and China" (*The Chinese Recorder*, November 1917, 721–727), esp. 725, 726.

²⁶ For South Africa see R. VOSLOO, "Commemoration, rememoration and Reformation: some historical-hermeneutical remarks in light of the 1917 Reformation celebrations of the Dutch Reformed Church" (Studia Historiae Ecclesiasticae 41/3 Pretoria 2015, http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/2412-4265/2015/764). That the celebrations were important is evident from a brief but fairly cynical notice in the International, a weekly journal edited by the Internationalist Socialist League, generally regarded as South Africa's first communist newspaper. In its issue of October 12, 1917 it commented (with a reference to 1 Sam 1:20): "The Provincial Council has postponed the Provincial Elections in the Transvaal in favour of the fourth centenary of Luther. If Luther had been alive today in South Africa, he would have been interned, for, tell it not in Gath, publish it not in the streets of Ascelon, the founder of the Protestant faith, and the prophet of the Reformation, was a "dirty Hun". ("The War Market", 3. For information on the International see

- it is interesting to summarize a report of the Evangelische Missionsmagazin which highlights the Luther perception in Japan at that time: Since the 31st October 1917 was also the birthday of the Japanese emperor and therefore a national holiday, Christians had the opportunity to participate in the Reformation anniversary, and about a thousand people met in the great hall of the Young Men's Christian Association in Tokyo. The leading personalities of the larger Japanese churches were present. After greetings, Bible reading, and prayers, a member of the House of Lords delivered a speech in honor of the Emperor, thanking God that the emperors had ruled uninterruptedly in Japan, and that the country had never seen a revolution. Then the whole assembly rose to sing the national anthem twice and then the Luther hymn in Japanese translation. In his address on the guiding principles of the Reformation, Dr. Ibuka referred to the authority of the Bible, salvation by faith and the universal priesthood of the faithful. But, he asked, if Luther awoke again and he saw the conditions prevailing in Germany, the idolatry of power, the evil tendencies of society, the laxity of moral conditions, what would be think of that? And if he perceived the spiritual and moral state of affairs in Japan, the prevailing superstition, the blindness of the blind leaders, the precipitous path upon which Japanese society is related to morality and religion, what would he say and do about this? In the meeting it was pointed out that a Reformation for Japan was needed.²⁷

The report of the *Evangelische Missionsmagazin* also summarized Japanese academic positions on the Reformation. It referred to Prof. Hino who had pointed out that Luther's first characteristic feature was the subjectivity of religion. In Hino's view, Luther was the founder of individualism in everything, and that was expressed in Luther's doctrine of universal priesthood. In Protestantism the individual is rated higher than in any other religion. This individualism then unfolded particularly well in England. Indirectly, Hino said, the influence of the Reformation in Japan was felt at the time of the founding of the Tokugawa dynasty when the European Counter Reformation was active in the country. But according to Hino, also the right of religious freedom in the Japanese constitution has its origin in Luther's Reformation. Therefore it seemed appropriate to him to celebrate a day of remembrance in honor of Luther and his work. To another scholar, Professor Ushida, it was important that Luther promoted the rights of conscience, which was the meaning of the Reformation. Luther was a man who sacrificed everything he had to humanity and spiritual freedom. His teachings and his work mark the culmination of the history of the human conscience. Therefore, a personality like Luther should not be monopolized by a single nation.²⁸

E. C. JONES, Inkululeko: organ of the communist party of South Africa, 1939–1950, in L. SWITZER, *South Africas Alternative Press*: Voices of Protest and Resistance, 1880–1960 (Cambridge 2009).

In East Africa, the *Uganda Herald* commented on the delayed celebrations in Germany in an article entitled "Postponing Luther" (September 14, 1917, 16): "Prolongation of the war has knocked out a grandios Prussian religious carnival – the celebration of the 400th anniversary of the Reformation, on October 31st and November 1st, of this year. Festivities were to be held at Wittenberg (of notorious fevercamp fame) and at Eisenach, where Luther threw the inkpot at the devil. By the Kaiser's orders the celebration has now been postponed until 1918 – date not fixed. The Kaiser evidently has regained possession of that inkpot – to judge from his latest messages. Perhaps it has been loaned by the one at whom Luther hurled it."

²⁷ T. AMMANN, "Luther in Japan" (Evangelisches Missions-Magazin 62/1918, 84–88).

²⁸ AMMANN, "Luther in Japan" 85, 86.

The Japanese celebrations of 1917 indicate one of the difficulties of such memorials: If Luther, and indeed the Wittenberg event of October 31st 1517(which is very concrete in terms of time and place), cannot be monopolized by a single nation, how then can one relate it to developments in other parts of the world? In the Japanese celebrations, two approaches can be detected: There is a reference to mission history and the missionary impact (in this case indirectly via the counter-reformation), and there is an overall framework of a grand narrative of human progress. Both approaches remained influential in later anniversaries.

The mission historical approach usually connects the Reformation – in one way or the other – to the arrival of missionaries, bible translations and the emerging Protestant churches. Many contributions of the 2017 anniversary analysed the history of Christianity in Africa, Asia, Latin America in this perspective, and they provided valuable insights. However, this approach faces the dilemma that Lutheran missionary initiatives in the Global South started only at the beginning of the 18th and, to a larger extent, during the 19th century. The missionaries who came represented particular strands of Lutheranism which again had emerged in specific contexts. Thus it is difficult to draw a direct line from, let us say Wittenberg 1517 to Tranquebar 1706.

The grand narrative of human progress found a very different expression in the 1967 celebrations. Wittenberg was in the German Democratic Republic, and officials sought to tie the 450 years anniversary to the 50 years jubilee of the Bolshevik Revolution.²⁹ An international symposium was held in Wittenberg in October 1967 and Max Steinmetz and Gerhard Brendler published the contributions in two volumes entitled *Weltwirkung der Reformation* (world-wide impact of the Reformation)³⁰ – a term that has been used before by the (West) German historian Gerhard Ritter. ³¹ Max Steinmetz was important for a new perspective on Luther in the GDR; from the late 1950s onwards, he developed the concept of the Reformation and the peasents' war as the *"frühbürgerlichen Revolution"* ("early bourgeois revolution").³²

In the United States, the 1960s were characterized by civil right movements and attempts were made to link them to the Reformation: Already in July 1966, Martin Luther King hammered his demands on the door of the Chicago Council House - an attempted imitation

²⁹ Cf. T. A. HOWARD, Remembering the Reformation: An Inquiry into the Meanings of Protestantism (Oxford 2016). Howard points out that a few church leaders became vexed with the persistent linking of the Reformationsfeier with the Bolshevik's revolution 50th anniversary. Several high-level church officials, including Bishop Johannes Jaenicke of Magdeburg, resigned in protest.

³⁰ M. STEINMETZ AND G. BRENDLER (Eds.), Weltwirkung der Reformation (Berlin/Ost 1969).

³¹ The term "Weltwirkung der Reformation" (world-wide impact of the Reformation) had been coined before by the Freiburg historian Gerhard Ritter. Cf. G. RITTER, *Die Weltwirkung der Reformation* (Leipzig 1944). New editions of this collection of essays appeared in 1959 (München) and 1969 (Darmstadt). However, Ritter's book focused mainly on Germany and "Northern Lutheranism". It also thematised "German and Western European thinking"; in this context Ritter asked why the interactions between church and state had developed so differently in Germany on the one side and in France and England on the other (1969, 146).

³² Cf. H. LEHMANN, "Das marxistische Lutherbild von Engels bis Honecker", in: H. MEDICK/P. SCHMIDT (Eds.), *Luther zwischen den Kulturen. Zeitgenossenschaft-Weltwirkung* (Göttingen 2004, 505–514).

of Luther's posting of the 95 theses.³³ Some US-American theologians, as for instance John Warwick Montgomery, protested strongly against such connections ("Why do the secular theologians always claim credit for jumping on social bandwagons that have been put into motion outside the church"³⁴), but in general, the discussions on Lutheranism and politics were more nuanced. At the 450th anniversary celebrations of the Reformation in the German Embassy in Washington, D.C. on October 30th, 1967, Dr. C. Thomas Spitz Jr., general secretary of the Lutheran Council in the USA, pointed out that although "we would probably describe him (Luther) as an ultra-conservative", Lutheran passivity in social and political matters is an unfortunate cultural and theological misinterpretation of the Reformation heritage.³⁵ And the editorial "Protestant Yang and Lutheran Yin" of the Christian Century summarized the developments in the 1960s as follows:

"The early years of the decade were full of optimism, of apotheosis of the secular (with sometimes little theos left), of almost utopian charters for the future. Some of these were misleading and have now become demoralizing. By the mid–1960s Americans seemed to be overcompensating with a sense of a new determinism or pessimism, a defeatism in the fact of the urban problem, an apathy in the instance of Vietnam, a choice to "opt out" on the part of the young. If Luther's kind of Protestantism remains in vital dialogue with all the rest of reformed Christianity, it can serve to teach lessons in ambiguity and contradiction even as it can be moved beyond its own endemic tendencies toward quietism, beyond a mere sell-out to the powers that happen to be. (...) Lutheranism has another side. Not only is it full of ambiguity and contradiction. It looks at the wounds of Christ and speaks of God; it stares at the cross and announces love and grace; it remembers the activity of God in Christ and dares to hope and to act."

While 2017 was probably not a time for grand narratives of human progress³⁷, many books published around the 500 years celebrations present the Reformation alongside with other reform and/or protest movements.³⁸ This, of course, is an obvious move to get away from a Wittenberg-centric, Lutheran-centric or Lutheran mission-centric approach and indeed, there

³³ H. LEHMANN, *Martin Luther and the American Imagination* (München 1988), 9, 10. It seems that academic works connecting the name cousins appeared much later: Cf. W. G. NAPHY, *The Protestant Revolution: From Martin Luther to Martin Luther King Jr* (London 2011); S. R. REAVIS, *Martin Luther-Martin Luther King, Jr. and the Black Experience* (New York 2010).

³⁴ J. W. MONTGOMERY, "95 Theses ... for the 450th Anniversary of the Reformation" (*Christianity Today* XII, Oct 27, 1967, 3–5), thesis 82.

^{35 &}quot;Luther: We Need Politicians", (The Lutheran Standard, November 28, 1967, 18).

^{36 &}quot;Protestant Yang and Lutheran Yin", (*The Christian Century*. Editorial, October 25, 1967, 1339, 1340), 1340

³⁷ At the time of our conference, there was the Brexit-decision in Britain which came unexpected for many participants.

³⁸ D. T. IRVIN (Ed.), The Protestant Reformation and World Christianity. Global Perspectives (Grand Rapids 2017) includes chapters on Jews and Muslims in Europe, Spaniards in the Americas, Women from Then to Now, The Synod of Dort on Baptizing the "Ethnics", The Protestant Reformations in Asia: A Blessing or a Curse and The Modern Era: Contemporary Challenges in Light of the Reformation.

had been comparisons between reformers outside Christianity and Martin Luther already in the 19th century. Thus, the Hindu reformer Ramohun Roy (1772–1833), who translated the Vedas and made them available to people who did not understand Sanskrit, has been called the "Luther of Brahmanism" by the English poet Samuel Taylor Coleridge in 1819³⁹, and in 1887, early Indian nationalists referred to Luther and the Hindu mystic Chaitanya (1485–1533) as two key figures "who largely developed the religious life of Europe and of India respectively".⁴⁰ Similarly, the medieval Buddhist monk Shinran (1173–1263) who had initiated a reform movement in Japan, received the title "Luther of Buddhism"⁴¹,and the Muslim reformer Sayyid Dschamāl ad-Dīn al-Afghānī (1838–1897) became the first "Luther of Islam".⁴² The tremendous growth and significant impact of African Independent Churches and Pentecostalism have been also compared to the events in 16th century Europe; Allan Anderson coined the term *African Reformation*.⁴³ The book edited by Dale T. Irvin, *The Protestant Reformation and World Christianity. Global Perspectives* (Grand Rapids, 2017) includes chapters on "Jews and Muslims in Europe", "Spaniards in the Americas", "Women

³⁹ Coleridge wrote to Robert Southey, in Keswick on 31. January 1819: "A Brahmin has, I hear, arisen to attempt what we have both so often wished – viz to be the Luther of Brahmanism – and with all the effect, that could be wished, considering the times." Cf. S. ROBERTS, "The Luther of Brahminism': Coleridge and the Reformation of Hinduism", in: J. VIGUS (Ed.), *Coleridge's Afterlives* (Basingstoke 2008, 85–111).

⁴⁰ In the article "Union of Efforts" of the Indian newspaper *The Tribune*, January 19, 1887 a "delegate" reported about the second meeting of the National Congress which had taken place in Calcutta in December 1886: "The present cold weather witnessed the second great national gathering in Calcutta. Every nook and corner of India responded heartily to the call to lay heads together and reason in order to forward the national cause. Hundreds of persons met for three days together to discuss and determine the burning questions of the hour. It was a perfect sight to see so many healthy signs of political life.... This movement has been denounced as the brain-work of discontended demagogues and professional agitators. We shall not even remotely refer to the cultivated taste which provokes such amateur judgment. But the composition of the Congress demands a notice (...). Were the barons of King John, who secured the rights and the privileges of the English people, discontended demagogues and professional agitators? (...) Were Luther and Chaitanya, who largely developed the religious life of Europe and of India respectively, discontended demagogues and professional agitators? We pause for a reply. If they were agitators, it is such agitation that have swept away old prejudices and have established and re-established the rights of civilized nations, and have brightened the pages of history."

⁴¹ W. E. GRIFFIS, The Religions of Japan (New York 1895, Reprint Teddington 2006), 139; cf. also C. KLEINE, "Der protestantische Blick auf Amida: Japanische Religionsgeschichte als orientalische Fiktion?" in: P. SCHALK, M. DEEG, O. FREIBERGER & C. KLEINE (Eds.), Religion im Spiegelkabinett: Asiatische Religionsgeschichte im Spannungsfeld zwischen Orientalismus und Okzidentalismus (Acta Universitatis Upsaliensis: Historia Religionum 22, Weikersheim 2002); F. HEILER, Die Religionen der Menschheit in Vergangenheit und Gegenwart (Stuttgart 1962), 348.

⁴² B. S. TURNER, *Max Weber:* From History to Modernity (London 1993), 55. For an overview of various Luther-perceptions and Luther-comparisons see F. LUDWIG, "Luther-Wahrnehmungen in Afrika, Asien und Lateinamerika. Aspekte der Rezeption zwischen Ablehnung und Aneignung", REFORMATIONSGESCHICHTLICHE SOZIETÄT DER MARTIN-LUTHER-UNIVERSITÄT HALLE-WITTENBERG (Ed.), *Spurenlese – Wirkungen der Reformation*" (Leucorea-Studie zur Geschichte der Reformation und der lutherischen Orthodoxie, Leipzig 2013, 279–307).

⁴³ A. ANDERSON, African Reformation. African initiated Christianiy in the 20th century (Trenton 2001).

from Then to Now", "The Synod of Dort and the Protestant Reformations in Asia" and "Contemporary Challenges in Light of the Reformation."

It is hardly possible to avoid these comparisons, if one wants to widen the Wittenberg focus and point out that the trademark "Reformation" became a "global citizen". 44 Many theologians and Christians worldwide do not refer to the European Reformation as the most important moment of their own identity. Contributions which focus exclusively on the Reformation of the 16th century and the later "export" of the respective theologies via missionary agencies can easily be seen as hegemonic, Eurocentric patterns of interpretation. On the other side, however, such an inclusive, comparative approach raises, of course, the problem of coherence. Can these protest movements be connected or are the various contexts not too different? As Thomas Kaufmann points out in his contribution to this volume, the pluralization of the term "Reformation" leads to the emergence of a multitude of diverse histories "possibly standing next to each other without relation, and definitely not having one thing: a distinct beginning, to which one can relate in form of an anniversary."45

Another approach is to study the impact of the Reformation in various contexts, and to study theological interactions.⁴⁶ Which interpretations of the "Reformation" have evolved; how can one understand "the heritage of the Reformation"? Which theologies developed during the Reformation became important in Africa, Asia and Latin America? Where are traditions blocking the way; where can they be fruitful?

Approaches, guiding questions and contributions in this volume

This volume uses a variety of approaches – with a strong focus on interactions, especially concerning the political and social role of the churches. The title of the original conference

⁴⁴ https://www.lutheranworld.org/news/lutheran-reformation-global-citizen. Cf. also "Ein Lockruf in alle Welt. Interview mit EKD-Auslandsbischöfin Petra Bosse-Huber", *Jahrbuch Mission 2015*: Reformation: Global. Eine Botschaft bewegt die Welt, 18–25, 18–21: "Gibt es diese Marke "Reformation" auch anderswo? Oder verbirgt sich hinter dem Begriff an anderen Orten eine Bewegung, die anders heisst, aber dieselbe Funktion hat. (...) Ich finde es großartig, dass der Lockruf jetzt umgekehrt von Lateinamerika oder anderen Weltgegenden an uns geht. Es ist richtig zu sagen: Da passiert Reformation heute und deshalb gehören wir dahin. Das ist genauso ein Schauplatz wie es Wittenberg einmal vor 500 Jahren war. (Frage: Ist das ein Zeichen dafür, dass sich die Reformation längst in die Welt verselbständigt hat und gar nicht zurück an die Wurzeln will?) Das kann man sicher so sagen. Oder wie die EKD-Synode es 2012 ausgedrückt hat. "Die Reformation ist zu einer Weltbürgerin geworden." Und Weltbürger sind nicht unbedingt in Wittenberg zu Hause. (...) Wollen wir dieses Martin-Luther Etikett überall draufkleben – das bedeutet auch immer Fürsten-Reformation, Reformation durch die Obrigkeit – oder tun wir nicht gut daran, die gesamte Breite europäischer Reformationsgeschichte in den Blick zu nehmen? Menschen im Rheinland etwa sind durch Flüchtlinge aus den Niederlanden evangelisch geworden, eine verfolgte Minderheit. Es war oft die verfolgte Kirche, die Keimzelle für Neues war."

⁴⁵ T. KAUFMANN, "The Reformation as Historiographical Concept", Chapter 3 in this volume.

⁴⁶ For this approach cf. H. BEDFORD-STROHM, T. GATWA, T. JAEHNICHEN, E. MUSEMAKWELI (Eds.), *African Christian Theologies and the Impact of the Reformation* (Wien/Zürich 2017); C.-H. GRENHOLM, G. GUNNER (Eds.), *Lutheran Identity and Political Theology* (Cambridge 2015).

in 2016 was "The churches of the Reformation in their social and political responsibility for the One World: Case studies and country analyses from Africa, Asia, America and Europe"; as mentioned before, it took place within the framework of the theme of the "Luther Decade" for the year 2016 "Reformation and the One World".

The term "One World" ("Eine Welt") is especially known in the German context: It was coined by the theologian Martin Niemöller; later it symbolized the rethinking of previous conservative development policy during the government of Willy Brandt and stressed the equality in partnership. Since then, references to the "One World" have been frequent - both by politicians and by development experts in the church. The term became popular especially in the Federal Republic of Germany, and the range of topics related to it became fairly wide: In his speech "One World - Our Responsibility" (September 2014), the German Development Minister, Gerd Müller listed climatic change and food crises, erosion of the soil and the struggle for water, scarcity of resources, population growth and megacities, fragile or crumbling states, asymmetric relations and intra-state wars, inequality of life chances and global debt as well as financial market crises, terrorism and organized crime, refugee waves, diseases and epidemics, conflicts caused or increased by political and religious ideologies, global value chains and transnationally operating companies, globally networked civil society and new forms of communication, as challenges. 47

It was the aim of the conference to analyze the internal negotiation processes and to ask questions such as: How do churches exercise their influence? In which public discourses do churches participate; where do they have some influence? What options are there; how can the situation of the Protestant churches in the respective social and religious environment be evaluated? In what areas are forms of cooperation between church and state established? Where did alliances with other religious and / or civil society institutions develop? How do Protestant churches translate the concern of the "responsibility for the world" into the various contexts? How do they react and relate their programmes to the United Nations' 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, *Transforming Our World*, with its intended "far-reaching and people-centred set of universal and transformative goals and targets"?⁴⁸ Does the growing interest of the UN (and other key actors of development policy)⁴⁹ in religion lead to a closer cooperation?

Another main focus of the conference were theological interactions, and it was an important insight that there is a mutual interconnectedness: Luther had not only an impact on World Christianity, but also World Christianity had an impact on Luther. After all, the age of the Reformation was also the age of European expansion, and – as DAVID DANIELS showed

⁴⁷ G. MÜLLER (Bundesentwicklungsminister), Rede beim 3. Internationalen Strategie-Symposium der Hanns-Seidel-Stiftung, September 2014, in: http://www.bmz.de/de/presse/reden/minister_mueller/2014/September/201410930 rede symposium hss.html.

⁴⁸ UNITED NATIONS, *Transforming Our World*. 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, September 2015, https://docs.google.com/gview?url=http://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/21252030%20Agenda%20for%20Sustainable%20Development%20web.pdf&embedded=true, 6.

⁴⁹ Cf. for instance A. KARAM (Ed.), Religion, Development, and the United Nations (Social Science Research Council, 2012), https://www.ssrc.org/publications/view/EB4B29C9-501D-E211-BB1A-001CC477EC 84/.

in his paper (Chapter 2 "Luther and Ethiopian Christianity"), the Wittenberg reformer was aware of Ethiopian Christianity and, indeed, impressed by it. "Ethiopia and Africa belonged to Luther's theological world"; the Wittenberg reformer contrasted the Ethiopian Church favourably with (Catholic) Christianity in Europe. To Luther, Ethiopia was among the first nations and Gentiles to convert to Christianity, and the story of Philip and the eunuch from Ethiopia in Acts 8 was important in this regard. Mathis Gerung's miniature of Acts 8, 26-40 in the "Ottheinrich-Bible" (completed between 1530 and 1532) is therefore replicated on the cover page of this volume. ⁵⁰

THOMAS KAUFMANN's contribution (Chapter 3 "The Reformation as Historiographical Concept") prepares the ground for the discussion of the different perceptions of the Reformation. He focuses on the genesis and the historical development of concepts of interpretations of the Reformation in Germany. His paper also aims to make the current dissonances in the international historiography of the Reformation transparent and touches on the role of the different worldwide recollections of the Reformation. Kaufmann points out that since there is no longer a unified narrative of "the" Reformation, the historiographical preconditions of a global memorial of the Reformation are complex.

The following two chapters introduce interpretations of the Reformation in different continental settings. Given the hybrid cultural identities and fluid religious affiliation of many believers in Latin America, Wanda Deifelt (Chapter 4 "Ecclesia Semper Reformanda: Intercultural and Interreligious Contributions to an Ongoing Reformation") asks what contributions intercultural and interreligious conversations can offer to a contemporary notion of Reformation. She contends that Luther's hermeneutic of grace offers a viable theological alternative for today's challenges. Although the idea of intercultural and interreligious dialogue and cooperation were not always evident and although many reformers – Martin Luther included – were often belligerent and bellicose in their statements, the theological breakthrough of the Reformation allows us, so Deifelt, to read the reformers critically and to come to terms with the radical message of the Gospel. "To acknowledge ongoing Reformation (ecclesia semper reformanda) is to take up the challenges and opportunities presented by our own time and context."

⁵⁰ The artist Mathis Gerung (1500–1570) from Lauingen near Ulm was influenced by Albrecht Dürer (1471–1528), Lucas Cranach the Elder (1472–1553) and Hans Burgkmair the Elder (1473–1531). His woodcuts illustrated Luther's concerns and views of the world, for instance in regard to the expansion of the Ottoman Empire. Cf. T. A. BRADY JR, *German Histories in the Age of Reformations, 1400 – 1650* (Cambridge 2009), 362; about Gerung cf. also A.-F. EICHLER, *Mathis Gerung (um 1500–1570)*: Die Gemälde (Frankfurt/Bern 1994). However, the "Ottheinrich-Bible" as such cannot be completely assigned to "the Reformation": The work was commissioned around 1430 by Ludwig VII, the Bearded, Duke of Bavaria-Ingolstadt, and the text dates back to a German translation of the Vulgata around 1350. The illumination of the text was started in Regensburg during the 15th century, but only about one-fifth of the miniatures were completed before the work was interrupted. Sometime before 1530, Ottheinrich (1502–1559, Count Palatine of Palatinate-Neuburg from 1505 to 1559, prince elector of the Palatinate from 1556 to 1559) acquired the Bible and commissioned Gerung to complete the sequence of miniatures, which previously extended only as far as the Gospel of St. Mark. Cf. https://www.wdl.org/en/item/4106/; https://www.historisches-lexikon-bayerns.de/Lexikon/Ottheinrich-Bibel (with further literature/Last accessed May 29th, 2019).

In his "From European to African Reformation: African Indigenous Churches in an Age of Globalization" (Chapter 5), AFE ADOGAME argues that Reformation within Christianity should be seen more as a continuous, dynamic process of renewal rather than as a one-off process. In order to re-envision the longue duree of Reformation, he provides an overview of the historiography from the 1960s to the present. To Adogame, the use of the term "African Reformation" for a description of the rapid growth of African initiated churches (AICs) and African charismatic churches is an important move, because then African perspectives and narratives are not longer "non-topics" or marginal in Reformation studies. They cannot be longer simply described as "protest movements" and "break-away churches" (as some earlier observers have done), but are taken more serious, and at the same time the conversation on the Reformation is widened by including the breadth dimension of reforming movements in Africa and in other global South realities.

If one wants to draw a line from "European Reformation" to "African Reformation", Bible translations could possibly serve as a connecting theme. As Luther's Bible translation became important in Germany, Bible translations into African languages were crucial for the appropriation of Christianity by Africans.⁵¹ This is a starting point for ITUMELENG DANIEL MOTHOAGAE's paper "The 1830–1857 Translation of the English-Setswana Bible as a Political Project" (Chapter 6). Reformation brought with it, Mothoagae states, the decentralization of Latin as a used language in church communities in reading the Bible as the word of God. Such a move meant that the Bible had to be understood by the people and be written in their local languages. The vernacularization of the Bible was a political, economic and social attempt of removing the Bible from ecclesiastical hierarchy into the faith communities. However, Mothoagae argues, the vernacularization of the Bible was never an innocent enterprise. The translation of the Bible into Setswana (a Southern African language) can be seen as an attempt to indoctrinate the first Batswana Christians. In the texts Luke 8: 27-38 and Luke 14: 14-20, for example, "evil spirits" are translated as "badimo" (the word used for ancestors in the traditional religion). This was, Mothoagae argues, an attempt to reorder the Batswana cosmology and to bring about a cultural revolution. "It is in these translated texts that power relation, cultural dominance, subordination and colonization of badimo as agents of darkness comes to the fore."

The second paper from South Africa in this volume is IGNATIUS SWART's contribution "Mainline Churches and the Prospects of a Reviving Kairos Consciousness: Reflecting on Religious and Social Change as a Research Focus in Post-Apartheid South Africa" (Chapter 7). Swart's point of departure is a new academic interest in the socio-religious reality of a reviving Kairos theological tradition or consciousness in post-apartheid South Africa, which, he argues, is also intricately related to an interest that is of direct relevance for this volume's focus on the churches of the Reformation in their contemporary social and political responsibility – the question of the potential and actual role of the country's historic mainline churches as reviving socio-political change agents. Swart, from this vantage point, proceeds to explore the discourse and appeals of especially two ecclesial letters through which the

⁵¹ Cf. L. SANNEH, Translating the Message (Markyknoll 1989, 2009).

leadership of a broad ecumenical representation from South Africa's mainline churches have in recent times sought to engage with the country's ruling party, the African National Congress (ANC). His verdict is that that the two letters could be considered as the boldest manifestation to date of the socio-religious reality of a reviving Kairos conscious in post-apartheid South Africa. This leads him to conclude his paper by looking forward to an envisaged longer-term research focus that would be steered by the research question about the prospects of a reviving Kairos consciousness actually becoming a meaningful catalyst of positive social change in post-apartheid South African society. Swart, in this respect, continues to highlight four topical concerns that need to be taken into consideration and researched in relation to a concern with the post-apartheid Kairos theme.

South Africa plays a significant role in the formation of public theologies in the Global South, as is illustrated in the first part of CHRISTINE LIENEMANN-PERRIN's article "Public Theology Emerging in Protestant Churches in the Global South" (Chapter 8). While extensive interpretations of the oeuvres of Luther, Calvin, Zwingli and others are not widespread in contemporary ethical writings of churches in the Global South, churches situating themselves explicitly and emphatically in the tradition of the 16th and 17th century Reformation are not absent, and in South Africa with its Reformed tradition there is, of course, a special focus on John Calvin. Readings of Calvin in South Africa are interesting because of the very diverse – even contradictory – comments on his oeuvre. Church leaders and theologians of the (white) Reformed Churches in South Africa have made use of Calvin's legacy to create and shape the Apartheid state while black and coloured together with a few white South Africans have opposed Apartheid by equally referring to Calvin. A third way of reading Calvin can be observed across the color bars in post-apartheid South Africa. The second part of Lienemann-Perrin's paper addresses some indirect traces of reformatory thinking in political ethics in the South, illustrated by examples from Asia. Lienemann-Perrin looks especially into church and state relations and the emergent liberation ethics in a time of growing state authoritarianism. The character and task of public theology in Protestant churches in the Global South are summarized in the concluding part.

The wide spectrum of Asian theologies and reformatory traditions is addressed in other contributions, and two of them focus on China. FUK-TSANG YING analyses "State-Church Relationships in Reform China" (Chapter 9). His starting point is the Third Plenum of the 11th Central Committee of the Communist Party of China (CPC) in December 1978 which marked the advent of reform and opening in China. During the past 38 years, he observes, the socialist economy of China has been turned upside down. Although reform and opening have been mainly expressed in the economic sphere, economic reform could not help but have a profound impact on other aspects of the society. On one hand, the ruling CPC turned from the political messianism of the era of Mao Zedong to rationalism and pragmatism, and the de-ideologization process in the intellectual realm eventually lead to the new prospects of intellectual freedom. On the other hand, China gradually threw off the shackles of a politicized society, while the relationship between the Party-State and society underwent a complicated restructuring and reestablishment. "No one should doubt that such transformations have had a fundamental impact in the religious sphere."

The study of NA CHEN and LIZUGU FAN "Conversion as an Overlapping Development of Indigenous Tradition – Understanding the Practice of Confucian Xiao among Li Village Christians" (Chapter 10) provides a Chinese perspective of the Reformation "as a historical

process to reach a significant goal of peace" and considers the 1648 treaty of Westphalia as an echo of the Confucian value of "harmony without conformity". It then turns to the cultural conflicts between Christian missionaries and indigenous people, especially the Chinese Rites controversy in the 17th and 18th centuries. The focus of the issue is the Confucian value of *Xiao* (孝), of which the English term of "filial piety" is a barely acceptable translation. Whether *Xiao* is considered as a religious or secular value, it has been a controversial issue in both the Christian orthodoxy and orthopraxy. It is reported, however, that in some Christian communities the Confucian value of *Xiao* is taken as the major positive yardstick in the judgment of behavior among local Christians. Using the case of Li Village in west Henan province, the article of Na Chen and Lizugu Fan attempts to examine the interaction between the incoming Christianity and the indigenous Confucianism and to reach a deeper understanding of religious conversion.

As Na Chen and Lizugi Fan open their article with Chinese interpretations of the Reformation, ANDAR PARLINDUNGAN uses Indonesian perspectives of the Reformation as a starting point. In his paper "Reformation and Wider Outlook Works - Change and Challenges of the 500 Years of Reformation in the Context of Indonesian Churches" (Chapter 11) he highlights an understanding which promotes biblical/theological teaching on anti-corruption as part of the work of eradicating poverty." The arrival of Christianity in Indonesia, especially in the late 18th century and the beginning of the 19th century, Parlindungan elaborates, coincided with colonialism and imperialism. The colonists were also predominantly Christian. Thus Christianity was stigmatized as the "colonial religion" (religion of the Netherlands). De Indische Kerk was the Netherland Church, which 400 years ago entered the island of Indonesia after the VOC army seized Fort Victoria in Ambon from the hands of the Portuguese. De Indische Kerk was a state church, whose authority was influenced by the colonial government. At the same time, it must be recognized that there were missionaries from the West who were not bound by the colonial or imperialist system. They were even considered, in fact, as enemies by the colonialists. For the Christians in Indonesia, these missionaries are even more important than the Reformer Luther. According to Parlindungan, they are considered the ones who have brought the light of the Gospel to the people. They are known as the liberators, who introduced a new era of modern civilization through the Gospel, development, health, and education. Nevertheless, he concludes, the stigma is still there. Christians are still seen as less nationalistic people, although a number of Christians were involved in the struggle for independence.

From Indonesia, we turn to Russia and start again with a historical analysis. OLGA KURILO's "The Role of the Evangelic Lutheran Church in Russia in times of Political Transition" (Chapter 12) traces the changes that the Evangelic Lutheran church in Russia experienced in the 20th century from the First World War and the October Revolution, to the Second World War, the collapse of the USSR and Perestroika. Because of emigration, deportation and assimilation its identity was radically transformed. At the beginning of the 20th century the Evangelical Lutheran church could be defined according to its members, pastors and language of church services as a German Church. By the end of the 20th century the most important Lutheran church in Russia became a church with a German tradition. Kurilo's paper focuses on the social and political role of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in these changing contexts and also describes the challenges the church is facing now.

"'A Faith of Protest and Mere Denial?' Prospects for Lutheranism for the Post-Soviet World" is the title of BRADN BUERKLE's paper (Chapter 13). It opens with Fyodor Dostoevsky's (Dostojevskij's) negative assessment of Lutheranism which to the great Russian writer was something utterly foreign. Yet, at the same time, he was living in a country where the Protestant presence stretched back to the 16th century and where more than a million Lutherans lived. In contrast to Dostoevsky's evaluation, Buerkle argues that they played a significant, constructive role in Russian society. Their place today, Buerkle argues, differs significantly from pre-Revolutionary times, and in the post-Soviet context the churches are still in the process of formulating their own identity and taking on responsibility.

The third paper on Russia, ANDREI S. DESNITSKY's "Waltzing with the Kremlin: ROC and the State in Present Day Russia" (Chapter 14) focuses on the Russian Orthodox Church and therefore can be seen as an excurse in this volume on the churches of the Reformation. However, it provides important insights into the Russian context. Desnitsky begins his analysis with the reintroduction of religious freedom in the USSR by M. Gorbatchev in 1988; this was the time when Orthodox believers were celebrating the thousandth anniversary of the "Baptism of Russia". By now the Russian Orthodox Church (ROC) has been free from the communist oppression for almost thirty years, and these years were full of political and economic changes. Russia moved from the state socialism to the most liberal society and then to an autocratic regime based on "traditional values". Meanwhile, even if ROC did not change internally, its relations with the state did not remain the same as they were in the nineties. It obviously changed, Desnitsky states, with the third term of Vladimir Putin when traditional values and national identity became the core of the new ideology: "On the one hand, the leaders of ROC did not want to associate closely with the state, on the other, more and more often they were deliberately choosing rhetorical strategies and practical measures that looked rather positive for the Kremlin." Desnitsky describes this relationship as a "waltz", and his paper gives a few practical examples of these tendencies and provides some general observations of this dance.

A different relationship is highlighted by MARGRET OBAGA and WILLIAM OBAGA: They look into "North-South Church Partnerships" (Chapter 15). These partnerships aim to develop mutual relationships to foster community through exchange of employees and volunteers, education, fellowship, compassion, mission and development. The Obagas point out that these partnerships also need intentional conversations around the difficult questions related with mindset and culture change in global power structures. There is a need to close the gaps in culturally-informed priorities and approaches, and to cultivate intercultural communication with Christian communities in the diaspora, especially those from the southern hemisphere residing in the northern hemisphere. In these partnerships, the globalized churches of the Reformation can strengthen each other's capacity for continual reflection on current theological and missiological thinking at the denominational level while recognizing the necessity of broader ecumenical participation. One aspect of these partnerships is mutual personnel exchange – German mission organisations today not only send co-workers to their partner churches and institutions but also receive co-workers from them. The Obagas emphasize that personnel exchange between academic institutions needs strengthening.

Ecumenical co-workers and missionaries in Germany come from different partner churches, but it seems that Tanzania, Ethiopia, India, Indonesia and Brazil are well

represented. The Brazilian context is highlighted in the following two papers. Under the title "Between Brazilian 'Coolness' and German 'Rigorousness'" FRITZ HEINRICH introduces "Hybrid Lutheran Identities in a Dreamed up Paradise" (Chapter 16). His paper provides a background of Protestant history in Brazil since the arrival of the first German speaking peoples at the bank on the middle course of the river Rio dos Sinos (about 40 km north of Porto Alegre) in July 1824. The process of "Brazilianisation" was slow: In the 1940s, sole of them had lived in Brazil in the fourth generation, but still spoke in their traditional German dialects, read German newspapers, went to German schools, attended German services and prepared their dishes in a German style. In particular their religiosity apparently remained not only Lutheran but as well somehow German bound. Heinrich analyses particularly the 450th anniversary of Reformation at the *Escola Superior de Teologia* in Sao Leopoldo in 1967 and shows that most of the debates mirror to some extent the contemporary discussions in the German theological field of that time. However, one can also trace roots of "Lutheran Brazilian" theological approaches. Today, their visibility increased significantly.

One of the contemporary Brazilian Lutheran theologians is FELIPE GUSTAVO KOCH BUTTELLI, whose contribution "Religion and Transformative Development" outlines "the Social and Political Responsibility of the Protestant Churches in Brazil." His article offers, first, an overview on the role of religion in Brazilian Public space in a historic perspective. Secondly, he debates the concept of development and critically reflects the results of the developmental agenda in Brazilian and most of Latin American societies. Koch Buttelli analyzes the voices of representatives of some humanitarian and developmental institutions related to Protestant Churches and ecumenical bodies in order to provide a vision of the main notions of development and engagement in society which guide their agendas and initiatives. He then discusses to which extent this notion responds, as a Christian and Protestant voice, to the Brazilian reality as a southern country living and struggling under a globalized and neoliberal capitalism. Koch Buttelli suggests the concept of transformative development as a central notion guiding the policies of Protestant churches and church related institutions.

As in Brazil, in North America Lutheranism came with migrants, and migrants from Germany played a major role in these contexts. In his contribution "North American Lutheranism from the Eighteenth to the Twentieth Century" (Chapter 18) HARTMUT LEHMANN points out that the Lutherans who emigrated from Central Europe and Scandinavia to North America in the course of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries experienced a completely new religious and social situation as they had to organize themselves independently of state protection. As a result, they had to conceive their churches as part of a relatively loose system of Protestant denominations. Unity was hard to achieve as continuous waves of Lutheran immigrants led to pluralism, in fact to frequent secessions, to regional and even local fragmentation. Lehmann then introduces the different situation of the twentieth century in which "the political aberrations of German Lutherans placed a heavy burden also on the shoulders of their American brothers and sisters."

CHARLES AMJAD-ALI's paper also tackles the situation in the United States. He observes that even when churches like the Lutherans, Calvinists and Anglicans/Episcopalians had denominational roots in the Reformation, they transformed their theology. In the US most Protestants had an intensely individualized faith and a voluntary associational ecclesial model based on the evangelical revival. According to Amjad-Ali, this first led to the inland mission in the US, and then to overseas mission. The latter concern led to the formation of the

American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions in 1810 which was directly based on the London Missionary Society. After the Civil War of 1861–65, a need was felt for new church plantation and for the conversion of the increasing immigrant population to particular expressions of Evangelical Christianity: the "conversion" of growingly maligned and marginalized first nation people; the newly "freed" African-American slaves in the postbellum South; and finally for the urban mission to convert the ever growing Catholic immigrant community in the cities. What is given little or no attention, Amjad-Ali states, "is the deep overwhelming racism prevalent at all levels of the society at the time and thus also in its missionary structures. This racist element must have a more vital epistemological role in any critical study and analysis of mission for any relevant contemporary understanding of it." His paper is therefore entitled "US Mission: Racism, Associational Ecclesiology, Colonialism and Modernity" (Chapter 19).

Concluding Remarks

The contributions of this volume provide critical perspectives and analyses of the Reformation in various contexts. The views expressed by the authors do not necessarily represent the positions of the editors and they challenge us with different interpretations: In some of them, the Reformation is presented as a (continuing) protest movement, others emphasize the hermeneutics of grace or – unexpectedly perhaps – the tradition of tolerance and compromise. Some focus on Bible translations and the coming of the early missionaries who on the one side are celebrated as liberators, but on the other side can be also seen as collaborators in racist and colonial systems. Other contributions elaborate the ambiguities of Protestant theologies and of development work, and many of them reflect processes of appropriation of the Reformation heritage in different settings.

The themes and locations are, of course, not complete. There are many more interactions between the Reformation and processes of globalisation which need to be considered, such as, for instance, the impact of the Western European expansion and the conquest of Latin America by Spain and Portugal or the competing expansion of the Ottoman Empire which bound the forces of Emperor Charles V and thus helped the Lutherans. In the case studies, some countries with a larger Lutheran presence are missing in – most notably Ethiopia⁵², Tanzania⁵³, Namibia⁵⁴ and India.⁵⁵

⁵² O. EIDE, Revolution & Religion in Ethiopia: The Growth & Persecution of the Mekane Yesus Church, 1974–85 (London 2000); J. HAUSTEIN, Writing Religious History: The Historiography of Ethiopian Pentecostalism (Wiesbaden 2011); F.G. KUSSA, Evangelical Faith Movement in Ethiopia: The Origin and Estabishment of the Ethiopian Church Mekane Yesu (Minneapolis 2009); J. LAUNHARDT, Evangelicals in Addis Ababa. With Special Reference to the Ethiopian Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus (Hamburg/Münster 2004).

⁵³ F. LUDWIG, Church & State in Tanzania (Leiden 1999).

⁵⁴ C.J. HELLBERG, *Mission, Colonialism, and Liberation*: The Lutheran Church in Namibia, 1840–1966 (New Namibia Books, 1997); P. KATJAVIVI, P. FROSTIN, K. MBUENDE, *Church and Liberation in Namibia* (London 1990).

⁵⁵ J. SEBASTIAN, "Celebrating the Dynamic Legacy of the Reformation. An Indian Perspective" in: P. D. W. KREY, *Reformation Observances* 1517–2017 (Eugene, 2017, 43–68); R. Sahayadhas (Ed.), *Hindu*

In our contemporary global context, also migration from the "Global South" deserves more attention. Migration is not only a key factor with regard to the understanding of contemporary economic dimensions in development discourses, but serves to highlight the chances and challenges of societal cohabitation, and religious communities play a significant role in this. The Evangelical Lutheran Church in America, for instance, developed a deliberate strategy to include the new migrant communities. ⁵⁶In the Protestant churches in Germany, new international convents are formed and in 2014 the EKD published the important text *Gemeinsam Evangelisch* which provides theological orientations and perspectives for the cooperation with migrant congregations. ⁵⁷ More reflections on migration in early Protestant history might be helpful – after all, the ius migrandi was one of the important individual rights established at the peace treaty of Augsburg in 1555.

It is hoped that this book encourages further research and discussions. It shows that "Reformation theology" or "Reformatory church processes" are not to be archived as something of the past, but are very much alive today. The Reformation tradition has given emphasis to the competence of local communities all around the world to read and interpret the Bible in their own languages and to be interpreters of their own realities in the light of faith, thereby strengthening their independence from agents of either religious or secular media to manipulate and exploit their religious longings. The discourses about the liberative power of the Gospel with, over against and/or within local cultures can never be at a standstill.⁵⁸

Nationalism and the Indian Church. Towards an Ecclesiology in Conversation with Martin Luther (New Delhi 2013). For literature on Lutherans in specific countries cf. the entries in T. J. WENGERT (Ed.), Dictionary of Luther and the Lutheran Traditions (Grand Rapids 2017); for continents cf. also the entries in V. LEPPIN & G. SCHNEIDER-LUDORFF (Eds.), Das Luther-Lexikon (Regensburg 2014).

⁵⁶ Cf. ELCA African Descent Strategic Plan, "Many Voices, Tell the Story, Create the Vision: Build Our Future", in: https://www.elca.org/Our-Work/Congregations-and-Synods/Ethnic-Specific-and Multicultural-Ministries/African-Descent. (Last accessed February 2019). ELCA also established ministries among Christian Middle Eastern immigrants, Asian and Pacific Islander and Latinos.

⁵⁷ https://www.ekd.de/ekd_de/ds_doc/ekd_texte_119.pdf (Last accessed February 2019). A brief overview of the integration efforts in Germany is given in: F. LUDWIG, "Mission und Theologie in Migrationsgemeinden", in: C. RAMMELT, E. HORNUNG, & V.-O. MIHOC, *Begegnung in der Glokalität*. Christliche Migrationskirchen in Deutschland im Wandel der Zeit (Leipzig 2018, 199–212).

⁵⁸ D. WERNER, The Churches of the Reformation in their Social and PoliticalResponsibility for the One World – Conference Reflections (unpublished), June 25th, 2016.