Paul Marnay

Basic concepts of ethics in the darsanas

Presented in the light of their respective concepts of man





Basic concepts of ethics in the darsanas

Presented in the light of their respective concepts of man

Trajectoires, mouvements, changements dans le sous-continent indien

Coll. Dirigée par Brigitte Tison

Cette collection est destinée à décrire, analyser, développer les mouvements de populations originaires du Sous-Continent indien ainsi que les populations du sud-est de l'Asie, de la Chine, des îles. Les raisons de ces mouvements de populations sont multiples tant économiques que religieuses ou guerrières. Parmi ces populations, nous ferons une place aux trajectoires d'écrivains, d'artistes, de défenseurs des libertés et aux voyageurs. L'influence de pays à travers leurs populations expatriées pourra faire partie de cette collection : vivent-elles? Ouelles adaptations? Cloisonnements. ghettos? Ouels échanges ont-elles entre elles? Une attention toute particulière sera portée aux champs de l'éducation et du soin. Les objectifs seront de mieux informer, d'apporter des compléments de connaissances pour mieux comprendre et améliorer les relations entre les peuples, la cohabitation dans nos villes. Les théories et pratiques seront le « fer-de-lance » de la collection ainsi que l'acquisition de savoir faire et de savoir être

Courses, Movements, Changes in India

Coll. Directed by Brigitte Tison

This collection is intended to describe, to analyze, develop the movements of populations originated from India as well as populations from south east asia, China, islands.

The causes of these movements of populations are many as much as economic, religious or warlike. Among these populations, we shall make a special place to the writters, the artists, the actor's freedom, the travellers ... We shall make the same with the diaspora 'populations. How they lived? Which adaptations? Ghettos or not. Have they any exchange among them?

We shall look after fields of education and care in particular. The aims will be informations, knowledges to improve people's relations and understandings, the housing in our cities.

Theories and Practices will be the most important in this collection just as the gains of knowledges (how, being).

Paul Marnay

Basic concepts of ethics in the darsanas Presented in the light of their respective concepts of man



Acknowledgement

Thank very much to the brother Xavier Chevillard for the confidence he gave me.

The christian thoughts of paul Marnay focused on the hindou thoughts. This reflexion could be known for the researchers in philosophy and religious sciences.

M. Pryen, director of L'Harmattan, has accepted that this text could be published in english. Thanks to him.

It's therefore published in english, in which Paul Marnay wrote his text and presented to Madras university (Tamil Nad – South India).

Fait à Paris, le 23 08 2016,
Brigitte Tison, Dr en psychologie Indologue,
Anciennement enseignante
À l'Institut national des langues Orientales, (INALCO)
À l'école laïque des religions de Paris (ELPR)

© L'Harmattan, 2016 5-7, rue de l'Ecole-Polytechnique, 75005 Paris

> http://www.harmattan.fr diffusion.harmattan@wanadoo.fr harmattan1@wanadoo.fr

ISBN: 978-2-343-10136-1 EAN: 9782343101361

Introduction

The hindu traditions which found their classical expression in the six darsanas, were living and lived answers to man's questions about himself, his destiny, the significance of his insertion in society and in the universe, the nature of reality, etc... Each one sprung from creative insights and beliefs¹. The purpose of the present study is: (1) to analyze their ethico-religious views in reference to their respective concepts of man as embedded in different outlooks on reality and in the light of their originating insights and beliefs, (2) and to compare their different approaches to the basic concepts of ethics.

We take the term ethics as denoting the practical knowledge which regulates man's conscious actions in relation to his ultimate end or ends. This alternative refers to the fact that the early Mimamskas up to the time of kumarila Bhatta believed that man's unique end was happiness as experienced in this universe, whereas all the other traditions (and the later Mimamskas too) teach that man is faced with a radical choice: happiness within this and other (finite) worlds at the cost of tranmisgrating existence which is inescapably beset with suffering, or liberation from the bondage that sorrowful transmigration is. These two mutually inconsistent ends determine therefore two ethical perspectives: the one is secular (secular ethics), the other is trans-worldly (meta-ethics).

We have selected four dasanas: Purva-Mimamsa (first exegesis), the Nyaya-darsana, the Yoga-darsana and the Uttara Mimamsa or Vedanta. This selection that is primarily meant to keep the present work within reasonable limits, is however not arbitrary. The well known affinities between the Vais'esika-darsana and the Nyaya-darsana on the one hand and between the Samkhya-darsana

And the Yoga-darsana on the other hand, would have caused fastidious repetitions if they had been separately considered. We preferred the Yoga-darsana to the Samkya-darsana because for the former'role in hindu spirituality and because of its special attention to ethical matters. The choice of the Nyaya-darsana is justified by its exhaustive study of the law of karma. The Vedanta is represented by Sankara(s non-dualism (advaita-Vedanta) and by Ramanuja's "Non dualism of the differenced as such" (visista-advaita). It is not without regret that Madhava's affinities with Ramanuja's views, it is the echo of a different religious and mystical tradition and contains some original insights about man's destiny.

The present work is based on the earliest commentary on the aphoristic manifest of each tradition that is now extant. References to subsequent works will be made whenever these works clarify obscure points, present relevant developments and help to single out the originating insights and beliefs. Moreover, the choice of first commentaries is not arbitrary and can be justified on the following

grounds: (1) although the authors of the Bhasyas were not the founders2 of new schools of thought, their deep personal understanding of the stand-point of their tradition and their existential commitment to the corresponding way of life and spirituality, enabled them to expound forcefully the comprehensive wisdom that they had inherited, in the light of its original insights and beliefs; (2) later, these creative elements became obscured by an excess of conceptual technicalities due partly to the propensity of teachers to indulge in abstract teaching and to stress marginal differences within one selfsame tradition at the expense of their fundamental agreement and partly to the requirements of controversies between orthodox traditions or with opponents from outside.

The twofold aspect of the present study determines its method and structure. Each tradition is considered in itself and analyzed separately so as to grasp its inner dynamism and, in function of this, the consistency and harmony of its different elements; special psychological basis of the image of man, and the ethical climate which determines the understanding of the basic concepts of ethics. After five quasi monographs, the ethical views of the different schools will be compared and their complementarity and opposition analyzed.

A comparative consideration of the direct means to salvation in reference to the nature of the saving experience leads to recognize different spiritualities: the Yoga spirituality of aloneness as rooted in the natural inclination of the mental faculty toward the saving experience. The advaitic spirituality of beatitudinous aloneness as the echo of the absolute and blissful autonomy of the non-dual Brahman that is the Self, the Ramanujiya spirituality of aloneness in dependence, and the Ramajiya spirituality of union as befitting a being whose sole essence-and-joy "to serve" his Lord through loving intuitive meditation. Special attention is given in the analysis of the path to salvation to the function of the discipline of action and the nature and function of bhakti and grace.

The present comparative approach tends to emphasize the specificity of the ethical views and spiritualities which correspond to different "images of man" within the Brahmanic orthodoxy; this should not however blur their profound affinities; a brief comparison with the Indian non-brahmanic view-points and with the Christian approach will manifest them.

My grateful thanks are due specially to Dr. T. M. P. Mahadevan who helped me, through his commentary of the Bhagavad-Gita, to perceive the existential coherence of the Advaitic view-point, and to Prof. K Balasubramania. May I be permitted also to recall my debt of gratitude to Prof. O. Lacombe who introduced me to the Vedanta and to J. Marit in who awakened me to the philosophical approach to Being-Truth.

Acknowledgment

I express sincere thanks to the authorities of the University of Madras for providing me with all facilities for conducting my research-work at the center for advanced study in philosophy.

CONTENTS

Preface3	
Acknowledgment	
Abbreviations9	
Summary	
Introduction	
I – Sabara's outlook on life41	
II- Gotams's rational approach to man's destiny	
III-The yogic saving experience	
IV- The saving realization of self as Brahman	
V- Ramanuja's personalistic theism	
VI- Conclusion : a threefold comparison	
Notes	
Introduction(312	2)
Chapter I(312	2)
Chapter II(319))
Chapter III	1)
Chapter IV	7)
Chapter V(338	3)
Conclusion (349))
Bibliography(351	L)

Abreviations

Remark – In the following list, the numbers refer to the bibliography		
Ap	17	Mimamsa Nyaya prakasa
As	15	The Arthasamgraha of Laugaksi Bhaskara
AV	7	L'Absolu selon le Vedanta
Br	18	Brhati (in V Br p. 43/P, V=Vol. V and / P the pancika)
BrB	26	Part II, Sankara's commentary on the Brhadaranyaka-Upanisad
BS		Brahma-sutras
BSB	25	Brahmasutrabhasya of Sankara
BrU		Brhadaranyaka-upanisad
СВ	2	Theorie de la connaissance et philosophie de la parole.
Ch, ChU		Chandogya-upanisad
ChB	26	Part I, Sankara's commentary on the Chandogya-upanisad
CIP	3	Contemporary Indian Philosophy
EIP	5	Essentiel of Indian philosophy
Н	4	L'hindouisme
HP	43	A history of philosophy
IC	6	L'Inde classique, tome II
IIP	8	Invitation to Indian philosophy
Ci		Bhagavad-Gita
Ci Zae	1	The Bhagavad-Gita, R.C. Zaehner
Ka		Katha-upanisad
Kau (U)		Kausitaki-upanisad
MS	9	Mimamsa-sutra
Mu, MuU		Mundaka-upanisad
MuB	26	Part I, sankara's commentary on the Mundaka-upanisad
NB	21	Nyayabhasya

NR

10 Nyayaratnakara

NS	21	Nyayasutra
PA	32	The Philosophy of Advaita
PD	31	Pancadasi
PP	19	Prakaranapancika
PWM	20	Philosophy of word and Meaning
RB	37	Ramanuja on the Bhagavad-Gita
RGB	34	Gitabhasya of Ramanuja
RY	24	Reapprisal of Yoga
Sb	9	Sabara bhasya
SB	33	Sribhasya ; for the first sutra the references are given to 36 La doctrine morale et métaphysique de Ramanuja
SGB	27	Sankara's commentary on the Bhagavad-Gita
SD	13	Sastradipika (Sanskrit text)
SD Et	14 i	d. (English translation)
Sv	10	et 11 Slokavarttika
SvU		Svetasvatara-upanisad
Ta1B	26	Part I, sankara's commentary on the Taittiriya-upanisad
TaiU		Taittiriya-Upanisad
TV	22	Tattvavaisaradi
TVK	21	Tantravarttika
VS	38	Vedartha samgraha
YB	22	Vyasabhasyam
YS	22	Yoga-sutra
YSP	23	Yoga-System of philosophy
YV		Yogavarttika

NB: Whenever a reference is followed either by/123 or $10/\text{or}\ 95/27$, the number to the right of/ refers to the page in the Sanskrit text, and the one to the left indicates the page of the English translation.

Contents (Summary)

Introduction

Perspective of the present study	4
Five monographs	
A threefold comparison centred on the image of man,	
The secular ethics and the ethics of salvation	
<u>CHAPTER ONE</u> Sabara's outlook on life	
(A secularized and this-worldly dynamic optimism)	
1. 0. Introduction	.1
I. The definition of dharma (In the perspective of an ethics of retribution)	
A The codanasutra : "codanalaksno'rtho dharma" 2. Its twofold object	
B The nature of dharma 4. Sabara's thesis	
C The role of Vedic injunctions and prohibitions 6. Positive injunctions set forth rites as means: prohibitions declare non values	14
D Implications of Sabara's definition of dharma 7. (a) Actions acknowledged as good because of their experienced Favorable effects are not dharmas	
E Kumarila's annotation to Sabara's interpretation of the codanasutra 8. The Veda under attack in the name of ahimsa, Kumarila's answer:	16

	9. (a) Malevolent rites are not anartha (morally bad)	
	in themselves	
	10. (b) Reason cannot determine what is morally evil	
	11. Conclusion.	. 48
	ne object of vedic injunction (vidhyartha)	
(ps	sychological and exegetical perspectives)	
	12. Introduction	. 48
Α	Defective opinions	
	13. Badari's opinion: the rite itself is the end to be achieved	. 49
	14. A still defective although improved opinion	. 49
В	The object of Vedic injunctions: psychological approach	
	15. Sabara's criticism as based on the law of psychological motivations	50
	The concept of purusartha	
	16. Are the compulsory rites (niyatakarma) enjoined	
	as conducive to Happiness ?	. 51
С	The object of Vedic injunctions : exegetical approach	
	17. In virtue of its logico grammatical structure a Vedic injunction	
	reveal Directly a rite as a means toward a desired end.	
	The theory of Akanksa.	. 52
	18. The visva jinnyaya. An argument in favor of the fruitfulness	
	of Compulsory rites	. 54
	19. Clearing away two difficulties:	
	(a) The synctactical unity of a Vedic injunction Is consistent with its enjoining rites as means	5.4
	20. (b) The delayed production of the aimed at result is made	. 54
	possible by the production of the apurva	. 54
	21. Rites as instruments	
	22. The impelling force of Vedic injunction and the feeling	
	of Obligation	. 55
	01 02284201	•00
III. S	abara's outlook on man's destiny	
111. 0	·	- /
	23. Introduction	
	24. Man's horizon is limited to this world25. Heaven is nothing but happiness in this world	
	26. A naïve secularized optimism	
	27. Kumarila introduces the doctrine of karma within	. 50
	The Mimamsaka tradition	58

	28. Sabara's demythologizing tendency confirms his secularism 59
IV *	 29. Sabara's functional concept of deities: his agonistic bent of mind60 30. The social function of the Veda: the role of the sistas
1 V.	The Miniamsaka doctrine of moksa posterior to Sabara
1	A According to Kumarila Bhatta 32. Kumarila rejects the theistic concept of the universe as incapable of Accounting for man's present condition of bondage
I	B The Prabhakara concept of moksa 35. As expounded by Salikanatha Misra
(C Further development in the Bhatta tradition 36. Parthasarathi Misra's restates the Bhatta view over against The Advaitic concept of moksa
v. T	he concept of moral obligation according to Prabhakara
	37. Introduction65
	38. Prabhakara's interpretation of Sabara's commentary
	On the codanasutra
	39. Dharma is a "thing-to-be-effected" by the qualified person
	shall Sacrifice"
	(b) Its implication as to the nature of the enjoined object: the apurva 67
	(c) Its extension to all Vedic injunctions and prohibitions 68
	41. The impelling force of Vedic mandates and prohibitions
VI.	Conclusion
	44. General outlook on life
	45. Originating insights and beliefs
	46. Ethical concepts in the Bhatta tradition
	47. Ethical concepts in the Prabhakara tradition

CHAPTER TWO

Gotama's rational approach to man's destiny.

(Man: existentially disillusioned but not pessimistic.)

U. <u>Int</u>	rodu	<u>ction</u>	
	1 2 3	The Nyaya-darsana is a comprehensive view-point on man's destiny Atwo branched-ethics : secular and meta-ethics Plan	75
I. <u>An</u>	thro	pology	
	4	Introduction	76
Α	Th	e individual's self as the ground of his adjunctive personality.	
	5	The Atman: its existence	77
	6	The Atman: its nature	78
	7	TheAtman: its eternity	79
	8	Plurality of distinctionless atmans and personality	79
В		e individual's atman is united to its body by the causative power karma.	
	9	Karma as the productive cause of human bodies	80
	10	The law of karma meets the psychological requirements	
		of purposeful Actions.	80
	11	The retributive function of karma meets the requirements	
		of moral Conscience.	
		The law of karma does not preclude fresh starts in life	
		The explanatory value of the law of karma	
		The cosmic function of the law of karma	
		The Sankhya concept of teleology criticized and rejected	82
	16	the law of karma harmonizes the intricate net of social and	02
C	Th	cosmic Relations with the personal history of each individual e atman: a deluded agent.	83
C		The genesis of purposeful actions: two perspectives	83
		An outline	
		The end as cause (prayojana)	
		Psychological dispositions (dosa and pre-dispositions (sankalpa)	٠.
		to acting	84
	21	Purposeful actions are rooted in wrong appreciations (moha)	
		Wrong appreciations are caused by a basic error about self	
		(ahamkara)	85
	23	Psychological freedom?	86

II. The unbearable evil – the call to conversion	
24 The possibility of liberation is challenged on psychological	
and ritualistic grounds	87
25 Scriptural arguments establishing the possibility of liberation	. 87
III. The nature of liberation.	
26 Renunciation to result-oriented actions is possible	. 87
29 The Naiyayika concept of ahamkara or mithyajnana compared	
with the advaitic concept of Avidya	. 90
30 The projective force of actions is conditioned by the intention of their agent.	90
31 The Naiyayika concepts of man and consciousness determine	
the nature of liberation.	90
32 The concept of liberation as a conscious blissful state	
is self-contradictory	91
33 Disillusion without pessimism	
IV. The path to Liberation	
34 A two-pronged effort	. 92
35 To overcome the allurement of objects	. 92
36 And to acquire the immediate knowledge of one's atman	. 93
37 A comprehensive discipline	. 93
38 The successive stages on the way to liberation	. 94
V. The Naiyayika ethics.	
39 The primary meaning of the terms dharma and adharma	. 95
40 The authoritative source of the moral law: the teachings	
of the Aptas.	. 95
41 The Naiyayika hedonism	. 97
42 The Naiyayika ethics compared with Mimamsaka ethics	. 97
43 The socio-cosmic dimension of the Naiyayika ethics	. 97
44 Secular ethics is hypothetical	98
45 Yogic exercises produce a particular dharma	. 98
46 Secular ethics and meta-ethics.	. 98
VI. An excursus:	
47 The non-theistic trend of the early Naiyayikas and Isvara's cosm	ic
function as measured by the Karmic loads of the innumerable	
bound atmans	. 98
VII. The Naiyayikas image of man and ethics	
48 A doctrine of salvation entered on a disillusioned quest for happiness	. 99

	49 Naiyayika and secular ethics compared	
(Man	CHAPTER THREE Yogic Saving Experience. : a being forgetful of his innate inclination to saving mystical experie	ence.
0. <u>Intr</u>	roduction.	•
	 The Mimamsaka concept of man: an active being	. 103
I. The	e evolution of mental consciousness.	
	0. <u>Introduction</u>.5. Plan	.104
Α.	The evolution of consciousness: a bird's eye view. 6 The yogic experience manifests the native mental power of concentration. 7 Cittabhumi: the five typical stages of mental becoming	. 105
В.	Ethical perspective. 9 The Trans-luminous enstasis determines an ethical valuation of conscious activities	all . 106 . 106 107 . 107
C.	Anthropological implications. 14 Introduction	.108
D.	The mental faculty (citta) 15 As one enduring entity facing a plurality of objects	. 109 . 109 . 109 . 109
	20 An excursus: the theory of causation	. 110 111

E.	<u>Ine purusa.</u>	
	22 The mental modes as objects of cognition	111
	23 The purusa as the illumining power	111
	24 Reflexive apprehension as pointing at the existence of the purusa	112
F.	Empirical consciousness	
	25 It arises from the relation purusa-citta	112
	26 The apparent structure of a cognitive mental act	113
	27 Process of superimposition and attribution	113
	28 The purusa is attributively conscious of the modes of its mind	114
	29 The cause of the empirical consciousness (synchronic perspective	<i>r</i> e:
	the teleological function of citta)	114
	30 The purusa's purposes	114
	31 The actual correlation between citta and purusa is beginningless	115
	32 The cause of empirical consciousness (diachronic perspective) :	
	a self-perpetuating misconception about self	115
	33 Soteriological implications of the Patanjala concept of empirical	
	consciousness compared with those of Naiyayika concept	116
II. Yo	gic soteriology.	
	34 Introduction	116
	35 The motive for "conversion"	
	36 Diagnosis of man's illness and prescription	
	37 A radically optimistic perspective	
ш т	'he path to liberation : the yogangas.	
	Introduction.	
1.1	38 The function of the yogangas	119
	39 Extrinsic and intrinsic auxiliaries	
	40 The psycho-somatic involvement of citta	
T)		
В.	Yamas and niyamas	4.00
	41 The five yamas	
	42 The five niyamas	
	43 Yamas and niyamas : an inadequate distinction	
	44 Obstacles to the practice of the yamas and niyamas; remedy	123
C.	Excursus I: The yogic concepts of karma and dharma.	
	45 The meaning of the technical terms karma and karmasaya	124
	46 Process of fructification (vipaka)	
	47 A fourfold valuation of actions	
	48 No action performed through external means is free from himsa	
	49 The concepts of dharma and adharma	126

		50 The process of retribution	27
	D.	Excursus II : Isvara's compassionate role	20
		53 The different modes of devotion to Isvara	28
		54 As a means of concentration	29
		55 Devout meditation on Isvara is not required ex necessitate finis 12	29
	E.	The yogangas: asana; pranayama, pratyahara	
		56 Introduction	30
		57 Asana and pranayama (psycho-somatic exercises)	30
		58 Pratyahara 13	31
	F.	The yogangas: dharapa, dhyana, Samadhi	
		59 The samyama technique	32
		60 Dharana and dhyana	
		61 Samadhi	
IV.	Th	ne yogic experience.	
		Introduction.	
		62 Different perspective on the yogic experience	33
		63 Aim of the present analysis: recapturing the original content	
		of the yogi's awareness of his experience13	33
		64 Plan	
	B	The cognitive enstasis unfolds in two typical moments.	
	Ъ.	65 Argument	2.1
			' +
	B :	: 1 - Object-specified (cognitive) enstasis.	
		66 Notion of objective assimilation (samapatti)	4
		67 Focussed attention as dwelling on gross objects : savitarka	
		and nirvitarka Samadhi	4
		68 Focussed attention as dwelling on subtle objects savicara/	
		nirvicara-samadhi13	
		69 A tentative pre-interpretative description of the nirvicara-samadhi 13	6
	B :	: 2 - The Translucent (cognitive) enstasis.	
		70 Vacaspati Misra's and Vijnanabhiksu's classifications of the typical	
		forms of cognitive enstasis (samprajnata Samadhi)13	
		71 Existence of a particular cognitive enstasis whose support	
		is the purusa13	39
		72 A tentative pre-interpretative description of the enstasis whose	
		support is the purusa: the translucent enstasis	39

	/3	(cognitive) enstasis and the translucent (cognitive) enstasis140
C.	74 75	arma meghasamadhi : the acme of the translucent enstasis. Divergent opinions about the nature of Dharmameghasamadhi 140 Patanjali's aphorisms
D.	<u>trar</u>	e source of Patanjali's soteriology: the experienced sequence of the aslucent and transluminous enstasis The trans-luminous enstasis (asamprajnatasamadhi)141
E.		e concept of jivanmukta Vyasa introduces the concept of Jivanmukta143
F.		e liberated condition of the purusa The liberated condition of the purusa143
V. <u>The</u>	e Ya	uga image of man and ethics
	80	A doctrine of salvation centred on the Yogic experience
	81	An anthropology based on philosophical analysis of mental consciousness
	82	The touch-stone of the absolute ethical valuation
	83	Secular ethics: an ethics: an ethics of value rather than of retribution 146
	84	Meta-ethics
	85	Comparative consideration
		CHAPTER FOUR
		The saving realization of self as Brahman.
(N	Ian :	as a deluded individual unaware of his ever being the blissful
		fullness that is Brahman)
0. <u>Intr</u>	odu	ction.
	1	The Vedantic stand-point
	2	The Advaitic and Ramanujiya spiritualities
Persp	<u>ecti</u>	ve of the present study of Sankara's doctrine.
•	3	A phenomenological anthropology149
	4	Plan
I. The	e inc	lividual's pilgrimage from duality to non-duality.
	5	Bondage : duality and action ; liberation : non-duality and
		actionlessness

Α.	Bondage: the individual's destiny (the pancagnividya)	
	6 Destiny is regulated by the law of karma	151
	7 The threefold path of destiny	
	8 Liberation by stages and immediate liberation	
	9 Can the self-hardened individual escape bondage?	
В.	From perception of duality and action (bondage) to Brahman-know edge and actionless-ness (liberation). 10 Toward a phenomenology of the mental consciousness of self	
В	: 1 The natural consciousness of self	
	11 Its characteristics	153
	12 The proximate psychological cause of evil	
В	: 2 The Vedic consciousness of self.	
	13 Its characteristics.	154
	14 The conflict between Natural and Vedic tendencies	154
	15 Checking tendencies toward wrong actions	155
В	: 3 <u>The Vedantic consciousness of self.</u> 16 The performance of Vedic rites, etc presupposes an erroneo	us
	valuation of things and self.	
	17 Stage one: the INCHOATIVE Vedantic consciousness	
	18 Stage two: the MATURE Vedantic consciousness	
В	: 4 <u>Beyond the Vedantic consciousness : LIBERATION</u> 19 Man as a being unaware of his ever free nature	157
D		101
В	: 5 The Advaitic anthropology.	
	20 An in-gressive phenomenology of the empirical consciousness as a way to the trans-phenomenal pure consciousness	157
	as a way to the trains phenomenal pure consciousness	151
II. <u>Ad</u>	lvaitic ontology and anthropology.	
	0. <u>Introduction.</u>	
	21 The aim of the Advaitic ontology and anthropology	
	22 Plan	158
A.	From this differenced universe to its cause: Brahman.	
	23 Aruni introduces his teaching about SAT with a simile	159
	24 From the transient universe to its cause: SAT	159
	25 The Naiyayika and Bouddha traditions reject Aruni's thesis	160
	26 Introducing the Advaitic doctrine of creation (Vivarta-vada)	
	27 The concept of configuration (samsthana)	160
	28 The concept of avidya as a cosmic principle	161
	29 Avidya as the Lord's cosmic power.	162

	30	Avidya as the seed-condition of the universe (the avyakta) and as maya	. 162
	31	The concept of avidya reconciles the metaphysics of non-duali required by the experience of the jivanmuktas and the realistic	ty
		epistemology implied in common experience	. 163
В.	Fre	om Brahman as pure consciousness to the individual selves.	
	32	Creation as a conscious divine activity	.163
	33	"Entering myself(=Isvara) into these elements as this living soul"	.164
	34	Objections raised against the non-difference of the individual	
		self from Brahman	.164
	35	The dialectical role of the similes	.164
	36	The simile of the reflected images of the sun	.165
	37	The simile of the ether within different cavities; the concept	
		of upadhi	.165
	38	The simile of the snake-rope	.166
	39	Conclusion: two ways of approaching the individual self	. 167
C.	Fre	om the empirical consciousness to pure consciousness. (anthrope	ologi
		approach).	
		Introduction	.168
	41	The waking consciousness: existence and nature of the	
		individual self.	
		The dreaming state: self-luminosity of the self	.169
	43	Deep sleep: the identity of the individual self with Brahman	
		as pure consciousness	
		The five "sheaths" (TaiU 2.2-5)	
	45	The cultural conditioning of empirical consciousness	. 172
D.	"T	hat thou art."	
	46	The Advaitic ontology and anthropology recapitulated:	
		TAT TVAN ASI	.172
	47	Tat tvam asi: grammatical structure; meaning of the term tat	
		and tvam	.172
	48	Tat tvam asi: a process of negation	.173
	49	Tat tvam asi: as liberating truth	.174
	50	The condition of jivanmukti is a fact	.174
	51	Brahman-knowledge and Experience	.174
	52	The continuance of the body of a Jivanmukta	.175
	53	The proximate preparation and the immediate cause of moksa.	. 176

III. <u>Human goals : corresponding outlooks and patterns of behavior.</u> 0. <u>Introduction.</u>

	54	Anyacchreyo 'nyadutaiva preyas (KaU 1.2.2)
Α.		ovisional) Vedic religious personalism Introduction177
A :	1	The Universe: extension and temporal structure. a/ The universe comprehends graded spheres of existence presided over by deities.
		Sankara's argument against the Mimamsaka concept of the universe
		Mantras and Arthavadas do reveal unseen worlds and deities 178 Deities are transmigrating beings
	60	The eternity of the Veda is consistent with such a structure 180 An objection
A :		<u>Isvara's function toward the universe and man.</u> a/ Isvara's creative action : retributive function and norms.
	63 64	Creation is not a chance-event
		The Veda
	67	c/ Isvara as the bestower of results. Rejection of the Mimamsaka concept of apurva
A :	3 <u>C</u>	Conclusion. VEDIC religious personalism
В.	Str	ucture of the path to liberation. Liberation as an objective eternal condition and as a process 184
С	(Pr	ovisional) VEDANTIC religious personalism. 1/ The discipline of action : karmayoga.
		Continuity and rupture between VEDIC and VEDANTIC religious personalism
	73	Basic pattern of the discipline of action
	75	2/ The attitude of karmayogi1873/ Bhagavadbhaktiyoga1874/ Bhakti and meditation188
		5/ Bhakti and Isvara's grace

		6/ The devotees of the other gods	189
	79	7/ Moral and psychological auxiliaries of the disciplines	
		of action and devotion	189
D.	The	e ultimate VEDANTIC trans-personalism.	
		Introduction	190
Б			
D		Preliminary matters.	
	81	1/ "Next, therefore the inquiry into Brahman".	101
	02	(required qualifications for the discipline of knowledge)	
		2/ Brahmavidya : its nature	
		A twofold process of negation	
	04	3/ Structure of the discipline of knowledge, jninanistha	192
D	: 2	The discipline of knowledge: its structure.	
		1/ Conceptual inquiry and yogic concentration.	
	85	Discipleship toward a guru who is a jivanmukta	193
	86	Sravana and Manana.	193
		Yogic concentration in relation to Brahman, nididyasana	
	88	2/ Psychological discipline (Samadamadi)	194
		3/ Absolute values that are natural to the jivanmuktas	
		Principle of continuity	
		Satiety in the self	
		The self is infinite bliss	195
	92	Bliss as reflected in the quasi consciousness of the	
		jivanmuktas who is tusta, aptakama, atmakama, akama	196
	93	Satiety in the self as anticipated makes renunciation to all	
		desires reasonable	196
	94	Beyond all obligations : the jivanmukta is : krtakrtya,	104
	0 =	paramahamsaparivrajaka, niskarma	196
	95	Renunciation to actions as the direct means to the	407
	0.6	consummation of knowledge: the parivrajya asrama	
		Without expectations and likings	
		Like a tortoise drawing in its limbs	
		Bhakti as knowledge	
	100		
	101		199
	102	2 True compassion is the mark of the Jivanmukta who is	400
	100	karuna, maitra, ahimsaka	
	103	3 Child-like perfection	200

IV. <u>Sa</u>	<u>nkar</u>	a's views on ethics.
	104	Dharma as the means toward well-being and the supreme good: secular ethics and meta-ethics
Α.	Dha	rma and adharma.
		Sankara's concept of dharma belongs to the Bhatta school 201
		Sankara's own contribution
		Degrees of dharma and adharma
		Potential religious value of rituals
		About compulsory rites
		The elimination of the potential effects of past actions202
	111	Vedic ritualism and universal yogic ethics
В.	Valu	ues as means and (provisional) absolute values.
		203
C	The	sense of obligation.
C.		Its ontological foundation
	110	The official foundation
V. <u>Im</u>	age o	of man and ethics.
	114	A revealed doctrine confirmed by the experience of the
		jivanmuktas and by relational investigation
		Sankara's epistemological realism and the concept of avidya 204
		The individual self
	117	The nature of liberation, the image of man and the cause
		of liberation
	118	The beginningless pilgrimage from duality and action to
		non-duality and actionlessness
		Sankara's contribution to secular ethics
	120	Meta-ethics: the ethics of disinterested actions and the ethics
		of non duality
		CHAPTER FIVE
		Ramanuja's personalistic theism
	(ma	n's sole essence-and-joy is to be subservient to the Lord).
0.	Intro	duction.
1.	The	object of the Vedantic Revelation211
I. The	e stru	acture of reality and its ethical implications.
		cture of Reality and man's destiny: an outline213
4.	Plan	214

5	Outline of the argument
A:1 6 7	The object of the Sadvidya. Brahman as the operative and material cause of the universe214 Sankya and Advaitic interpretations rejected
A:2 8 9 10	The Ramanujiya doctrine of causality. Analysis of Aruni's descriptive definition of modifications 215 The effect is not a new entity
A:3 11 12 13 14	The relational structure of Reality. Outline of the argument
B: 15 16 17	The universe as the body of the Supreme Self. Structure of the atman-body relation
C. The 18 19 20 21	universe as a mode of Brahman. Perceptual cognition is about differenced things
D. <u>Ont</u> 22	ological and ethical aspects of the sesa-sesin relation. The atman's sole joy-and-essence: subservience to the Lord 223
0. <u>Intro</u>	onalistic ontology. eduction.
23 A. <u>The</u> 24	Plan
A:1 25 26 27 28 29 30	The atman as a knower by essence is a person. The concept of pure consciousness is inconsistent

	31	Atmans as persons	227
	A:2	The atman's transmigrating condition.	
	32	Structure of the argument	228
	33	Consciousness experiences itself as mutable	
	34	The atman's creatureliness	
	35	Karma has the form of ignorance, ignorance the form of action	229
	36	Psychology of action; - desires beget actions	
	37	The karma-caused misconception about self begets desires	231
	38	The gunas effect the actions	231
	39	of which the atmans are the responsible agents,	232
	40	and the experiencers of their results	232
	41	The atman's agency depends on the Supreme Self	232
	B The	e Supreme Person.	
	42	Introduction	233
	43	Brahman is a differenced being	
	44	The proper form of Brahman	
	45	Brahman is free from evil	
	46	Meaning of the Upanisadic "neti, neti"	
	47	The hymns of praise of Visnu-Narayana	
	C Dom		
	48	sonalistic and ethico-religious aspects of Creation. Introduction	225
	40	IIIIOductioii	233
	C:1	Two Vedantic perspectives on creation	
	49	The purpose of creation is sporting (lila)	
	50	Inequalities are due to the karmic weights of the bound selves	
	51	The cosmic rhythm of creation and Isvara's compassion	236
	C:2	Structure of the divine providence.	
	52	The individual cannot act without Isvara's consent	237
	53	The particular regime of divine providence	238
	54	Its personalistic implications	
II.	_	onalistic ethics	
	55	Introduction	240
	A. <u>A tl</u>	heocentric system of values.	
	56	Ethics implies personalistic relationship with the divine person	240
	57	Man's ethical relation to the Supreme Person	
	58	The power of actions coincides with the Supreme Person's	
		pleasure and displeasure	241
	B. Sac	red and profane orders of reality.	
		1 7	

		59	Vedic sacrifices: homage value and instrumental power242
		60	Reaction against the atheistic and utilitarian concept of dharma 242
		61	Sacred and profane orders of reality
		62	The primacy of intention in ethical matters243
	C.	Exis	stential perspective: the dynamics of ends.
		63	Existential valuation of actions
		64	- in referenc to the Supreme Person as Refuge244
		65	- in reference to the deities
		66	- in reference to the Supreme Person as the law-giver245
IV	Lil	oerat	ion: nature and means.
		67	Introduction
	Α.	Tow	ard a face to face encounter with the Supreme Person.
		68	A question of vocabulary247
		69	Man's pilgrimage to union with God (in the Vedarthasamgraha) 247
		70	Human activity and God's favor in the emergence of
			parabhakti248
		71	Parabhakti and the elective grace of the Supreme Person 249
		72	Human initiative and divine favor
		73	The sage's election of Self (Sankara) and God's election of man
			(Ramanuja)
		74	The auxiliaries of bhakti
	В.	Libe	eration as the experience of one's blissful nature (kaivalya)
		75	The fact
		76	Possibility and quasiexistential contradiction252
	C.	<u>The</u>	discipline of knowledge and the experience of self.
		77	The position of the Gitabhasya
	C:	: 1	The discipline of knowledge (jnanayoga)
		78	The discipline of knowledge: nature, dispositions and effect 254
	C:	: 2	The discipline of action as an independent means to the experience
			of self as a preparation to bhaktiyoga.
		79	Superiority and independence of the discipline of action 255
		80	The discipline of actions incorporates to itself the knowledge
			of self,
		81	and leads by itself to the experience of self256
	C:	: 3	The intuitive experience of self as dispositive to bhaktiyoga.
		82	The immediate perception of self as auxiliary to bhaktiyoga 256
		83	Its nature and effect 257

	84	Ramanuja's works
D	Twe	o important aspects of the Ramanujiya spirituality.
D.	85	A faith by which one lives
	86	Non-dualistic and dualistic spiritualities of action
	87	Concerning prapatti as an autonomous way to God
	07	Concerning praparti as air autonomous way to God200
V. Rai	man	uja's image of man and ethics.
	88	A personalistic theology consonant with the spontaneous
		evidence of consciousness
	89	Man's present condition and his eminent dignity263
	90	A personalistic ethics : the Supreme Person is the Head of the
		ethico-religious order
	91	Ethics of salvation
		An ethics of beatitude
		The spirituality of alones (in dependence)
		The spirituality of union
		CHAPTER VI
0.1	1	
U. Intr	oduc	<u>ztion</u>
I. A th	ıreef	<u>Cold comparision</u> 270
		of man in the Ancient Indian Traditions.
Α.	The	Brahmanic image of man
11,	2.	Man is a compound being whose atman is associated with succes-
		sive bodies under the regulation of the law of karma; the law of
		karma ensures the ethical rationality of the socio-cosmic history;
		The universe whether absolutely real or provisionally real is the
		field of man's purposeful actions and retributive experiences;
		Man's individuality is adventitious to his true being and is memory-based;
		Embodied existence is beset with inevitable defects
В.		n-Vedic approaches to man in Ancient India.
	3.	Materialistic, Buddhist and Jains approaches
C.	The	common patrimony of the Ancient Indian Traditions.
	4.	Beliefs in karma-caused rebirth and in an adequate temporal
		retribution; Embodied existence is evil and salvation is its
		absolute cessation

	D.	The	e Christian point of view on map	
		5.	Man as a being unaware of God's calling to consent to His saving	
			grace secretly at work within his heart by "dying with Christ" to	
			his old nature and "rising with Him to a new life" as son of God 2	74
	E.	And	cient Indian and Christian images of man compared	
		6.	The beliefs in retributive rebirths and in a once-for-all existence	
			determine:	75
		7 a/	Two radically different attitudes toward suffering2	75
		8 b,	/ Two different approaches to ethics	76
		9 c/	A common challenge met in different ways2	77
		10	d/ points of agreement2	79
II	Se	cula	ar ethics	
			Introduction	79
	Λ	E+h	ing of natribution and othics of obligation	
	Λ.		ics of retribution and ethics of obligation	90
		12 13	The Mimamsaka concept of the Veda	
		14	Vedic interpretations and psychological options	
		15		
			Prabhkara's ethics of obligation	
		16 17	The ethics of retribution as a rationalization of the	.03
		1 /		02
		18	socio-cosmic history (Maiyayika)	
	В.	Pata	anjali's ethics of value.	
		19	Primacy of ahimsa and the ambiguity of material means2	85
		20	The Mimamsaka, Naiyayika and Patanjala ethics are not theistic2	
	C.	A tł	heistic ethics of retribution (Sankara)	
		21	Retribution as an aspect of Isvara's cosmic sporting activity 2	87
		22	Sankara's secular ethics: its content	
	D.	A tl	heistic ethics of value (Ramanuja).	
		23	Man is inescapably engaged in an ethico-religious relationship	
			with the Supreme Person. 2	88
		24	Isvara as the Head and the end of the ethico-religious order 2	
		25	Structure of the Ramanujiya concept of value2	
III	Et	hics	of salvation	
		26	Introduction	90
	Α.	Bra	hmanic ethics of salvation : points of convergence	
			The evil one seeks to get rid of is rebirth;	90

	Bondage is necessarily attended with ignorance;
	The fructifying power of compulsory rites (and other actions) is
	Conditional
	The elimination of karma;
	Except for Ramanuja, the liberated one is in an a-cosmic, a social
	And even god-less condition;
	Salvation is accessible to all
B. Bra	hmanic ethics of salvation : affinities and differences.
28	a criterion of classification: the function attributed to the miscon-
	ception about self with regard to empirical consciousness 293
B.1	The misconception about self as affecting the natural, provisional,
	consciousness of self. Mimamsaka and Naiyayika traditions
29	The anthropological option common to the Mimamsaka
	and Naiyayika traditions
30	The misconcepting about self
	As an obstacle to the performance of Vedic actions (Mi)
	As the prerequisite of secular purposeful activities (Nai) 294
31	The liberated self is deprived of self-consciousness294
B:2	The misconception about self as conditioning the appearance of
	empirical consciousness. Yauga and Advaitic traditions
32	Common aspects of the concepts of self and liberation in the
	Yauga and Advaitic traditions
33	The saving mental experiences of the yogi and the Advaitin are
	non different
34	Two kindred spiritualities of alones with different emphasis 297
35	Two metaphysical accounts of the selfsame mental experience 297
36	Correspond to different emphasis in ontology297
37	The structure of Patanjali's pluralistic ontology and its axiomatic
20	assumptions and factual basis
38	The advaitic spirituality of alones and its emphasis on truth299
B:3	The misconception about self as conditioning retributive
	processes according to Visistadvaita
39	The misconception about self is of the nature of karma301
40	1
41	A radical choice: self-experience in dependent aloneness
	or union with God
42	A spirituality of aloneness and immanence but not of autonomy 302
43	A spirituality of union sealed by reciprocal love303
C. <u>De</u>	votion and grace
44	Introduction 303

C:1	Devotion and grace without real dependence on Isvara (Patanjala
	tradition).
45	The yogi's devotion to, and meditation on, the Lord are not
	grounded on an ontological dependence304
C:2	Bhakti and grace as moments in the progressive unrealization of
4.6	personalistic differences.
46	Bhakti as a reverential attitude and parabhakti as the saving knowledge of non duality
47	Grace as the eternal effulgence that is pure Consciousness 305
C:3	Bhakti and divine favor as moments in a personalistic encounter with God
48	Structure of the concept of bhakti
49	Moral and metaphysical aspects of the concept of elective grace .306
C : 4	Brahmanic and Christian approaches to the concept of grace.
50	An outline of the Christian concept of grace307
51	Affinities between the Ramanujiya and Christian concepts 308
D. <u>Uni</u>	city of Truth and pluralism of faiths.
52	A dialogue in common attention to Reality/Truth309

BASIC CONCEPTS OF ETHICS IN THE DARSHANAS

Presented

IN THE LIGHT OF THEIR RESPECTIVE CONCEPTS OF MAN

Introduction

The Hindu traditions which found classical expression in the six darsanas, were living and lived answers to man's questions about himself, his destiny, the significance of his insertion in society and in the universe, the nature of reality, etc ... Each one sprung from creative insights and beliefs¹. The purpose of the present study is: (1) to analyse their ethico-religious views in reference to their respective concepts of man as embedded is different outlooks on reality and in the light of their originating insights and beliefs, (2) and to compare their different approaches to the basic concepts of ethics.

We take the term ethics as denoting the practical knowledge which regulates man's conscious actions in relation to his ultimate end or ends. This alternative refers to the fact that the early Mimamsakas up to the time of kumarila Bhatta believed that man's unique end was happiness as experienced in this universe, whereas all the other traditions (and the later Mimamsakas too) teach that man is faced with a radical choice: happiness within this and other (finite) worlds at the cost of transmigrating existence which is inescapably beset with suffering, or liberation from the bondage that sorrowful transmigration is. These two mutually inconsistent ends determine therefore two ethical perspectives: the one is secular (secular ethics), the other is trans-worldly (meta-ethics).

We have selected four darsanas: <u>Purva-Mimamsa</u> (First Exegesis), the <u>Nyayadarsana</u>, the Yoga-<u>darsanas</u>, and the <u>Uttara-Mimamsa</u> or <u>Vedanta</u>. This selection that is primarily meant to keep the present work within reasonable limits, is however not arbitrary. The well known affinities between the <u>Vaisesika-darsana</u> and the <u>Nyaya-darsana</u> on the one hand, and, between the <u>Sankhya-darsana</u> and the <u>Yoga-darsana</u> on the other hand, would have caused fastidious repetitions if they had been separately considered. We preferred the <u>Yoga-darsana</u> to the <u>Samkhya-darsana</u> because of the former's role in Hindu spirituality and because of its special attention to ethical matters. The choice of the <u>Nyaya-darsana</u> is justified by its exhaustive study of <u>the law of karma</u>. The Vedanta is represented by Sankara's non-dualism (advaita-Vedanta) and by Ramanuja's "Non-dualism of the differenced as such" (visista-<u>advaita</u>). It is not without regret that Madhava's dualism has been left out of our enquiry; for in spite of its affinities with Ramanuja's views, it is the echo of a different religious and mystical tradition and contains some original insights about man's destiny.

The present work is based on the earliest commentary on the aphoristic manifest of each tradition that is now extant. References to subsequent works will be made whenever those works clarify obscure points, present relevant developments and help to single out the originating insights and beliefs. Moreover, the choice of first commentaries is not arbitrary and can be justified on the following grounds: (1) although the Authors of the Bhasyas were not the founders ² of

new schools of thought, their deep personal understanding of the stand-point of their tradition and their existential commitment to the corresponding way of life and spirituality, enabled them to expound forcefully the comprehensible wisdom that they had inherited, in the light of its original insights and beliefs; (2) later, these creative elements became obscured by an excess of conceptual technicalities due partly to the propensity of teachers to indulge in abstract teaching and to stress marginal differences within one selfsame tradition at the expense of their fundamental agreement, and partly to the requirements of controversies between orthodox traditions or with opponents from outside.

The twofold aspect of the present study determines its method and structure. Each tradition is considered in itself and analyzed separately so as to grasp its inner dynamism and, in function of this, the consistency and harmony of its different elements; special attention is given to the correlation between the ontological and psychological basis of the <u>image of man</u>, and the <u>ethical climate</u> which determines the understanding of the basic concepts of ethics. After five quasi monographs, the ethical views of the different schools will be compared, and their complementarity and opposition analysed.

Here are the ethical themes which emerge from the monographs as worthy points of comparison: the concept of dharma, its structure and its relation to the concept of value; authority in ethico-religious matters; the role of Reason in discriminating values or in founding them; the concept of obligation with its psychological and ontological aspects; dominant.ethical.virtue(s), its/their relation to spiritual experience and to the ontological concept of reality; ends of man; motivation for turning away from happiness in objects and conversion to liberation; the belief and existential inclination which make one able to tread the path to liberation.

The first chapter presents <u>Sabara's outlook on life</u>. It corresponds to a society sure of itself, deeply rooted in immemorial traditions and whose unity was based on its being the depository of the Vedic Revelation. Man experiences himself as an earth-bound being who seeks from birth to birth happiness through his actions. The experienced efficacy of experience-based actions and the "superefficacy" of Vedic rites induce in him a naïve optimism as yet unware of the destressing aspects of metempsychosis.

The insights and beliefs that animate this naively optimistic image of man are: the awareness that man's unique motive to act is happiness; the belief that happiness consists in enjoying material goods, high social status, and other secular values that are held in high esteem in the Brahmanic society (Cf. the role of the elitist group of the Sistas, i.e. the learned in Vedic lore); and the belief in the absolute auto-efficacy of the Vedic dharmas (rites) as conducive to happiness.

The Veda sets forth new means (rites, spells, etc ...) toward already known ends, and these ends are morally objectionable only if they are objects of Ve-