# Transnational Organised Crime

A Comparative Analysis

Tom Obokata and Brian Payne



## **Transnational Organised Crime** A Comparative Analysis

Organised crime covers a wide range of activities, including drug trafficking, illegal trafficking of people, and fraud. The existence of a land border does not impede these operations; instead in many cases it is used to their advantage. In response, law enforcement strategies must include a transnational, multi-agency approach.

This book critically analyses the extent to which Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland have been successful in implementing effective action against transnational organised crime. It explores the adoption of key law enforcement strategies and measures in these jurisdictions, and evaluates how regional (EU law) and international (UN Convention) standards have been implemented at the national level. Drawing on interviews with over 90 stakeholders including the Department of Justice Northern Ireland, the Department of Justice and Equality in Ireland, the Police Service of Northern Ireland and An Garda Síochána, Tom Obokata and Brian Payne discuss the factors affecting the effective prevention and suppression of organised crime, particularly in relation to cross-border cooperation.

In exploring challenges of transnational crime and cooperation, this book will be of great use to students and researchers in international and transnational criminal law, criminology, and crime prevention.

**Tom Obokata** is a Professor of International Law and Human Rights at Keele Law School. Previously he taught at Queen's University Belfast (2006–2012) and the University of Dundee (2004–2006). He is an expert on transnational organised crime and has published and consulted widely on this topic.

**Brian Payne** is a Senior Lecturer of Criminology at the University of Gloucestershire. Brian's primary research interests lie in the areas of transnational organised crime, community policing, and restorative justice. Prior to taking up this post, Brian was a Research Fellow for the research project 'North–South Irish Responses to Transnational Organised Crime'.

## Routledge Research in Transnational Crime and Criminal Law

Available titles in this series include:

#### Cross-Border Law Enforcement

Regional Law Enforcement Cooperation – European, Australian and Asia-Pacific Perspectives
Saskia Hufnagel, Clive Harfield and Simon Bronitt (eds.)

#### **Combating Economic Crimes**

Balancing Competing Rights and Interests in Prosecuting the Crime of Illicit Enrichment

Ndiva Kofele-Kale

# Transnational Organised Crime

A Comparative Analysis

Tom Obokata and Brian Payne



First published 2017 by Routledge 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2017 Tom Obokata and Brian Payne

The right of Tom Obokata and Brian Payne to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by them in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*Trademark notice*: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Names: Obokata, Tom, author. | Payne, Brian (College teacher), author. Title: Transnational organised crime: a comparative analysis / Tom Obokata and Brian Payne.Description: Abingdon, Oxon; New York, NY: Routledge, 2017. | Series: Routledge research in transnational crime and criminal law | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016010434 | ISBN 9781138934504 (hbk) | ISBN 9781315677958 (ebk)Subjects: LCSH: Organized crime—Law and legislation. | Organized crime—Law and legislation—Ireland. | Organized crime—Law and legislation—Northern Ireland. | Organized crime—Prevention.

Classification: LCC K5240 .O255 2017 | DDC 345-dc23 LC record available at http://lccn.loc.gov/2016010434

ISBN: 978-1-138-93450-4 (hbk) ISBN: 978-1-315-67795-8 (ebk)

Typeset in Galliard by Keystroke, Station Road, Codsall, Wolverhampton

## Contents

	Acknowledgements	ix
	Abbreviations	xi
	Table of cases	xiii
	Table of international and regional instruments	xix
	Tables of national legislation	XXV
	Introduction	1
	Background 1	
	The aim and scope of this book 4	
1	International standards on action against transnational	
	organised crime	9
	1.1 Introduction 9	
	1.2 International standards on action against	
	transnational organised crime 9	
	1.2.1 Defining organised crime 9	
	1.2.2 Prohibition of organised crime 13	
	1.2.3 Establishment of criminal jurisdiction 16	
	1.2.4 Intelligence-led law enforcement 20	
	1.2.5 Confiscation of criminal proceeds/asset recovery 21	
	1.2.6 International cooperation 22	
	1.2.6.1 Extradition 22	
	1.2.6.2 Mutual legal assistance in criminal matters 25	
	1.2.7 Protection and promotion of human rights 28	
	1.3 Conclusion 34	
2	Regional standards on action against transnational	<b>.</b>
	organised crime	35
	2.1 Introduction 35	
	2.2 Core principles 35	

V I	Contents	
V1		

	<ul> <li>2.3 EU action against transnational organised crime 37</li> <li>2.3.1 Prohibition of organised crime and criminal jurisdiction 37</li> <li>2.3.2 Intelligence-led law enforcement 40</li> <li>2.3.3 Confiscation of criminal proceeds/asset recovery 41</li> <li>2.3.4 International cooperation 42</li> <li>2.3.5 Protection and promotion of human rights 45</li> </ul>	
	2.4 Critical appraisal of the EU action against transnational organised crime 48	
	2.5 Conclusion 53	
3	Legislative frameworks on substantive offences 3.1 Introduction 54 3.2 Definitions of organised crime/criminal group 54 3.3 Participation in an organised criminal group 59 3.4 Human trafficking 62 3.5 Drug offences 67 3.6 Fiscal and excise fraud 74 3.7 Conclusion 77	54
4	Criminal investigation and prosecution of transnational organised crime  4.1 Introduction 79  4.2 Key law enforcement agencies 79  4.3 Intelligence-led law enforcement 82  4.4 Practical issues in law enforcement 87  4.5 Protection and promotion of human rights 92  4.6 Prosecution 95  4.7 Cross-border cooperation in criminal investigation and prosecution 100  4.7.1 Key measures 100  4.7.2 Practical issues in cross-border cooperation 105  4.8 Conclusion 110	79
5	Criminal proceedings and confiscation of criminal proceeds 5.1 Introduction 111 5.2 Trial without jury 111 5.3 Evidential issues 120 5.4 Sentencing 125 5.5 Confiscation of criminal proceeds/asset recovery 131	111

<ul><li>5.6 Cross-border dimensions of criminal proceedings and confiscation of criminal proceeds 139</li><li>5.7 Conclusion 148</li></ul>	
Conclusion	149
Selected bibliography	152
Index	158



### Acknowledgements

This book is based on the research project 'North-South Irish Responses to Transnational Organised Crime' conducted between 2012 and 2014. We would like to thank the Arts and Humanities Research Council for giving us the opportunity to carry out this research. The successful completion of this project would not have been possible without the valuable contributions of a host of other individuals and organisations. We would like to acknowledge the support and expert advice provided by Professor John Jackson (University of Nottingham) who served as a consultant for this project. We also wish to express our immense gratitude to the following members of the advisory board of stakeholders who have guided the research team throughout the research cycle: Eugene Corcoran (An Garda Síochána), Brian Gormally (Committee on the Administration of Justice), Claire Hamilton and Mark Kelly (Irish Council for Civil Liberties), Robert Kidd (Department of Justice - Northern Ireland), Philip Marshall (Police Service of Northern Ireland), Roy McComb (Police Service of Northern Ireland/ National Crime Agency), Deirdre Meenan (Department of Justice and Equality - Republic of Ireland), Tricia Roulston (Organised Crime Task Force), and John Whiting (HM Revenue & Customs). Finally, we would like to thank over 90 interviewees, representing the law enforcement agencies, the civil society sector, the legal profession and the European Union agencies, who have kindly provided valuable insights into the action against transnational organised crime in Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland.



#### **Abbreviations**

CAB Criminal Assets Bureau

CAJ Committee on the Administration of Justice

CHIS Covert Human Intelligence Sources

CPS Crown Prosecution Service
DPP Director of Public Prosecutions
EAW European Arrest Warrant

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights 1950

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

ECJ European Court of Justice EEW European Evidence Warrant EIO European Investigation Order

EU European Union

GCHQ Government Communications Headquarters

GRETA Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings

HMRC HM Revenue & Customs ICCL Irish Council for Civil Liberties

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1966

JIT Joint Investigation Team
NCA National Crime Agency
NPS New Psychoactive Substances
OCTF Organised Crime Task Force
PII Public Interest Immunity
POCA Proceeds of Crime Act 2002

PPS Public Prosecution Service (Northern Ireland)

PSNI Police Service of Northern Ireland

REFCO Network of Prosecutors against Organized Crime RIPA Regulation of Investigatory Powers Act 2000

SCC Special Criminal Court

SOCA Serious Organised Crime Agency TEU Treaty on European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

UNODC United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime

UNTOC United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime

2000



## Table of cases

### International & regional cases

UN Human	Riahts	Committee

Alzery v Sweden, Communication No. 1416/2005, CCPR/	
C/88/D/1416/2005	33
G.T. v Australia, Communication No. 706/1996, CCPR/	
C/61/D/706/1996	32
Judge v Canada, Communication No. 829/1998, CCPR/	
C/78/D/829/1998	32
Kavanagh v Ireland, Communication No. 89/1998, CCPR/	
C/71/D/819/1998	115, 118
Kwok Yin Fong v Australia, Communication No. 1442/2005,	
CCPR/C/97/D/1442/2005	32
Maksudov and Rakhimov v Kyrgyzstan, Communication No. 1461, 14	62,
1476 & 1477/2006, CCPR/C/93/D/1461,1462,1476 &	21 22
1477/2006	31, 33
Toonen v Australia, Communication No. 488/1992, CCPR/C/WG/44/D/488/1992	30
European Court of Human Rights	
A and Others v United Kingdom, App no 3455/05 (2009)	123
A v The Netherlands, App no 4900/06 (2010)	
A.M. v Italy, App no 37019/97 (2000)	33
Adzhigovich v Russia, App no 23202/05 (2009)	31
Air Canada v United Kingdom, App no 18465/91(1995)	
Al-Khawaja and Tahery v United Kingdom, App nos 26766/05 and	
22228/06 (2011)	121
Al-Skeini v United Kingdom, App no 55721/07 (2011)	109
Bankovic v Belgium, App no 52207/99 (2001)	
Brozicek v Italy, App no 10964/84 (1989)	140
Colozza v Italy, App no 9024/80 (1985)	140

<i>Cyprus v Turkey</i> , App no 25/81/94 (2001)	109
Donohoe v Ireland, App no 19165/08 (2013)	118, 123
Doorson v The Netherlands, App no 20524/92 (1996)	121, 123
Dougoz v Greece, App no 40907/98 (2001)	146
Enea v Italy, App no 74912/01 (2009)	146
Engel v The Netherlands, App nos 5100/71, 5101/71, 5102/71,	
5354/72 and 5370/72 (1976)	31
Gäfgen v Germany, App no 22978/05 (2010)	
Guthrie v United Kingdom, App no 22226/12 (2013)	
Haas v Germany, App no 73047/01 (2005)	
Harkins and Edwards v United Kingdom, App nos 9146/07 and	
32650/07 (2012)	32
Harutyunyan v Armenia, App no 36549/03 (2010)	
HLR v France, App no 24573/94 (1997)	
Husayn v Poland, App no 7511/13 (2015)	
Jalloh v Germany, App no 54810/00 (2006)	
Jasper v United Kingdom, App no 27052/95 (2000)	
Kafkaris v Cyprus, App no 21906/04 (2008)	
Kennedy v United Kingdom, App no 26839/05 (2010)	
Khan v United Kingdom, App no 35394/97 (2000)	
Khudobin v Russia, App no 59696/00 (2006)	
King v United Kingdom, App no 9742/07 (2010)	
Kostovski v The Netherlands, App no 11451/85 (1989)	
Kruslin v France, App no 11801/85 (1990)	86
Kudła v Poland, App no 30210/96 (2000)	146
Levinta v Moldova, App no 17332/03 (2009)	
Liberty and Others v United Kingdom, App no 58243/00	
(2008)	86, 109
Loizidou v Turkey, App no 15318/89 (1995)	109
Luca v Italy, App no 33354/96 (2001)	120
Ludi v Switzerland, App no 12433/86 (1992)	30, 120
Malone v United Kingdom, App no 8691/79 (1984)	86
Maslov v Austria, App no 1638/03 (2008)	32
Medvedyev and Others v France, App no 3394/03 (2010)	109
Mehemi v France, App. no 25017/94 (1997)	32, 146
Nashiri v Poland, App no 287611/11 (2015)	142
Öccalan v Turkey, App no 46221/99 (2005)	
Othman (Abu Qatada) v Others v United Kingdom, App no 8139,	/09
(2012)	
P.V. v Germany, App no 11853/85 (1987)	
Phillips v United Kingdom, App no 41087/98 (2001)	
Rotaru v Romania, App no 28341/95(2000)	86
Rowe and Davis v the United Kingdom, App no 28901/95	
(2000)	118, 121–2
Salduz v Turkey, App no 36391/02 (2008)	52

33, 124
31, 146
53
86
. 30, 33
15, 123
120
120
146
31
121
140
37
4, 51–2
. 44, 52
3) <b>29</b>
69
122
122
123
128
86
69
07
123
123
123 99 23, 125 124
123 99 23, 125 124 122
123 99 23, 125 124

Gilligan v Criminal Assets Bureau [2001] IESC 82	138
Hussein v The Labour Court & Anor [2012] IEHC 364	67
Kavanagh v Ireland [1996] 1 IR 348	118
Marks v Beyfus [1890] 25 QBD 494	122
McDonald v RTE [2001] 1 IR 355	
Minister of Justice and Equality v Gherine [2012] IEHC 536	. 140
Minister of Justice, Equality and Law Reform v Sliczynski [2008]  IESC 73	
Skeffington v Rooney and Others [1997] 1 IR 22	
United Kingdom	
A and Others v Secretary of State for the Home Department (No. 2) [2005]  UKHL 71	141
Attorney General's Reference (Number 1 of 2008), Gibbons and Others [2008] NICA 41	129
Belhadj and Others v Security Service, Secret Intelligence Service, Governmen	
Communications Headquarters, Secretary of State for Home Department	
and Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Office [2015]	
UKIPTrib 13 132-H	83
Beretki v Harghita Law Court Romania [2012] EWHC 336 (Admin)	. 140
Bohm v Romania [2011] EWHC 2671 (Admin)	. 140
Cadder v Her Majesty's Advocate [2010] UKSC 43	52
HH v Deputy Prosecutor of the Italian Republic, Genoa; PH v Deputy	
Prosecutor of the Italian Republic, Genoa; and F-K v Polish Judicial	
Authority [2012] UKSC 25	. 146
Liberty and Others v Security Service, Secret Intelligence Service and	
Government Communications Headquarters [2015] UKTrib	
13_77H 2	
Lithuania v Campbell [2013] NIQB 19	
Maxwell v H.M. Advocate 1980 JC 40	
N v The Police IPT/07/02/CH (2009)	
Perry v Serious Organised Crime Agency [2012] 3 WLR 379	134
R v Bow Street Metropolitan Stipendiary Magistrate, ex parte Pinochet	1.42
Ugarte [2000] 1 AC 61	
R v Clarke and Anor [2010] NICC 7	
R v Comerford [1998] 1 Cr App Rep 235	
R v G [2008] UKHL 37	
R v Guthrie and Others [2011] EWCA Crim 1338	
R v H [2004] UKHL 3	. 1,22
1 AC 42	142
R v Hull [2011] EWCA Crim 1261	
R v J, S, M [2010] EWCA Crim 1755	
R v Jones [1832] 110 ER 485	

R v Lambert [2001] UKHL 37	64
R v Matyas Pis [2012] NICC 14	
<i>R v P</i> [2001] 2 WLR 463	
R v Secretary of State for the Home Department, ex parte Read [1988]	
3 WLR 948	144
<i>R v T</i> [2009] EWCA Crim 1035	
R v Zardad [2007] All ER (D) 90	
Re Abdur Rashid Khan [2006] EWHC 2826 (QB)	
Re Brian and Paula Arthurs [2010] NIQB 75	
Re McParland [2008] NIQB 1	113
Samantha Orobator v Governor of HMP Holloway and Secretary of	
State for Justice [2010] EWHC 58 (Admin)	145
Serious Organised Crime Agency v Gale [2011] UKSC 49	
Wawrzyczek v Poland [2015] EWHC 2854 (Admin)	140
X v Local Authority IPT/03/50/CH (2008)	
United States	
United States v Alvarez-Machain 504 US 655 (1992)	141



## Table of international and regional instruments

#### International treaties

Slavery Convention 1926, 60 LNTS 254	15
International Convention for the Suppression of Counterfeiting	
Currency 1929, 112 LNTS 371	15
ILO Convention (No. 29) Concerning Forced and Compulsory	
Labour 1930, 39 UNTS 55	5, 28
Convention for the Suppression of the Illicit Traffic in Dangerous Drugs	
1936, 198 LNTS 301	
Single Convention on Narcotic Drugs 1961, 520 UNTS 151	18
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 1966, 993 UNTS 3	30
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1966, 999 UNTS 171	. 109
International Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Seizure of Aircraft 1970, 860 UNTS105	,
Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property 1970, 823 UNTS 231	
Convention for the Suppression of Unlawful Acts against the Safety of Civil Aviation 1971, 974 UNTS 178	10
Convention on Psychotropic Substance 1971, 1019 UNTS 175	
Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage 1972, 1037 UNTS 151	
Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of Crimes against	13
Internationally Protected Persons 1972, 1035 UNTS 167	19
Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora 1973, 993 UNTS 243	4, 15
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women 1979, 1249 UNTS 13	28
Convention on the Physical Protection of Nuclear Material 1979, 1456 UNTS 101	
International Convention against the Taking of Hostages 1979, 1316	,
UNTS 205	19