

# Feminist Economics and Public Policy

*Edited by*  
**Jim Campbell and**  
**Morag Gillespie**



Routledge IAFEE Advances in Feminist Economics

# FEMINIST ECONOMICS AND PUBLIC POLICY

Professor Ailsa McKay, who was known not only for her work as a feminist economist but also her influence on Scottish social and economic policy, died in 2014 at the height of her academic career and impact on public life. Organised around the key themes of Ailsa McKay's work, this collection brings together eminent contributors to argue for the importance of making women's roles and needs more visible in economic and social policies.

*Feminist Economics and Public Policy* presents a uniquely coherent analysis of key issues including gender mainstreaming, universal childcare provision and universal basic income security, in the context of today's challenging economic and political environments. It draws on international perspectives to look at the economic role of women, presenting readers with interrelated sections on gender budgeting and work and childcare, before concluding with a discussion on Citizen's Basic Income and how it could contribute towards a more efficient, equitable social security system. The theoretical, empirical and practice-based contributions assembled here present recommendations for more effective public policy, working towards a world in which women's diverse roles are recognized and fully accounted for.

This book is a unique collection, which will be of great relevance to those studying gender and economics, as well as to researchers and policy makers.

**Dr Jim Campbell** is a Reader in Economics at Glasgow Caledonian University, Scotland, UK.

**Morag Gillespie**, now retired, was formerly a Senior Research Fellow at Glasgow Caledonian University and a member of Women in Scotland's Economy Research Centre, UK.

## ROUTLEDGE IAFFE ADVANCES IN FEMINIST ECONOMICS

IAFFE aims to increase the visibility and range of economic research on gender; facilitate communication among scholars, policy makers and activists concerned with women's wellbeing and empowerment; promote discussions among policy makers about interventions which serve women's needs; educate economists, policy makers and the general public about feminist perspectives on economic issues; foster feminist evaluations of economics as a discipline; expose the gender blindness characteristic of much social science and the ways in which this impoverishes all research, even research that does not explicitly concern women's issues; help expand opportunities for women, especially women from underrepresented groups, within economics; and, encourage the inclusion of feminist perspectives in the teaching of economics. The IAFFE book series pursues the aims of the organisation by providing a forum in which scholars have space to develop their ideas at length and in detail. The series exemplifies the value of feminist research and the high standard of IAFFE sponsored scholarship.

### **1 Living Wages, Equal Wages**

Gender and Labor Market Policies in the United States

*Deborah M. Figart, Ellen Mutari and Marilyn Power*

### **2 Family Time**

The Social Organization of Care

*Edited by Nancy Folbre and Michael Bittman*

### **3 Feminist Economics and the World Bank**

History, Theory and Policy

*Edited by Edith Kuiper and Drucilla K. Barker*

### **4 Sexual Orientation Discrimination**

An International Perspective

*Edited by M. V. Lee Badgett and Jefferson Frank*

### **5 The Feminist Economics of Trade**

*Edited by Irene van Staveren, Diane Elson, Caren Grown, Nilufer Catagay*

### **6 Sex Markets**

A Denied Industry

*Marina Della Giusta, Maria Di Tommaso and Steinar Strøm*

### **7 Gender and Chinese Development**

Towards an Equitable Society

*Lanyan Chen*

### **8 Gender and the Contours of Precarious Employment**

*Leah Vosko, Martha MacDonald and Iain Campbell*

**9 Questioning Financial Governance  
from a Feminist Perspective**

*Edited by Brigitte Young, Isabella Bakker and  
Diane Elson*

**10 Challenging Knowledge, Sex and  
Power**

*Gender, Work and Engineering  
Julie E. Mills, Suzanne Franzway, Judith Gill  
and Rhonda Sharp*

**11 Women and Austerity**

*The Economic Crisis and the Future for  
Gender Equality  
Edited by Maria Karamessini and Jill Rubery*

**12 New Frontiers in Feminist Political  
Economy**

*Edited by Shirin M. Rai and Georgina Waylen*

**13 Gender and Climate Change  
Financing**

*Coming Out of the Margin  
Mariama Williams*

**14 Feminist Economics and  
Public Policy**

*Reflections on the work and impact of  
Ailsa McKay  
Edited by Jim Campbell and Morag Gillespie*

*This page has been left blank intentionally*

# FEMINIST ECONOMICS AND PUBLIC POLICY

Reflections on the work and impact  
of Ailsa McKay

*Edited by Jim Campbell and Morag Gillespie*

First published 2016  
by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge  
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

© 2016 Jim Campbell and Morag Gillespie

The right of the editors to be identified as the author of the editorial material, and of the authors for their individual chapters, has been asserted by them in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*Trademark notice:* Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

*British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

A catalog record for this book has been requested

ISBN: 978-1-138-95085-6 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-138-95086-3 (pbk)

ISBN: 978-1-315-66855-0 (ebk)

Typeset in Bembo by  
Servis Filmsetting Ltd, Stockport, Cheshire

# CONTENTS

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>x</i>
<i>List of tables</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Notes on contributors</i>	<i>xii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	<i>xviii</i>
<i>List of UK and international legislation</i>	<i>xx</i>

## **PART I**

### **Introduction and appreciation 1**

- |   |                                                                                   |    |
|---|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 1 | Introduction to the themes of the book<br><i>Jim Campbell and Morag Gillespie</i> | 3  |
| 2 | Appreciation: talking to Ailsa<br><i>Marilyn Waring</i>                           | 13 |

## **PART II**

### **Gender budgeting 25**

- |   |                                                                                               |    |
|---|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| 3 | Gender budgeting and macroeconomic policy<br><i>Diane Elson</i>                               | 27 |
| 4 | Challenging the norms: gender budgeting as feminist<br>policy change<br><i>Angela O'Hagan</i> | 38 |



5	Gender budgeting in Scotland: seeking transformative change through public spending <i>Angela O'Hagan and Morag Gillespie</i>	46
6	Gender budgeting in the capability approach: from theory to evidence <i>Tindara Addabbo</i>	54
7	In search of a gender budget with 'actual allocation of public monies': a wellbeing gender budget exercise <i>Gulay Gunluk-Senesen</i>	61
8	The Spanish Central Government budget: comments on recent experience <i>Paloma de Villota</i>	71
<b>PART III</b>		
<b>Women, work and childcare</b>		<b>81</b>
9	Childcare as an investment in infrastructure <i>Sue Himmelweit</i>	83
10	Integrating economic and social policy: childcare – a transformational policy? <i>Gary Gillespie and Uzma Khan</i>	94
11	Scotland and the great recession: an analysis of the gender impact <i>Jim Campbell, Ailsa McKay and Susanne Ross</i>	112
12	Occupational segregation and Modern Apprenticeships in Scotland <i>Emily Thomson</i>	124
13	Women working together <i>Ann Henderson</i>	137
<b>PART IV</b>		
<b>Citizen's Basic Income</b>		<b>151</b>
14	On justifying a Citizen's Basic Income <i>Chris Pierson</i>	153

15	A Citizen's Basic Income and its implications <i>Annie Miller</i>	164
16	Debating a Citizen's Basic Income: an interdisciplinary and cross-national perspective <i>Caitlin McLean</i>	177
17	Citizen's Basic Income: a radical and transformative idea for gender equality? <i>Morag Gillespie</i>	189
	<b>Conclusions</b>	<b>199</b>
18	Concluding thoughts: building on Ailsa's legacy <i>Jim Campbell and Morag Gillespie</i>	201
	Index	207

# FIGURES

4.1	Key actions for feminist policy change	40
4.2	Framework of favourable conditions	43
8.1	Density function and PIT rates	76
10.1	Scottish economic strategy: framework	95
10.2	The four priorities	96
10.3	Trends in employment rate; men and women: Scotland and UK	99
10.4	Male and female employment rates by age band	100
10.5	Childcare costs as a percentage of net family income	101
10.6	Labour market status and aspirations of women with dependent children	103
10.7	Impact on the Scottish economy of increased women's labour market participation	105
10.8	Public spending on family benefits in kind, in cash and tax measures	107
10.9	Public spending on family benefits in kind as a percentage of GDP, 2009	108

# TABLES

7.1	Gaziantep Municipality planned activities and budget allocations related to women and gender equality, 2015	67
7.2	Gaziantep Municipality budget allocations for women’s capabilities, 2015	68
8.1	Percentage of employed earners and PIT tax rates	75
10.1	Gender differences in labour market participation and employment March–May 2015	100
11.1	Employment in Scotland 2008–2015	113
11.2	Unemployment in Scotland 2008–2015	113
11.3	Economic inactivity in Scotland 2008–2015	114
11.4	Full-time and part-time employment in Scotland	115
11.5	Self-employment in Scotland 2008–2014	116
11.6	Underemployment in Scotland 2008–2014	118
12.1	Female participation rates by age	127
12.2	Female participation rate by SVQ level of attainment	128
12.3	Female participation in the ‘top ten’ occupational frameworks 2015 and change from 2009	128

# CONTRIBUTORS

**Tindara Addabbo** is Associate Professor of Economic Policy at the Department of Economics Marco Biagi of the University of Modena and Reggio Emilia (Italy). She is a member of CAPP (Centre for the Analysis of Public Policies), RECent (Center for Economic Research), the Scientific Committee of Fondazione Marco Biagi and the European Gender Budgeting Network. She has published in the areas of the gender impact of public and social policies, measurement of wellbeing in the capability approach, employment and wage discrimination by gender, income distribution and quality of work.

**Jim Campbell** is a Reader in Economics at Glasgow Caledonian University. His current research is focused on the following three areas: the impact of European Structural Funds on economic development in Scotland and in particular how changes in the level of funding and the administration of the funds will affect future economic development; occupational segregation in the context of apprenticeship training and workforce development; and the economic and social impact of the provision of childcare on local communities in areas of economic deprivation and the wider labour market implications of the expansion of childcare.

**Diane Elson** is Emeritus Professor of Sociology at the University of Essex, UK, and a Visiting Professor at Glasgow Caledonian University. She is a member of the UN Committee for Development Policy, and adviser to UN Women. She is a former Vice President of the International Association for Feminist Economics, and is Chair of the UK Women's Budget Group. She has published widely on gender equality, and economic policy, including articles in *World Development*, *Journal of International Development*, *Feminist Economics*, *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities* and *International Review of Applied Economics*. She is one of the founders of gender budget analysis with numerous publications on this issue.

**Gary Gillespie** was appointed Director and Scottish Government Chief Economist in 2011. He joined the civil service in 2000 from the Fraser of Allander Institute (University of Strathclyde) where his research interests included Scottish economy, regional economic modelling and foreign direct investment. His current role in providing economic advice to the First Minister is one of the most visible roles within the public sector in Scotland. He publishes regular assessments of the State of the Economy and is a regular participant in economic discussion across Scotland. He was made an Honorary Professor at Glasgow Caledonian University in January 2011 and was appointed to the role of Visiting Professor at the University of Strathclyde in 2015.

**Morag Gillespie**, now retired, was formerly a Senior Research Fellow at Glasgow Caledonian University and a member of Women in Scotland's Economy Research Centre. She has a long history of working with voluntary and community groups, including delivering and managing social, welfare and legal rights advice services in a variety of voluntary sector settings. She is a qualitative researcher with an interest in inclusion and involvement of groups experiencing poverty who are often excluded from research and decision making. Her writing and teaching focuses on poverty (including social security) and inequality, with particular interests in gender and women's experiences of poverty.

**Gulay Gunluk-Senesen** is a Professor of Public Finance at the Faculty of Political Sciences, Istanbul University, Turkey. Her publications are in the areas of gender issues (glass ceiling, women's employment and gender budgeting), input-output modelling and defence expenditures. She was a member of the Turkish delegation at the UN CSW, 52nd session on 'Financing for Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women', New York, USA, in 2008. She is involved in The Women's Labour and Employment Initiative Platform (KEIG, [www.keig.org](http://www.keig.org)) – Turkey. She recently led a research project on 'Public Policies, Local Governments, Gender Budgeting: Women Friendly Cities, Case of Turkey'. She is a member of the European Gender Budgeting Network.

**Ann Henderson** has been Assistant Secretary at the Scottish Trade Union Congress since 2007, responsible for government and parliamentary liaison. Ann has campaigned for women's equality throughout her varied working life, as a train driver, parliamentary researcher, community worker and member of the Women's National Commission. Her interests focus on improving women's working conditions, the value of women's work, women in public policy and political decision making. As a researcher early in the Scottish Parliament, Ann was instrumental in securing access for the new Scottish Women's Budget Group to promote gender analysis in the Scottish budget process. Through the STUC Women's Committee Ann organised a series of 'Economics for Equality' Weekend Schools for women trade unionists, led by Ailsa McKay.

**Susan Himmelweit** is Professor Emeritus in Economics at the Open University, whose research is on the economics of gender, including gender budgeting, theoretical and policy aspects of the economics of care and intra-household inequalities. She was President of the International Association for Feminist Economics, an Associate Editor of the journal *Feminist Economics* and the founding chair of the UK Women's Budget Group, whose policy advisory group she now coordinates, contributing to its reports on the gender impact of successive budgets and spending reviews ([www.wbg.org.uk/RRB\\_Reports.htm](http://www.wbg.org.uk/RRB_Reports.htm)). With Hilary Land she has written on care policy for the Equal Opportunities Commission, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation and the trade union Unison. She is a member of the EHRC's Fair Financial Decisions Advisory Group.

**Uzma Khan** joined the Scottish Government as a professional economist in 1999. Her experience spans a broad number of departments including providing economic advice to Scottish Ministers on education and lifelong learning, health, business and enterprise and, more recently, transport policy. Currently, Uzma heads up the Economic Policy and Strategy Unit within the Office of the Chief Economic Adviser where her key role is to develop the policy framework for the Scottish Economic Strategy and labour market economics. Uzma graduated from Glasgow University in Economics in 1999, and completed her Masters degree in Business Economics from Strathclyde University in 2002.

**Caitlin McLean** was the first Ailsa McKay Postdoctoral Fellow in Economics based in the WiSE Research Centre at Glasgow Caledonian University. In that post she explored the potential for a Citizen's Basic Income (CBI) to contribute to greater gender equality. She holds a PhD in Social Policy from the University of Edinburgh, where her thesis compared childcare policy and provision in the US and UK. She has also contributed to collaborative projects comparing childcare in Europe, including research for the EU-funded project 'Families & Societies' as well as an international review of childcare provision published by the Scottish Government. Caitlin is now a Workforce Research Specialist at the Center for the Study of Child Care Employment, University of California-Berkley.

**Annie Miller**, now retired, lectured at Heriot-Watt University, teaching mainly business economics, and maths and statistics for economists. She was a co-founder in 1984, and has been a Trustee since 1989, of The Basic Income Research Group, which became the Citizen's Income Trust in 1992. She has been Chair of CIT since 2001 and she contributes regularly to its *Citizen's Income Newsletter*. She has also given talks and presented papers on CBI both here in the UK and abroad. Annie collaborated with Ailsa to promote debate and discussion on CBI, most recently at the Scottish Parliament on 15 January 2014. Further details of Annie's publications and the work of the CIT are available at [www.citizensincome.org](http://www.citizensincome.org).

**Angela O'Hagan** is a Lecturer at Glasgow Caledonian University (GCU) and a researcher with WiSE. Angela and Ailsa met when setting up the Scottish Women's Budget Group (SWBG) and became firm friends. Convenor of SWBG since 2006, Angela is also a long-standing member of the Scottish Government Equality and Budgets Advisory Group, the UK Women's Budget Group Management Committee and the European Gender Budgeting Network. Angela completed her PhD at GCU with Ailsa McKay as her Director of Studies, comparing gender budgeting in Scotland and Spain. Angela has held a number of senior management roles in civil society and statutory organisations and has a range of current and past roles on management boards of civil society organisations.

**Chris Pierson** is Professor of Politics in the School of Politics and International Relations at the University of Nottingham. He is lead editor of the journal *Political Studies*. He has held visiting research posts at the University of California, Santa Barbara, the Johns Hopkins University, the Australian National University, the University of Auckland and the Hansewissenschaftskolleg in Niedersachsen, Germany. He is working on a three-volume history of justifications of private property. The first volume is published as *Just Property: A History in the Latin West*. (Oxford University Press, 2013).

**Susanne Ross** is a Lecturer in Business (with an interest in Public Management) at Queen Margaret University, Edinburgh. She has previously worked at the Scottish Government, Glasgow Caledonian University, Heriot-Watt University and Glasgow International College. Susanne has undertaken research into the gender impact assessment of funding decisions for, and gender-based occupational segregation within, the Scottish Modern Apprenticeship programme; gender mainstreaming within the European Structural Funds programme; as well as work on developing a system of National Accounts for Scotland. Her academic and research interests include feminist economics, women in the labour market, gender analysis and public policy. She is currently a member of the International Association for Feminist Economics and research associate for WiSE Research Centre, Glasgow Caledonian University.

**Emily Thomson** is a Senior Lecturer in Economics and a member of the Women in Scotland's Economy (WiSE) Research Centre at Glasgow Caledonian University. Her teaching and research interests include feminist economics, the business case for gender equality and international development. Emily is a member of the International Association for Feminist Economics, a fellow of the International Working Group on Gender, Macroeconomics and International Economics and a fellow of the Higher Education Academy.

**Paloma de Villota** is Professor of Applied Economy at Universidad Complutense de Madrid. She is the director and promoter of the doctorate course 'The Economic Theory from a feminist perspective' which was distinguished with 'Mención de



Calidad' by the Ministry of Education. She has worked on many studies with the European Commission and a variety of European and Latin American Universities. Her research focuses on gender incidence of taxation and public policies. She is head of the Feminist Research Institute of the Universidad Complutense, on the Board of Editorial Committee of the *Feminist Studies Magazine* (Universidad Complutense) and a leading member of the Scientific Committee of the Economía Crítica and the Spanish network Women in Science, GENET.

**Marilyn Waring** is Professor of Public Policy at AUT University, Auckland, New Zealand, an honorary graduate of GCU and a long-standing inspiration in the work of Ailsa McKay. Her research interests include governance and public policy, political economy, gender analysis and human rights. Marilyn received Amnesty International New Zealand's Human Rights Defender Award in 2013, and in 2014 was the Institute of Economic Research Economist of the Year, and was awarded the University Vice Chancellor's Research Medal. The film *Who's Counting? Marilyn Waring on Sex, Lies and Global Economics* forms the basis of the 'Economics for Equality' programme at GCU. Ailsa's last publication was a co-edited volume on the influence and impact of Marilyn's thinking on feminist economics in practice.

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book came about as a result of a commemorative conference held for Ailsa McKay in January 2015.

I would like to thank all of the people who attended the event, particularly the speakers who came from far and wide to celebrate Ailsa's research and impact. In particular I would like to thank Glasgow Caledonian University and the Scottish Government for providing the financial resources which enabled us to stage the conference in the first place.

Thanks to all of the contributors for responding to the various requests for changes in a timeous manner. A very special thanks to my co-editor Morag Gillespie for all her hard work in bringing this project to a successful conclusion, despite the fact that she 'retired' halfway through. Also thanks to Professor Eleanor Gordon and Professor Sara Cantillon, Director of Women in Scotland Economy Research Centre (WiSE) for providing helpful comments on some of the chapters.

The book is dedicated to the memory of Ailsa McKay and I hope that it will be a fitting testament to her impact as an academic and as an activist who made it her mission to ensure 'women counted'.

For Ailsa, 'the best thing that ever happened to me'.

Jim Campbell  
September 2015

# LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CBI	Citizen's Basic Income
CEA	Council of Economic Advisers
CIT	Citizen's Income Trust
COSLA	Convention of Scottish Local Authorities
DSS	Department of Social Security
DWP	Department for Work and Pensions
EBAG	Equality and Budgets Advisory Group
EBS	Equality Budget Statement
EGBN	European Gender Budgeting Network
EHRC	Equality and Human Rights Commission
EOC	Equal Opportunities Commission
EQF	European Qualification Framework
ESA	European System of National Accounts
EU	European Union
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GFI	General Formal Investigation
GGEPMI	Global Gender and Economic Policy Management Initiative
HBAI	Households Below Average Incomes
HES	Household Economies of Scale
HMRC	Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs
HMSO	Her Majesty's Stationery Office
IAFFE	International Association for Feminist Economics
IMF	International Monetary Fund
JdA	Junta de Andalucía
LGBTI	Lesbian, Gay, Bi-sexual, Trans-sexual, and Intersex
LTCI	Long-Term Care Insurance
MA	Modern Apprenticeship

MDR	Marginal Deduction Rate
MSP	Member of the Scottish Parliament
MTB	Means-Tested Benefit
NHS	National Health Service
NI	National Insurance
NIC	National Insurance Contributions
NICE	National Institute for Health and Care Excellence
NLW	National Living Wage
NMW	National Minimum Wage
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
ONS	Office for National Statistics
OSWG	Occupational Segregation Working Group
PIT	Personal Income Tax
R&D	Research and Development
SA	Social Assistance
SDS	Skills Development Scotland
SES	Scotland's Economic Strategy
SNA	System of National Accounts
SNP	Scottish National Party
STUC	Scottish Trades Union Congress
SVQ	Scottish Vocational Qualification
SWBG	Scottish Women's Budget Group
TL	Turkish Lira
UBI	Universal Basic Income
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNJP	United Nations Joint Programme
UNSNA	United Nations System of National Accounts
WBG	Women's Budget Group
WiSE	Women in Scotland's Economy

# LIST OF UK AND INTERNATIONAL LEGISLATION

Equality Act (2006)

Equality Act (2010)

Health and Safety at Work Act (1974)

*Ley 26/2014*, 27 November 2014. Madrid. BOE-A-2014-12327

*Ley 39/2010*, 22 December 2010. Madrid. BOE-A-2010-19703

*Ley 35/2006*, 28 November 2006. Madrid: BOE-A-2006-20764

*Ley 30/2003*, 13 October 2003. Madrid: BOE-A-2003-18920

Real Decreto Ley 20/2011, 30 December 2011. Madrid. BOE-A-2011-20638

Trade Union Act (1927)

## **PART I**

# **Introduction and appreciation**

*This page has been left blank intentionally*

# 1

## INTRODUCTION TO THE THEMES OF THE BOOK

*Jim Campbell and Morag Gillespie*

As I am an economist I could provide you with a shed load of statistics. However as I am a Feminist Economist I am going to continue to tell you stories. Not because I can't do statistics but because I think the statistics need the stories to provide a more rich understanding of their meaning. In that sense I like to follow the example of Keynes and Stiglitz – great economists of our time, who believed and continue to believe in the need to engage and persuade the public – and to tell the story in a way that we all understand and to appeal to us all to follow a path that makes sense with respect to valuing all of our assets and not just those with a market price.

(McKay, 2012)

Professor Ailsa McKay told stories about women's disadvantaged position in the economy in a way that made people listen. She built a formidable international reputation as a feminist economist and had a profound influence on discussions of economic and social policy in Scotland and beyond. She died on 5 March 2014 at the height of her academic career and impact on public life.

This book is largely based on the contributions made at a two-day commemorative conference held in Ailsa's honour in January 2015. The conference themes reflected the key areas of Ailsa's research interests, namely: gender budgeting; women, work and childcare; and Citizen's Basic Income (CBI). This book follows a similar structure and is divided into three distinct but inter-related sections.

With one exception, all of the contributors to this book would regard themselves not just as colleagues of Ailsa's but friends and, in some cases, very close friends. The exception is Dr Caitlin McLean who did not know Ailsa but was appointed as the first Ailsa McKay Postdoctoral Research Fellow in Economics at Glasgow Caledonian University in January 2015. This position was created by Professor Pamela Gillies, Principal and Vice-Chancellor of Glasgow Caledonian University, in memory of Ailsa and to take her work forward.