

Edited by
Adrienne Harris
& Steven Kuchuck

THE LEGACY OF
**SÁNDOR
FERENCZI**

From Ghost to Ancestor



THE LEGACY OF SÁNDOR FERENCZI

Ferenczi wanted his colleagues and pupils to think and work in their own unique ways and according to their own interests and personality. This is one of the reasons that therapists and analysts of various theoretical origins continue to be drawn to his propositions. Ferenczi was probably the first and perhaps still even the only psychoanalyst who did not speak of *training* in psychoanalysis, but of *learning* it according to one's own rhythms rather than merely following a prescribed course. This important new book illustrates Ferenczi's unique vision of psychoanalysis and summarizes and expands on the gifts psychoanalysts can find in the abundance of his work. It also offers a glimpse into Ferenczi's personal history, and how this affected the ways in which he considered human beings, the world, psychoanalysis, and himself.

—Judith Dupont, Ph.D. Editor, *The Clinical Diary of Sándor Ferenczi*, Literary representative of Sándor Ferenczi, Recipient of the 2013 Sigourney Award

This fine collection of essays, written by clinicians and scholars of diverse backgrounds, honors the memory of Sándor Ferenczi, Sigmund Freud's closest friend and collaborator, whose groundbreaking contributions to the theory and practice of psychoanalysis were scorned and marginalized by many of his contemporaries. The contributors to this volume have adroitly and sensitively demonstrated the relevance of Ferenczi's ideas to current trends in psychoanalytic thinking and are taking a major step toward restoring his legacy to its rightful place in history.

—Peter T. Hoffer, Ph.D. Psychoanalytic Center of Philadelphia; Translator, *The Correspondence of Sigmund Freud and Sándor Ferenczi*

When *The Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi* appeared in 1993, Ferenczi was often ignored or maligned in psychoanalytic circles. That book was a significant part of the Ferenczi Renaissance—a striking example of the psychoanalytic notion that the

past keeps changing. The present volume appears in a different climate—Ferenczi, to our great benefit, returned from exile—and testifies to the continued liveliness of contemporary Ferenczi scholarship by eminent authors around the world, illuminating his life and the development of his stimulating revolutionary ideas.

—**Emanuel Berman, Ph.D. Israel Psychoanalytic Society**

The Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi, first published in 1993 and edited by Lewis Aron and Adrienne Harris, was one of the first books to examine Ferenczi's invaluable contributions to psychoanalysis and his continuing influence on contemporary clinicians and scholars. Building on that pioneering work, *The Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi: From Ghost to Ancestor* brings together leading international Ferenczi scholars to report on previously unavailable data about Ferenczi and his professional descendants.

Many—including Sigmund Freud himself—considered Sándor Ferenczi to be Freud's most gifted patient and protégé. For a large part of his career, Ferenczi was almost as well known, influential, and sought after as a psychoanalyst, teacher, and lecturer as Freud himself. Later, irreconcilable differences between Freud, his followers, and Ferenczi meant that many of his writings were withheld from translation or otherwise stifled, and he was accused of being mentally ill and shunned. In this book, Adrienne Harris and Steven Kuchuck explore how newly discovered historical and theoretical material has returned Ferenczi to a place of theoretical legitimacy and prominence. His work continues to influence both psychoanalytic theory and practice and covers many major contemporary psychoanalytic topics such as process, metapsychology, character structure, trauma, sexuality, and social and progressive aspects of psychoanalytic work.

Among other historical and scholarly contributions, this book demonstrates the direct link between Ferenczi's pioneering work and subsequent psychoanalytic innovations. With rich clinical vignettes, newly unearthed historical data, and contemporary theoretical explorations, it will be of great interest and use to clinicians of all theoretical stripes, as well as scholars and historians.

Adrienne Harris, Ph.D. (co-editor) is faculty and supervisor, NYU Postdoctoral Program in Psychotherapy and Psychoanalysis, Faculty and Training Analyst at the Psychoanalytic Institute of Northern California, serves on the *Editorial Boards of Psychoanalytic Dialogues, Studies in Gender and Sexuality, Psychoanalytic Perspectives* and the *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association*. Co-editor, *Routledge's Relational Perspectives Book Series*.

Steven Kuchuck, LCSW (co-editor) is a faculty member, supervisor, Board member, and codirector of curriculum for the adult training program in psychoanalysis at the National Institute for the Psychotherapies and faculty, Stephen Mitchell Center for Relational Studies. Steven is Editor-in-Chief of *Psychoanalytic Perspectives*, and Associate Editor of *Routledge's Relational Perspectives Book Series*.

Relational Perspectives Book Series

Lewis Aron & Adrienne Harris

Series Co-Editors

Steven Kuchuck & Eyal Rozmarin

Associate Editors



The Relational Perspectives Book Series (RPBS) publishes books that grow out of or contribute to the relational tradition in contemporary psychoanalysis. The term *relational psychoanalysis* was first used by Greenberg and Mitchell¹ to bridge the traditions of interpersonal relations, as developed within interpersonal psychoanalysis and object relations, as developed within contemporary British theory. But, under the seminal work of the late Stephen Mitchell, the term *relational psychoanalysis* grew and began to accrue to itself many other influences and developments. Various tributaries—interpersonal psychoanalysis, object relations theory, self psychology, empirical infancy research, and elements of contemporary Freudian and Kleinian thought—flow into this tradition, which understands relational configurations between self and others, both real and fantasied, as the primary subject of psychoanalytic investigation.

We refer to the relational tradition, rather than to a relational school, to highlight that we are identifying a trend, a tendency within contemporary psychoanalysis, not a more formally organized or coherent school or system of beliefs. Our use of the term *relational* signifies a dimension of theory and practice that has become salient across the wide spectrum of contemporary psychoanalysis. Now under the editorial supervision of Lewis Aron and Adrienne Harris with the assistance of Associate Editors Steven Kuchuck and Eyal Rozmarin, the Relational Perspectives Book Series originated in 1990 under the editorial eye of the late Stephen A. Mitchell. Mitchell was the most prolific and influential of the originators of the relational tradition. He was committed to dialogue among psychoanalysts and he abhorred the authoritarianism that dictated adherence to a rigid set of beliefs or technical restrictions. He championed open discussion, comparative and integrative approaches, and he promoted new voices across the generations.

Included in the Relational Perspectives Book Series are authors and works that come from within the relational tradition, extend and develop the tradition, as well as works that critique relational approaches or compare and contrast it with alternative points of view. The series includes our most distinguished senior psychoanalysts, along with younger contributors who bring fresh vision.

1 Greenberg, J. & Mitchell, S. (1983). *Object relations in psychoanalytic theory*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Vol. 1

Conversing with Uncertainty: Practicing Psychotherapy in a Hospital Setting

Rita Wiley McCleary

Vol. 2

Affect in Psychoanalysis: A Clinical Synthesis

Charles Spezzano

Vol. 3

The Analyst in the Inner City: Race, Class, and Culture through a Psychoanalytic Lens

Neil Altman

Vol. 4

A Meeting of Minds: Mutuality in Psychoanalysis

Lewis Aron

Vol. 5

Holding and Psychoanalysis: A Relational Perspective

Joyce A. Slochower

Vol. 6

The Therapist as a Person: Life Crises, Life Choices, Life Experiences, and Their Effects on Treatment

Barbara Gerson (ed.)

Vol. 7

Soul on the Couch: Spirituality, Religion, and Morality in Contemporary Psychoanalysis

Charles Spezzano & Gerald J. Gargiulo (eds.)

Vol. 8

Unformulated Experience: From Dissociation to Imagination in Psychoanalysis

Donnel B. Stern

Vol. 9

Influence and Autonomy in Psychoanalysis

Stephen A. Mitchell

Vol. 10

Fairbairn, Then and Now

Neil J. Skolnick & David E. Scharff (eds.)

Vol. 11

Building Bridges: Negotiation of Paradox in Psychoanalysis

Stuart A. Pizer

Vol. 12

Relational Perspectives on the Body

Lewis Aron & Frances Sommer Anderson (eds.)

Vol. 13

Seduction, Surrender, and Transformation: Emotional Engagement in the Analytic Process

Karen Maroda

Vol. 14

Relational Psychoanalysis: The Emergence of a Tradition

Stephen A. Mitchell & Lewis Aron (eds.)

Vol. 15

The Collapse of the Self and Its Therapeutic Restoration

Rochelle G. K. Kainer

Vol. 16

Psychoanalytic Participation: Action, Interaction, and Integration

Kenneth A. Frank

Vol. 17

The Reproduction of Evil: A Clinical and Cultural Perspective

Sue Grand

Vol. 18

Objects of Hope: Exploring Possibility and Limit in Psychoanalysis

Steven H. Cooper

Vol. 19

Who is the Dreamer, Who Dreams the Dream? A Study of Psychic Presences

James S. Grotstein

Vol. 20

Relationality: From Attachment to Intersubjectivity

Stephen A. Mitchell

Vol. 21

Looking for Ground: Countertransference and the Problem of Value in Psychoanalysis

Peter G. M. Carnochan

Vol. 22

Sexuality, Intimacy, Power

Muriel Dimen

Vol. 23

September 11: Trauma and Human Bonds

Susan W. Coates, Jane L. Rosenthal, & Daniel S. Schechter (eds.)

Vol. 24

Minding Spirituality

Randall Lehman Sorenson

Vol. 25

Gender as Soft Assembly

Adrienne Harris

Vol. 26

Impossible Training: A Relational View of Psychoanalytic Education

Emanuel Berman

Vol. 27

The Designed Self: Psychoanalysis and Contemporary Identities

Carlo Strenger

Vol. 28

Relational Psychoanalysis, Vol. II: Innovation and Expansion

Lewis Aron & Adrienne Harris (eds.)

Vol. 29

Child Therapy in the Great Outdoors: A Relational View

Sebastiano Santostefano

Vol. 30

The Healer's Bent: Solitude and Dialogue in the Clinical Encounter

James T. McLaughlin

Vol. 31

Unconscious Fantasies and the Relational World

Danielle Knafo & Kenneth Feiner

Vol. 32

Getting from Here to There:

Analytic Love, Analytic Process

Sheldon Bach

Vol. 33

Creating Bodies: Eating Disorders as Self-Destructive Survival

Katie Gentile

Vol. 34

Relational Psychoanalysis, Vol. III: New Voices

Melanie Suchet, Adrienne Harris, & Lewis Aron (eds.)

Vol. 35

Comparative-Integrative Psychoanalysis: A Relational Perspective for the Discipline's Second Century

Brent Willock

Vol. 36

Bodies in Treatment: The Unspoken Dimension

Frances Sommer Anderson (ed.)

Vol. 37

Adolescent Identities: A Collection of Readings

Deborah Browning (ed.)

Vol. 38

Repair of the Soul: Metaphors of Transformation in Jewish Mysticism and Psychoanalysis

Karen E. Starr

Vol. 39

Dare to be Human: A Contemporary Psychoanalytic Journey

Michael Shoshani Rosenbaum

Vol. 40

The Analyst in the Inner City, Second Edition: Race, Class, and Culture through a Psychoanalytic Lens

Neil Altman

Vol. 41

The Hero in the Mirror: From Fear to Fortitude

Sue Grand

Vol. 42

Sabert Basescu: Selected Papers on Human Nature and Psychoanalysis

George Goldstein & Helen Golden (eds.)

Vol. 43

Invasive Objects: Minds under Siege

Paul Williams

Vol. 44

Good Enough Endings: Breaks, Interruptions, and Terminations from Contemporary Relational Perspectives

Jill Salberg (ed.)

Vol. 45

First Do No Harm: The Paradoxical Encounters of Psychoanalysis, Warmaking, and Resistance

Adrienne Harris & Steven Botticelli (eds.)

Vol. 46

A Disturbance in the Field: Essays in Transference- Countertransference Engagement

Steven H. Cooper

Vol. 47

Uprooted Minds: Surviving the Politics of Terror in the Americas

Nancy Caro Hollander

Vol. 48

Toward Mutual Recognition: Relational Psychoanalysis and the Christian Narrative

Marie T. Hoffman

Vol. 49

Understanding and Treating Dissociative Identity Disorder: A Relational Approach

Elizabeth F. Howell

Vol. 50

With Culture in Mind: Psychoanalytic Stories

Muriel Dimen (ed.)

Vol. 51

Relational Psychoanalysis, Vol. IV: Expansion of Theory

Lewis Aron & Adrienne Harris (eds.)

Vol. 52

Relational Psychoanalysis, Vol. V: Evolution of Process

Lewis Aron & Adrienne Harris (eds.)

Vol. 53

Individualizing Gender and Sexuality: Theory and Practice

Nancy Chodorow

Vol. 54

The Silent Past and the Invisible Present: Memory, Trauma, and Representation in Psychotherapy

Paul Renn

Vol. 55

A Psychotherapy for the People: Toward a Progressive Psychoanalysis

Lewis Aron & Karen Starr

Vol. 56

Holding and Psychoanalysis: A Relational Perspective

Joyce Slochower

Vol. 57

The Play Within the Play: The Enacted Dimension of Psychoanalytic Process

Gil Katz

Vol. 58

Traumatic Narcissism: Relational Systems of Subjugation

Daniel Shaw

Vol. 59

Clinical Implications of the Psychoanalyst's Life Experience: When the Personal Becomes Professional

Steven Kuchuck (ed.)

Vol. 60

The Origins of Attachment: Infant Research and Adult Treatment

Beatrice Beebe & Frank M. Lachmann

Vol. 61

The Embodied Analyst: From Freud and Reich to Relationality

Jon Sletvold

Vol. 62

A Relational Psychoanalytic Approach to Couples Psychotherapy

Philip A. Ringstrom

Vol. 63

Cyclical Psychodynamics and the Contextual Self: The Inner World, the Intimate World, and the World of Culture and Society

Paul L. Wachtel

Vol. 64

Traumatic Ruptures: Abandonment and Betrayal in the Analytic Relationship

Robin A. Deutsch (ed.)

Vol. 65

The Cut and the Building of Psychoanalysis, Volume 1: Sigmund Freud and Emma Eckstein

Carlo Bonomi

Vol. 66

Relational Psychoanalysis and Psychotherapy Integration: An Evolving Synergy

Jill Bresler & Karen Starr (eds.)

Vol. 67

The Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi: From Ghost to Ancestor

Adrienne Harris & Steven Kuchuck (eds.)

Vol. 68

Somatic Experience in Psychoanalysis and Psychotherapy: In the Expressive Language of the Living

William F. Cornell

This page intentionally left blank

THE LEGACY OF SÁNDOR FERENCZI

From Ghost to Ancestor

*Edited by Adrienne Harris and
Steven Kuchuck*

First published 2015
by Routledge
27 Church Road, Hove, East Sussex BN3 2FA

and by Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017
Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2015 Adrienne Harris & Steven Kuchuck

The right of the editor to be identified as the author of the editorial material, and of the authors for their individual chapters, has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi (2015) The legacy of Sándor Ferenczi: from ghost to ancestor / edited by Adrienne Harris & Steven Kuchuck.

p. ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

I. Harris, Adrienne, editor. II. Kuchuck, Steven, editor. III. Title. [DNLM: 1. Ferenczi, Sándor, 1873–1933. 2. Psychoanalysis. 3. Psychoanalytic Theory.

WM 460] RC506

616.89'17—dc23

2014042310

ISBN: 978-1-138-82011-1 hbk

ISBN: 978-1-138-82012-8 pbk

ISBN: 978-1-315-74399-8 ebk

Typeset in Bembo
by codeMantra

In memory of Martin S. Bergmann (1913–2014) and György Hidas
(1925–2012)

Keepers of the flame.

Preservers of Ferenczi's work, traditions, and meaning.

We thank them and everyone in this volume who has helped to preserve and enliven the work of Ferenczi. We are all in their debt.

This page intentionally left blank

CONTENTS

<i>List of Contributors</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xix
Introduction	1
PART I	
The Context	17
1 Ferenczi in Our Contemporary World <i>Judit Mészáros</i>	19
2 The Penis on the Trail: Re-reading the origins of psychoanalysis with Sándor Ferenczi <i>Carlo Bonomi</i>	33
3 Ferenczi's Attitude <i>André E. Haynal and Véronique D. Haynal</i> <i>Translated by Sarah K. Wang</i>	52
PART II	
History	75
4 Out of the Archive/Unto the Couch: Clara Thompson's Analysis with Ferenczi <i>B. William Brennan</i>	77
5 Georg Groddeck's Influence on Sándor Ferenczi <i>Christopher Fortune</i>	96

- 6 Elizabeth Severn: Sándor Ferenczi's Analyst and
Collaborator in the Study and Treatment of Trauma 111
Arnold Wm. Rachman
- 7 Ferenczi's Work on War Neuroses 127
Adrienne Harris
- 8 The Other Side of the Story: Severn on Ferenczi
and Mutual Analysis 134
Peter L. Rudnytsky
- 9 Freud and Ferenczi: Wandering Jews in Palermo 150
Lewis Aron and Karen Starr

PART III

Theory and Technique 169

- 10 Ferenczi, the "Introjective Analyst" 171
Franco Borgogno
- 11 Confusion of Tongues: Trauma and Playfulness 187
Galit Atlas
- 12 The Persistent Sense of Being Bad: The Moral
Dimension of Identification with the Aggressor 204
Jay Frankel
- 13 On the Therapeutic Action of Love and Desire 223
Steven Kuchuck
- 14 The Dialogue of Unconsciouses, Mutual Analysis, and the
Uses of the Self in Contemporary Relational Psychoanalysis 235
Anthony Bass
- 15 Ferenczi with Lacan: A Missed Encounter 251
Lewis Kirshner
- 16 A Second Confusion of Tongues: Ferenczi, Laplanche,
and Social Life 264
Eyal Rozmarin
- 17 Some Preventive Considerations about Ferenczi's
Ideas Regarding Trauma and Analytic Experience 274
Haydée Christinne Kahtuni
- Index* 287

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Lewis Aron, Ph.D., ABPP is the director of the New York University Postdoctoral Program in Psychotherapy and Psychoanalysis. He is a past president of the Division of Psychoanalysis (39) APA, founding president of the International Association for Relational Psychoanalysis and Psychotherapy (IARPP), and founding president of the Division of Psychologist-Psychoanalysts of NYSPA; the co-founder and co-chair of the Sándor Ferenczi Center at The New School for Social Research; an honorary member of the William Alanson White Psychoanalytic Society, and adjunct professor, School of Psychology, Interdisciplinary Center (IDC) Herzliya, Israel; a co-founder of Psychoanalytic Dialogues and the co-editor of the Relational Perspectives Book Series; author of *A Meeting of Minds* (1996), *A Psychotherapy for the People* (with Karen Starr); editor of *Relational Psychoanalysis: The Emergence of a Tradition* (with Stephen Mitchell); co-editor of the Relational Perspectives Book Series; and author and editor of numerous articles and books. For more information, see www.lewaron.com.

Galit Atlas, Ph.D. is a psychoanalyst, creative arts therapist, and clinical supervisor in private practice in New York City. She is a clinical assistant professor on the faculty of the New York University Postdoctoral Program in Psychotherapy & Psychoanalysis, a faculty member of the Institute for Expressive Analysis (IEA), and a faculty member of the National Training Programs (NTP) and the Four-Year Adult Training Program of the National Institute for the Psychotherapies (NIP) in NYC. Galit serves on the Editorial Board of Psychoanalytic Perspectives, is on the Board of Directors of the Division of Psychoanalysis (39) APA, and is the author of articles and book chapters that focus primarily on gender and sexuality. Galit teaches ongoing private study and supervision groups. Her book *The Enigma of Desire: Sex, Longing and Belonging in Psychoanalysis* will be published by Routledge's Relational Perspectives Book Series next year. More information is available at www.galitatlas.com.

Anthony Bass, Ph.D. is on the faculty of the New York University Postdoctoral Program in Psychotherapy and Psychoanalysis, The Columbia University Center for Psychoanalytic Training and Research, the Stephen Mitchell Center for Relational Studies, The National Institute for the Psychotherapies National Training Program, and the Institute for Relational Psychoanalysis of Philadelphia. He is a joint editor-in-chief of *Psychoanalytic Dialogues: The International Journal of Relational Perspectives* and a founding director of The International Association for Relational Psychoanalysis and Psychotherapy.

Carlo Bonomi, Ph.D. is a faculty member and supervising analyst at the Istituto di psicoanalisi H. S. Sullivan (Florence, Italy), associate editor of the *International Forum of Psychoanalysis*, and co-founding president of the Associazione culturale Sándor Ferenczi. Together with Judit Mészáros, he has promoted the Ferenczi-House project.

Franco Borgogno, Ph.D. is full professor of clinical psychology at the Psychology Department of Turin University (Italy), full member of the International Psychoanalytical Association and of the American Psychoanalytic Association, training and supervising analyst of the Società Psicoanalitica Italiana, and author of *Psychoanalysis as a Journey* (London, Open Gate, 2007) and *The Girl Who Committed Hara-Kiri and Other Clinical and Historical Essays* (London, Karnac Books, 2012).

B. William Brennan, ThM, MA, LMHC is a psychoanalyst and psychoanalytic historian in independent practice in Providence, Rhode Island. He is a graduate of the National Training Program of the National Institute for the Psychotherapies, NYC. He has written on Izette de Forest, as well as the identities of the patients in Ferenczi's *Clinical Diary*, and is currently working on a book about Ferenczi and his American circle.

Christopher Fortune, Ph.D. is a historian of psychoanalysis who focuses on the work of Sándor Ferenczi. He has lectured and published internationally and written papers, chapters, reviews, and interviews for scholarly and popular journals. He is the editor of *Sándor Ferenczi-Georg Groddeck Correspondence: 1921–1933* (Open Gate Press, 2002). He has a doctorate from the University of Toronto and is presently an associate of the Institute for the Humanities at Simon Fraser University, Vancouver, Canada.

Jay Frankel, Ph.D. is adjunct clinical associate professor in the New York University Postdoctoral Program in Psychotherapy and Psychoanalysis, professor in the Master's program in Critical Theory and the Arts at the School of Visual Arts, and a faculty member at the Institute for Psychoanalytic Training and Research, all in New York; associate editor of *Psychoanalytic Dialogues*; author of more than two dozen journal articles and book chapters; and co-author of *Relational Child Psychotherapy* (Other Press, 2002).

Adrienne Harris, Ph.D. (co-editor) is on the faculty and supervises at the NYU Post-doctoral Program in Psychotherapy and Psychoanalysis. She is a faculty member and a training analyst at the Psychoanalytic Institute of Northern California and serves on the Editorial Boards of *Psychoanalytic Dialogues*, *Studies in Gender and Sexuality*, *Psychoanalytic Perspectives*, and the *Journal of the American Psychoanalytic Association*. She is the author of *Rocking the Ship of State and Gender As Soft Assembly* and co-editor of *Storms in Her Head: The Centennial of Studies on Hysteria; Relational Traditions Vol. 3, 4 and 5; First, Do No Harm: Psychoanalysis, War Making and Resistance*; and forthcoming: *Ghosts in the 21st Century Consulting Room*. Dr. Harris has published widely in the areas of gender studies, developmental theory, analytic vulnerability, and self-care and is particularly interested in the analysts living and working in the shadow of World War I. With Jeremy Safran and Lewis Aron, she formed the Sándor Ferenczi Center at The New School for Social Research.

André E. Haynal, M.D. is a philosopher, physician, psychoanalyst (IPA), and author of more than a dozen books and hundreds of other publications. He was a leading editor of the Freud/Ferenczi Correspondence (1992–2000), and a recipient of the Sigourney Award for his life work. His most recent publication was *Disappearing and Reviving* (London, Karnac Books, 2002).

Véronique D. Haynal, M.A. is a psychoanalytic psychotherapist, life coach, and researcher in nonverbal communication (formerly University Hospital of Geneva, Switzerland).

Haydée Christinne Kahtuni, Ph.D. is a clinical psychologist and psychoanalyst, author of *Dictionary on the Thought of Sándor Ferenczi—A Contribution to the Psychoanalytic Contemporary Clinic* (Elsevier Editora: Rio de Janeiro e FAPESP: São Paulo, 2009) and *Brief Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy: Understanding and Care of the Human Soul* (Editora Escuta, São Paulo, 1996), specialist in Adolescent Psychotherapy (IPUSP), specialist in Hospital Psychology (HCFMUSP), university professor, clinical supervisor, and head of Discipline of Psychology of the Personality (teaching Theory and Practice in Psychoanalysis on Sigmund Freud, Sándor Ferenczi, Melanie Klein, and Donald Woods Winnicott) between 1998 and 2004 (UNIP). She is a member of the Sándor Ferenczi Society and an expert on Trauma Theory of Sándor Ferenczi. She treats adolescents and adults in her office in São Paulo.

Lewis A. Kirshner, M.D. is a clinical professor in Psychiatry, Harvard Medical School; training and supervising analyst, Boston Psychoanalytic Society and Institute; author of *Having a Life: Self Pathology after Lacan* (The Analytic Press, 2004); and editor of *Between Winnicott and Lacan: a Clinical Engagement* (Routledge, 2011).

Steven Kuchuck, LCSW (co-editor) is a faculty member, supervisor, member of the Board of Directors, and co-director of curriculum for the adult training program in psychoanalysis at the National Institute for the Psychotherapies; a faculty member

at the Stephen Mitchell Center for Relational Studies, the Institute for Contemporary Psychotherapy, and the Institute for Expressive Analysis; and a Board member of The International Association for Relational Psychoanalysis and Psychotherapy. Steven is editor-in-chief of *Psychoanalytic Perspectives*, associate editor of Routledge's Relational Perspectives Book Series, editor of *Clinical Implications of the Psychoanalyst's Life Experience: When the Personal Becomes Professional* (Routledge, 2014), and author of articles and book chapters that focus primarily on the analyst's subjectivity. He practices psychoanalysis and supervises in Manhattan. More information is available at www.stevenkuchuck.com.

Judit Mészáros, Ph.D. is a founding member and president of the Sándor Ferenczi Society, Budapest, Hungary; a training and supervisory analyst at the Hungarian Psychoanalytical Association; and an honorary associate professor at the ELTE, Budapest, Hungary.

Arnold Wm. Rachman, Ph.D., F.A.G.P.A. is associate professor of Psychiatry at New York University Center; faculty at the Trauma & Disaster Studies Program in the New York University Postdoctoral Program in Psychoanalysis; a member of the Board of Directors for the Sándor Ferenczi Center at The New School for Social Research; a donor to *The Elizabeth Severn Papers*, Library of Congress; and author of *Sándor Ferenczi: The Psychotherapist of Tenderness & Passion*, *Psychotherapy of Difficult Cases*, *Analysis of the Incest Trauma*.

Eyal Rozmarin, Ph.D. is co-editor of *Studies in Gender and Sexuality* and associate editor of Routledge's Relational Perspectives Book Series. He has published book chapters and articles in psychoanalytic journals, including *Psychoanalytic Dialogues*, *Contemporary Psychoanalysis*, and *Studies in Gender and Sexuality*. His writing explores the relations between subjectivity, society, and history.

Peter L. Rudnytsky, Ph.D., LCSW is professor of English at the University of Florida and an analyst in training at the Florida Psychoanalytic Institute. He holds undergraduate degrees from Columbia and Cambridge and a Ph.D. from Yale. Among his many authored and edited books are *Ferenczi's Turn in Psychoanalysis* (NYU, 1996) and *Reading Psychoanalysis: Freud, Rank, Ferenczi, Groddeck* (Cornell, 2002), for which he received the Gradiva Award. He maintains a private practice in Gainesville.

Karen Starr, Psy.D. is an author, with Lewis Aron, of *A Psychotherapy for the People: Toward a Progressive Psychoanalysis*; an editor, with Jill Bresler, of *Relational Psychoanalysis and Psychotherapy Integration*; and the author of *Repair of the Soul: Metaphors of Transformation in Jewish Mysticism and Psychoanalysis*. Dr. Starr is on the Editorial Board of the Psychoanalysis and Jewish Life Book Series, Academic Press. She is a clinical supervisor at The Graduate Center, City University of New York and Long Island University/C.W. Post. Dr. Starr maintains a private practice in New York City and Great Neck, Long Island.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many people, so deeply knowledgeable about Ferenczi, have helped in the crafting of this book and its many details. In particular, we thank Judit Mészáros for her generosity and guidance.

Adrienne thanks her intellectual, collegial community: Lewis Aron, Anthony Bass, Steven Botticelli, Philip Bromberg, Nancy Chodorow, Susan Coates, Steven Cooper, Ken Corbett, Muriel Dimen, Sam Gerson, Virginia Goldner, David Lichtenstein, Donald Moss, Eyal Rozmarin, Stephen Seligman, Jane Tillman, and Lynne Zeavin, all of whom create the intellectual conversation and climate around me, which is like oxygen.

I thank my family for so much support and care: Lorna, Kate, Justin, Jake, and Philip.

And always I remember my beloved Robert Sklar (1936–2011), who encouraged me to write and put work into the world.

Steven thanks dear friends and colleagues Lewis Aron, Galit Atlas, Sally Bjorklund, Hillary Grill, Sharyn Leff, and Caryn Sherman-Meyer, for enriching my life in so many ways. Thank you, too, to Kim Bernstein, Margaret Black, Pamela Feldman, Ken Frank, Ellen Fries, Linda Hopkins, Steven Knoblauch, Clem Loew, Kristin Long, Pamela Raab, Marc Sholes, and Rachel Sopher for their professional and personal support. I am grateful to my study and reading group-mates, and thank my family and friends, especially Phyllis, Danny and Art Kuchuck, Judith Young, the Peligris, Strausses, Jodd Readick, Herb Stern, and of course Emma, Yali, and Mia Koch. As always, I thank David Flohr for love and devotion that helps to sustain me.

I am very fortunate to have an intellectually stimulating and emotionally nurturing professional home at the National Institute for the Psychotherapies and thank my fellow Board members and members of the larger community for providing that. Thank you friends and colleagues at *Psychoanalytic Perspectives* and fellow Board members at The International Association for Relational Psychoanalysis and Psychotherapy.

xx Acknowledgments

Together, we offer our deep appreciation to Routledge Taylor & Francis Group, which has for many years published and championed the Relational Perspectives Book Series. In particular, we thank our publisher Kate Hawes, Senior Editorial Assistant Kirsten Buchanan, and Editorial Assistant Susan Wickenden for their patience, support, and great care in guiding us and ushering our book through production. Thank you, too, to Annelisa Pedersen for her skillful help in preparing the manuscript.

And finally, we offer our gratitude to the authors of these chapters, who have worked through revisions, edits, and many conversations in order to produce work that we are so proud to represent.

INTRODUCTION

The Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi: Lost and Found

In the nineteen years since the release of the Freud–Ferenczi correspondence (1996), twenty-two years since the publication of *The Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi* (Aron and Harris, 1993), and thirty years since the original French publication of *The Clinical Diary* in 1985, much has changed in the conversation about Ferenczi and psychoanalysis. Relational psychoanalysis, then only recently coined as a term and newly emerged on the scene (Greenberg and Mitchell, 1983; Mitchell, 1988), is now a dominant influence for many theoreticians and practitioners. Through a merging of British object relations theory (Klein, 1992; Fairbairn, 1952; Winnicott, 1971; among others) and interpersonal psychoanalysis (Sullivan, 1953; Fromm, 1956; Thompson, 1953; and others), relational psychoanalysis has shifted the focus from the drive theory of sex and aggression to real external, as well as fantasized internal object relationships. In relational psychoanalysis, object seeking and relationships are central to development and motivation more than, or rather than, drives, according to some (Mitchell, 1988; Greenberg and Mitchell, 1983). Contemporary Freudian (Bach, 2001; Richards, 1999; among others) and post-Bionian field theories (Civitaresse and Ferro, 2013; Stern, 2013a, 2013b), which each in their way also emphasize the centrality of the therapeutic relationship and many of Ferenczi's ideas, have also become more integral in the psychoanalytic conversation during this period.

These have been scientifically, philosophically, and culturally fertile years. Post-modern, dialectical thinking has now supplanted or at least overshadows Cartesian assumptions in psychoanalysis and other disciplines, and a two-person psychology, in which the analyst's psyche is also mined—mainly for clinical data—and scanned for its impact on the patient and treatment, is now central (Aron, 1996). Previously marginalized voices of women, people of color, the economically challenged, and

2 Introduction

lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgendered people—among others previously overlooked or disowned by society and psychoanalysis more specifically—have been invited into this modernized psychoanalytic tent. Ferenczi was perhaps the first to devote significant time and energy to clinical work with the disenfranchised and traumatized, half a century before the postmodern, contemporary Freudian, and relational turns. He was also among the first to routinely treat severely disturbed patients. In this respect especially, he not only changed the course of classical psychoanalysis, but also prefigured all the schools to follow.

This volume of essays attests to the inescapable truth that Ferenczi is now canonical. In the recuperation of his theoretical ideas—the importance of countertransference, the importance of early object relations and mother-child relationships, and the centrality of trauma—we see his formative place in our own history. In his work at an institutional level, we see how crucial he was in the genesis of an international psychoanalytic movement. In understanding his links to culture and to socially and politically progressive ideals, we have a model of psychoanalytic citizenship that offers much to admire and aspire to.

To encounter Ferenczi, his work, his colleagues, and his thinking is to recognize at once the consequences of lost psychoanalytic knowledge and wisdom when history is dismissed or otherwise discarded, and forefathers are pushed to the side. Psychoanalysis, as practice and theory, has paid a high price for Ferenczi's forced exile. Discovering, amplifying, and reclaiming Ferenczi's legacy are ways to restore severed connections to our past without underplaying the importance of more modern innovations. Indeed, a number of contemporary theorists and a majority of the authors in this volume have noted the direct links between Ferenczi and early interpersonal and object relations theorists and therefore the direct connection between Ferenczi and relational psychoanalysis. Freud, of course, is in the psychoanalytic DNA of us all (Brown, 2011; Galit Atlas, *in press*) and continues to inform our work and ongoing evolution. There is an additional through-line though. Lost from sight for some time but never fully diminished in influence, this line has traveled in particularly direct ways from Ferenczi, perhaps in large part because age, generation, and modern, even prescient sensibilities positioned him as father or grandfather to all incarnations of classical and contemporary perspectives, psychoanalytic schools, and movements. More specifically, as noted above and as many of the authors here have pointed out, Ferenczi's thinking about mutuality, trauma, the analyst's psychology, and the environment not only foretold contemporary psychoanalytic perspectives, but when held in tension with more classical theories also adds to and deepens the dialogue between Freud and those who followed (Aron and Starr, 2013). This pathway from classical thinking to present-day psychoanalytic theory and practice is a central part of Ferenczi's legacy and marks his status as not merely ghost, but also, ancestor (Loewald, 1989).

In 1991, Lewis Aron and Adrienne Harris organized an international Ferenczi conference in New York City, the first of its kind in the United States. A diverse

group of European voices including Judit Mészáros, André Haynal, György Hidas, and Judith Dupont joined with Aron, Harris, and other Americans in the throes of discovery or rediscovery, including Therese Ragen, Sue Shapiro, Arnold Rachman, Jay Frankel, Christopher Fortune, Axel Hoffer, and Ben Wolstein. Two years later, inspired by the proceedings and inclusive of many of those presentations as well as additional original contributions, Aron and Harris's *The Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi* (1993) introduced a larger, print audience of psychoanalysts to Sándor Ferenczi. No longer merely the bad boy of early psychoanalytic history, seen as deserving of banishment from Freud's inner circle and status as laughingstock of the larger professional community, Ferenczi emerged in those pages as he did in that earlier conference; a complex, often gifted theoretician and practitioner.

At the conference, American psychoanalysts who were discovering Ferenczi and claiming a long lost ancestor met up with European (primarily Hungarian and English) analysts who had made this possible because of what they salvaged. We have Michael Balint to thank for the ongoing preservation and eventual English translation of Ferenczi's *The Clinical Diary* (1932/1988). Many individuals, some of whom presented at the conference and published in the original and current volume, kept Ferenczi's ideas alive and his manuscripts safe from destruction for decades. Balint, perhaps foremost in this group of preservationists, was determined to keep Ferenczi's technical research and writing present in the postwar period in England, where he became an initiating force in object relations theory. He brought the manuscript of *The Clinical Diary* from Budapest to London but, perhaps correctly, remained fearful of having it translated and published. Publication occurred some years after Balint's death in a different, more evolved psychoanalytic climate from the one in which Balint (and for that matter, Ferenczi) had worked. In his writing about Ferenczi and Freud's disagreement, he sets a graceful, loving tone, feeling and conveying the tragedy of their conflict and its cost to psychoanalysis. Rather than demonizing or idealizing, Balint saw the troubles on each side of that dyad. His manner is measured, mature, and deeply emotionally attuned to both men. Balint's voice remains one of the important ways to tell this story (Balint, 1969). Mészáros, Haynal, Hidas, and Dupont also demonstrated courageous and devoted persistence in keeping Ferenczian work alive and intact, even if not very much in sight until more recent years. The debt owed to these psychoanalysts is incalculable. Both the 1993 book and this current work reflect the importance of the rediscovery of Ferenczi, the enormous evolution of scholarship and theory building in Ferenczian mode, and the valiant efforts of those who saved his legacy and therefore made these strides possible.

Along with the conference, Aron and Harris's book (1993) served as an introduction to and defense of Freud's most famous patient, colleague, inheritor, and opponent. As the editors explained:

Sándor Ferenczi was dismissed by mainstream psychoanalysts, disregarded because of his radical clinical experiments, because of his revival of interest in

4 Introduction

the etiological importance of external trauma, and because he was perceived as encouraging dangerous regressions in his patients and attempting to cure them with love. All these criticisms were reinforced with personal aspersions on his character and accusations that he had mentally deteriorated and even gone mad in the final years of his life at the height of his clinical experimentation and in the midst of disputes with Freud. (p. 2)

Their influential book was an attempt to rescue Ferenczi from these aspersions and resulting professional exile. In Aron and Harris's view, his contributions to early psychoanalysis were second only to Freud's. They note his central role in organizing and representing the psychoanalytic movement and influence as a lecturer, theoretician, and clinician. Indeed, Ferenczi founded the International Psychoanalytical Association and the Budapest Psychoanalytic Association, was the first university-based professor of psychoanalysis, helped found the *International Journal of Psychoanalysis*, and conducted the first formal training analysis (of Ernest Jones). In psychoanalytic historian Edith Kurzweil's introduction to the book, she notes that, "Adler thought Ferenczi was the most brilliant of Freud's disciples" (1993, p. xxii). As analyst to Michael Balint, Ernest Jones, Melanie Klein, and John Rickman in England, as well as to Clara Thompson, Geza Roheim, and Sándor Rado in the United States, he influenced generations of leading psychoanalytic thinkers and writers as well as their patients and subsequent generations of clinicians. Although there were significant missteps, mistakes, boundary violations, and, beyond his control, political forces in play—namely in relation to Freud and Freud's disciples—a rich literature and talented elder statesman and guide were lost for over half a century.

Contributions to the Literature

At the time of Aron and Harris's publication, the Freud–Ferenczi correspondence (1993) was not yet translated into English, and Ferenczi's previously mentioned *The Clinical Diary* (1932/1988)—published in the same year as Stephen Mitchell's first solely relational book (as Bass points out in this volume)—had only been available in English for five years, although a French edition had been released in 1985, the year that many believe ushered in the Ferenczian renaissance. Also in 1985, the Sándor Ferenczi Society was established in Budapest, and international Ferenczi conferences have been held across the world every two to three years since then. Aron and Harris and their contributors were pioneers, aided by the aforementioned crucial acts of courage that preserved Ferenczi's work, and they helped pave the way for future Ferenczi scholars.

A number of important contributions have been made to the literature since 1993, including Rudnytsky, Bokay, and Giampieri-Deutsch (1996), Rachman (1997a), Haynal (2002), Szekacs-Weisz and Keve (2012), and Mészáros (2014). In 2008, Jeremy Safran, Lewis Aron, and Adrienne Harris established the Sándor

Ferenczi Center at The New School for Social Research, exactly one hundred years after Ferenczi's first meeting with Freud, and just over eighty years after Ferenczi spent four months in New York City in 1926, seeing a full roster of patients and giving a series of ten lectures at The New School on topics including psychosis, psychoanalytic theory, and technique. Ferenczi's lectures were well attended, and in fact he notes that three hundred people were present on the first evening. The Sándor Ferenczi Center was established as a tribute to his New School tenure and with the goal of sponsoring conferences and promoting research, scholarship, and publications regarding Ferenczi, promoting new translations and publications of Ferenczi's writings, and in conjunction with similar centers in Europe, contributing to the ongoing vitality of psychoanalysis as a cultural, intellectual, and psychotherapeutic discipline.

In recent years, various journals have devoted special issues to Ferenczi's legacy (*Le-Coq-Héron*, 1999; *International Forum of Psychoanalysis*, 1998 and 2004; *Integrative Therapy*, 2003; *Psychoanalytic Inquiry*, 1997 and 2014). In 2010, under the editorial direction of then co-editors Steven Kuchuck and Deborah Pines, *Psychoanalytic Perspectives* published a special "Ferenczi issue" that included a new, updated introduction to *The Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi* written by Aron and Harris. This new introduction and the currently out-of-print 1993 book are available for download at the Ferenczi Center website. In 2011, after a six-year, extensive fundraising project, the Sándor Ferenczi Society and the International Sándor Ferenczi Foundation (founded in 2006) purchased part of the former Sándor Ferenczi house which had been used as his office in order to house the International Ferenczi Center.

From Ghost to Ancestor

Ferenczi, probably more than any other well-known psychoanalyst, truly exemplifies an integration of classical and contemporary ways of thinking about and practicing his craft. Through our current lens and even during his life, Ferenczi stood with one foot in the classical world and one foot in the modern. His professional vocabulary and emphasis on the intrapsychic still speak to classical and more contemporary Freudian scholars and practitioners, while his experiments in mutuality and emphasis on the here and now and healing potential of the relationship—among numerous other factors—resonate for relational and other contemporary psychotherapists. There are likely additional reasons that he speaks so cogently to so many of us. There may be an identification with Ferenczi as an outsider or "other" that many psychoanalysts also feel in their lives that causes them to experience a corresponding resonance with his work. Also, relational analysts, graduates of non-International Psychoanalytical Association training programs, and those who do not obtain psychoanalytic certificates and therefore are sometimes accused of not being truly psychoanalytic (Aron and Starr, 2013) may experience an understandable identification with his forced exile from the academy and the psychoanalytic mainstream.

The contributions you are about to read come to us from some of the most influential Ferenczi scholars in the world. We are fortunate to be able to include new work by a number of authors from the original volume, and they have been joined by other senior scholars and newer, important voices in international Ferenczian and psychoanalytic scholarship. This is a gathering of geographically and theoretically diverse, at times overlapping, concordant, and complimentary writers; in that sense the collection is perhaps a fitting tribute to a man summarily dismissed for his difference from the dominant psychoanalytic culture and, like many colleagues and citizens of his day, because of the prevailing religious–political ethos.

Part I: The Context

Although we have divided this collection into three sections, some of the chapters cross-reference both each other and historical developments, and therefore as in psychoanalysis—or life—chronology and categories are more nonlinear than the organizational structure of the book might indicate. The chapters in “The Context” could also have been included in “History,” and the chapters that we have placed in “History” are certainly interrelated with those folded into “Theory and Technique,” as developments in these three areas always are. Regardless of whether or not readers choose to read this work in the order presented here, we do hope this volume will enhance your own experience of “discovery and rediscovery” (Aron and Harris, 1993, 2010) of Sándor Ferenczi.

Few people have done more to further the international Ferenczi renaissance than Hungarian psychoanalyst and Ferenczi scholar Judit Mészáros. In 1993, she provided the contextual framework for the chapters that followed by introducing readers to the social and ideological worlds that gave birth to and supported Ferenczi’s educational and professional life and evolution. Building on this foundation two decades later, she asks several key questions and provides answers that help orient readers to Ferenczi’s current position of prominence in the psychoanalytic canon. What attracts us to Ferenczi? What does he represent that has been bringing clinicians and academics from various scholarly fields together for decades? What is it in our current era of feuds between psychoanalytic schools of thought that draws people from otherwise opposing theoretical perspectives to connect with Ferenczi and allows for a common way of thinking among professionals who live in a variety of personal and professional cultures and political systems throughout the world? What is it about Ferenczi that leads contemporaries to connect to psychoanalysis and to Ferenczi now, just as they did in the past before his fall from grace?

Carlo Bonomi begins his essay with a very disturbing dream. He suggests that Ferenczi presents this dream in his letter to Freud as a sign of subjugation, though Bonomi reads the complexity of that dream and its transmission as a cover for rebellion as well as a wish to treat—ultimately, perhaps, even to save—Freud and psychoanalysis. Bonomi traces the complexities of Ferenczi’s relationship to Freud

as compliant and rebellious son, student, patient, friend, colleague, and would-be analyst through a careful consideration of Ferenczi's *The Clinical Diary* (1932/1988), correspondence, publications, and additional well-cited sources. He explores Ferenczi's views about the split found in psychoanalysis between what Ferenczi viewed as Freud's initial passion and caring for his patients and his eventual move toward a colder, more calculating surgical precision. Bonomi considers the toll that carrying these thoughts and feelings of dissent and deep disappointment—mostly in secret—took on Ferenczi and how these dynamics shaped his personal and professional evolution.

In the 1993 volume, psychoanalytic historian André Haynal engaged in a search for the origins of then current psychoanalytic technique in the work of Freud and his pupils, especially Ferenczi. His consideration of correspondence, professional writing, and theoretical evolution shed light on Freud and Ferenczi's complex relationship, including areas of personal and professional similarities and differences. In this earlier contribution, Haynal began to explore what he called Ferenczi's attitude, a topic he and Véronique Haynal now take up in great depth and with remarkable scholarship, insight and zeal. They present Ferenczi in the context and as a product of a rich cultural heritage and describe how the evolution of Ferenczi's personal and psychoanalytic attitude unfolded and became an integral part of his psychoanalytic identity.

The Haynals provide us with a vision of Ferenczi's individuality as a crucial element in his creation of theory and technical experiment. They employ the term "ethics" in showing us how deeply Ferenczi cared to help patients and how deeply his clinical mission went. His character, which the Haynals term "attitude," was one of intensity and passion. He was not proscriptive and moralizing, but rather, was interested in working within relationships, whether institutionally or clinically. He had good critical judgment and cooperated in a highly intellectually elaborate world of ideas and projects. All of these aspects of Ferenczi's character render him a very imaginative and creative innovator in psychoanalysis, yet the Haynals take great pains to show us Ferenczi the team player, the collaborator, and the powerful creator of a movement. This essay goes very far in repairing the construction of Ferenczi as damaged, ill, and marginal to the psychoanalytic movement. It also includes a useful analysis of the difficult-to-unpack book *Thalassa: A Theory of Genitality* (Ferenczi, 1924/1989) and focuses on Ferenczi's seminal contributions to trauma theory, including the reality of externally originating abuse, a modern turn that was long in coming due in large part to the occlusion of Ferenczi's work.

Part II: History

If Freud and others have likened psychoanalytic treatment to detective work (Freud, 1916), with B. William Brennan we are no doubt in the company of an actual psychoanalytic sleuth. Brennan has devoted a large portion of his psychoanalytic research and

writing (for example, 2009, 2011) to decoding Ferenczi's *The Clinical Diary* (1932/1988) and to considering related ethical issues and resulting insights into Ferenczi and his patients. This chapter explores Ferenczi's work with Clara Thompson, whose identity as Dm is revealed in *The Clinical Diary* by Dupont (Ferenczi 1932/1988, pp. 2–3) and who became a leading figure in the development of interpersonal psychoanalysis. Brennan offers new insights into Thompson and her controversial analysis based on her candid interview with Kurt Eissler about her treatment with "Papa Ferenczi," which until recently had been sequestered in the Freud archives.

Christopher Fortune, in his earlier contribution (1993), offered a moving narrative of Elizabeth Severn, the patient who appears in *The Clinical Diary* as RN. His chapter shed tremendous light on the strengths and weaknesses of the mutual analysis Ferenczi entered into under pressure from this challenging patient and colleague. Fortune's current work is also about an important figure in Ferenczi's (and Freud's) life, Georg Groddeck, a German physician and psychoanalyst who may have been the first to seriously explore the relationship between physical and mental illness. Fortune discusses Groddeck's influence on Ferenczi as gleaned primarily through a fascinating examination of their twelve-year correspondence.

A prolific contributor to the Ferenczi literature (for example, 1989, 1993, 1997a, 1997b, 1997c, 2000, 2003, 2007, 2010a, 2010b, 2014, among others), Arnold Rachman focused his earlier contribution on Ferenczi's ideas about sexuality, especially as explored in Ferenczi's work with what was then called a transvestite patient (1993) and was prescient of a much later and still burgeoning literature of transgender studies. Rachman's current work, like Fortune's earlier chapter (1993), concerns itself with Elizabeth Severn. Based on newly available data including the discovery of the Elizabeth Severn papers and the Kurt Eissler Interview of Elizabeth Severn (Severn, 1952), Rachman accomplishes a sophisticated deconstruction of Severn's treatment (including the development and impact of what came to be known as mutual analysis) and professional acumen. He provides well-documented support for his claim that Elizabeth Severn should be credited with helping Ferenczi to develop his ideas about the diagnosis, treatment, and theory of trauma.

Adrienne Harris reflects on Ferenczi's "Two Types of War Neuroses" (1926/1994), tying his essay to an interest not only in trauma but also psychotic process and primitive states, and to the work of Ferenczi's colleagues treating and writing in the shadow of the First World War. Ferenczi developed many of his ideas about trauma by observing and working with combat veterans during World War I. The war took its toll on the psychoanalytic community in numerous ways, and in Harris's view, the erasure of Ferenczi within psychoanalysis prevented this war-generation of analysts from having a greater impact on the profession. Her essay is an attempt to at least identify and even begin to amplify their voices.

That we decided to include three chapters devoted primarily to Elizabeth Severn (not counting her appearance in several others) is a testament to her influence on Ferenczi and therefore contemporary psychoanalysis and is indicative of the

complexity of their relationship and its resulting historical, theoretical, and clinical implications. It is also reflective of the significant original sources that exist—some only recently available for examination—as well as the varied research interests of these talented Ferenczi–Severn scholars. In his chapter, analyst and historian Peter Rudnytsky notes that *The Discovery of the Self* (1933) contains a thinly disguised case history of Ferenczi, as well as of Severn, which makes the book one of the essential texts in the history of psychoanalysis and of crucial supplemental value to *The Clinical Diary*. For the first time Severn emerges as a subject in her own right with an entire body of work that warrants a thorough reconsideration. Severn's book and Rudnytsky's investigation allow us to more fully appreciate her work as a theoretician and clinician and to gain insight into Ferenczi's struggles as a patient.

In addition to coediting the 1993 volume and other contributions to Ferenczi-related scholarship already mentioned, Lewis Aron wrote a comprehensive introductory chapter with Adrienne Harris that introduced Ferenczi to a new audience by providing a historical and theoretical context and overview (1993, 2010). Also in the earlier volume, with Therese Ragen, he wrote about Ferenczi's daring experiment of mutual analysis, a cutting edge (especially twenty-two years ago) if problematic and flawed paradigm worthy of modification and reconsideration. Writing now with Karen Starr, Aron explores the personal and professional relationship between Freud and Ferenczi, two Jewish Enlightenment men who enacted between them dynamics shaped in large part by internalizations and reactions to an anti-Semitic and homophobic culture.

Part III: Theory and Technique

While babies are hungry for objects and affects they need in order to develop, they have no choice but to take in everything without being able to select and defend themselves from the toxic elements of what they ingest. Franco Borgogno writes that as Ferenczi focused his thinking on the important role of introjections, he asked what it was that the baby puts inside itself and how these things are offered to the infant. Borgogno contends that from Ferenczi's point of view, it is the specific quality of the response of the other that shapes our ensuing identifications and resulting views and perceptions of ourselves and the world.

In her writing about sexuality (2011, 2012a, 2012b, 2013, 2014) and informing her newly coined terms “enigmatic and pragmatic knowing” (in press), Galit Atlas synthesizes primarily Kleinian, object relations, and relational psychoanalytic perspectives of the mind. In her current chapter, she also explores the “confusion of tongues” (1933) that arises in the spaces between the language of tenderness and the language of aggression, especially as this confusion unfolds in two extended case examples. Atlas believes that patients and therapists use playfulness to collude in avoiding aggression in order to protect the fragile sense of tenderness that evolves in the treatment for both parties.

The analyst privileges the patient's inner world and creates the necessary conditions of so-called analytic "neutrality"—at least according to more classical thinkers, and non-intrusiveness (for a more contemporary exploration of this topic, see Robert Grossmark, 2012) in order for internal content to emerge in the consulting room. On the other hand, there is an opposing, more contemporary position that suggests the therapist always participates in the clinical relationship and can therefore never be merely an anonymous "neutral" observer. In the 1993 volume, Jay Frankel explored this paradox and Ferenczi's attempts to address if not reconcile the seeming contradiction. In his most recent work, Frankel continues to focus on the analyst's efforts to both explore the patient's inner world and the analyst–patient relationship, particularly with regard to Ferenczi's perhaps most well-known concept, identification with the aggressor.

Although Freud wrote that psychoanalysis was a "healing through love" (F/JU, 6.12.1906), he attempts to separate the notions of psychoanalytic "transference" love from real world "actual" love. Of the two men, Ferenczi is far more interested in exploring the healing potential of love, and unlike Freud who worried about transference contamination as the result of the analyst's strong countertransference, Ferenczi believed that the analyst must be able to love in order to be of use to his traumatized patients. Steven Kuchuck explores this idea as it applies to the analyst's loving and erotic feelings and their relation to contemporary notions of therapeutic action, gender, and sexual orientation.

Anthony Bass, building on Ragen and Aron's earlier work (1993), Benjamin Wolstein (1993), and others, engages in an in-depth consideration of Ferenczi's "mutual analysis." Bass considers the links between Ferenczi's radical notions of psychoanalysis as a mutual endeavor finally on its way to a two-person psychology, his experiments in mutual analysis, and the direct line from Ferenczi's work in this area to contemporary interpersonal and relational theory and practice. Bass of course acknowledges the problems and limitations of the far lengths to which Ferenczi went to apply his understanding of mutuality. But he also brings in examples from his own personal treatment and practice to illustrate contemporary applications of Ferenczi's theories of mutuality. In the process, Bass shows us how sometimes minor—albeit significant—modifications of Ferenczi's original technique allow for powerful interventions that still adhere to conventional contemporary wisdom about appropriate boundaries and the therapeutic frame.

Although Lacan was familiar with Ferenczi's work, he arrived on the scene too late to have met him. He does mention Ferenczi several times in his seminars and writings, and some features of Ferenczi's work apparently made an impact on Lacan. Nonetheless, the overall tone that he took with regard to Ferenczi's work was dismissive. Lewis Kirshner's chapter summarizes the major references to Ferenczi in Lacan's work and elaborates upon some of the parallels between these two visionaries.

Eyal Rozmarin raises a number of profound questions, as he wonders with us about the nature of development and trauma. Rozmarin brings us two different but

related seminal notions: Ferenczi's "confusion of tongues" (1933) and Laplanche's concept of the "enigmatic message" (1995). As he suggests, both notions are concerned with the enigmatic and potentially traumatic differences between adults and children. Although there is some overlap of meaning, the confusions explored by each are very different. Laplanche presents a version of confusion in which the language of the adult is excessive, but for the most part benevolent and implicit, while Ferenczi exposes a form of confusion where the language of the adult is explicitly raw, often toxic, and therefore catastrophic.

The end of Ferenczi's life, like many endings, eventually led to a new beginning—a renaissance, as we and others have referred to the renewed interest in his contributions to the field. As time passed, old professional feuds faded, wounds healed, and psychoanalytic theories, epistemologies, and hegemonies eventually caught up to this visionary thinker. We end this collection with another beginning. Brazilian psychoanalysts Haydée Christinne Kahtuni and Gisela Paraná Sanches have published the first dictionary of Sándor Ferenczi's work. Their goal was to provide both beginning and more advanced psychoanalytic readers with an integrated, extensive but curated collection of his definitions and excerpts of his writings. Entries include his main concepts, original ideas, new expressions, and additional related ideas that are presented in order to guide and facilitate further study of Ferenczi's work. Although the dictionary was published in Portuguese only, funding efforts are underway to translate this ambitious work into English and other languages. Kahtuni arranged for a small portion of the dictionary—the section concerning Ferenczi's trauma theory—to be translated into English for this volume.

Surfaces and Separations

Perhaps in some cases one can actually begin to judge or at least understand a book by its cover. Completed in 1896 when Ferenczi was a young man of 23 and just three years after he moved to Hungary's capital, the (Emperor) Franz Joseph Bridge connects the cities of Buda and Pest, previously separate cities that were united in 1873, the year Ferenczi was born. We chose a photograph of the bridge emerging from shadows into light and clarity. The parts of the city hidden by clouds and darkness include the area where Ferenczi lived in the last years of his life. Destroyed by the German army during their retreat at the end of World War II, the bridge was reconstructed and reopened in 1946 as the Liberty (sometimes called Freedom) Bridge on St. Stephen's day, Hungary's most important holiday and celebration of the nation's founding. This photograph conjures up tragic losses and eclipses of many freedoms, but also symbolizes an opening to the future.

As was the case with Aron and Harris's first volume, our goal is to celebrate Ferenczi's (in this case continuing) return from theoretical exile. These essays shine a new, bright light on Ferenczi's contributions to, influence on, and integration into more contemporary schools of psychoanalysis. Some of them introduce new

historical discoveries. Each illuminates Ferenczi's and in some cases his patients' and mentors' personal and professional development and theories.

Final Thoughts

We are in the middle of a fascinating set of conversations; we do not hope for conclusions. Rather than the certitude which sometimes accompanies finality and which we know can lead to intellectual stagnation, our wish is for questions to follow the questions and tentative answers this collection, like its predecessor, presents. We hope for what Mészáros relays to us about Ferenczi, an ability to endure the tension created by uncertainties without rushing into rash or prejudiced conclusions (this volume). And in this spirit we are also buoyed by Michael Balint's words about his former analyst, colleague, and friend, "Even the most common, the most everyday, the most routine experience was never rounded off and finished for him; he never filed anything away as finally dealt with or definitely solved" (Balint, 1948/1957, pp. 245–246 in Mészáros, this volume).

In addition to questions, we also desire more and multiple beginnings. We would like to believe that returned to respectability—indeed, to a position of professional appreciation, admiration, and for some, inspiration—Ferenczi has for some time now been available to learn from and use. As theories develop and evolve, our expectation is that each generation of psychotherapists and psychoanalysts will discover Ferenczi anew and in their own particular ways, just as different generations and individual authors within the same generation have done in this volume and have been doing in offices and clinics for many years.

In the words of Hans Loewald, who passed away in 1993, the same year that Aron and Harris's volume was published:

Those who know ghosts tell us that they long to be released from their ghost life and led to rest as ancestors. As ancestors they live forth in the present generation, while as ghosts they are compelled to haunt the present generation with their shadow life ... In the daylight of analysis the ghosts ... are laid and led to rest as ancestors whose power is taken over and transformed into the newer intensity of present life. (1989, p. 249)

So it is for Sándor Ferenczi.

References

- Aron, L. (1996). *A Meeting of Minds: Mutuality in Psychoanalysis*. New York: Routledge.
- Aron, L. and Harris, A. (1993). Discovery and rediscovery. In L. Aron and A. Harris (eds), *The Legacy of Sándor Ferenczi*. London: The Analytic Press, pp. 1–36.
- Aron, L. and Harris, A. (2010). Sándor Ferenczi: Discovery and rediscovery. *Psychoanalytic Perspectives*, 7:5–42.