

# **The Political Economy of Bureaucracy**

**Steven O. Richardson**



Routledge Frontiers of Political Economy

# The Political Economy of Bureaucracy

*The Political Economy of Bureaucracy* applies Public Choice theory and a complex systems view of government institutions to analyze policy implementation as an economic process. It addresses the common and vexing question of why managing federal agencies for results is so difficult by challenging traditional assumptions of institutional design and policy analysis. Using creative methods that focus on relationships that constrain the choices of executives and managers in a political hierarchy, the author reveals control and coordination as goals that are imperfectly achieved and often conflicting with one another.

Despite decades of intense study, serious reform efforts and impressive technological advances, the US government remains a typical bureaucracy that fails to meet citizens' expectations. Clearly, policy analysis is missing something. The problem may rest with "machine" models of government. Rules, especially those governing expenditures, are assumed to be feasible and effective. Analysis of the federal government as a complex system of relationships between semi-autonomous agents helps explain the disconnect between policy and results. The solution is to roll back micromanagement of ends and means; policy makers should focus on objectives and facilitate implementation by selectively relaxing constraints that prevent experimentation needed to determine the most effective methods.

This book devotes unusual attention to the interaction between executive and legislative branches of government and between political appointees and career civil servants. Most studies of government policy take existing institutional structure for granted. Different conclusions emerge from this analysis by virtue of the systems view that accepts status quo hierarchies but questions the effectiveness of the rules that govern policy implementation. This book will be of interest to postgraduates and researchers focusing on Economic Theory, Public Choice, Institutional Economics and Political Science, as well as to those working in the public sector interested in Public Administration, Public Policy and Organizational Behavior.

**Steven Richardson** is a Program Specialist in the Department of Labor's Center for Program Planning and Results, USA. He holds a Ph.D. in Economics from George Mason University.

## **Routledge frontiers of political economy**

### **1 Equilibrium Versus Understanding**

Towards the rehumanization of economics within social theory  
*Mark Addleson*

### **2 Evolution, Order and Complexity**

*Edited by Elias L. Khalil and Kenneth E. Boulding*

### **3 Interactions in Political Economy**

Malvern after ten years  
*Edited by Steven Pressman*

### **4 The End of Economics**

*Michael Perelman*

### **5 Probability in Economics**

*Omar F. Hamouda and Robin Rowley*

### **6 Capital Controversy, Post Keynesian Economics and the History of Economics**

Essays in honour of Geoff Harcourt, volume one  
*Edited by Philip Arestis, Gabriel Palma and Malcolm Sawyer*

### **7 Markets, Unemployment and Economic Policy**

Essays in honour of Geoff Harcourt, volume two  
*Edited by Philip Arestis, Gabriel Palma and Malcolm Sawyer*

### **8 Social Economy**

The logic of capitalist development  
*Clark Everling*

### **9 New Keynesian Economics/Post Keynesian Alternatives**

*Edited by Roy J. Rotheim*

### **10 The Representative Agent in Macroeconomics**

*James E. Hartley*

### **11 Borderlands of Economics**

Essays in honour of Daniel R. Fusfeld  
*Edited by Nahid Aslanbeigui and Young Back Choi*

### **12 Value, Distribution and Capital**

Essays in honour of Pierangelo Garegnani  
*Edited by Gary Mongiovi and Fabio Petri*

- 13 The Economics of Science**  
Methodology and epistemology as if economics really mattered  
*James R. Wible*
- 14 Competitiveness, Localised Learning and Regional Development**  
Specialisation and prosperity in small open economies  
*Peter Maskell, Heikki Eskelinen, Ingjaldur Hannibalsson, Anders Malmberg and Eirik Vatne*
- 15 Labour Market Theory**  
A constructive reassessment  
*Ben J. Fine*
- 16 Women and European Employment**  
*Jill Rubery, Mark Smith, Colette Fagan and Damian Grimshaw*
- 17 Explorations in Economic Methodology**  
From Lakatos to empirical philosophy of science  
*Roger Backhouse*
- 18 Subjectivity in Political Economy**  
Essays on wanting and choosing  
*David P. Levine*
- 19 The Political Economy of Middle East Peace**  
The impact of competing trade agendas  
*Edited by J.W. Wright, Jnr*
- 20 The Active Consumer**  
Novelty and surprise in consumer choice  
*Edited by Marina Bianchi*
- 21 Subjectivism and Economic Analysis**  
Essays in memory of Ludwig Lachmann  
*Edited by Roger Koppl and Gary Mongiovi*
- 22 Themes in Post-Keynesian Economics**  
Essays in honour of Geoff Harcourt, volume three  
*Edited by Claudio Sardoni and Peter Kriesler*
- 23 The Dynamics of Technological Knowledge**  
*Cristiano Antonelli*
- 24 The Political Economy of Diet, Health and Food Policy**  
*Ben J. Fine*
- 25 The End of Finance**  
Capital market inflation, financial derivatives and pension fund capitalism  
*Jan Toporowski*
- 26 Political Economy and the New Capitalism**  
*Edited by Jan Toporowski*
- 27 Growth Theory**  
A philosophical perspective  
*Patricia Northover*
- 28 The Political Economy of the Small Firm**  
*Edited by Charlie Dannreuther*
- 29 Hahn and Economic Methodology**  
*Edited by Thomas Boylan and Paschal F. O'Gorman*

- 30 Gender, Growth and Trade**  
The miracle economies of the postwar years  
*David Kucera*
- 31 Normative Political Economy**  
Subjective freedom, the market and the state  
*David Levine*
- 32 Economist with a Public Purpose**  
Essays in honour of John Kenneth Galbraith  
*Edited by Michael Keaney*
- 33 Involuntary Unemployment**  
The elusive quest for a theory  
*Michel De Vroey*
- 34 The Fundamental Institutions of Capitalism**  
*Ernesto Screpanti*
- 35 Transcending Transaction**  
The search for self-generating markets  
*Alan Shipman*
- 36 Power in Business and the State**  
An historical analysis of its concentration  
*Frank Bealey*
- 37 Editing Economics**  
Essays in honour of Mark Perlman  
*Edited by Hank Lim, Ungsuh K. Park and Geoff Harcourt*
- 38 Money, Macroeconomics and Keynes**  
Essays in honour of Victoria Chick, volume one  
*Edited by Philip Arestis, Meghnad Desai and Sheila Dow*
- 39 Methodology, Microeconomics and Keynes**  
Essays in honour of Victoria Chick, volume two  
*Edited by Philip Arestis, Meghnad Desai and Sheila Dow*
- 40 Market Drive and Governance**  
Reexamining the rules for economic and commercial contest  
*Ralf Boscheck*
- 41 The Value of Marx**  
Political economy for contemporary capitalism  
*Alfredo Saad-Filho*
- 42 Issues in Positive Political Economy**  
*S. Mansoob Murshed*
- 43 The Enigma of Globalisation**  
A journey to a new stage of capitalism  
*Robert Went*
- 44 The Market**  
Equilibrium, stability, mythology  
*S.N. Afriat*
- 45 The Political Economy of Rule Evasion and Policy Reform**  
*Jim Leitzel*
- 46 Unpaid Work and the Economy**  
*Edited by Antonella Picchio*
- 47 Distributional Justice**  
Theory and measurement  
*Hilde Bojer*
- 48 Cognitive Developments in Economics**  
*Edited by Salvatore Rizzello*

- 49 Social Foundations of Markets, Money and Credit**  
*Costas Lapavistas*
- 50 Rethinking Capitalist Development**  
Essays on the economics of Josef Steindl  
*Edited by Tracy Mott and Nina Shapiro*
- 51 An Evolutionary Approach to Social Welfare**  
*Christian Sartorius*
- 52 Kalecki's Economics Today**  
*Edited by Zdzislaw L. Sadowski and Adam Szeworski*
- 53 Fiscal Policy from Reagan to Blair**  
The left veers right  
*Ravi K. Roy and Arthur T. Denzau*
- 54 The Cognitive Mechanics of Economic Development and Institutional Change**  
*Bertin Martens*
- 55 Individualism and the Social Order**  
The social element in liberal thought  
*Charles R. McCann, Jnr*
- 56 Affirmative Action in the United States and India**  
A comparative perspective  
*Thomas E. Weisskopf*
- 57 Global Political Economy and the Wealth of Nations**  
Performance, institutions, problems and policies  
*Edited by Phillip Anthony O'Hara*
- 58 Structural Economics**  
*Thijs ten Raai*
- 59 Macroeconomic Theory and Economic Policy**  
Essays in honour of Jean-Paul Fitoussi  
*Edited by K. Vela Velupillai*
- 60 The Struggle over Work**  
The "end of work" and employment alternatives in post-industrial societies  
*Shaun Wilson*
- 61 The Political Economy of Global Sporting Organisations**  
*John Forster and Nigel Pope*
- 62 The Flawed Foundations of General Equilibrium Theory**  
Critical essays on economic theory  
*Frank Ackerman and Alejandro Nadal*
- 63 Uncertainty in Economic Theory**  
Essays in honor of David Schmeidler's 65th birthday  
*Edited by Itzhak Gilboa*
- 64 The New Institutional Economics of Corruption**  
*Edited by Johann Graf Lambsdorff, Markus Taube and Matthias Schramm*
- 65 The Price Index and its Extension**  
A chapter in economic measurement  
*S.N. Afriat*
- 66 Reduction, Rationality and Game Theory in Marxian Economics**  
*Bruce Philp*

- 67 Culture and Politics in Economic Development**  
*Volker Bornschier*
- 68 Modern Applications of Austrian Thought**  
*Edited by Jürgen G. Backhaus*
- 69 Ordinary Choices**  
Individuals, incommensurability, and democracy  
*Robert Urquhart*
- 70 Labour Theory of Value**  
*Peter C. Dooley*
- 71 Capitalism**  
*Victor D. Lippit*
- 72 Macroeconomic Foundations of Macroeconomics**  
*Alvaro Cencini*
- 73 Marx for the 21st Century**  
*Edited by Hiroshi Uchida*
- 74 Growth and Development in the Global Political Economy**  
Social structures of accumulation and modes of regulation  
*Phillip Anthony O'Hara*
- 75 The New Economy and Macroeconomic Stability**  
A neo-modern perspective drawing on the complexity approach and Keynesian economics  
*Teodoro Dario Togati*
- 76 The Future of Social Security Policy**  
Women, work and a citizens' basic income  
*Ailsa McKay*
- 77 Clinton and Blair**  
The political economy of the third way  
*Flavio Romano*
- 78 Marxian Reproduction Schema**  
Money and aggregate demand in a capitalist economy  
*A.B. Trigg*
- 79 The Core Theory in Economics**  
Problems and solutions  
*Lester G. Telser*
- 80 Economics, Ethics and the Market**  
Introduction and applications  
*Johan J. Graafland*
- 81 Social Costs and Public Action in Modern Capitalism**  
Essays inspired by Karl William Kapp's theory of social costs  
*Edited by Wolfram Elsner, Pietro Frigato and Paolo Ramazzotti*
- 82 Globalization and the Myths of Free Trade**  
History, theory and empirical evidence  
*Edited by Anwar Shaikh*
- 83 Equilibrium in Economics**  
Scope and limits  
*Edited by Valeria Mosini*
- 84 Globalization**  
State of the art and perspectives  
*Edited by Stefan A. Schirm*
- 85 Neoliberalism**  
National and regional experiments with global ideas  
*Edited by Ravi K. Roy, Arthur T. Denzau and Thomas D. Willett*

- 86 Post-Keynesian Macroeconomics**  
Essays in honour of Ingrid Rima  
*Edited by Mathew Forstater,  
Gary Mongiovi and  
Steven Pressman*
- 87 Consumer Capitalism**  
*Anastasios S. Korkotsides*
- 88 Remapping Gender in the New Global Order**  
*Edited by Marjorie Griffin Cohen  
and Janine Brodie*
- 89 Hayek and Natural Law**  
*Eric Angner*
- 90 Race and Economic Opportunity in the Twenty-First Century**  
*Edited by Marlene Kim*
- 91 Renaissance in Behavioural Economics**  
Harvey Leibenstein's impact on contemporary economic analysis  
*Edited by Roger Frantz*
- 92 Human Ecology Economics**  
A new framework for global sustainability  
*Edited by Roy E. Allen*
- 93 Imagining Economics Otherwise**  
Encounters with identity/difference  
*Nitasha Kaul*
- 94 Reigniting the Labor Movement**  
Restoring means to ends in a democratic labor movement  
*Gerald Friedman*
- 95 The Spatial Model of Politics**  
*Norman Schofield*
- 96 The Economics of American Judaism**  
*Carmel Ullman Chiswick*
- 97 Critical Political Economy**  
*Christian Arnsperger*
- 98 Culture and Economic Explanation**  
Economics in the US and Japan  
*Donald W. Katzner*
- 99 Feminism, Economics and Utopia**  
Time travelling through paradigms  
*Karin Schönpflug*
- 100 Risk in International Finance**  
*Vikash Yadav*
- 101 Economic Policy and Performance in Industrial Democracies**  
Party governments, central banks and the fiscal–monetary policy mix  
*Takayuki Sakamoto*
- 102 Advances on Income Inequality and Concentration Measures**  
*Edited by Gianni Betti and  
Achille Lemmi*
- 103 Economic Representations**  
Academic and everyday  
*Edited by David F. Ruccio*
- 104 Mathematical Economics and the Dynamics of Capitalism**  
Goodwin's legacy continued  
*Edited by Peter Flaschel and  
Michael Landesmann*
- 105 The Keynesian Multiplier**  
*Edited by Claude Gnos and  
Louis-Philippe Rochon*



- 106 Money, Enterprise and Income Distribution**  
Towards a macroeconomic theory of capitalism  
*John Smithin*
- 107 Fiscal Decentralization and Local Public Finance in Japan**  
*Nobuki Mochida*
- 108 The ‘Uncertain’ Foundations of Post-Keynesian Economics**  
Essays in exploration  
*Stephen P. Dunn*
- 109 Karl Marx’s *Grundrisse***  
Foundations of the critique of political economy 150 years later  
*Edited by Marcello Musto*
- 110 Economics and the Price Index**  
*S.N. Afriat and Carlo Milana*
- 111 Sublime Economy**  
On the intersection of art and economics  
*Edited by Jack Amariglio, Joseph W. Childers and Stephen E. Cullenberg*
- 112 Popper, Hayek and the Open Society**  
*Calvin Hayes*
- 113 The Political Economy of Work**  
*David Spencer*
- 114 Institutional Economics**  
*Bernard Chavance*
- 115 Religion, Economics and Demography**  
The effects of religion on education, work, and the family  
*Evelyn L. Lehrer*
- 116 Economics, Rational Choice and Normative Philosophy**  
*Edited by Thomas A. Boylan and Ruvin Gekker*
- 117 Economics Versus Human Rights**  
*Manuel Couret Branco*
- 118 Hayek Versus Marx and Today’s Challenges**  
*Eric Aarons*
- 119 Work Time Regulation as Sustainable Full Employment Policy**  
*Robert LaJeunesse*
- 120 Equilibrium, Welfare and Uncertainty**  
*Mukul Majumdar*
- 121 Capitalism, Institutions and Economic Development**  
*Michael Heller*
- 122 Economic Pluralism**  
*Robert Garnett, Erik Olsen and Martha Starr*
- 123 Dialectics of Class Struggle in the Global Economy**  
*Clark Everling*
- 124 Political Economy and Globalization**  
*Richard Westra*
- 125 Full-Spectrum Economics**  
Toward an inclusive and emancipatory social science  
*Christian Arnsperger*

- 126 Computable, Constructive and Behavioural Economic Dynamics**  
Essays in honour of  
Kumaraswamy (Vela) Velupillai  
*Stefano Zambelli*
- 127 Monetary Macrodynamics**  
*Toichiro Asada, Carl Chiarella,  
Peter Flaschel and  
Reiner Franke*
- 128 Rationality and Explanation in Economics**  
*Maurice Lagueux*
- 129 The Market, Happiness, and Solidarity**  
A Christian perspective  
*Johan J. Graafland*
- 130 Economic Complexity and Equilibrium Illusion**  
Essays on market instability and macro vitality  
*Ping Chen*
- 131 Economic Theory and Social Change**  
Problems and revisions  
*Hasse Ekstedt and Angelo Fusari*
- 132 The Practices of Happiness**  
Political economy, religion and wellbeing  
*Edited by John Atherton,  
Elaine Graham and  
Ian Steedman*
- 133 The Measurement of Individual Well-Being and Group Inequalities**  
Essays in memory of  
Z.M. Berrebi  
*Edited by Joseph Deutsch and  
Jacques Silber*
- 134 Wage Policy, Income Distribution, and Democratic Theory**  
*Oren M. Levin-Waldman*
- 135 The Political Economy of Bureaucracy**  
*Steven O. Richardson*

# **The Political Economy of Bureaucracy**

**Steven O. Richardson**

First published 2011  
by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada  
by Routledge  
270 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business*

© 2011 Steven O. Richardson

Typeset in Times by Wearset Ltd, Boldon, Tyne and Wear

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

A catalog record for this book has been requested

ISBN: 978-0-415-58856-0 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-0-203-83718-4 (ebk)

# Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	xv
<i>List of tables</i>	xvi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvii
<i>List of abbreviations and symbols</i>	xviii
 <b>Introduction</b>	 1
 <b>1 The research question</b>	 7
<i>What is effective government?</i>	8
<i>Incentives</i>	13
<i>Ends and means</i>	16
<i>Cognitive dissonance</i>	21
 <b>2 Bureaucracy and beyond</b>	 25
<i>Organized anarchy</i>	25
<i>From hierarchies to polycentric networks</i>	30
<i>Order</i>	36
 <b>3 Methodology and the Kaleidic Hyperstructure (KH) model</b>	 39
<i>Ideal types and complex geometry</i>	39
<i>Radical subjectivism and creative destruction</i>	44
<i>Introducing the players</i>	49
<i>Tie strength</i>	53
 <b>4 From politics as usual to transparency, competition, and flexibility</b>	 58
<i>Baseline</i>	61
<i>Austerity (President's Budget)</i>	65
<i>PART (program performance information)</i>	68
<i>Relaxed (spending discretion)</i>	71

<i>Accountability (PART + relaxed)</i>	76
<i>Lean (austerity + accountability)</i>	78
<i>Summary</i>	80
<b>5 Case study of the Department of Homeland Security (DHS)</b>	<b>83</b>
<i>Good intentions</i>	84
<i>Chronic challenges</i>	91
<i>Managing the complex DHS network</i>	94
<i>KH view of DHS – before and after</i>	96
<i>Zooming in on the agencies</i>	100
<i>Budget and performance</i>	104
<i>Summary</i>	106
<b>6 Lessons for institutional change</b>	<b>107</b>
<i>Government is human</i>	108
<i>Complex orders are facilitated, not imposed</i>	114
<i>A new vision: policies as experimental meta-rules</i>	119
<i>Conclusion</i>	124
<b>Appendix – DHS element attributes</b>	<b>127</b>
<i>Notes</i>	129
<i>Bibliography</i>	137
<i>Index</i>	145

# Figures

3.1	Citizen's view	50
3.2	Senator's view	51
3.3	President's view	51
3.4	Agency head's view	52
3.5	Program manager's view	52
3.6	All together now	53
3.7	Link weights	56
4.1	Baseline	62
4.2	Austerity	66
4.3	PART	70
4.4	Relaxed	75
4.5	Accountability	77
4.6	Lean	79
4.7	Tie strength summary	81
4.8	Effectiveness summary	81
5.1	DHS before 2002	98
5.2	DHS in 2003	99
5.3	DHS in 2008	99
5.4	DHS agencies in 2002	100
5.5	DHS agencies in 2003	101
5.6	DHS agencies in 2008	102
5.7	DHS budget and performance, 2008	105

# Tables

3.1	Agent types	50
3.2	Valuation criteria	55
4.1	Hypothetical scenarios	58
4.2	Baseline attributes	61
4.3	Baseline tie strengths	64
4.4	Austerity tie strengths	67
4.5	PART tie strengths	71
4.6	Relaxed tie strengths	76
4.7	Accountability tie strengths	78
4.8	Lean tie strengths	80
5.1	DHS agencies before and after reorganization	97
5.2	Good and bad ties in DHS	104



# Acknowledgments

The ideas presented in this book synthesize knowledge and experience that I began accumulating when I went to work for the Mercatus Center, which is affiliated with the Economics Department of George Mason University, in 1999. Through joint education programs on application of economics to federal government policy, I met Professor Peter J. Boettke. He inspired my return to school after a hiatus of over 20 years, taught me fearless scholarship, and encouraged ambitious writing projects such as this book. Professor Richard E. Wagner demonstrated by example how to explore the intellectual frontier. He helped me conceive this book and offered invaluable advice in its development. Dr. Jerry Ellig, a former colleague at the Mercatus Center, provided numerous constructive comments on the draft.

My professional experience working with and within US federal agencies is a critical factor in the relevance and perspective of ideas expressed in this book. I am in debt to The Honorable Maurice P. McTigue at the Mercatus Center's Government Accountability Project for teaching me how to focus on results in government. I also want to thank colleagues at the US Department of Labor for the opportunity to serve my country and learn how things really work (not to mention a flexible schedule that made my academic pursuits possible). Key individuals are Veronica Campbell, Donna Copson, Dave Frederickson, Rick French, Lissette Geán, Jim McMullen, Karen Pane, and Maureen Walsh.

I am particularly grateful for the unconditional love and understanding of my dear wife, Mari, who moved nearly 2,000 miles from the rest of her family at my request and continued to support my career and educational ambitions in countless ways.