

ELIMINATING POVERTY THROUGH DEVELOPMENT IN CHINA

China Development Research Foundation



中国发展研究基金会 China Development Research Foundation



Eliminating Poverty through Development in China

In recent years China has achieved impressive economic growth, and also made remarkable progress in human development. However, contemporary China is still faced with the great challenge of widespread poverty. This not only constitutes a barrier against China's pursuit of sustainable economic growth, but also poses a potential threat to China's attempts to construct a harmonious society in the future. The report, directed by the China Development Research Foundation, one of China's leading think-tanks and drawing on the research of over twenty of China's top scholars in this field, including chief authors Wang Xiaolu, Li Shi and Wang Sangui - three renowned poverty-reduction experts - examines China's efforts to eliminate poverty through development. It analyses all of the key issues, providing a review of China's past record in poverty alleviation, comparing this with the experiences of other countries, identifying the new characteristics and trends in poverty in recent years, and discussing the factors responsible. It assesses the objectives and success of the poverty alleviation policies adopted by the Chinese government in a comprehensive way, and puts forward suggestions for policy makers. Overall, this report is a valuable account of China's own thinking on its problems of poverty, and the best ways to tackle it and achieve sustainable economic development.

China Development Research Foundation (CDRF) is a nation-wide non-profit organization founded on the initiative of the Development Research Center (DRC) of the State Council. CDRF's mission is to advance good governance and public policy to promote economic development and social progress in China.

Routledge Studies on the Chinese Economy

Series Editor Peter Nolan, University of Cambridge

Founding Series Editors

Peter Nolan, University of Cambridge and Dong Fureng, Beijing University

The aim of this series is to publish original, high-quality, research-level work by both new and established scholars in the West and the East, on all aspects of the Chinese economy, including studies of business and economic history.

- 1. The Growth of Market Relations in Post-reform Rural China A micro-analysis of peasants, migrants and peasant entrepreneurs *Hiroshi Sato*
- 2. The Chinese Coal Industry: An Economic History Elspeth Thomson
- 3. Sustaining China's Economic Growth in the Twenty-First Century Edited by Shujie Yao & Xiaming Liu
- 4. China's Poor Regions: Rural-urban migration, poverty, economic reform and urbanisation *Mei Zhang*
- 5. China's Large Enterprises and the Challenge of Late Industrialization Dylan Sutherland
- 6. China's Economic Growth Yanrui Wu
- 7. The Employment Impact of China's World Trade Organisation Accession A.S. Bhalla and S. Qiu
- 8. Catch-Up and Competitiveness in China The case of large firms in the oil

industry Jin Zhang

9. Corporate Governance in China Jian Chen

- 10. The Theory of the Firm and Chinese Enterprise Reform
 The case of China International Trust and Investment Corporation Qin Xiao
- Globalisation, Transition and Development in China The case of the coal industry Huaichuan Rui
- 12. China Along the Yellow River Reflections on rural society Cao Jinqing, translated by Nicky Harman and Huang Ruhua
- 13. Economic Growth, Income Distribution and Poverty Reduction in Contemporary China Shujie Yao
- 14. China's Economic Relations with the West and Japan, 1949–79 Grain, trade and diplomacy *Chad J. Mitcham*
- 15. China's Industrial Policy and the Global Business Revolution The case of the domestic appliance industry Ling Liu
- 16. Managers and Mandarins in Contemporary China The building of an international business alliance *Jie Tang*

- 17. The Chinese Model of Modern Development Edited by Tian Yu Cao
- 18. Chinese Citizenship Views from the margins Edited by Vanessa L. Fong and Rachel Murphy
- **19. Unemployment, Inequality and Poverty in Urban China** *Edited by Shi Li and Hiroshi Sato*
- 20. Globalisation, Competition and Growth in China Edited hy Jian Chen and Shujie Yao
- 21. The Chinese Communist Party in Reform Edited by Kjeld Erik Brodsgaard and Zheng Yongnian
- 22. Poverty and Inequality among Chinese Minorities A.S. Bhalla and Shufang Qiu
- 23. Economic and Social Transformation in China Challenges and opportunities Angang Hu
- 24. Global Big Business and the Chinese Brewing Industry Yuantao Guo

- 25. Peasants and Revolution in Rural China Rural political change in the North China Plain and the Yangzi Delta, 1850–1949 Chang Liu
- 26. The Chinese Banking Industry Lessons from history for today's challenges Yuanyuan Peng
- 27. Informal Institutions and Rural Development in China Biliang Hu
- 28. The Political Future of Hong Kong Democracy within communist China *Kit Poon*
- 29. China's Post-Reform Economy Achieving Harmony, Sustaining Growth Edited by Richard Sanders and Chen Yang
- **30. Eliminating Poverty Through Development in China** *China Development Research Foundation*



Eliminating Poverty through Development in China

China Development Research Foundation





中国发展研究基金会 China Development Research Foundation First published 2009 by Routledge 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada by Routledge 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2009 The China Development Research Foundation

Typeset in Times New Roman by RefineCatch Limited, Bungay, Suffolk

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data A catalogue record has been requested for this book

ISBN 978-0-415-46277-8 (hbk) ISBN 978-0-415-55134-2 (pbk) ISBN 978-0-203-88772-1 (ebk)

Contents

	List of figures	ix
	List of tables	xii
	List of boxes	xiv
	Foreword	xv
	Authors' foreword	xvii
	List of contributors	xxi
1	Introduction	1
	A review of China's poverty and anti-poverty efforts 2	
	Socioeconomic development and poverty reduction 10	
	Evolution of poverty concepts and other countries'	
	experiences 17	
	This report's approach 21	
2	New characteristics of poverty in China today	32
	The absolute poverty line in China 32	
	Poor populations in rural areas of China 38	
	Size and geographical distribution of poor	
	populations in urban areas 51	
3	Analysis of the causes of poverty	56
	An analytical framework 56	
	Agricultural dependence and natural environmental	
	constraints 58	
	Human capital constraints 68	
	Public services constraints 82	
	Causes of urban poverty 98	
	A brief summary of the causes of poverty 102	
	\mathcal{J}	

Contents	
China's poverty alleviation policies: goals and impacts	108
Main poverty alleviation policies and their characteristics 108 The effects of poverty alleviation policies in rural areas 122 The poverty alleviation effects of anti-poverty policies in urban areas 184 Conclusive evaluation of China's anti-poverty policies 192	
Governance and poverty alleviation	197
The organization of China's poverty alleviation forces and their functions 197	
The Chinese Government's primary experiences in poverty alleviation 205	
The main problems with the Chinese Government's administrative practices for poverty alleviation 208	
Suggestions for poverty alleviation policies	218
Establish a developmental poverty line and adjust long-term poverty alleviation objectives 219 Establish a reasonable credit mechanism for poverty alleviation and define the financial sector's participation 220 Establish and completely implement the social security system for rural and urban areas 221 Support the drive for urbanization, and provide social security and public services to migrants from rural areas working in urban areas 222 Provide fairer educational opportunities 224 Provide more intensive training to rural labourers on employment, occupational skills and labour transfers 226 Improve rural medical services 226 Establish a reasonable public finance-assisted poverty alleviation mechanism and reinforce governmental oversight 227 Expand the role played by non-governmental organizations in poverty alleviation 228 In conclusion 229	
	China's poverty alleviation policies: goals and impacts Main poverty alleviation policies and their characteristics 108 The effects of poverty alleviation policies in rural areas 122 The poverty alleviation effects of anti-poverty policies in urban areas 184 Conclusive evaluation of China's anti-poverty policies 192 Governance and poverty alleviation The organization of China's poverty alleviation forces and their functions 197 The Chinese Government's primary experiences in poverty alleviation 205 The main problems with the Chinese Government's administrative practices for poverty alleviation 208 Suggestions for poverty alleviation policies Establish a developmental poverty line and adjust long-term poverty alleviation objectives 219 Establish a reasonable credit mechanism for poverty alleviation and define the financial sector's participation 220 Establish and completely implement the social security system for rural and urban areas 221 Support the drive for urbanization, and provide social security and public services to migrants from rural areas working in urban areas 222 Provide fairer educational opportunities 224 Provide more intensive training to rural labourers on employment, occupational skills and labour transfers 226 Establish a reasonable public finance-assisted poverty alleviation mechanism and reinforce governmental oversight 227 Expand the role played by non-governmental organizations in poverty alleviation 228

Bibliography 231 Index 243

Figures

1.1	Changes in the poor population in rural areas of	
	China from 1978 to 2005	4
1.2	Changes in the income gap among rural areas of	
	China from 1990 to 2005: Gini coefficient	6
1.3	Comparison between China's rate of poverty	
	and the world's rate of poverty (%)	8
1.4	Income level and poverty rate at provincial level	
	in rural China, 2004	12
1.5	Relevancy between the growth of per capita net	
	income and the decrease in the incidence rate of	
	poverty in rural areas of China from 1979 to 2005	13
1.6	Human development index and rate of poverty	
	in rural areas by province in 2004	15
2.1	Official poverty line in rural China from 1985 to 2005	33
2.2	Ratio between the official poverty line for rural	
	areas and per capita net income of rural residents	
	from 1985 to 2005 (%)	34
2.3	Correlation between the minimum security level	
	and per capita disposable income of urban residents	
	in each province (RMB yuan)	35
2.4	Changes in the population in subsistence and	
	developmental poverty in rural China	38
2.5	Incidence rate of poverty among children in	
	rural areas of China from 1998 to 2005	44
2.6	Incidence rates of poverty among people of different	
	age groups in rural areas of China in 1998 and 2005	45
2.7	Discrepancy between the poor population and	
	the non-poor population in rural areas in terms of	
	educational background in 2005	49
2.8	Variations in the incidence rate of urban poverty	
	in China from 1986 to 2000	52
2.9	Incidence rates of urban poverty by gender and	
	age group in 2002	53

x I	Figures	
2.10	Poverty incidence rates among urban residents	
	by personal capacity in 2002	54
3.1	Sources of income for rural people	59
3.2	Rates of illiteracy among labourers in different	
	income groups	70
3.3	The in-school rate is increasing, but	
	discrepancies still exist	72
3.4	Distribution of families in absolute poverty in	
	rural areas of Hefei City by causes of poverty	78
3.5	Percentage of medical expenditures in the net	
	income of rural families by income groups (%)	89
3.6	Relationship between changes in living	
	standards and per capita medical expenditures	
	among rural families in the past five years (2005)	90
3.7	Percentages of educational expenditures out of	
	net incomes for families in different rural income	
	groups (2005)	92
3.8	Relationship between the changes in living	
	standards of rural families in the past five years and	
	their per capita educational expenditures (2005)	93
3.9	Mixture of urban residents receiving security	
	benefits for bare subsistence	98
3.10	Distribution of causes of poverty among urban	
	families receiving minimum security subsidies in	
	Hefei City	100
4.1	Spending of poverty alleviation funds allocated	
	to poverty-stricken counties (1998–2001)	117
4.2	The investment demands of rural households in	1.17
4.2	poor regions	117
4.3	Trends in the three kinds of poverty alleviation	
	investments made by the central Government	100
4.4	(constant price in 1986, RMB 100 million yuan)	123
4.4	Distribution of poor counties in different income groups in 1986	130
4.5	Distribution of poor counties in different	150
4.5	income groups in 1993	130
4.6	Distribution of poor villages by different income	1,00
4.0	groups in 2001	131
4.7	Geographical distribution of poor villages	131
4.8	Changes in infrastructure and public service	1.54
	facilities from 2002 to 2005	135
4.9	Comparison between income growth and	133
	consumption growth from 2002 to 2005	136
4.10	Usage of interest-subsidized loans in 2005	147
		/

4.11	Bad loan ratio of interest-subsidized loans for	
	poverty alleviation	149
4.12	Bad loan ratios for different types of poverty	
	alleviation loans in 2005 %	149
4.13	People entitled to the "five guarantees" from	
	1985 to 2002	162
4.14	The size of the rural population covered by	
	welfare support from 2002 to 2006	165
4.15	Variations in tuition fees levied upon students in	
	schools with and without the "One Fee System"	
	in 2004	170
4.16	Taxes paid by rural households in different	
	income groups in major counties subject to poverty	
	alleviation in 2002	179
4.17	Degrees of agricultural tax exemptions and	
	reductions for rural households in different income	
	groups, 2002–2005	180
4.18	Contributions made by tax reduction to income	
	growth among rural households in different income	
	groups from 2002 to 2005	181
4.19	Changes in income and expenditure for rural	
	households converting or not converting their croplands	
	into forests in Ningxia Province from 1999 to 2003	184
4.20	The size of the urban population using the	
	minimum living standard system and coverage ratios	
	from 1996 to 2005	185
4.21	Coverage ratios of the minimum living standard	
	system for people who should and should not be	
	covered by this system	187
4.22	Coverage ratios of the minimum living standard	
	system for different income groups	188
4.23	Ratios of re-employment recorded by	
	unemployed or laid-off labourers with different	
	educational degrees	191
5.1	Organization chart of the Chinese Government	
	for rural poverty alleviation work	199
5.2	Organization chart of the Chinese Government	
2	for urban poverty alleviation work	206
		_ • •

Tables

2.1	Comparisons between poverty lines and security lines for minimum subsistence of urban residents in China in 2004	36
2.2	Geographical distribution and trends in subsistence poverty in rural areas of China from	20
	1998 to 2005	42
2.3	Rates of subsistence poverty across provinces	
	from 1998 to 2005 (%)	43
2.4	Geographical distribution and evolution of the	
	population in subsistence poverty in rural areas	44
2.5	Poverty indexes for children aged 15 years and	
	below in rural areas of China in 1995 and 2002	45
2.6	Subsistence poverty indexes and decomposition	
	for children in different regions	46
2.7	Child poverty indexes and decomposition	
	thereof in poor counties and non-poor counties	46
2.8	A comparison between poor families in rural	
	areas and all rural families in China in terms of	
	average indexes (2004)	48
2.9	Rates of subsistence poverty of different groups	
	of people with dissimilar educational backgrounds	
	from 1998 to 2005 (%)	48
2.10	Headcount burdens of rural families in poor regions	50
	Medical and educational expenditures of	
	different groups of rural families, based on data from	
	the surveillance of poverty in six provinces in 2004	51
3.1	Ranking of causes of livelihood difficulties: a	
	survey of 4,000 rural families in 15 provinces (districts,	
	cities)	60
3.2	Educational backgrounds of rural labourers in	
	China by income group in 2004	69
3.3	Percentages of disabled people in the total	
	population in poverty (1998)	77

3.4	Percentages of families with sick or disabled	
	family members in the total number of families in some	
	poverty-stricken villages in eastern China (2006)	78
3.5	Family headcount burdens of rural families in	
	poverty-stricken regions	80
3.6	The main financial difficulties encountered by	
	rural families at present	84
3.7	Medical and educational expenditures of rural	
	families: poverty surveillance in six provinces (2004)	85
3.8	Medical care and educational expenditures for	
	rural families in different income groups: poverty	
	surveillance in nine provinces and municipalities (2005)	86
3.9	Causes of livelihood difficulties in rural families	
	in nine provinces and municipalities of central and	
	western China (2006)	94
3.10	Loans incurred by families in relative poverty	
	and other types of rural families (sample: 3,427 families)	96
3.11	Rural poverty and livelihood hardships incurred	
	by institutional factors (2006)	97
4.1	China's poverty alleviation policies	109
4.2	Income growth rates for different categories of	
	villages (2001 to 2004)	140
4.3	Material prerequisites in elementary and junior	
	high schools in sampled counties of Gansu Province	
	from 2000 to 2004	167
4.4	Influence of out-of-pocket payments on poverty	176
4.5	Sizes of urban populations covered by the	
	minimum living standard system and coverage ratios in	
	different provinces in 2004	186

Boxes

1.1	The relationship between absolute poverty and	
	relative poverty	19
3.1	Three major causes of poverty: low revenue in	
	agriculture, and high costs for medical services and	
	children's schooling	60
3.2	The influence of foodstuff prices upon incomes	
	in rural low-income populations	65
3.3	Survey of infrastructure facilities in central and	
	western China	67
3.4	The methods for defining the subsistence poverty line	87
4.1	The evolution of China's developmental poverty	
	alleviation policies for rural areas	112
4.2	The evolution of China's urban minimum living	
	standard policies	119
4.3	Determining poor counties and villages	126
4.4	A description of China's labour market	143
4.5	The influence of resettlements in Suichuan	
	County in Jiangxi Province	154
4.6	Science and technology helps develop the tea	
	industry in Yingshan County of Hubei Province	155
4.7	Societal poverty alleviation activities in China	157
4.8	'One Fee System' reform for compulsory education	169
4.9	Primary agricultural subsidization and	
	environmental protection policies	181
4.10	Different forms of insurance for urban residents	189

Foreword

窗体底端

Over the last three decades, China has made historic progress in poverty alleviation. The number of rural poor has dropped from 250 million people in 1978 to about 20 million today, with the poverty incidence rate declining from 31 percent to 2.5 percent in that period. Culture, education and medical care have developed differently across China. By and large the productivity and living conditions of the rural poor have improved, while poor urban residents have mostly had their subsistence guaranteed. China's accomplishments in poverty elimination are immensely laudable.

China is a developing country, and her economic situation today is well off, but still at a low level with some inconsistencies and imbalances. Since the start of the twenty-first century, when China entered a development stage featuring concerted efforts to build a well-off society, anti-poverty initiatives have confronted changing new circumstances and, consequently, have involved new tasks. Tens of millions of Chinese people in rural and urban areas remain in poverty, even as China's economic growth and social advancement mean the yardstick for identifying poverty is undergoing corresponding changes. Today, emerging from poverty is not just dependent on having enough food and clothing. Instead, people need the capabilities to embrace development on their own, eliminating both the causes and the effects of poverty.

China's burgeoning economic strength today allows it to exert more efforts to support poverty-stricken populations and regions to escape poverty and cultivate wealth. New socioeconomic circumstances require better poverty alleviation strategies, however. These involve eliminating subsistence poverty by setting up and improving the social security system for rural and urban areas, and emphasizing the need to embrace development, including by enhancement of the capabilities of the poor and acceleration of socioeconomic development in impoverished regions. In today's China, where each and every resident contributes to building a well-off society, effective poverty alleviation policies are of gigantic significance for the sake of realizing common prosperity.

The China Development Report is a comprehensive research report compiled and released regularly by the China Development Research Foundation,

xvi Foreword

based on its research efforts. The report touches upon themes of importance to China's economic and social development. This report, based on the 2007 report, is entitled *Eliminating Poverty through Development in China*, which not only shows the need to regard the elimination of poverty as an important goal of economic development, but also indicates that the ultimate solution for poverty elimination is the pursuit of development. China's development in the current phase has met those requirements.

The Report is based on the findings of in-depth research. It describes China's accomplishments in poverty reduction and the poverty situation today. Many of the report's conclusions touch upon the root causes of poverty and the means for reducing it. Overall, the contents are thoughtprovoking and worth much reference. I believe this Report is helpful for China's further implementation of her poverty alleviation programme, and also for the international community's understanding of China's progress and experience in poverty alleviation.

I would like to thank all the experts who have participated in the research efforts on which this report is based for their diligent input and sharp wisdom. I would also like to thank the China Development Bank and the Ford Foundation for their generous support.

Wang Mengkui

Former President of the Development Research Center of the State Council and Chairman of the China Development Research Foundation

Authors' Foreword

Eliminating Poverty through Development in China addresses the theme of poverty, briefly describes the history and status quo of the poverty issue in China, introduces other countries' experiences in poverty alleviation, analyses the characteristics of poverty in China today and the various reasons behind it, reviews and assesses various poverty alleviation policies in China and their effects, studies governmental practices in anti-poverty work, and puts forward multiple suggestions for policy makers based on data and analysis.

The Chinese nation is now undergoing a historically unprecedented renaissance of immense significance. On its path leading to prosperity and modernism, China needs to mobilize all its citizens to make concerted efforts to stride forward. Development is not the only objective; the goal of a harmonious society is equally significant. Both poverty elimination and economic growth are essential to this process.

In the past 30 years, China's anti-poverty efforts have achieved stunning results. Almost a quarter of a billion people have been lifted out of poverty; the provision of education, health care and other services has vastly improved across the country. China's amazing achievements have been widely acknowledged in the international community, while some other developing countries now see China as a role model. In the final analysis, China's anti-poverty accomplishments are credited to its fast economic growth and active poverty alleviation policies.

China today, however, still shoulders a heavy task in continuing its progress in reducing poverty, which has a number of causes. Economic growth, *per se*, will not make poverty vanish automatically. It is necessary to conduct further research on effective strategies, and mobilize people from all walks of life to make joint efforts to eliminate poverty entirely.

This report has made some new contributions towards this end.

First, in view of the latest developments in China and in line with the evolution of global thinking on poverty reduction, we calculate that the original rural poverty line used to assess whether or not subsistence needs are met does not adequately reflect the needs of rural residents to develop their own capabilities (principally with respect to health care, education, etc.).

Hence, this report puts forward a concept of a developmental poverty line that covers basic needs for health care and education. This concept covers more ground than the original poverty line and fits better into China's future poverty alleviation goals.

Second, as indicated by the findings of this report, poverty in rural areas increasingly stems from the lack of human capital in terms of health care and education, and the lack of related public services. In urban areas, the most obvious reason for poverty is underemployment, but limited health care, education and public services are important contributing factors.

Third, the report comprehensively analyses and assesses, for the first time, the poverty alleviation policies and measures adopted by the Chinese Government. It acknowledges that the previous development-oriented policies for poverty alleviation for some rural areas (inclusive of production and infrastructure development) have achieved marked results. The cancellation of agricultural taxes and other policies beneficial to peasants have assisted many low-income rural families. In the future, however, development-oriented poverty alleviation policies should pay more attention to human capital development, instead of just production development, and adopt such measures as support for education, job skills training and health care security to enhance the level of human capital. This will be an even more effective means of eliminating poverty, particularly if accompanied by a fully implemented social security system.

Fourth, it finds that China's constant efforts to alleviate poverty through government leadership have produced important results, but also given rise to a series of problems that have reduced efficiency in the use of poverty alleviation funds. Improving public administration will help bolster effectiveness.

Finally, suggestions are put forward in nine areas, targeting policy makers. These include issues related to poverty alleviation strategies, poverty line determination and concrete poverty alleviation measures.

Preparations for the report on which the report is based began in early 2006. The China Development Research Foundation undertook the organization of the project. Lu Mai, Secretary General for the Foundation, participated, from beginning to end, in the design of the framework for, discussions upon and amendments to the original report, making essential contributions. Wang Mengkui, former President of the China Development Research Center of the State Council and Chairman of the China Development Research Foundation, has put forward a host of important, concrete, constructive opinions regarding amendments to the draft report. Tang Min, Vice Board Chairman for the China Development Research Foundation, has taken part in amendments on the section 'Suggestions to Policy Makers'. In the course of research and compilation, many experts were involved and put forward an array of constructive suggestions. The National Bureau of Statistics of China and The Rural Economy Research Center, under the State Ministry of Agriculture, offered generous assistance in terms of data sourcing and field surveys.

Supported by the China Development Research Foundation. Chinese experts and some relevant organs offered 23 background papers for this project. Many data, analyses and opinions were integrated in the report. The papers are: 'International Theories and Practical Policies of Poverty Alleviation' (Liu Minguan and Yu Jiantuo), 'Influence of Rural Policies on the Poverty-Stricken Population' (Zuo Ting), 'Assessment of the Influence Wielded by Rural Compulsory Education Policies on Rural Poverty' (Jin Lian), 'Assessment of the Influence Wielded by Medicare Policies on Rural Poverty' (Han Jun), 'Research on Interest-Subsidized Loans for Poverty Alleviation Purposes' (Zhang Tao, Yi Cheng and Wang Tian), 'Assessment of Social Poverty Alleviation Endeavours and their Influence' (Li Zhou and Cao Jianhua), 'Report upon the Assessment of the Evolution of Industrialization Endeavours for Poverty Alleviation Purposes' (Li Zhou and Cao Jianhua), 'Immigration and Poverty Alleviation' (Li Xiaoyun and Tang Lixia), 'Assessment of the Poverty Alleviation Effect Generated by Training with Regard to the Transfer of the Labour Force' (Li Wen), 'Poverty Issues in Rural Areas of China – An Analysis into the Findings of a Survey of Rural Families' (Ma Yongliang, Zhao Changbao and Wu Zhigang), 'Report upon a Survey of Poverty in Rural Areas of East China' (Shanghai DataSea Marketing Research Co., Ltd), 'Research upon Parties Participating in the Formulation of Budgets of County and Township-Level Governments' (Beijing De Sai Si Chuang Consultation Centre), 'Influence Wielded by Minimum Livelihood Security Policies in Rural and Urban Areas upon the Poverty Scene' (He Ping), 'Institutionalization of China's Social Succor System' (Gu Xin), 'China's Urban Poverty Scene: Trends, Policies and New Problems' (Du Yang), 'Laying-off, Unemployment, Re-employment and Urban Poverty' (Cai Fang and Wang Meiyan), 'Descriptions of the Urban Poverty Scene and the Population Covered by the Minimum Livelihood Security System' (Wang Zhenyao), 'A Generation Living in a Crevice in the City' (Topical Research Group dedicated to studying the newly emerging unemployed population), 'Child Poverty in Rural Areas' (Yue Ximing), 'Nutrition, the Health of Underprivileged Children and Related Governmental Policies' (Ma Guansheng), 'Analysis of China's Urban Poverty Scene and Conditions of the Low-income Population since 1995' (Zheng Feihu and Li Shi), 'Appraisal Report upon Village-Wide Implementation Work' (Wang Sangui) and 'Structure of China's Poverty Alleviation Work' (Wang Sangui). In addition, Wang Chunhua has offered certain findings of his study in relevant documents.

To compile the original report for *Eliminating Poverty through Development* in *China*, the China Development Research Foundation organized a field survey of poverty in Chuxiong Prefecture, Wuding County within Yunnan Province, Hefei City, Shitai County within Anhui Province, Pingshun County, and Taigu County within Shanxi Province. The survey was conducted by the authors of this report, Lu Mai and Zhao Shukai with the China Development Research Foundation, assisted by Du Zhixin, Huang

xx Authors' foreword

Haili, Zhang Changdong and Chou Ting. Governmental departments in the prefectures, counties, townships, cities and provinces, and local villagers and cadres assisted the survey.

In addition, Zhao Shukai, Vice Secretary General of the China Development Research Foundation, Du Zhixin, Zhao Junchao, Huang Haili, Feng Mingliang and Zhang Changdong – all personnel with the Foundation – have undertaken many project-organizing tasks. We express our heartfelt thanks to all the organizations and individuals that have contributed to this report.

Wang Xiaolu, Li Shi and Wang Sangui

Contributors

ADVISERS

- Wang Mengkui, Former President, Development Research Center of the State Council, and Chairman, China Development Research Foundation
- Chen Xiwen, Deputy Director, The Office of the Central Leading Group for Finance and Economics, and Director, The Office of the Central Leading Group for Rural Affairs
- Xie Fuzhan, Director General, National Bureau of Statistics of China

PROJECT COORDINATOR

Lu Mai, Secretary General and Research Follow, China Development Research Foundation

CHIEF AUTHORS

- Wang Sangui, Professor, School of Agricultural Economics and Rural Development, Renmin University of China
- Li Shi, Professor, School of Economics and Business, Beijing Normal University
- Wang Xiaolu, Deputy Head and Research Fellow, National Economy Research Institute, China Reform Foundation

AUTHORS OF BACKGROUND REPORTS

Zhao Changbao, Deputy Head and Associate Research Fellow, Rural Studies Center, Ministry of Agriculture

xxii Contributors

- Cai Fang, Director and Research Fellow, Institute of Population and Labor Economics, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences
- Zheng Feihu, Lecturer and Doctor, School of Economics and Business, Beijing Normal University
- Ma Guansheng, Deputy Director and Research Fellow, Nutrition and Food Safety, Chinese Center for Disease Control and Prevention
- Han Jun, Head and Research Fellow, Department of Rural Economy Studies, Development Research Center, State Council
- Sheng Laiyun, Deputy Head, Rural Survey Team, National Bureau of Statistics of China
- Jin Lian, Lecturer and Doctor, School of Resources and Environmental Management, Guizhou Institute of Finance and Economics
- Lv Liangming, Manager, DataSea (Shanghai) Market Research Company
- Sun Liping, Professor, School of Humanities, Tsinghua University
- Wang Liqun, Professor, Beijing Forestry University
- Dong Mei, Lecturer, Nanjing Agricultural University
- Liu Minquan, Professor, School of Economics, Peking University
- He Ping, Director and Research Fellow, Research Institute of Social Insurance, Ministry of Labor and Social Security
- Wang Pingping, Head, Rural Poverty Surveillance Division, Rural Survey Team, National Bureau of Statistics of China
- Wang Sangui, Professor, School of Agricultural Economics and Rural Development, Renmin University of China
- Zhang Tao, Deputy Director General, Research Bureau, People's Bank of China
- Zuo Ting, Deputy Dean and Professor, School of Humanities and Development, China Agricultural University
- Li Wen, Associate Research Fellow, Institute of Agricultural Economics and Rural Development, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences
- Zheng Xiaoxian, Professor, Beijing Forestry University
- Li Xiaoyun, Dean and Professor, School of Humanities and Development, China Agricultural University
- Gu Xin, Professor, Research Institute of Social Development and Public Policies, Beijing Normal University
- Yue Ximing, Professor, School of Finance, Renmin University of China

- Du Yang, Associate Research Fellow, Institute of Population Studies, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences
- Li Yingxing, Associate Research Fellow, Institute of Agricultural Economics and Rural Development, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences
- Wang Zhenyao, Head, Department of Disaster Relief and Succor, Ministry of Civil Affairs
- Li Zhou, Deputy Director and Research Fellow, Research Institute of Rural Development, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences

HEAD OF THE PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION OFFICE

Zhao Shukai, Vice Secretary General and Research Fellow, China Development Research Foundation

STAFF MEMBERS OF THE PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION OFFICE

Du Zhixin, Huang Haili and Feng Mingliang, China Development Research Foundation



1 Introduction

Since China began its reform and opening to the outside world, rapid economic growth has not only elevated the living standards of people in both urban and rural areas, but also sharply decreased the number of people in poverty. In the course of three decades of economic development, the numbers of the rural poor population have shrunk dramatically, according to various measurements. Based on China's official poverty line, there were 250 million rural poor people in 1978. By the end of 2005, there were only 23.65 million rural poor people. The rate of poverty fell from 31 percent to 2.5 percent in that period.¹ Even if the measurement is done according to a relatively high poverty line, such as that of the World Bank (US \$1 dollar per day per person), the size of the poor population in rural areas and the incidence rate of poverty in China have declined in a largely identical way.²

Prior to reform, the restrictions on China's economic development and system meant the rate of poverty was far beyond the average in other countries. Today, China's rate is markedly below the world's average (Chen and Ravallion 2004). Propelled by the Government's developmental poverty alleviation strategy, poor regions in the country have embraced development in terms of culture, education, health care and other social undertakings, to different extents. China has become a role model for some other developing countries due to its stunning accomplishments in poverty alleviation and the commendation it has earned from the global community.

Nevertheless, China is still faced with a rather formidable poverty alleviation task. On the one hand, the remaining poor mainly comprise people who cannot be helped out of poverty that easily. On the other hand, with social advancement and people's increasing awareness of poverty, the term 'poverty' today is not meant for inadequate income alone. It also manifests through poor capabilities. A better awareness of poverty has raised standards for poverty alleviation, while the yardstick for poverty measurement has also moved as a consequence of economic development, becoming more prone to the influence of concepts of social development. The elimination of poverty no longer means merely meeting the minimum subsistence needs of the poor population. Instead, it is necessary to provide a basic capability

2 Eliminating Poverty through Development in China

for embracing development. Chinese society is undergoing a significant transformation as far as poverty alleviation strategies are concerned.

China's victory over poverty is accredited to two factors: rapid economic growth and ambitious poverty alleviation policies. Economic growth is, in large part, due to China's economic reform and opening-up policy. Poverty alleviation policies have been fuelled by the Chinese Government's determination and committed efforts.

It is essential to sum up China's successful experiences in poverty alleviation and also to analyse influential factors. Among them, swift economic growth is the most notable but that alone is not enough. In an economic scenario featuring a widening income gap, for the sake of poverty alleviation it is of paramount importance to make the mode of economic growth more beneficial to the poor and more conducive to the income growth of low-income earners. A mode beneficial to the poor will enable those people participating in economic activities to escape poverty in the shortest time. It will, however, be less helpful to those poor families with no labour capability. The roots of subsistence poverty cannot be eliminated unless a basic social security system, comprising social relief, is established. It is even more necessary to become aware that solving subsistence poverty is simply the first goal. Alleviating and eventually eliminating capability and developmental poverty is the ultimate goal, involving elevating the quality of the labour force and the potential capabilities of humans.

In today's China, where citizens are making concerted efforts to contribute to a harmonious society, the formulation of ambitious and effective antipoverty policies is of extraordinary significance.

A REVIEW OF CHINA'S POVERTY AND ANTI-POVERTY EFFORTS

Prior to 1949, China was an economically backward country, with an enormous population of people in poverty. At that time, China was among those countries registering the highest rates of poverty. The founding of the People's Republic of China provided an important political foundation for poverty alleviation. Over the past half century, China has achieved historic results in its anti-poverty efforts, although the story includes numerous twists and turns.

China's poverty before its reform and opening up

Before the People's Republic of China was founded in 1949, China had carried out rural land reform in some Liberation Zones. After the founding of the People's Republic of China, the country launched a nationwide land reform that ended the 2000+ years old feudal land system, thus boosting productivity in rural areas. On the basis of national economic recovery,

China started to implement the first 'Five-Year-Long National Development Programme' in 1953. In 1957, China's economy experienced a historic boom. while the size of the poor population in both rural and urban areas reached a record low.³ Nevertheless, the public ownership system, formed in the wake of the socialist transformation of ownership of the means of production in the mid 1950s, and the planned economic system established on its basis featuring a high degree of centralization, were not adapted to China's productivity level at that time. The country adopted a development mode that prioritized heavy industry, which, along with the burgeoning of people's communes and the 'Great Leap Forward' campaign, heavily jeopardized China's economic development. In the late 1950s and early 1960s, the country saw the yield of agricultural products drop sharply, peasants' incomes fell dramatically, the living standards of rural and urban residents declined markedly, and the rate of poverty rose steeply. Later, China made some adjustments to its economic system that enabled the national economy to regain steam. The rate of poverty began to fall to a level consistent with the stage of economic development at that time.

During the 10-year-long Cultural Revolution, the nominal growth of China's economy did not alleviate the roots of its poverty levels. Political movements exerted a negative impact on economic development, the population grew excessively fast, and hidebound economic and management systems gave rise to appalling wastage and low efficiency. Fast economic growth that was the result of immoderate accumulation did not benefit the multitudes in pragmatic terms. As some pertinent data indicate, the per capita income of rural residents from 1966 to 1977 was up by only RMB 18 yuan (Zhou Binbin 1991), which is less than half of the per capita income growth rate of peasants' income on average was less than 1.5 percent, while the per capita food intake of rural residents did not reach 2100 calories per day (ibid.). When measured by the nutrition yardstick, 40 percent to 50 percent of rural residents were in a state of subsistence poverty.

China's development and the evolution of anti-poverty efforts since reform and opening up

According to the National Bureau of Statistics of China, in 1978, shortly after China adopted a policy of reform and opening up, the size of the poor population in rural areas was 250 million, and the rate of poverty was up to 31 percent (using China's officially announced poverty line, which is on the low side).⁴ Measured by the rural poverty line, the size of the poor population in urban areas could have been deemed negligible.⁵ At that time, the Chinese Government focused its efforts on rural poverty, an inevitable task.

Since then, the country's anti-poverty campaign has evolved in three stages. The first stage featured a mode of poverty alleviation principally based on