Understanding Pensions

Martin Sullivan

Routledge International Studies in Money and Banking

Understanding Pensions

With birth rates falling at the same time that average age is rising in the developed world, the pensions time bomb is ticking more loudly than ever. Understanding how pensions work, their history and their future is absolutely essential.

This book thoroughly explains to readers the unique concepts and terminology which underpin pensions. It focuses first on the rationale for pensions and their evolution, before moving on to an explanation of the latest controversies regarding pensions. The glossary of pensions terminology in the final section of the book virtually ensures its place on many academic bookshelves.

This timely volume is an extremely useful contribution to this important issue. Of use to policy-makers as much as to students and academics of finance and public policy, *Understanding Pensions* should prove to be a popular addition to the literature.

Martin Sullivan is a Senior Lecturer in Economics, University of the West of England, Bristol, UK.

Routledge international studies in money and banking

- **1 Private Banking in Europe** *Lynn Bicker*
- 2 Bank Deregulation and Monetary Order George Selgin
- 3 Money in Islam A study in Islamic political economy Masudul Alam Choudhury
- 4 The Future of European Financial Centres Kirsten Bindemann

5 Payment Systems in Global Perspective

Maxwell J. Fry, Isaak Kilato, Sandra Roger, Krzysztof Senderowicz, David Sheppard, Francisco Solis and John Trundle

- 6 What is Money? John Smithin
- 7 Finance A characteristics approach Edited by David Blake
- 8 Organisational Change and Retail Finance An ethnographic perspective *Richard Harper, Dave Randall and Mark Rouncefield*
- **9** The History of the Bundesbank Lessons for the European Central Bank *Jakob de Haan*

10 The Euro

A challenge and opportunity for financial markets Published on behalf of *Société Universitaire Européenne de Recherches Financières (SUERF) Edited by Michael Artis, Axel Weber and Elizabeth Hennessy*

- **11 Central Banking in Eastern Europe** *Nigel Healey*
- **12 Money, Credit and Prices Stability** *Paul Dalziel*

13 Monetary Policy, Capital Flows and Exchange Rates Essays in memory of Maxwell Fry *Edited by William Allen and David Dickinson*

14 Adapting to Financial Globalisation

Published on behalf of Société Universitaire Européenne de Recherches Financières (SUERF) Edited by Morten Balling, Eduard H. Hochreiter and Elizabeth Hennessy

15 Monetary Macroeconomics

A new approach *Alvaro Cencini*

16 Monetary Stability in Europe Stefan Collignon

17 Technology and Finance

Challenges for financial markets, business strategies and policy makers Published on behalf of *Société Universitaire Européenne de Recherches Financières (SUERF) Edited by Morten Balling, Frank Lierman, and Andrew Mullineux*

18 Monetary Unions

Theory, history, public choice Edited by Forrest H Capie and Geoffrey E Wood

19 HRM and Occupational Health and Safety *Carol Boyd*

20 Central Banking Systems Compared

The ECB, the pre-euro Bundesbank and the federal reserve system *Emmanuel Apel*

21 A History of Monetary Unions

John Chown

22 Dollarization

Lessons from Europe and the Americas Edited by Louis-Philippe Rochon and Mario Seccareccia

23 Islamic Economics and Finance: A Glossary, 2nd Edition Muhammad Akram Khan

24 Financial Market Risk

Measurement and analysis *Cornelis A. Los*

25 Financial Geography A banker's view *Risto Laulaiainen*

26 Money Doctors

The experience of international financial advising 1850–2000 *Edited by Marc Flandreau*

27 Exchange Rate Dynamics

A new open economy macroeconomics perspective Edited by Jean-Oliver Hairault and Thepthida Sopraseuth

28 Fixing Financial Crises in the 21st Century

Edited by Andrew G. Haldane

29 Understanding Pensions

Martin Sullivan

Understanding Pensions

Martin Sullivan



First published 2004 by Routledge

Published 2014 by Routledge 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada by Routledge 711 Third Avenue, New York, NY, 10017, USA

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2004 Martin Sullivan

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data A catalog record for this book has been requested

ISBN 13: 978-0-415-27389-3 (hbk) ISBN 13: 978-0-415-40705-2 (pbk) For Kerstin

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

List of figures List of tables	xi xii
Acknowledgements List of abbreviations	xiii xiv
Introduction	1
PART 1 Pensions: principles and practice	3
 1.1 Pensions and pension schemes 5 1.2 Public pensions 9 1.3 Changes and challenges 16 1.4 Population ageing in Britain 21 1.5 Occupational pensions 24 1.6 Public sector pensions 31 1.7 Final salary woes 33 1.8 Individual pensions 38 1.9 Pensioners' incomes 43 	
PART 2 Pensions: issues and controversies	49
 2.1 Population ageing in perspective 51 2.2 Living and working for longer 58 2.3 Of Ponzi schemes and pension funds 64 2.4 Taxing funded private pensions 69 2.5 Annuities and annuitisation 74 2.6 The Maxwell affair 80 2.7 The perils of self-investment 83 	

x Contents

- 2.8 Solvency, accounting and occupational scheme closures 85
- 2.9 A pension benefit guarantee corporation for the UK 89
- 2.10 The personal pensions mis-selling scandal 92
- 2.11 The Equitable Life fiasco 94
- 2.12 Closing the pension savings gap 98
- 2.13 Simplifying pensions 105

PART 3 An A–Z of Pensions

References157Index161

111

Figures

1.1.1	People aged 65 and over as a proportion of the total	
	population in selected countries, 2000	5
1.1.2	Estimated shares of UK pensioner units' gross income	
	by source, 2001–2002	6
1.4.1	Projected change in the population share of people aged	
	60 and over, UK 2001–2051	21
1.4.2	Projected change in the support ratio, UK 2001-2051	22
1.4.3	Projected change in the old-age dependency ratio,	
	UK 2001–2051	22
1.7.1	FTSE-100 levels, January 2000 to October 2003	36
1.9.1	Proportion of all pensioners with some non-state	
	pension income, by source, 2001–2002	46
2.12.1	Increase in the MIG/BSP differential, £ per week,	
	over time	101

Tables

1.3.1 Projected change in the ratio of people aged 60 and over		
	to those aged 20–59 in selected countries, 2000–2025	18
1.3.2	Claimants of state pension age by key benefit type, 2000	20
1.4.1	Infant mortality rates, UK 1970–2000	23
1.5.1	Percentage of all workers covered by an occupational	
	pension scheme, 1953–1995	27
1.8.1	Number of stakeholder contracts sold in first year of	
	operation, by category of purchaser	42
1.9.1	Estimated median net income of pensioner units	
	(£ per week) by quintile of the net income distribution,	
	2001–2002	44
1.9.2	Estimated average net income (£ per week) of pensioner	
	units, 2001–2002	45
1.9.3	Estimated average net income (£ per week) of pensioner	
	units by age, 2001–2002	46
1.9.4	Estimated percentages of average single pensioner	
	incomes by age and source, 2001–2002	47
1.9.5	Percentage of pensioners with incomes below 60 per cent	
	of the median income, 1996–2002	47
2.1.1	Projected youth and total dependency ratios, 2001–2051	57
2.2.1	Economic inactivity rates (%), male and female, by age,	
	in May–July 2003	62
2.2.2	Percentage of all economically inactive people of	
	working age registered as long-term sick or disabled in	
	spring 2003	63
2.5.1	Declining real value of level annuity payments over a	
	30-year period with 2.5, 3 and 5 per cent inflation	75
2.5.2	Typical annuity rates, November 2003	76
2.12.1	Total annual savings gap (£ million) by age and household	
	income	99
2.12.2	Weekly retirement income generated by men and women	
	making stakeholder contributions of £81 per month until	100
	age 65, by age at which contributions commence	103

Acknowledgements

This book could not have been written without the help and support of numerous friends and colleagues. Thanks are especially due, however, to Kerstin, for her unswerving encouragement; Dru Esam, for her invaluable assistance with every aspect of the book's preparation; Peter Howells, for his helpful comments on the draft; and David Allen, whose spreadsheet skills are legendary and without whose help the graphical illustrations in the book would be much poorer. Any errors or defects the book might contain are, of course, the author's sole responsibility.

Abbreviations

ABI	Association of British Insurers
ABO	Accrued Benefit Obligation
ACA	Association of Consulting Actuaries
ACT	Advance Corporation Tax
AFPs	Asociaciones de Fondos de Pensiones
APP	Approved Personal Pension
ASB	Accounting Standards Board
AVCs	Additional Voluntary Contributions
BIM	Bishopsgate Investment Management
BSP	Basic State Pension
CARE	Career Average Revalued Earnings
CPF	Central Provident Fund
DB	Defined Benefit
DC	Defined Contribution
DRC	Delayed Retirement Credit
DSS	Department of Social Security
DTC	Dividend Tax Credit
DWP	Department for Work and Pensions
ERISA	Employee Retirement Income Security Act
EU	European Union
FASB	Financial Accounting Standards Board
FRS 17	Financial Reporting Standard 17
FSA	Financial Services Authority
FSAVCs	Free-Standing Additional Voluntary Contributions
GAD	Government Actuary's Department
GAR	Guaranteed Annuity Rate
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GMC	Guaranteed Minimum Contribution
GMP	Guaranteed Minimum Pension
GPPP	Group Personal Pension Plan
GPS	Graduated Pension Scheme
HRP	Home Responsibilities Protection
IBO	Indexed Benefit Obligation
	-

IRAs	Individual Retirement Accounts
LAUTRO	Life Assurance and Unit Trust Regulatory Organisation
LEL	Lower Earnings Limit
LPI	Limited Price Indexation
MCC	Maxwell Communications Corporation
MFR	Minimum Funding Requirement
MGN	Mirror Group Newspapers
MIG	Minimum Income Guarantee
MNT	Member Nominated Trustee
MWR	Married Women's Rate
NAPF	National Association of Pension Funds
NDC	Notional Defined Contribution
NI	National Insurance
NICs	National Insurance Contributions
OASDI	Old-Age, Survivors and Disability Insurance
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OMO	Open Market Option
OPB	Occupational Pensions Board
OPRA	Occupational Pensions Regulatory Authority
PAYG	Pay-As-You-Go
PBGC	Pension Benefit Guarantee Corporation
PBO	Projected Benefit Obligation
PCB	Pensions Compensation Board
PPF	Pension Protection Fund
PPP	Personal Pension Plan
PRF	Personal Retirement Fund
RPI	Retail Prices Index
S2P	State Second Pension
SAS	Self-Administered Scheme
SERPS	State Earnings-Related Pension Scheme
SFO	Serious Fraud Office
SGC	Superannuation Guarantee Charge
SIB	Securities and Investments Board
SIP	Statement of Investment Principles
SIPP	Self Invested Personal Pension
SMPI	Statutory Money Purchase Illustration
SPA	State Pension Age
SSAP	Statement of Standard Accounting Practice
SSAS	Small Self-Administered Scheme
SSB	Short Service Benefit
UEL	Upper Earnings Limit
UFPS	Unified Funded Pension Scheme

This page intentionally left blank

Introduction

Benjamin Franklin once famously remarked that there were two certainties in life, death and taxes. When Franklin made this observation, in the eighteenth century, most people died young. We should not be surprised, then, that he did not include living to a ripe old age in his list of life's certainties. Living to a great age is not a certainty today. For growing numbers of people, though, it is a distinct possibility. Children born in the year 2000 in France, Germany, the UK and the USA can, on average, expect to live for more than 77 years. Their Japanese counterparts have an average life expectancy of over 80 years. In Britain, the number of congratulatory messages the Queen sends each year to new centenarians has quadrupled since she was crowned in 1953. What is more, life expectancy is projected to go on rising in the coming decades.

Unlike longevity, the length of time people typically spend in paid employment has not been increasing. In fact, the opposite has happened. Since the 1970s, the average age at which people in Britain and many other developed countries cease working for a living has been falling steadily. In other words, there has been a significant increase in the proportion of peoples' lives spent in retirement. This has raised pensions to a level of importance never seen before. In the past, pensions were a means by which people insured against the unlikely event that they would become too old to support themselves by working. Today, pensions act more like retirement endowments, because most people can expect to stop working long before they die.

Pensions have long been the subject of fierce controversy. Although few would argue against the need for pensions, a debate has raged for more than a century over the most appropriate way to provide them. This is because pensions can be provided through a variety of mechanisms which differ in their advantages and disadvantages. The debate is not just about the pros and cons of one approach to pension provision compared with another, but about whether, and how, different approaches can be combined to produce an optimal retirement income system. Although the intensity of the debate has ebbed and flowed over time, it has never been stronger than it is at present.

2 Introduction

It is not the purpose of this book to enter directly into the current debate about pensions. Rather, it aims to shed light on the issues being debated by providing a clear and accessible guide to the unique language and concepts of pensions. It is intended to be a source of information and analysis which will be of interest to academics, students, pension industry practitioners, journalists and those with a general interest in the subject of pensions. Information is presented on the pension arrangements in various countries, including Australia, Britain, Germany, Italy and the United States. The constraints of time and space, however, make a comprehensive analysis of different national pension systems impracticable. The British pension system is described and analysed in the greatest depth. There are two reasons for this. First, Britain is the country whose pension arrangements the author knows most about. Second, lessons can be learned from Britain's recent pensions experience which have relevance for other countries.

The book is organised into three distinct parts. Part 1, Pensions: Principles and Practice, considers the rationale for pension provision, describes the evolution of public and private pensions and explores the ways in which pensioners' incomes have changed over time. It also outlines the perceived demographic challenges to public pension schemes and considers different national responses to these challenges. Part 2, Pensions: Issues and Controversies, provides analysis of a range of contemporary issues in the areas of public and private pension provision. Uncertainty is a major theme in the analysis of these issues. Section 2.1, for example, highlights the speculative nature of population projections and casts doubt on the argument that public pension schemes will ultimately be blown apart by a 'demographic time bomb'. Other important themes running through the analysis in Part 2 are paternalism, choice, fairness and the role of regulation. Finally, Part 3 consists of an extensive glossary of pensions and related terminology.