

International Child Law

Trevor Buck

Routledge · Cavendish
Taylor & Francis Group

INTERNATIONAL CHILD LAW



INTERNATIONAL CHILD LAW

Trevor Buck

Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Law, University of Leicester



First published in Great Britain 2005 by Cavendish Publishing

Transferred to digital printing 2007 by Routledge-Cavendish 2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN

Simultaneously published in the USA and Canada by Routledge-Cavendish 52 Vanderbilt Avenue, New York, NY 10016

Routledge-Cavendish is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© Buck, Trevor 2005

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, scanning or otherwise, without the prior permission in writing of Routledge Cavendish Publishing Limited, or as expressly permitted by law, or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department, Routledge Cavendish Publishing Limited, at the address above.

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover and you must impose the same condition on any acquirer.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data International Child Law 1 Children (International law) 2 Children – Legal status, laws, etc I Title 346'.0135

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data Data available

> ISBN 1-85941-948-8 ISBN 978-1-859-41948-9

Publisher's Note

The publisher has gone to great lengths to ensure the quality of this reprint but points out that some imperfections in the original may be apparent





PREFACE & ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The aim of this book has been to provide the reader with an accessible introduction to International Child Law, a subject that spans both traditional areas of private international law and public international law. There is also some critical commentary in each chapter and hopefully sufficient 'further reading' and 'Internet resources' material at the end of each chapter for the reader to be able to pursue specialist topics in greater depth. There has been an increasing number of international instruments, both at the global and regional level, that impact on children's lives. Children's issues have taken on greater importance in the policy agendas of many states. A greater focus on, and concern for, our children is literally an investment in the future that governments must not ignore.

Chapter 1 of the book provides some context for the reader on the concepts of 'childhood' and 'children's rights' from a number of disciplinary perspectives. Chapter 2 provides a brief account of the relevant international institutions and sources of international law for those unfamiliar with this territory. Chapter 3 outlines the structure and importance of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, arguably now the 'gold standard' of international child law. Chapter 4 analyses the problem of child labour and its international regulation. Chapter 5 discusses the emerging framework of European law relating to children's issues in Europe. Chapter 6 focuses on international parental abduction and the operation of the relevant Hague Convention. Chapter 7 addresses the problem of intercountry adoption and its international control by means of another Hague Convention. Finally, some concluding remarks on the state of the world's children are offered in Chapter 8. The main international legal instruments and some other material is included in the Appendices that correlate broadly to the subject matter of each of the first seven Chapters.

The book does not pretend to offer complete or comprehensive coverage of what has become a significant area of interdisciplinary study. The coverage, of necessity, has to be selective, though there are a number of cross-references between the various chapters to guide the reader through the material. To some extent, the shape of the book has followed the interests of my postgraduate students to whom I have taught International Child Law for the past nine years. However, I would be interested to hear from those of you who have enjoyed reading this book, and any suggestions you may have to improve or add further contents in any future edition.

My acknowledgments must go to my colleagues Dr Aileen Kavanagh and Professor Robin White for reading and commenting on certain sections of the book, but of course any remaining inaccuracies in the text are all mine. Thanks are also due to Jane Sowler who provided assistance with proof reading. Finally, my thanks also to all my past and present students of International Child Law.

Trevor Buck Faculty of Law University of Leicester 29 March 2005



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Pro	face & A	Acknozul	edoments	vii
Preface & Acknowledgments Table of Cases				
Table of International Legislation				
			xxix	
1	CHILI	DHOO	D AND CHILDREN'S RIGHTS	1
	1.1	Child	hood	1
		1.1.1	Historical perspectives	1
		1.1.2	Psychological perspectives	3
		1.1.3		5
		1.1.4	Social policy perspectives	8
	1.2	Huma	an rights	10
		1.2.1	Children's rights	12
		1.2.2	International children's rights	17
	Furthe	r readii	<u> </u>	18
	Intern	et resou	urces	19
2	INTRODUCTION TO INTERNATIONAL LAW SOURCES			
	AND INSTITUTIONS			21
	2.1	Introd	luction	21
	2.2	Sourc	es of international law	21
		2.2.1	International treaties and conventions	22
		2.2.2	International customary law	24
		2.2.3	General principles of international law	25
		2.2.4	Judicial decisions and publicists' writings	26
		2.2.5	Hierarchy of sources and jus cogens	27
	2.3	Relationship between municipal (domestic) and international law		27
	2.4			29
		2.4.1	United Nations	29
		2.4.2	Hague Conference on Private International Law	36
	2.5	Huma	an rights protection	37
		2.5.1	Global protection – UN machinery	37
		2.5.2	Regional protection	42
	Further reading			45
	Intern	et resou	arces	45
3	UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD			47
	3.1	Introduction		47
	3.2	Background and history		
	3.3	3.3 The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child		49
		3.3.1	The Committee on the Rights of the Child	49
		3.3.2	The reporting process	50

4

3.4	The C	CRC in action	54
	3.4.1	General measures of implementation: Arts 4, 42 and 44(6)	54
	3.4.2	Definition of the child: Art 1	57
	3.4.3	General principles: Arts 2, 3, 6 and 12	58
	3.4.4	Civil rights and freedoms: Arts 7, 8, 13–17 and 37(a)	61
	3.4.5	Family environment and alternative care: Arts 5, 18 (1)(2), 9–11, 19–21, 25, 27(4) and 39	64
	3.4.6	Basic health and welfare: Arts 6, 18(3), 23, 24, 26, 27(1)(2) and (3)	66
	3.4.7	Education, leisure and cultural activities: Arts 28, 29 and 31	68
	3.4.8	Special protection measures: Arts 32–36, 37(b)(c)(d), 38, 39 and 40	<i>7</i> 0
3.5	The C	Optional Protocols	73
	3.5.1	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict (OPAC)	73
	3.5.2	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography (OPSA)	76
3.6	Failu	re of the United States to ratify	77
3.7		ıral relativism	78
3.8	The C	CRC, international customary law and jus cogens	79
3.9		lusion	79
Furth	er readi	ng	79
Inter	net resou	irces	83
CHII	D LAB	OUR	85
4.1	The p	henomenon of child labour	85
4.2	_	nagnitude and nature of the problem	87
4.3		istory of legal protection of child labour	91
	4.3.1	The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and child labour	93
4.4		nation of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (1999): Convention No 182	95
	4.4.1	The duties under the Worst Forms of	
		Child Labour Convention	95
	4.4.2	ILO: reporting and complaints procedures	100
4.5		egal framework for international action	104
Furth	er readi	ng	105
Internet resources 10			

5	THE	CHILD	IN EUROPE	107
	5.1	Introd	duction: regional protection in Europe	107
	5.2		cil of Europe	107
		5.2.1	The European Conventions	110
		5.2.2	The European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1950)	110
		5.2.3	European Social Charter 1961 (revised 1996)	119
		5.2.4	European Convention on the Adoption of Children (1967)	122
		5.2.5	European Convention on the Legal Status of Children Born out of Wedlock (1975)	122
		5.2.6	European Convention on Recognition and Enforcement of Decisions Concerning Custody of Children and on Restoration of Custody of Children (1980)	123
		5.2.7	European Convention on the Exercise of Children's Rights (1996)	124
		5.2.8	Convention on Cybercrime (2001)	125
		5.2.9	Convention on Contact Concerning Children (2003)	125
	5.3	Europ	pean Union (EU)	127
		5.3.1	EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	128
	5.4	Concl	lusions	129
	Furthe	er readii	ng	129
	Intern	et resou	irces	130
6	INTE	RNATI	ONAL CHILD ABDUCTION	131
	6.1	The p	henomenon of international child abduction	131
	6.2	Introd	luction to the international legal instruments	132
	6.3	of De	pean Convention on Recognition and Enforcement cisions Concerning Custody of Children and on	124
	6.4		ration of Custody of Children (1980) e Convention on the Civil Aspects of	134
	0.4		national Child Abduction (1980)	134
		6.4.1	Wrongful removal or retention	136
		6.4.2	The duty to make a return order	140
		6.4.3	The 'proviso' to the underlying duty to make a return order	140
		6.4.4	The Article 13 'defences'	141
		6.4.5	Exercising discretion	144
	6.5	Deve	lopments in European Union law	145
	6.6	Concl	luding comments	147
		6.6.1	Non-convention countries	147
		6.6.2	Developments in child law	148
	Furthe	er readii	ng	150
	Intern	et resou	arces	150

7	INTE	RCOUN	NTRY ADOPTION	151
	7.1	The p	henomenon of intercountry adoption	151
		7.1.1	Romania	151
		7.1.2	The Russian Federation	152
		7.1.3	China	153
		7.1.4	The Republic of Korea	153
		7.1.5	The receiving countries	154
	7.2 The need for international legal regulation		155	
	7.3	The H	Hague Convention on Intercountry Adoption	156
		7.3.1	The Preamble to the Convention	157
		7.3.2	The scope of the Convention	157
		7.3.3	Requirements for intercountry adoptions	158
		7.3.4	Central authorities and accredited bodies	159
		7.3.5	Procedural requirements in intercountry adoption	160
		7.3.6	Recognition and effects of the adoption	161
		7.3.7	General provisions	163
		7.3.8	Final clauses	164
	7.4	Incor	poration in the United Kingdom	164
		7.4.1	Policy issues	166
	Further reading		169	
	Internet resources		170	
8	CON	CLUDII	NG REMARKS	173
	Furth	er readi	ng	176
	Internet resources		177	
Ge	neral B	ibliograpi	hy	179
	Index 3			

CONTENTS OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX 1 CHILDREN'S RIGHTS AND CHILDHOOD	189
Universal Declaration on Human Rights 1948 (extracts)	189
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1966 (extracts)	190
ICCPR General Comment No 17: Rights of the child (Art 24): 07/04/89	191
ICCPR General Comment No 19: Protection of the family, the right to marriage and equality of the spouses (Art 23): 27/07/90	193
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966) (extracts)	195
APPENDIX 2 INTRODUCTION TO INTERNATIONAL LAW SOURCES AND INSTITUTION	197
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1969) (extracts)	197
Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action (1993) (extract)	198
African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child (1999) (full text)	198
Resolution Adopted by the General Assembly: 'A World Fit for Children' (2002) (extract)	213
APPENDIX 3 UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION	
ON THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD	217
Declaration of the Rights of the Child 1924 (full text)	217
Declaration of the Rights of the Child 1959 (full text)	217
The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989 (full text)	219
General Comments: Committee on the Rights of the Child (extract)	236
Recommendations/Decisions: Committee on the Rights of the Child (extract)	242
Days of General Discussion: Committee on the Rights of the Child (extract)	244
International Conference on Combating Child Pornography on the Internet (1999) (conclusions and recommendations)	249
Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflicts (2000) (full text)	251
Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and	
child pornography (2000) (full text)	256
Security Council Resolution 1539 (2003) (full text)	263
APPENDIX 4 CHILD LABOUR	267
The 'Philadelphia Declaration' (1944) (full text)	267
C138 Minimum Age Convention (1973) (full text)	269
ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work (1998) (full text)	275
C182 Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (1999) (full text)	278
R190 Worst Forms of Child Labour Recommendation (1999) (full text)	282

APPENDIX 5 THE CHILD IN EUROPE	287
Social Charter (1996 Revised Version) (extracts)	287
European Union Charter of Fundamental Rights 2000 (extracts)	289
European Convention on Cybercrime (2001) (extract)	290
(Draft) European Constitution (June 2004) (extracts)	290
APPENDIX 6 INTERNATIONAL CHILD ABDUCTION	293
The Hague Convention on the Civil Aspects of International	
Child Abduction (1980) (full text)	293
APPENDIX 7 INTERCOUNTRY ADOPTION	303
The Hague Convention on Protection of Children and Co-operation	
in Respect of Intercountry Adoption (1993) (full text)	303
Recommendation Concerning Refugee Children (1994) (full text)	313

TABLE OF CASES

A v UK (1999) 27 EHRR 611	
Airey v Ireland (1979) 2 EHRR 305	114
Andersson v Sweden (1992) 14 EHRR 615	
AQ v JQ Outer House of the Court of Session (Scotland) 12 December 2001, HC/E/UK 415	
Autisme-Europe v France, Complaint No 13/2002	
B (Abduction: Retention of Orphan Belarussian), Re [2001] Fam Law 90	148
B (Minor) (Abduction), Re [1994] 2 FLR 249	138
B v France (1992) 16 EHRR 1	
B v UK (1987) 10 EHRR 74	
Barry Eldon Matthews (Commissioner, Western Australia Police Service) v Ziba Sabaghian (2001) HC/E/AU 345	142
(Family Court of Western Australia at Perth)	
boyle V UK (1994) 19 EHKR 1/9	
C (Minors) (Abduction: Grave Risk of Psychological Harm), Re [1999] 1 FLR 1145	143
C v S (Minor: Abduction: Illegitimate Child) [1990] 2 All ER 961	137, 139
Corbett v Corbett [1970] 2 All ER 33	
Cossey v UK (1990) 13 EHRR 622	
D (Abduction: Discretionary Return), Re [2000] 1 FLR 24	144
DP v Commonwealth Central Authority; JLM v Director-General NSW Department of Community Services (2001) HCA 39 (High Court of Australia)	142
De directie Preventie, optredend voor zichzelf en namens Y (de vader/the father) against X (de moeder/the mother)	
(7 February 2001, ELRO nr AA9851 Zaaknr: 813–H–00)	
Director-General, Department of Families, Youth and Community	
Care v Rhonda May Bennett [2000] Fam CA 253	
Dudgeon v UK (1981) 4 EHRR 149	
Eriksson v Sweden (1989) 12 EHRR 183	
F (Minor: Abduction: Jurisdiction), Re [1990] 3 All ER 97	147
Garland v British Rail Engineering Ltd [1983] 2 AC 751	29
Gaskin v UK (1990) 12 EHRR 36	
Gault, Re 387 US 1 (1967)	
Ghaidon v Godin-Mendoza [2004] 2 AC 557	
Gil v Rodriguez (2002) 184 F Supp 2d 1221 (MD Fla 2002)	

Gillick v West Norfolk and Wisbech Area Health Authority and Another [1986] AC 112; [1985] 3 WLR 830
Glaser v UK (2001) 33 EHRR 1
Goodwin v UK (2002) 35 EHRR 18
Guardianship Case See Netherlands v Sweden
H (A Minor) (Abduction: Rights of Custody), Re [2002] 2 AC 291
H (Abduction Acquiescence), Re [1998] AC 72
H (Abduction: Child of 16), Re [2000] 2 FLR 51
H v UK (1987) 10 EHRR 74
HB (Abduction: Child's Objections) (No 2), Re [1998] 1 FLR 564
H(MS) v H(L) (2000) 3 IR 390 (Ireland)
Hokkanen v Finland (1994) 19 EHRR 139
Horsham See Sheffield and Horsham v UK
I (Abduction Acquiescence), Re [1999] 1 FLR 778
I v UK (2003) 36 EHRR 53
International Commission of Jurists v Portugal, Decision on the Merits, Complaint No 1/1998, para 28, ECSR
International Federation for Human Rights (IFHR) v France, Complaint No 14/2003
JA (Child Abduction: Non-Convention Country), Re [1998] 1 FLR 231
JS Private International Adoption, Re [2000] 2 FLR 638
Janine Claire Genish-Grant v Director-General Department of Community Services [2002] Fam CA 346
Johansen v Norway (1996) 23 EHRR 33
K (Abduction: Consent), Re [1997] 2 FLR 212
K v Finland [2001] 2 FLR 707
Keegan v Ireland (1994) 18 EHRR 342
Kroon v Netherlands (1994) 19 EHRR 263
L (A Child) (Abduction: Child's Objections to Return), Re [2002] 1 WLR 3208 \dots
Ludin v State of Baden-Wuerttemberg [2003] 2 BVR 1436/02
M (Abduction: Intolerable Situation), Re [2000] 1 FLR 930
M v K (2000) (Iceland) HC/E/IS 363
MB v UK (1994) App No 22920/93, 77–A DR 108
McMichael v UK (1995) 20 EHRR 205
Malone v UK (1985) 7 EHRR 14

World Organisation against Torture v Belgium, Complaint No 21/2003	121
World Organisation against Torture v Greece, Complaint No 17/2003	121
World Organisation against Torture v Ireland, Complaint No 18/2003	121
World Organisation against Torture v Italy, Complaint No 19/2003	121
World Organisation against Torture v Portugal, Complaint No 20/2003	121
X (Stichting Bureau Jeugdzorg (BJA)) v Y (the Mother) (2000) (ELRO nr AA5523 Zaaknr: R99/111HR) (High Court of Netherlands)	.139
X (the mother) against De Directie Preventie, en Namens Y (the father) (2000) (14 April 2000, ELRO nr AA 5524, Zaaksnr: R99/076HR)	.143
X and Y v Netherlands (1985) 8 EHRR 235	.116
X, Y and Z v UK (1997) 24 EHRR 143	.117
Z v Finland (1997) 25 EHRR 371	.116

TABLE OF INTERNATIONAL LEGISLATION

Abolition of Forced Labour Convention 1957 (ILO Convention No 105)	95
Access to Health Records Act 1990	
Access to Personal Files Act 1987	
Access to Social Services Records Act 1990	
Adoption Act 1968	
Adoption Act 1976	
Adoption (Intercountry Aspects) Act 1999	
ss 1, 2	
Adoption and Children Act 2002 s 144(4)	165, 166
African (Banjul) Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights 1981 (Nairobi) Arts 3–62	
African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights 1998, Protocol	
Arts 2, 4(1), 5	
Arts 14(2), 34(3)	
African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child	
Arts 11(4), 12, 26	
Arts 44, 45, 47(3)	
Agriculture Convention 1921 (ILO)	
Amsterdam Treaty 1997 Arts 13, 29	
American Convention on Human Rights 1969	
(Pact of San Jose, Costa Rica)	
Asian Human Rights Charter: A Peoples' Charter 1998 (Kwangju, South Korea)	
(),	
Bill of Rights 1689	10
Bill of Rights (US)	
Birth and Death Registration Act 1998 (Botswana)	62
Brussels II See Council Regulation (EC) No 1347/2000	
Brussels IIA See Council Regulation (EC) No 2201/2003	
Charter to Human Rights, UN	
Preamble	
Art 2(2)	
Art 51	
Art 68	
Child Abduction Act 1984—	4
s 1(1)	
United Addition and Custody Act 1985	

Child Marriage Restraint Act 1929 (India)58
Children Act 1989
s 1
s 4
Children Act 2004
Children's Act for Responsible Employment 2001 (US)—
s 868
Civil Partnership Act 2004
Committee on the Rights of the Child – Recommendation No 2 1999, UN
Constitution of the United States of America 1787—
Art VI, cl 2
14th Amendment
Constitutive Act of the African Union 2000
Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and
Degrading Treatment or Punishment 1984
Convention on Contact Concerning Children 2003
See European Convention on Contact Concerning Children 2003
Convention on Cybercrime 2001
See European Convention on Cybercrime 2001
Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of
Discrimination against Women 1979
Convention on the Elimination of All forms of Racial Discrimination 1965
Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide 194837
Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons 1954 (Canada)
Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989
23, 25, 27, 28, 37, 39,
41, 42, 44, 45, 47–50,
53, 54, 56–62, 69–71,
73, 75–80, 86, 87,
92–95, 99, 113, 124,
126, 128, 129, 154,
155, 158, 167, 173–76
Art 1
Art 2
Art 3
Art 4
Art 5
Art 6(2)
Arts 7, 8
Art 9
Art 9(3)
Art 10
Art 10(2)
Art 11
Art 11(2)
Art 12

Art 13	
Art 14	
Art 15	•
Art 16	
Art 17	•
Art 18(1) and (2)	
Art 18(3)	
Art 19	
Art 20	•
Art 20(3)	
Art 21	
Art 21(b)	
Art 21(d)	
Art 21(3)	
Art 22	
Art 23	,
Art 24	
Art 25	
Art 26	• •
Art 27	
Art 27(1)–(3)	
Art 27(4)	
Arts 28, 29	•
Art 29(1)	
Art 29(1)(a)	
Art 31	
Art 32	•
Art 32(2)	
Art 33	
Art 34	
Art 35	
Art 36	
Art 37	•
Art 37(a)	•
Art 37(b)	•
Art 37(c)	
Art 37(d)	
Art 37(1)	
Art 38	
Art 39	
Art 40	
Art 42	·
Arts 43–45	•
Art 43	
Art 43(8), (11)	
Art 44	
Art 44(5)	
Art 44(6)	
Art 45(a), (d)	•
Art 49	
A.: 40/1\	40

Art 5050, 7	73
Art 51	
Art 51(2)	
Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989,	
Optional Protocol on the involvement of	
children in armed conflict 2000	
70, 73–75, 17	
Arts 1, 2	
Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989,	
Optional Protocol on the sale of children,	
child prostitution and child pornography 2000	7,
72, 76, 77, 17	74
Arts 2, 3, 5, 6, 10	77
Council Regulation (EC) No 1347/2000, (Brussels II) on jurisdiction	
and the recognition and enforcement of judgements in	
matrimonial matters and in matters of parental responsibility	
for children of both spouses, OJ L160/19/29 May 2000	
Art 1, (a)	
Arts 4, 37	
Council Regulation (EC) No 44/2001 in matters relating to maintenance (COM (2002) 222 final – OJ C203, 27 August 2002)	
Council Regulation (EC) No 2201/2003 (Brussels IIA)	
Coulch regulation (De) 110 2201, 2000 (Blussels III)	10
Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work 1998 (ILO)85, 95, 9	97
Art 3	
Annex, para III	
Declaration of Independence 1776 (US)	10
Declaration of Philadelphia 1944	
Declaration of the Rights of the Child 1924 (League of Nations)	
Declaration of the Rights of the Child 1959	
Principle 2	
Principle 3	
Principle 7	59
Declaration of the Rights of Man and of Citizens 1788 (France)	11
Declaration on the Survival, Protection and Development of Children 1990	19
Disabled Persons Policy Act 1975 (France)	21
Discrimination (Employment and Occupation)	
Convention 1958 ILO Convention No 111	€
EC Directive on the protection of young people at	
work and on the organisation of working time	94
Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour	
Convention 1999 ILO Convention No 182	

Art 1	
Art 2	
Art 3	
Art 3(a)–(c)	
Art 3(d)	
Art 4	
Art 4(3)	
Art 4(3)	
Art 5 .96,	
Art 6	
Art 6(1)	
Art 7(1)	
Art 7(2)	
Art 7(2)(a)–(e)	
Art 8	
Equal Remuneration Convention 1951 ILO Convention No 100	
European Charter of Fundamental Rights 2000	
Arts 7, 9	
Art 14	
Art 32	
,	
European Convention on Contact Concerning Children 2003	
Arts 19, 20	
European Convention on Cybercrime 2001	
Arts 7–10	25
European Convention on Recognition and Enforcement	
of Decisions Concerning Custody of Children and	
on Restoration of Custody of Children 1980	35
Art 8	
Arts 8(1), 9, 10, 17	23
European Convention on the Adoption of Children 1967	58
Art 8(1)	
European Convention on the Exercise of Children's Rights 1996109, 110, 124, 1	29
Arts 1(4), 3–5, 16–19	
European Convention on the Legal Status of Children	
Born out of Wedlock 1975	22
European Convention on the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 1950 (Rome)	77
109–17, 119, 126, 127, 1	
Art 2	
Art 3	
Art 5	-
Art 6	
Art 8	
Art 8(2)	
Art 10	
Art 12	
Art 14	

European Social Charter 1961	121
Art 7	
Art 7(1)	
Art 12	
Art 13	
Art 16	119
Art 17	•
Arts 19, 20	
Arts 24, 25	120
European Social Charter 1961, Additional Protocol Providing for a System of Collective Complaints, ETS No 158 1995	
European Social Charter 1996 (revised), ETS no 163	
Arts 15(1), 17(1)	
Art 20, Part V, Art E	
Fair Labour Standards Act 1938 (US)	
Family Law Act 1986	
Fishermen Convention 1959 (ILO)	
Forced Labour Convention 1930 ILO Convention No 29	
Art 29	
Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to	
Organise Convention 1948 ILO Convention No 87	95, 97
Gender Recognition Act 2004	
Geneva Conventions 1949	
Geneva Conventions 1747	
Hague Convention Concerning the Powers of Authorities and	
the Law Applicable in respect of the Protection of Infants 1961	33 123
Hague Convention on Civil Aspects of International	
Child Abduction 1980	23 37 123 126 131_35
	138–42, 145–49, 155, 160
Arts 1, 2	
Art 3	
Art 3(a)	
Art 4	
Art 5(a)	136
Art 6	
Art 7(a)	
Art 8	
Art 11	
Art 12(1)	
Art 12(2)	
Art 13	, , ,
Art 13(1)(a)	,
Arts 13(1)(b), 16	
• • • •	

Art 18	
Art 19	140
Art 20	144, 145
Art 21	
Art 36	140
Hague Convention on Guardianship 1902	
Hague Convention on Jurisdiction, Applicable Law, Recognition,	
Enforcement and Co-operation in Respect of Parental	
Responsibility and Measures for the Protection of Children 1996	37
- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Hague Convention on Jurisdiction, Applicable Law and	00 155 174
Recognition of Decrees Relating to Adoptions 1965	
Art 19	
Hague Convention on Protection of Children and	
Co-operation in respect of Intercountry Adoption 1993	
	126, 152, 154–68
Preamble, paras 1–5	
Art 1	
Art 1(c)	
Art 2	
Art 3	
Art 4	,
Art 4(a)–(c)	
Art 4(c) and (d)	
Art 5	
Art 5(a)	
Arts 6–9	
Art 6(2)	
Art 14–16	
Art 17	,
Art 17 Art 17(c)	·
Arts 18–21	
Art 18	
Art 19(1)	
Arts 19(1)	
Art 22	
Art 23	•
Art 23(1)	,
Arts 24, 25	
Art 26	
Art 26(2)	
Art 27	
Arts 28–30, 32	
Art 32(2)	
Art 35	
Arts 36–40	,
Art 39(2)	
Art 42–48	
Ch II	
Human Rights Act 2004 (ACT)	

Human Rights Act 1998	11, 28, 56, 110, 111, 113, 145
s 2s 6	
Industry Convention 1919 (ILO)	91–94, 97
Industry Convention 1937 (ILO)	91–94, 97
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1966	11, 12, 17, 32, 37, 40, 43, 49, 60, 73
Arts 6(5), 10(3), 17	
Arts 23(4), 24	
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 1966	
Pt IV	
Arts 12, 13	
International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families 1990, Optional Protocol – Involvement of Children in Armed Conflict 2000	
International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families 1990, Optional Protocol – Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography 2000	37
Magna Carta 1215	10
Minimum Age Convention 1973 ILO Convention No 138	
Art 2	93
Art 3	
Art 3(1)	
Art 4	
Arts 5, 6, 7(4)	
Non Industrial Employment Convention 1932 (ILO)	91–94, 97
Non Industrial Employment Convention 1937 (ILO)	
Organisation for African Unity Charter 1963	43
Plan of Action for Implementing the Declaration (on the Survival, Protection and Development of Children) in the 1990s	49

Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention 1949 ILO Convention No 98	95
Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court 2002	
Sea Convention 1920 (ILO)	91–94, 97
Sea Convention 1936 (ILO)	
Security Council Resolution 1379/2001	
Security Council Resolution 1460/2003	
Statute of the Hague Conference on Private International Law 1951	
Statute of the Hague Convention on Private International Law 1955 Art 1	
Statute of the International Court of Justice 1945 Art 38 Art 59	
Statute of the International Law Commission 1947	
Stockholm Declaration (Programme of Action for the Prevention of the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography)	
Stockholm Declaration – Agenda For Action	
Three Mile Territorial Sea Rule	25
Treaty of Maastricht 1992— Art 6(2)	127
Treaty of Versailles 1919	
Trimmers and Stokers Convention 1921 (ILO)	
Twelve Mile Territorial Sea Rule	
Underground Workers Convention 1965 (ILO)	
Universal Declaration of Human Rights 1948	12, 17, 32, 37, 38, 43, 48, 49, 110
Arts 1, 12	
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 1969 Art 18 Art 19 Art 19(c) Arts 31–32	
Art 53	27
Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action 1993	37

International Child L	aw
-----------------------	----

	•	٠	٠
VVI	71	1	1

World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children 1996 (Stockholm)	5
World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children 2001 (Yokohama)	ó
Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention 1999 See Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention 1999	

ABBREVIATIONS

African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	Banjul Charter
African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child	ACRWC
Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Committee	ESCRC
European Committee of Social Rights	ECSR
European Convention on Human Rights	ECHR
European Convention on the Exercise of Children's Rights	ECECR
European Court of Human Rights	ECtHR
European Court of Justice	ECJ
European Union	EU
International Court of Justice	ICJ
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	ICCPR
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	ICESCR
International Confederation of Free Trade Unions	ICFTU
International Labour Organisation	ILO
International Law Commission	ILC
International Monetary Fund	IMF
International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour	IPEC
Millennium Development Goals	MDG
Non-Government Organisation	NGO
Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights	OHCHR
Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflicts	OPAC
Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography	OPSA
Organisation for African Unity	OAU
Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe	OSCE
Time-Bound Programme	TBP
UN Commission on Human Rights	UNCHR
UN Convention on the Rights of the Child	CRC
UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation	UNESCO
UN Population Fund	UNFPA
United Nations Children's Fund	UNICEF
United Nations	UN
World Health Organisation	WHO



CHAPTER 1

CHILDHOOD AND CHILDREN'S RIGHTS

The international law relating to children is best understood by considering at the outset what we mean when we talk about 'childhood' and 'children's rights'. At first sight, these two concepts seem straightforward, but on closer examination they turn out to be quite contestable notions. 'Childhood' assumes some kind of understanding of what it means to be a child and, by implication, an adult. 'Children's rights' assumes a background framework of knowledge about 'human rights' of which children's rights can be considered a part. In short, the way in which we perceive childhood and children's rights will have a highly significant bearing on how we view international child law and the international community's approach to legal regulation and standard setting. This chapter seeks to introduce the reader to these two important concepts.

1.1 CHILDHOOD

The following sections include a brief overview of the historical, psychological, sociological and social policy perspectives on childhood. The study of childhood has become a truly multi-disciplinary activity. Indeed, there are now a number of research centres dedicated to the study of childhood, see the 'Internet Resources' at the end of this chapter.

1.1.1 Historical perspectives

Ariès's (1962) work is the classic historical study of the notion of childhood and his analysis is often referred to in the literature as simply the 'Ariès thesis'. Ariès examined the iconography in art and literature over several centuries to identify an emerging 'discovery of childhood'. He suggested that in mediaeval society the concept of childhood simply did not exist at all. He argued that infants below seven years old were recognised as physically vulnerable, but their parents were largely indifferent to them, probably due to the high levels of infant mortality. After seven years of age, the child was simply regarded as another (smaller) adult. By contrast, from about the 15th to the 17th centuries, Ariès suggested a transition had occurred in the prevalent notion of childhood: the child was perceived as a significant family member to be nurtured and protected. Ariès reinforced his views by pointing to the historical development of education for the young, and the establishment of the 'child' as a central figure in the appearance of the 'family', itself a newly developing institution emerging over the centuries. Subsequent commentators have questioned Ariès's thesis and methodology, and indeed some of his conclusions do not appear to be sufficiently supported by the evidence.

Archard (1993) has provided a carefully crafted deconstruction of Ariès's influential thesis. He points not only to its weak evidential basis but also to Ariès's 'predisposition to interpret the past in the light of present-day attitudes, assumptions and concerns'. Furthermore, he argues that Ariès subscribes (wrongly) to an historical understanding of 'modernity' as a linear progression to moral enlightenment. Instead, Archard argues, one can employ a distinction between a 'concept' and a 'conception' to better analyse Ariès's thesis. The argument, in brief, is that to have a *concept* of childhood is to recognise that

there is a distinction between children and adults. To have a *conception* of childhood is a specification of what are the distinguishing attributes. Archard concludes that all societies at all times have had a *concept* of childhood, but there have been a number of different *conceptions*. Historically, we cannot be confident about the reliability of our knowledge in relation to these conceptions. He therefore concludes that Ariès's thesis is flawed by what he refers to as an 'ill judged leap' from 'concept' to 'conception'.

Archard also provides an interesting conceptual framework to accommodate the examination of different 'conceptions' of childhood. He introduces three elements to the notion of childhood: its 'boundaries', 'dimensions' and 'divisions'. He defines the 'boundary' for childhood as the point at which it ends. He argues that any particular society's 'conception' of this boundary may be different according to its culture. Conceptions of childhood frequently locate the relevant boundary in relation to cultural 'rites of passage or initiation ceremonies which celebrate the end of childhood and beginning of adulthood'. According to Archard, '[t]hese are likely to be associated with permission to marry, departure from the parental home or assumption of the responsibility to provide for oneself'.

Conceptions of childhood may also differ according to their 'dimensions'. Archard suggests that a number of perspectives would render a distinction between children and adults, for example, moral, juridical, philosophical and political. Each society will have its own particular value system that may at any one time favour one or more of these perspectives. Sometimes a society sets the legal age of majority according to a view about one or more of these dimensions. A majority age need not necessarily be consistent with the 'boundary' implied by other dimensions. By way of illustration of this point, Archard points to the origins (in Europe) of the age of majority, which was fixed in the Middle Ages by the capacity of a young boy to bear arms and changed as armour became increasingly heavier and thus demanded greater strength to wear it. If, however, rationality is the key dimension, then the acquisition of reason is a better test of majority age. Similarly, in societies that focus on the overriding importance of sustaining and reproducing life, 'the ability to work and bear offspring is a strikingly obvious mark of maturity'.

Finally, Archard argues that conceptions of childhood will also depend on how its 'divisions' are ordered and managed. In most societies, there are a number of subcategories between birth and adulthood. Most cultures recognise a period of very early infancy where the child is particularly vulnerable and deserving of adult care; a point which is consistent with the findings of developmental psychology outlined below. Some cultures attach importance to weaning, the point at which close maternal care ends. Some societies put particular significance on the point at which a child acquires speech. Roman law specified three age periods of childhood: *infantia* (child incapable of speech); *tutela impuberes* (pre-pubescent child requiring a tutor) and *cura minores* (post-pubescent young person requiring the care of a guardian prior to attaining majority). At any rate, the notion of 'adolescence' or 'youth' in the modern conception of childhood is widely recognised as a period usually involving an apprenticeship for the roles to be required of adulthood. Indeed, the inclusion of the 'middle-aged child', that is, the post-infantile seven year old to the pre-adolescent 12 year old, is arguably a key element of the modern conception of childhood.

Archard concluded that:

... any conception of childhood will vary according to the ways in which its boundaries are set, its dimensions ordered and its divisions managed. This will determine how a culture thinks about the extent, nature and significance of childhood. The adoption of one conception rather than another will reflect prevailing general beliefs, assumptions and

priorities. Is what matters to a society that a human can speak, be able to distinguish good from evil, exercise reason, learn and acquire knowledge, fend for itself, procreate, participate in running the society or work alongside its other members? (Archard, 1993, p 27)

In essence, what emerges from the historical analysis is that the notion of childhood is significantly related to the way in which it has developed and been understood over a long period of time, and the particular ways it has entered the culture and priorities of the society under examination. The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (see Appendix 3 for text) defines the child as meaning 'every human being below the age of eighteen years unless under the law applicable to the child, majority is attained earlier' (Art 1). In Archard's terminology, this is the 'boundary' of childhood as defined in international law. Given the high degree of cultural relativity inherent in the conception of childhood, it is perhaps surprising that the international community was ever able to agree on this important age limit. Equally, the proviso contained in Art 1 allows for a majority age of less than 18 years, a result achieved partly by virtue of sensitivity to cultural diversity and in part by the diplomatic awareness that such flexibility would encourage a maximum number of ratifications. See Chapter 3 for a discussion of the problems surrounding the definition of a child in the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child.

1.1.2 Psychological perspectives

While Ariès pointed to the development of education as historical evidence of a major shift in attitudes towards the nature of childhood, the adoption of universal education in some countries can also be seen as indicative of a pre-existing theory of learning. The particular shape of an education system must be based on some kind of view about the ability of children to receive and process knowledge, in other words, cognitive development.

Piaget (1952, 1960) provided an analysis of how the processes of thought were structured through his theory of learning. He realised that a child's mind was different from merely being a small version of an adult's mind. In essence, Piagetian theory attempts to explain how humans adapt to their environment via the process of the child's 'assimilation' (taking in new encounters) and 'accommodation' (revising cognitive constructs) of experience. Piaget suggested that the developmental process involved the individual in a search to achieve a balance between assimilation and accommodation. This balance is what Piaget describes as *equilibrium*.

On the basis of empirical studies, he identified a model of the child's intellectual growth through separate chronological stages. First, the sensory-motor stage (infancy) immediately after birth. In this period, which he asserted lasted until around two years old, the infant's adaptation to his or her environment is shown by motor activity without the use of abstract reasoning. At first, infants use motor reflexes to interact with their environment. The infant relies on seeing, feeling, sucking and touching to learn about their environment. Infants eventually learn that their environment is not simply an extension of themselves. The infant develops a sense of causation in learning to move an object by hand. Children acquire the concept of 'object permanence' at about seven months old, that is, an understanding that an object (or person) still exists when not in view. For example, a young infant will lose interest in a toy when it is covered up, but an older infant will actively seek it out. Following an understanding of object permanence, the infant performs motor experiments ('directed groping') and learns how to manipulate objects. An increase in the child's physical mobility allows the child to

develop new intellectual abilities. Some symbolic abilities, for example, language, are developed at the end of this stage.

Piaget's second, 'pre-operational stage' (toddler and early childhood), lasts until the child is around seven years old. In this period a child will acquire language skills, and memory and imagination are developed, but thinking is done in a non-logical, non-reversible manner. This stage is characterised by what Piaget terms egocentric thinking, that is, they will only view the outside world from their own perspective. For example, a three year old may well hide behind a chair in the belief that as he cannot see anyone else no one else can see him. Pre-operational children will develop an internal representation of the outside environment that allows them to provide a description of people, events and feelings. Children can be observed using memory and imagination during this stage.

Piaget's third stage, 'concrete operations' (elementary and early adolescence), was said to last for children around seven to 12 years old. Such children are capable of taking into account another person's point of view and can appreciate more than one perspective at the same time. The beginning of this period is marked by the acquisition of the principle of 'conservation'. This is an understanding that the number, volume, mass, liquid, weight, area and length of objects does not change when the particular configuration of the object(s) is changed. For example, a child will appreciate that two identical lengths of ribbon, one rolled up into a ball and the other laid flat, retain the same length. Children also acquire the idea of reversibility, that is, some changes can be undone by reversing an earlier action. For example, one can regain the flat ribbon by rolling out the ball. Children become capable of mentally visualising this type of action without the need to see it actually performed. Egocentric thought decreases. A child develops the ability to co-ordinate two dimensions of an object simultaneously, arrange structures in sequence, transpose differences between items in a series, and will have a better idea of time and space. During this stage, a child begins to reason logically, but can only think about actual, concrete, physical objects; they cannot yet manage abstract reasoning.

The final stage of Piaget's theory is 'formal operations' (adolescence and adulthood), acquired by children around 11 or 12 years old into adulthood. Children at this stage will be capable of thinking logically and in the abstract, and can reason theoretically, though some people may never reach this stage. Early on at this stage there is a return to egocentric thought processes. However, at this stage, thinking is not tied exclusively to events that can be observed. Some research studies have suggested that only around 40–60% of college students reach this stage! The stage is characterised by the ability to construct hypotheses and systematically test these to resolve a problem. In particular, an ability arises to reason hypothetically, or contrary to the known facts. For example, an argument based on the premise that the world is flat could be processed.

The impact of Piaget's theory on, for example, education curricula, has been immense. The lasting influence of Piaget can be seen in the 'Early Childhood Studies' courses available in university education departments. One key point to his theory should be noted. This is that a child could only pass from one stage to another when the appropriate levels of maturity and external stimuli were present. The theory thus acknowledges both the importance of the child's biological maturation and the differential influence of the external environment, in other words, 'nature and nurture'. In the absence of good conditions to sustain both, a child is unlikely to progress to his or her fullest potential. However, subsequent researchers in developmental psychology do not accept Piaget's theory uncritically. Indeed, there is an increasing body of evidence in the last 30 years that young babies, for example, do far more representational 'thinking'

than merely the motor reflexes that Piaget underlined at this (first) stage. Nevertheless, Piaget's contribution has been an enduring one. The cognitive development of the child makes much sense when applied, as in the *Gillick* case¹ in the UK, to determine the point at which teenagers can be regarded as sufficiently mature to understand the meaning and consequences of important decisions which may have significant effects upon their lives.

1.1.3 Sociological perspectives

The sociology of childhood is a relatively recent sub-discipline. It was only in the 1980s and 1990s that academic societies paid specific attention to this area. For example, in 1998 a research committee of the International Sociological Association was dedicated to the study of childhood (see the 'Internet Resources' at the end of this chapter). One explanation for the marginalisation of academic interest in children is their general marginalisation in society. Adult perspectives on children often focus on what children are to become rather than an appreciation of what they are. Children are often viewed as passive consumers of a culture already established by adults. Society can be seen, within traditional social theory, as maintaining its integrity through a process of 'socialisation'. Individuals are in effect guided into suitable roles via a wide range of institutional and other processes. The notion of socialisation itself involves society's values being lodged into individuals' personalities. Social theory has often recognised the child as particularly in need of such socialisation in order to provide the appropriate induction into the adult world. It is the family that has the expected primary role to ensure that this process of socialising the child is carried out effectively. It is useful in this context to distinguish two different models of the socialisation process: the deterministic and constructivist models (Corsaro, 1997): see Figure 1.1 below.

Deterministic model Constructive model (child appropriated by society) (child appropriates society) Child **Functionalist** has more active and stresses need to maintain self-determining role order and balance in society Individual action (Piaget) Collective action (Vygotsky) Interpretive Reproductive reproduction (Corsaro) provides critique of Focus on collective inequalities in society interactions and children's peer cultures

Figure 1.1 Models of the socialisation process

¹ Gillick v West Norfolk and Wisbech Area Health Authority and Another [1986] AC 112. See section 6.4.4.4 below.

The deterministic model is based on the idea that the child is essentially appropriated by society, that is, trained into becoming a useful member of society. On the one hand, the child's potential future contribution to society is recognised. On the other hand, the underlying assumption is that without the appropriate application of socialisation the child will remain a threat to the good order of society. The child's role in this conceptualisation is essentially a passive one. Furthermore, there are 'functionalist' and 'reproductive' models contained within this deterministic approach.

The functionalist approach in the 1950s and 1960s emphasised the need to maintain order and balance in society and therefore looked at children in terms of how they could be best prepared to take up useful places in the adult world. Theorists such as Talcott Parsons advocated such an approach and viewed the child as a threat to the intricate balance required to maintain society. Parsons saw the child as a 'pebble "thrown" by the fact of birth into the social "pond"' (Parsons and Bales, 1956). The child's point of origin, the family, will be the first element to feel the effects of this potential disruption, followed by schools and then other social institutions and processes. Eventually, the child internalises the values, norms and standards of the wider society. A key criticism of the functionalist approach, however, was that the internalisation of the requirements for society's good order could simply be viewed as a sophisticated method of social control. It assumed that the status quo would be maintained. In other words, these socialisation processes were viewed as a means to reproduce social inequalities.

The reproductive model of society therefore tended to analyse more deeply the nature of such inequality in a more critical manner and not just assume that the function of society was merely to reproduce itself without improvement or any fundamental change. As regards the impact on children, such an approach takes more note of the existence and nature of social conflict and inequality. The deterministic approach as a whole can be criticised in that it will tend to overemphasise the outcomes of socialisation and underestimate the active roles played by the individual. Some advocates of the deterministic approach have advanced a behaviourist understanding of childhood, emphasising the value of training in skills needed for functional living and to the need for a clear system of rewards and punishment which would determine appropriate socialisation.

In contrast to the notion of society appropriating the child, the constructivist model focuses on how the child appropriates society. The contribution of developmental psychology, in particular Piagetian theory, is particularly important here. The child is conceptualised as extracting information from his or her environment in order to construct his or her own interpretation of society. Piaget's 'stage' analysis of intellectual development (see section 1.1.2 above) confirms children's differing qualitative understandings of their environment and their interactions with it compared to adults. Piaget's concept of 'equilibrium' also provides a view of the child as more active and self-determining than a picture of the child determined by irresistible societal forces. Though Piaget believed there was an inherent tendency for children to compensate for environmental intrusions (he termed this 'equilibrium') nevertheless: 'the nature of the compensation is dependent on the activities of children in their social-ecological worlds' (Corsaro, 1997, p 13).

Lev Vygotsky is another significant constructivist theorist who underlined children's active rather than passive roles. He believed that their social development, however, was based on *collective* rather than individual (Piaget) action. He argued that language and other cultural tools were developed collectively by societies over the course of history and were acquired by children in order to actively participate and contribute to that culture. Vygotsky had a notion of 'internalisation' whereby every function in the child's