

Women, Work, and Child Welfare in the Third World

Edited by
Joanne Leslie
Michael Paolisso

**Women, Work,
and Child Welfare
in the Third World**



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

Women, Work, and Child Welfare in the Third World

*Edited by Joanne Leslie
and Michael Paolisso*

 **Routledge**
Taylor & Francis Group
NEW YORK AND LONDON

First published 1989 by Westview Press, Inc.

Published 2021 by Routledge
605 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

Copyright © 1989 by the American Association for the Advancement of Science

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Notice:

Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Women, work, and child welfare in the Third World / edited by Joanne
Leslie, Michael Paolisso.

p. cm. — (AAAS selected symposium : 110)

Includes bibliographies and index.

ISBN 0-8133-7805-2

1. Child welfare—Developing countries. 2. Children of Working mothers—Developing countries. 3. Working mothers—Developing countries. I. Leslie, Joanne. II. Paolisso, Michael Jeffrey. III. Series.

HV804.W65 1989

362.7'09172'4—dc20

89-14683
CIP

ISBN13: 978-0-367-21457-9 (hbk)

ISBN13: 978-0-367-21738-9 (pbk)

DOI: 10.4324/9780429268656

About the Book

Two fields of social action that have received increasing attention in the last decade in much of the developing world are the survival and healthy development of children, and the social and economic roles of women. Researchers, policy makers and program planners in both fields have become increasingly concerned about the relationship between women's work and child welfare, although frequently from differing points of view. The primary focus of those in the women in development field has been on ways to enhance women's economic opportunities; this focus has led to a tendency either to de-emphasize women's child care responsibilities or to assume that substitute child caretakers would provide equally good care. In a similarly one-sided fashion, those concerned with child survival and development, usually professionals from education and public health, have tended to view women primarily as instruments to produce healthy children, ignoring or minimizing the opportunity costs of women's time and the genuine need in most low-income households for mothers to earn income during the same years that they are bearing and raising children.

This book represents one of the first efforts to bring together in a single volume the work of a growing number of researchers interested in simultaneously studying women's roles and child welfare in the Third World. The studies included illustrate not only the multifaceted nature of women's work and child welfare but also the benefits of using a variety of research approaches and methodologies. The findings from these studies are important to the development of policies and interventions that simultaneously increase women's effectiveness as economic actors and as child care providers.

About the Series

The *AAAS Selected Symposia Series* was begun in 1977 to provide a means for more permanently recording and more widely disseminating some of the valuable material that is discussed at the AAAS Annual National Meetings. The volumes in this *Series* are based on symposia held at the Meetings that address topics of current and continuing significance, both within and among the sciences, and in the areas in which science and technology have an impact on public policy. The *Series* format is designed to provide for rapid dissemination of information, so the papers are reproduced directly from camera-ready copy. The papers published in the *Series* are organized and edited by the symposium arrangers, who then become the editors of the various volumes. Most papers published in the *Series* are original contributions that have not been previously published, although in some cases additional papers from other sources have been added by an editor to provide a more comprehensive view of a particular topic. Symposia may be reports of new research or views of established work, particularly work of an interdisciplinary nature, since the AAAS Annual Meetings typically embrace the full range of the sciences and their societal implications.

ARTHUR HERSCHMAN

*Head, Meetings and Publications
American Association for the
Advancement of Science*

Contents

Acknowledgments	ix
Foreword Scott B. Halstead	xi
Chapter 1: Introduction: Joanne Leslie and Mayra Buvinic'	1
Chapter 2: Women's Work and Child Nutrition in the Third World: Joanne Leslie	19
Chapter 3: Women's Work and Social Support for Child Care in the Third World: Susan Joeques	59
Chapter 4: The Effects of Women's Work on Breastfeeding in the Philippines, 1973-1983: Barry M. Popkin, John S. Akin, Wilhelm Flieger and Emelita L. Wong	85
Chapter 5: Breastfeeding and Maternal Employment in Urban Honduras: Chloe O'Gara	113
Chapter 6: Women's Market Work, Infant Feeding Practices, and Infant Nutrition Among Low-Income Women in Santiago, Chile: Isabel Vial, Eugenia Muchnik, and Francisco Mardones S.	131
Chapter 7: Maternal Employment, Differentiation, and Child Health and Nutrition in Panama: Katherine Tucker	161

Chapter 8:	Child Care Strategies of Working and Nonworking Women in Rural and Urban Guatemala:	
	Patrice Engle	179
Chapter 9:	Effects of New Export Crops in Smallholder Agriculture on Division of Labor and Child Nutritional Status in Guatemala:	
	Joachim von Braun	201
Chapter 10:	Women's Agricultural Work, Child Care, and Infant Diarrhea in Rural Kenya:	
	Michael Paolisso, Michael Baksh and J. Conley Thomas	217
Chapter 11:	Women's Community Service and Child Welfare in Urban Peru:	
	Jeanine Anderson	237
Index.		257
About the Authors.		261

Acknowledgments

First and foremost, we want to acknowledge our enormous debt to Dr. Mayra Buvinic', Director of the International Center for Research on Women (ICRW). In a very real sense, this book is as much hers as ours. From the initiation of ICRW's research program on Women's Work and Child Welfare in 1984, through the organization of the AAAS Symposium at which many of these papers were originally presented, to the lengthy process of selecting, revising, and editing the final collection, Mayra has provided the moral commitment, intellectual leadership, and institutional support that have made preparing this book not just possible, but richly rewarding. In addition, we are deeply appreciative of the untold hours spent by ICRW staff members, both past and present, on checking references, typing, copy editing, proofreading, and then checking everything one last time. They have shown dedication, patience, and a professional attention to detail above and beyond the call of duty, and we sincerely thank each and every one of them. We are also extremely grateful to the Rockefeller Foundation for its early encouragement of ICRW's work in this area and for the financial assistance the Foundation has provided in support of ICRW's work on this book. Many others have provided a sounding board for ideas, a critical reading of particular chapters, sorely needed encouragement along the way, and sometimes all of the above. We are grateful to each of you and hope you will be pleased with the book you have helped to bring into existence.

Joanne Leslie
Michael Paolisso



Taylor & Francis

Taylor & Francis Group

<http://taylorandfrancis.com>

Foreword

Both the fields of international health and economic development recognize the need to better understand the productive and reproductive responsibilities of women in developing countries. From the health perspective, the concern with primary health care, maternal child health, and child survival focuses attention on the role of women as providers of health for young children. From the economic position, the contribution of women to the economies of developing countries results in an increased interest in ways of integrating women into economic development projects in different sectors.

What has not been addressed adequately to date is how Third World women balance productive and reproductive responsibilities, and what, if any, are the health consequences for children due to women's need to work. This concern with the interactive nature of women's economic work and time spent providing care for children is critically important, given the expansion of women's work responsibilities due to the combined effects of macro-level economic changes—Third World recession, debt, and government austerity measures—and changes at the micro-level, which can be seen in the rising incidence of women-headed households and the restructuring of women's traditional household roles to accommodate the need for additional family income. Concurrently, many of the international health initiatives depend on women as key implementors of primary health care and child survival interventions, and thus may lead to an increased demand on women's time.

The studies in this volume collectively address the questions of how women manage their work and child care responsibilities and whether specific types or patterns of women's work have negative impacts on child

welfare. The multifaceted nature of women's work and child welfare and the benefits of using a variety of research approaches and methodologies are evident in this collection. The authors provide carefully drawn conclusions that identify a number of key relationships and criteria that need to be considered by both economic development and health programs. As a collection of case studies supported by reviews that provide analytical frameworks, *Women, Work, and Child Welfare in the Third World* is a significant contribution to the development literature. It raises critical questions, discusses various approaches and provides findings that undoubtedly will motivate and guide others to follow.

Scott B. Halstead
Rockefeller Foundation

1

Introduction

Joanne Leslie and Mayra Buvinic'

Two fields of social action that have been given increasing attention in the last decade in much of the developing world are the survival and healthy development of children, and the social and economic roles of women. Researchers, policy makers, and program planners in both fields have been concerned about the relationship between women's work and child welfare, although frequently from differing points of view. The primary focus of those in the women in development field has been on ways to enhance women's economic opportunities; this focus has led to a tendency either to deemphasize women's child care responsibilities, or to assume that substitute child caretakers would provide equally good care. In a similarly one-sided fashion, those concerned with child survival and development, usually professionals from education and public health, have tended to view women primarily as an instrument to produce healthy children, ignoring or minimizing the opportunity costs of women's time, and the genuine need in most low-income households for mothers to earn income during the same years that they are bearing and raising children.

Uninformed by an appreciation of women's multiple roles, a main policy inference from research on child health and nutrition has been that reduced malnutrition rates and increased child welfare, result from keeping poor women at home rather than promoting their participation in the marketplace. Uninformed by a child welfare orientation, a main inference from women-in-development literature has been that women's incorporation into the workforce offers only benefits and no costs to women and children.

It is only quite recently that bridges have been built and a fruitful dialogue has begun between the women in development and child welfare fields (Myers and Indriso 1987; Leslie, Lycette, and Buvinic 1988). A genuine collaboration between those working for the survival and healthy development of children and those working to support the social and economic roles of women should produce policy and program recommendations that will improve both the status of women and the welfare of children in developing countries. Initial collaboration has already enriched research in both fields, as is evident from the studies included in this volume.

A Brief History

A precursor to interest in the relationship between women's work and child welfare was an interest in the relationship between women's work and fertility. More than two decades ago, first in industrialized countries and then in developing economies, demographers and economists began to look at the relationship between women's labor force participation and fertility in order to understand population and labor supply trends. In fact, studies on the relationship between women's labor force participation and fertility represent some of the earliest attempts to integrate a gender perspective into economic development research and policy.

The central hypothesis of the research carried out in industrialized economies, which was then transferred to developing ones, was that there was an inverse relationship between female labor force participation and fertility behavior. This hypothesis was based on an assumed incompatibility between women's work in the marketplace and women's reproductive and childbearing functions at home. Extensive empirical research with large data sets demonstrated, however, that the relationship between these two variables was much more complex than originally anticipated. In industrialized countries it was generally found that increased female labor force participation was positively correlated with lower birth rates when women in low income groups were excluded (Oppenheimer 1970). In developing countries, however, the relationship between female labor force participation and fertility varied dramatically depending on, among other things, rural-urban residence, education, and participation in modern or traditional sectors of the economy; the empirical evidence in developing countries often contradicted the original predictions (Piepmeyer and Adkins 1973). One principal factor that could explain these opposite empirical findings was the relative lack of conflict in developing countries between women's roles as workers and mothers (Standing 1978). In fact, some authors argued quite forcefully that the notion of incompatibility between labor force participation and reproductive and child care tasks

was derived from an ethnocentric Western model that did not apply to traditional and/or rural-based economies where women's work and child care were compatible activities (Ware 1975).

Researchers within the women in development framework, along with more traditional demographers and economists, have continued to undertake empirical studies in order to clarify the relationship between women's market work and fertility patterns, as well as the broader relationship between women's status — measured by women's education and labor force participation — and fertility behavior (Cochrane 1978). These studies have benefitted from the knowledge gained in the women in development field and, at the same time, have shed light on the complex nature of women's work in developing economies, particularly of work that takes place outside the modern marketplace (see, for instance, Dixon 1975; Birdsall 1976; and Youssef 1974).

The new household economics, based on the model of the household as a productive unit, has also provided valuable insights and analytical tools in the growing effort to understand the relationship between women's economic and reproductive roles (Schultz 1973). One important contribution of the new household economics has been the explicit consideration of the economic value of goods and services produced and consumed within the family. This has led to a greater recognition of the value of women's economic contribution, since women are the primary producers of goods and services within the home, and to a greater appreciation of the opportunity cost of women's time. Another central feature of the new household economics is the model of the household as a rational decision-making unit, which is presumed to lead to an optimal allocation of time by different household members among different domestic and income-generating tasks. While valid questions have been raised about the appropriateness of treating the household as a single decision-making unit (Dwyer and Bruce 1988), an important contribution of the model of the rational household has been to provide a framework within which to examine the tradeoffs between time spent on child care, time spent in the labor force, and other uses of women's time (Birdsall 1980; DaVanzo and Lee 1983).

The original hypothesis of conflict between women's work and child-bearing roles, which had positive implications both for increasing women's economic status and reducing population growth in developing countries, took a more negative turn when transferred to the field of public health and child development. A corollary to the hypothesis of the inverse work-fertility relationship is the hypothesis that women's labor force participation will be negatively related to child welfare. It is assumed that women's labor force participation is directly related to a reduction in time spent in breastfeeding and child care, which, in turn, has negative consequences for child welfare (Nerlove 1974; Monckeberg 1977; Popkin 1978).

As the studies in this volume indicate, the hypothesized inverse relationship between women's market work and child welfare in developing countries is as fraught with similar complexities and inconsistencies as the earlier postulated inverse work-fertility relationship. Until recently, however, the assumption of a negative relationship between women's market work and child welfare went largely unquestioned in the literature in part because the research did not benefit from collaborative inputs from women in development and child health and development perspectives. It is probable that, as the positive policy implications for women's economic advancement and reduced birth rates nurtured the development of a gender dimension in population studies, contrary or negative policy implications regarding women's economic participation and child welfare built a gulf that, until recently, prevented collaboration between those concerned with women in development and those concerned with child welfare.

Recent Trends

An interest in the relationship between women's work and child welfare is particularly relevant given several recent trends in developing countries. One is women's increased participation and visibility in the market economy. Another is the continuing high levels of child mortality, morbidity, and malnutrition in many developing countries. A third is the recent promotion of child survival technologies, which rely heavily on women as agents in their dissemination. The following sections briefly review these trends to provide a context in which to consider the findings from the studies in this volume.

Trends in Women's Work

The majority of women of reproductive age, in industrialized and developing countries alike, face the need at some point in their lives to combine economically productive work with nurturing their children. The burden of these dual responsibilities, however, falls most inevitably and heavily on low-income women in the Third World. While the true economic contribution made by women in the developing world may not have increased in the post-colonial period, the pattern of women's work has changed substantially. Increased urbanization, industrialization, and migration have caused greater numbers of women to seek income-generating work away from home. The proportion of women officially recorded as being part of the paid labor force in developing countries increased from 28 percent in 1950 to 32 percent in 1985 (Sivard 1985). At the same time, more women have become the primary economic support of themselves and their children. Estimates of the proportion of house-

holds headed by women range from almost half in Botswana, to a third in Jamaica, to a minimum of 10 percent in most Arab Middle Eastern countries (Youssef and Hetler 1984).

The worldwide economic recession of the past few years and the severe food production crisis throughout much of sub-Saharan Africa has intensified the burden that poor women in the developing world have to contribute to, if not to assume the sole responsibility for, the economic welfare of their households (Gozo and Aboagye 1985; Savane 1985). Few low-income women have the option of devoting themselves exclusively to nurturing their children, even during the first year after childbirth. At the same time, child care responsibilities during the reproductive years are increasingly being recognized as a major reason for the high proportion of women in informal-sector jobs, many of which are low paying and insecure (Lycette and White 1988).

The changing nature of women's work in less-developed countries — more women working away from home and more women earning a cash income — and the resultant increased recognition of the importance of women's economically productive roles, is one factor that has led to a desire to understand better how women combine their productive and maternal roles and to what extent, or under what circumstances, the one may interfere with or constrain the other.

Trends in Child Survival and Development

Overall, the chances of survival of children in the Third World have improved considerably in the past 20 years. The infant mortality rate (IMR) in countries that the World Bank defines as "middle-income" declined from an average of 104 per 1000 births in 1965 to 68 in 1985, and child death rates over the same period declined from 17 to 8 deaths per 1000 children aged 1 to 4 years (World Bank 1987). Even in the lowest-income countries, the average IMR fell from 150 to 112 and the average child death rate from 27 to 19. In spite of these substantial declines, however, infant and child mortality rates remain distressingly high, particularly in Sub-Saharan Africa. There is also a growing concern that certain trends, such as the increasing prevalence of female-headed households, and more recently, the economic recession and structural adjustments to it, could be reversing the trend towards improvements in child survival (Cornia, Jolly, and Stewart 1987).

One of the earliest issues that focused interest on the relationship between women's work and child welfare was the belief that changing patterns of work among women were a major cause of declining rates of breastfeeding, which in turn were having a negative effect on child survival and nutritional status (Jelliffe 1962; Wray 1978). Recent evidence suggests, however, that changes in breastfeeding patterns have been less

dramatic than originally thought, particularly among rural populations. The main change seems to have been a reduction in duration of breastfeeding in urban areas (Popkin, Bilsborrow, and Akin 1982; Millman 1986). In addition, most studies have found that the need to work, or factors related to work, have been cited by a surprisingly small proportion of women as their reason for not initiating breastfeeding, for introducing supplementary bottles, or for terminating breastfeeding (Van Esterik and Greiner 1981). Nonetheless, concern about the influence of maternal work patterns on breastfeeding behavior continues and is one of the reasons that it seemed essential in this volume to carefully review the actual empirical evidence concerning women's work as a determinant of infant feeding patterns (see particularly Chapters 2, 4, 5, and 6).

Another issue that has gained increasing attention in recent years — one that suggests the possibility of both negative and positive effects of women's work on child health and nutritional status — is the importance of a protein-and energy-dense diet to ensure adequate nutrition among weaning-age children (Gibbons and Griffiths 1984). Children in this age group have particularly high nutritional needs, due to the combined effects of rapid growth and a high prevalence of infectious diseases. Because they are also unable to consume large amounts of food at one time, weaning-age children need frequent, nutrient-dense meals to prevent malnutrition. Mothers who are not working or who work at home may be better able to assure frequent meals and to monitor intrahousehold food distribution to ensure that weaning-age children receive an adequate share. On the other hand, mothers who are working may be better able to produce or purchase the more expensive oils, legumes, and animal source proteins needed to provide energy- and protein-dense diets for their weaning-aged children. The findings from Guatemala reported by Engle in Chapter 8 are particularly interesting in regard to weaning-age children. While she found some evidence of a negative effect of maternal work on nutritional status among children less than a year old, she found that, during the second year of life, children of women who worked were less malnourished than children of women who did not work, which she attributed in part to their mothers being better able to buy higher-quality, age-appropriate foods.

Women's Role in Child Survival Interventions

The recent emphasis within the international health community on increasing child survival through the use of selective primary health care interventions relies heavily on women as agents in introducing new health technologies and practices. UNICEF's 1986 *State of the World's Children* states, "whether we are talking about breastfeeding or weaning, oral rehydration therapy or immunization, regular growth checking or fre-

quent handwashing, it is obvious that the mother stands at the center of the child survival revolution" (UNICEF 1986).

Of the four central components of the child survival approach to selective primary health care, only one, breastfeeding, focuses on a traditional practice. Breastfeeding was felt to warrant promotion, however, precisely due to the concern discussed earlier that substantial numbers of mothers were breastfeeding less — to the detriment of their children's nutritional status and health. Unfortunately, in the last ten years considerably more effort has gone into establishing the undeniable benefits to both mothers and children of appropriate breastfeeding (both directly and indirectly through its effect on increasing birth intervals) and to documenting regional and urban/rural differences in rates of change in infant feeding practices than into understanding women's reasons for choosing a particular pattern for feeding their infants or assessing the costs and benefits of different infant feeding patterns, given different family and economic structures.

The other three main components of the child survival strategy — oral rehydration therapy, immunizations, and growth monitoring (including improved weaning practices) — all demand that women understand and accept new knowledge about their children's health and nutrition and that they incorporate new activities into their schedules. As with breastfeeding, the attention of researchers has been directed more to establishing the health and nutrition benefits to children of these new technologies than to assessing their costs, particularly costs to mothers and households. Each of these technologies is potentially life saving, and, properly implemented, can certainly be health and nutrition promoting. Making them available as widely as possible increases the range of options available to households in developing countries to produce child health and nutrition, and that is desirable. However, utilization of these child survival technologies also requires the input of time and money on the part of someone responsible for the target child, usually the child's mother.

The monetary costs of the technologies are generally modest, but they are not inconsequential, particularly for the poorest families. Such costs may include ingredients for home-prepared oral rehydration salts (ORS) and special weaning foods, transportation costs to get to the location where immunizations are being given or growth monitoring is being carried out, or payment for packaged ORS, immunizations, growth charts, or community-prepared weaning foods.

From the user perspective, the time costs of the child survival technologies may be even more significant than the monetary costs (Leslie 1989). Averaged out in terms of minutes per day, neither ORT, immunizations, nor growth monitoring would add much to a mother's work day.

However, the time costs are not distributed evenly, but are bunched. When a child needs ORT, someone must be in attendance almost constantly. In order to take a child to be weighed or to be immunized, a mother may have to forego as much as an entire day of work, depending on the distance to be traveled and the number of other children involved. In contrast to the potentially disruptive but occasional time costs of ORT, immunizations, and growth monitoring, the preparation and feeding of appropriate weaning foods is a daily activity. Initial supplemental foods usually cannot be the same foods eaten by the rest of the family, weaning-age children should eat more frequently than older children and adults, and avoiding bacterial contamination requires preparation of small amounts at a time and careful cleaning of all utensils used. All of these mean that improving current weaning practices requires a substantial increase in the amount of time mothers and others in the household devote to child feeding. The effects of women's work on adoption of child survival technologies, in terms of competing demands on women's time, level and control over household income, or some other linkage warrant serious study.

This Volume

This book represents one of the first efforts to bring together in a single volume the work of a growing number of researchers who are interested in simultaneously studying women's roles and child welfare in the Third World. The volume is based on a symposium organized at the May 1986 Annual Meeting of the American Association for the Advancement of Science, although several papers not presented at the original symposium have been included and all of the papers have been substantially updated and revised. The predominance of research from Latin America, which characterized the original symposium, continues in this collection. However, the inclusion of the two cross-country review chapters, as well as one country study each from Asia and from Africa, make it clear that the issue of the relationship between women's work and child welfare raises similar challenges to understanding and policy throughout the Third World.

The studies included in this volume illustrate not only the multifaceted nature of women's work and child welfare (as will be discussed in greater detail), but also the benefits of using a variety of research techniques to explore the complex relationships between them. "Women's Work and Child Nutrition in the Third World" (Chapter 2) and "Women's Work and Social Support for Child Care in the Third World" (Chapter 3) demonstrate that, when carefully analyzed and considered as a whole, a great deal can be learned from research and project evaluations that may

not have been specifically designed to focus on the relationship between women's work and child welfare. These two overview chapters are included because they present interesting preliminary findings concerning the relationship between women's work and two key aspects of child welfare — child nutrition and child care — and provide a framework and point of departure for reading the country-specific studies (chapters 4-11).

The country studies can all be loosely categorized as multidisciplinary in that, to a greater or lesser extent, they draw on concepts and methods from several different academic disciplines, including economics, anthropology, and the health sciences. However, the main methodological approach taken differs considerably among the eight chapters. "The Effects of Women's Work on Breastfeeding in the Philippines 1973-1983" (Chapter 4), "Women's Market Work, Infant Feeding Practices, and Infant Nutrition Among Low-Income Women in Santiago, Chile" (Chapter 6), and "Effects of New Export Crops in Smallholder Agriculture on Division of Labor and Child Nutritional Status in Guatemala" (Chapter 9) are primarily microeconomic studies in which mathematical models of the relationship among the variables are tested and the results presented quantitatively. At the other end of the continuum, "Women's Community Service and Child Welfare in Urban Peru" (Chapter 11) presents the findings of an ethnographic study in a predominantly descriptive, nonquantitative style. The remaining four studies report data from health or nutrition field surveys, but each is strengthened by reference to specific social science concepts and analytical frameworks. "Breastfeeding and Maternal Employment in Urban Honduras" (Chapter 5) and "Women's Agricultural Work, Child Care, and Infant Diarrhea in Rural Kenya" (Chapter 10) both include findings from ethnographic studies that were carried out to provide information that would complement the results of the survey data. "Maternal Employment, Differentiation, and Child Welfare in Panama" (Chapter 7) uses the sociological concept of differentiation to explore specific linkages in the relationship between women's work and child welfare. "Child care Strategies of Working and Nonworking Women in Rural and Urban Guatemala" (Chapter 8) draws on theories of child development, and in so doing underlines the importance of taking the age of the child into consideration when looking at the effects of women's work on child welfare.

Key Concepts

At the core of each study included in this volume is the question of whether women's work, particularly recent increases or changes in women's labor force participation, may have a detrimental effect on the welfare of children in the Third World. The findings vary considerably

depending on the specific characteristics of women's work in the study population, the particular measure(s) of child welfare used, and the theoretical and methodological approach taken. In fact, one of the conclusions that emerges most clearly from examining the studies presented in this volume is the importance of disaggregating both the concepts of women's work and of child welfare so that research results can be interpreted more meaningfully. Key characteristics of women's work — such as type of work, location of work, time spent working, income earned, and work-related benefits — as well as key aspects of child welfare — such as morbidity, nutritional status, cognitive development, dietary intake, and caregiver — need to be defined and measured separately. Although none of the studies in this volume include all of the important variables associated with women's work or child welfare, each makes a serious attempt to disaggregate both concepts, to investigate specific linkages, and to reach conclusions that go beyond the simplistic assertion that women's work has negative or positive consequences for child welfare. Some of the more interesting findings are summarized below.

Women's Work

In industrialized and developing countries alike, women's work differs in fundamental ways from men's work (Humphries 1988). Women's work includes production for the market, production for home consumption, and other domestic responsibilities. Market work standardly includes formal and informal sector income-generating activities as well as unpaid labor in the firm or the farm. Home production, as it is usually defined, encompasses activities that can be shifted to the market economy (e.g., food processing) but excludes child care. However, a broader definition of women's domestic work would certainly include child care, as well as care of other family members. Most researchers have categorized women's social activities as leisure, but social activities in many settings should more properly be considered as another component of women's work. Such activities are frequently part of a complex system of reciprocal exchange of services, including but not limited to child care (see Chapter 3). As Anderson's study from Peru (Chapter 11) also makes clear, women's unpaid community work can sometimes pose significant short-term risks to child welfare, particularly since such work has similar time costs to those of market work but without the benefit of income.

Women's participation in market production has time, income, and status effects, among others, that are important determinants of child care strategies and child welfare outcomes. As female wage rates increase, women's costs to allocate time to both home production and child care increase, but, on the other hand, the household can purchase additional goods (food, health care, etc.) while holding constant the time women

spend in market work. This trade-off between time and income is explicitly considered in the study from Santiago, Chile, by Vial, Muchnik, and Mardones (Chapter 6), which investigates the effect of maternal work during an infant's first six months on both infant feeding practices and weight gain. The authors report significantly better weight gain among infants of working than nonworking mothers and conclude that, in this population, the negative effects of earlier termination of breastfeeding are outweighed by the benefits of higher incomes among working mothers, which allow increased expenditures for food and better access to health care.

An increase in women's income can increase women's status within the home and may lead to shifts in allocation of household resources among expenditures or among household members. The study by von Braun of the introduction of nontraditional export crops in highland Guatemala (Chapter 9) focuses on a situation in which women's work shifted from income-generating work in the informal sector to unpaid farm work. Von Braun concludes that if total household income increases, but at the expense of women's control over income, the expected nutritional benefits to children turn out to be significantly less than anticipated.

Child Welfare

In its broadest definition, child welfare encompasses a continuum of desirable outcomes ranging from mere survival to access to the necessary resources and opportunities for all children to develop to their full potential. Because child mortality, morbidity, and malnutrition remain widespread problems in most developing countries, and because other aspects of child welfare are difficult to achieve if good health and nutrition are lacking, studies on child welfare in the Third World have tended to focus on child health and nutrition outcomes, or on factors that are presumed to be direct determinants of child health and nutrition, such as breastfeeding, dietary intake, or child care. With the one exception of Anderson's study in Peru (Chapter 11), which presents some limited data on child development, the studies included in this collection all focus on child health and nutrition and their direct determinants.

The three studies that focus on the relationship between women's work and infant feeding practices all improve on the dichotomous categorization of children as breastfed or not breastfed that has characterized much of the earlier research (for a more detailed discussion of this problem, see Chapter 2). Popkin, Akin, Flieger, and Wong, in their longitudinal study of breastfeeding in the Philippines (Chapter 4), calculate the probability of an infant being breastfed at different ages and discover that most of the increases or decreases in breastfeeding probabilities over the decade from 1973 to 1983 that had a significant impact on duration took place

during the second year of the infant's life, when they could be expected to have only small health or demographic effects. Both O'Gara, in her study of urban Honduran mothers (Chapter 5), and Vial, Muchnik, and Marcondes, in their study of urban Chilean mothers (Chapter 6), report a similar pattern of an early shift from exclusive breastfeeding to mixed feeding (e.g., breast and bottle) among working and nonworking women alike, although there is some indication in the Chilean sample that working mothers shifted to exclusive bottle feeding if they could not take the baby to their work place. Another interesting finding from O'Gara's Honduran study is that employed women nurse less frequently, but for longer period than housewives, so that the total time spent nursing by working and nonworking women is virtually the same.

An intervening variable between maternal work and child health and nutrition that was examined in several of the studies in Part II is non-maternal caregivers. In her study of urban and rural women in Guatemala, Engle (Chapter 8) found that the majority of rural working mothers and slightly more than half of urban working mothers still reported being responsible for child care for the whole day. Overall, working mothers reported receiving surprisingly little help with child care. However, when someone other than the mother did provide child care, Engle found that adult caretaking was positively related to child health and nutritional status, sibling caretaking was negatively related, and the effect on the child of the mother receiving no help with child care was somewhere in between.

In her study of urban and rural working mothers in Panama, Tucker (Chapter 7) examines quality of substitute child care, maternal differentiation (defined in terms of access to and ability to process information), and household differentiation (defined in terms of number of possessions and number of different economic activities) as intervening variables mediating the effect of maternal work on child health and nutrition. Tucker finds some evidence that substitute child care provided by relatives, particularly grandmothers, was associated with better child health and nutrition than child care provided by nonrelatives. In addition, she finds that measures of differentiation are important intervening variables, with maternal differentiation a key determinant of child growth, and household differentiation a key determinant of prevalence of parasitic infections among children.

Paolisso, Baksh, and Thomas, in a study of work patterns among Kenyan rural women with and without infants (Chapter 10), find that women with infants spend significantly less time on agricultural production and self care but similar amounts of time on social and leisure activities than do women without infants. Not surprisingly, the authors find that it is during the peak agricultural season that women's work and child

care seem to be most incompatible. However, they also find that households deal with this incompatibility by having female siblings care for the infant in place of the mother. Most interesting is the finding that, in terms of incidence of diarrhea (which in this study measures child welfare), sibling care seems to be equally as effective as maternal care in promoting infant health.

Benefits of Collaboration

The collaboration between those concerned with the survival and healthy development of children and those concerned with the social and economic roles of women has already been fruitful in strengthening research on the relationship between women's work and child welfare. More importantly, it has begun to broaden the perspective of policymakers and program planners in both fields. The benefits of collaboration for those in the women in development field are myriad.

1. First and most importantly, it provides a more complete grasp of women's responsibilities and contributions in developing countries, which is essential for the design of balanced policies and interventions. As a result, it yields a new set of indicators to measure the impact of policy and project interventions on women, which can assess the success of policies and interventions simultaneously in increasing women's effectiveness as economic actors and as child care agents.
2. By identifying the use of alternative child care providers, it demystifies the notion of mothers as the only caretakers and, by assessing the time working women spend in child care, it counteracts the notion of working women as unlikely or unfit mothers. As a result, by challenging the notion of women as mothers only or as workers only, it provides a more accurate basis for understanding women's, as well as families', strategies for survival.
3. Through a focus on child care and promotion of child health and nutrition, it illuminates issues of how resources and benefits are allocated by gender and age, and how resources are transferred within households.
4. It draws attention to the fact that child care needs and/or child welfare can be important determinants of women's work choices.
5. It legitimizes supporting the development of women by strengthening their roles as mothers as well as workers.

For those concerned with the survival and healthy development of children, a main benefit of collaboration is to help them better understand

one of their key target groups, mothers of preschool age children. More specifically:

1. It expands the range of strategies to be considered in promoting child health and nutrition to include policies and projects that enhance women's educational opportunities, women's economic opportunities, and women's status.
2. It suggests important additional criteria (e.g., indicators of effects on women) to be included in selecting among health and nutritional interventions, as well as to be used in assessing the impact of such interventions.
3. By focusing attention on women's multiple roles and responsibilities, it provides a more realistic appreciation of the constraints women face in adopting new health practices and in utilizing health services.
4. It suggests the possibility of building a broad base of support for strategies that enhance both women's economic opportunities and child welfare, such as interventions to improve the health and nutritional status of women, work-based or community-based child care, and increased access to family planning.
5. By increasing understanding of the variability in women's work patterns, it allows the design of studies that go beyond a simple categorization of mothers as employed or not employed and is able to clarify links between specific aspects of women's work and the welfare of their children. The results of those studies can then suggest ways by which policies and projects can reduce conflicts and increase compatibility between women's productive and reproductive roles.

References

Birdsall, Nancy.

1980. "Measuring Time Use and Nonmarket Exchange." In *Third World Poverty: New Strategies for Measuring Development Progress*, pp. 157-174. Edited by William Paul McGreevey. Lexington, MA: Lexington Books.

1976. "Women and Population Studies." *Signs* 1: 699-712.

Cornia, Giovanni Andrea; Jolly, Richard; and Stewart, Francis.

1987. *Adjustment with a Human Face: Protecting the Vulnerable and Promoting Growth*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Cochrane, Susan Hill.

1978. *Fertility and Education: What Do We Really Know?* Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

DaVanzo, Julie and Lee, Donald Lye Poh.

1983. "The Compatibility of Childcare with Market and Nonmarket Activities: Preliminary Evidence from Malaysia." In *Women and Poverty in the Third World*. Edited by Mayra Buvinic, Margaret A. Lycette and William Paul McGreevey. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Dixon, Ruth B.

1975. *Women's Rights and Fertility*. Reports on Population/Family Planning, No. 17. New York: Population Council.

Dwyer, Daisy and Bruce, Judith.

1988. *A Home Divided: Women and Income in the Third World*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Gibbons, Gayle and Griffiths, Marcia.

1984. *Program Activities for Improving Weaning Practices*. Report prepared for UNICEF. Washington, DC: American Public Health Association.

Gozo, K.M. and Aboagye, A.A..

1985. "Impact of the Recession in African Countries: Effects on the Poor." Paper prepared for the International Labor Organization. Processed.

Humphries, Jane.

1988. "Women and Work." In *The New Palgrave: A Dictionary of Economics*. Edited by J. Eatwell, M. Milgate, and P. Newman. New York: Stockton Press.

Jelliffe, Derrick B.

1962. "Culture, Social Change and Infant Feeding: Current Trends in Tropical Regions." *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition* 10 (January 1962): 19-45.

Leslie, Joanne.

1989. "Women's Time: A Factor in the Use of Child Survival Technologies." *Health Policy and Planning*, vol. 4, no. 1.