

Education, Poverty and International Development

THE POLITICS OF ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION AND SOCIAL INEQUALITY

GLOBAL PRESSURES, NATIONAL PRIORITIES AND SCHOOLING IN INDIA

Maya Kalyanpur, Padmini Bhuyan Boruah, Sarina Chugani Molina, and Sunaina Shenoy



'This exquisitely complex book is invaluable for those of us seeking deeper understandings of the role played by English in magnifying economic inequalities globally. Building on wisdom drawn from their own life experiences with linguicide, transnationalism, and English-as-medium-of-education policies, these four authors render skillful analyses that shed light on the complicated dilemmas surrounding language-in-education policy. Offering insightful understandings widely applicable beyond the contemporary Indian context, the book provides supportive and constructive guidance for enacting critical resistance in the context of a range of often-neoliberal language policy reforms.'

Suhanthie Motha, Associate Professor of Applied Linguistics/TESOL, English Department, University of Washington, USA

'This book provides critical insights into processes of globalization and multilingual education from the perspective of the less privileged. Embodied by the personal experiences of four scholars from different regions and language groups, and richly situated in classrooms and communities in India, the book portrays dysfunctional outcomes. Educational policies motivated by the global pressures of economic progress and national goals of development hamper proficiencies in both heritage languages and English. We leave persuaded that a pedagogy that honestly addresses economic disparities, critiques ongoing colonial designs, and values heritage languages and epistemologies is more beneficial for the Global South.'

Suresh Canagarajah, Edwin Erle Sparks Professor of Applied Linguistics, English, and Asian Studies, Pennsylvania State University, USA

'This book makes a significant contribution to bringing together post-colonial scholarship on the politics and practices of language policies and language education. It draws on rich lived experiences of the diverse language identities of the authors. This richness is evident throughout the text as the authors engage in a nuanced manner with a complex intellectual terrain on language politics, whilst drawing on research evidence from the field. The arguments presented in the book also problematise the construction of disability and the labelling of learning disability especially in schooling contexts, such as those in India. The book raises important points in relation to how 'disability' labels are uncritically adopted in settings such as many English medium schools which provide access to first generation learners and largely non-English speakers from low-income background.'

Nidhi Singal, Professor of Disability and Inclusive Education, University of Cambridge, UK

'This provocative book will change how you think about language teaching and learning. In *The Politics of English Language Education and Social Inequality*, Kalyanpur, Boruah, Molina, and Shenoy offer an incisive analysis of how English language education operates as a colonizing presence. With a focus on a multilingual nation that has a complex relationship with English – India – the

authors brilliantly weave personal experiences with research data and theory in order to illuminate reverberations of language policy, language teaching, and the language experiences of children across dimensions that range from identity to national policy to global domination.'

Christine Sleeter, Professor Emerita, School of Professional Studies, California State University-Monterey Bay, USA

'This book, authored by four Indian women, is unlike any other. It is written from the heart and from the women's own life experiences and academic research. Theory about the role of English education in colonialism and globalization, as well as its relationship to poverty, flow here from the local Indian context, as the authors reflect jointly and foreground their own positionality. The book is an example of decolonial resistance not only to traditional English language education, but also to academic treatises that do not reveal the authors' selves.'

Ofelia García, Professor Emerita, The Graduate Center,
City University of New York, USA

The Politics of English Language Education and Social Inequality

Based on policy analysis and empirical data, this book examines the problematic consequences of colonial legacies of language policies and English language education in the multilingual contexts of the Global South.

Using a postcolonial lens, the volume explores the raciolinguistics of language hierarchies that results in students from low-income backgrounds losing their mother tongues without acquiring academic fluency in English. Using findings from five major research projects, the book analyzes the specific context of India, where ambiguous language policies have led to uneasy tensions between the colonial language of English, national and state languages, and students' linguistic diversity is mistaken for cognitive deficits when English is the medium of instruction in schools. The authors situate their own professional and personal experiences in their efforts at dismantling postcolonial structures through reflective practice as teacher educators, and present solutions of decolonial resistance to linguistic hierarchies that include critical pedagogical alternatives to bilingual education and opportunities for increased teacher agency.

Ultimately, this timely volume will appeal to researchers, scholars, academics, and students in the fields of international and comparative education, English and literacy studies, and language arts more broadly. Those interested in English language learning in low-income countries specifically will also find this book to be of benefit to their research.

Maya Kalyanpur is Professor of Inclusive Education, Department of Learning and Teaching at the University of San Diego, USA.

Padmini Bhuyan Boruah is Professor and Head, Department of English Language Teaching at Gauhati University, India.

Sarina Chugani Molina is Associate Professor in English Language Education, Department of Learning and Teaching, University of San Diego, USA.

Sunaina Shenoy is Assistant Professor in the Educational Diagnostic Certificate Program, Department of Special Education, University of New Mexico, USA.

Education, Poverty and International Development Series Series Editors

Madeleine Arnot

Faculty of Education, University of Cambridge, UK

This series of research-based monographs and edited collections, which was set up in collaboration with the late Professor Christopher Colclough, contributes to global debates about how to achieve education for all. A major set of questions faced by national governments and education providers concerns how the contributions made by education to reducing global poverty, encouraging greater social stability and equity, and ensuring the development of individual capability and wellbeing can be strengthened. Focusing on the contributions that research can make to these global agendas, this series aims to provide new knowledge and new perspectives on the relationships between education, poverty, and international development. It offers alternative theoretical and methodological frameworks for the study of developing-country education systems, in the context of national cultures and ambitious global agendas. It aims to identify the key policy challenges associated with addressing social inequalities, uneven social and economic development, and the opportunities to promote democratic and effective educational change in the name of social justice.

The series brings together researchers from the fields of anthropology, economics, development studies, educational studies, politics, international relations, and sociology. It includes work by some of the most distinguished writers in the fields of education and development, along with new authors working on important empirical projects. The series contributes significant insights on the linkages between education, the economy, communities, and society, based on interdisciplinary, international, and national studies.

Selected volumes include critical syntheses of existing research and policy, work using innovative research methodologies, and in-depth evaluations of major policy developments. Some studies will address topics relevant to poverty alleviation, national and international policy-making and aid, while others will be anthropological or sociological investigations of how education functions within local communities, for households living in poverty or for particular socially marginalized groups. The authors explore a diverse range of themes from the challenges associated with providing quality teacher, professional and entrepreneurial education, to those associated with promoting gender equality, reducing gender violence, understanding the impact of poverty on constructions of childhood, or assessing the impact of learner-centered school pedagogies. They offer sharp, critical studies that are intended to have a strategic influence on the thinking of academics, researchers and policy-makers.

Published Titles

Education Outcomes and Poverty

A Reassessment

Edited by Christopher Colclough

Teacher Education and the Challenge of Development

A Global Analysis

Edited by Bob Moon

Education Quality and Social Justice in the Global South

Challenges for Policy, Practice and Research

Edited by Leon Tikly and Angeline M.

Barrett

Learner-Centred Education in International Perspective

Whose Pedagogy for Whose Development?

Michele Schweisfurth

Professional Education, Capabilities and the Public Good

The Role of Universities in Promoting Human Development Melanie Walker and Monica McLean

Livelihoods and Learning

Education For All and the Marginalisation of Mobile Pastoralists Caroline Dyer

Gender Violence in Poverty Contexts

The Educational Challenge Edited by Jenny Parkes

The 'Poor Child'

The Cultural Politics of Education, Development and Childhood Edited by Lucy Hopkins and Arathi Sriprakash

Educating Entrepreneurial Citizens

Neoliberalism and Youth Livelihoods in Tanzania Joan DeJaeghere

Education, Poverty and Global Goals for Gender Equality

How People Make Policy Happen Elaine Unterhalter and Amy North

Reforming Education and Challenging Inequalities in Southern Contexts

Research and Policy in International Development Edited by Pauline Rose, Madeleine Arnot, Roger Jeffery and Nidhi Singal

Mothers and Schooling

Poverty, Gender and Educational Decision-Making in Rural Kenya Fibian Lukalo

The Politics of English Language Education and Social Inequality

Global Pressures, National Priorities and Schooling in India Maya Kalyanpur, Padmini Bhuyan Boruah, Sarina Chugani Molina, and Sunaina Shenoy

For more information on the series, please visit https://www.routledge.com/ Education-Poverty-and-International-Development/book-series/EPID



The Politics of English Language Education and Social Inequality

Global Pressures, National Priorities and Schooling in India

Maya Kalyanpur, Padmini Bhuyan Boruah, Sarina Chugani Molina, and Sunaina Shenoy



First published 2023 by Routledge 4 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN and by Routledge 605 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10158

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2023 Maya Kalyanpur, Padmini Bhuyan Boruah, Sarina Chugani Molina, and Sunaina Shenoy

The right of Maya Kalyanpur, Padmini Bhuyan Boruah, Sarina Chugani Molina, and Sunaina Shenoy to be identified as authors of this work has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-0-367-64616-5 (hbk) ISBN: 978-0-367-64618-9 (pbk) ISBN: 978-1-003-12548-8 (ebk)

DOI: 10.4324/9781003125488

Typeset in Galliard by Apex CoVantage, LLC To my father, who left me when I was ten, but with English to grieve and articulate the void. To my homeland, with the hope that this book provokes, challenges and inspires us all to look anew at our tryst with English.

Padmini

I dedicate this book to my mother, who taught me, through her healing ways, my rightful inheritance of Indigenous wisdoms and traditions handed down from times immemorial. And to all the disenfranchised people who have succumbed to the weight of colonialism and experienced the loss of their linguistic and cultural heritage.

Sarina

In memory of my parents: my mother, Leela Rao, who was fluent in the language of every region of the world she lived in, Konkani, English, Hindi, Bahasa, Mandarin, and Kannada, and my father, Bhaskar Kalyanpurkar, who was not (and whose gene I have inherited).

Maya

To my mom who is a Professor of English; To my dad who is a proud Malayali; And to my husband who is a Konkani at heart; You have made me a scholar in English, a quick-witted Malayali and a susegad Goan!

Sunaina



Contents

	About the authors	xiv
	List of figures and tables	xvi
	List of abbreviations	xvii
	Acknowledgements	xix
Pro	ologue: our language stories	1
	RT I	
Th	e global context for language policy	17
1	Introducing a postcolonial perspective on	
	language education	19
	A colonial/postcolonial framework 21	
	Language as a tool of oppression in globalization 24	
	The diminishment of non-world languages 27	
	Socio-economic barriers to the acquisition of the English language 29	
	The structure of the book 32	
	Conclusion 34	
2	Language, linguicide and equity: navigating the tension	
	between heritage, national and colonial agendas	40
	Language vitality, status, and terminology 41	
	National language policies in Pakistan and Bangladesh: issues of linguistic equity 43	
	The Chinese language diaspora in East Asia 50	
	Language challenges in Taiwan and Hong Kong 52	
	Linguicide or the integration of heritage language education? 54	

PART II The politics and practice of India's language education policies 6		
3	Language contestations and the illusions around English in India's Three Language Formula	65
	English in education: from constitutional provisions to policy 67 English as deliverance, English as Indian: competing social and educational goals 69	
	Pedagogic models of English language teaching: ground realities and social disadvantage 76	
	Repositioning English: empowerment agendas and multiliteracy frameworks 79 Constraint 20	
	Conclusion 80	
4	English language teachers and teacher education: challenging normative linguistic positionings	87
	The impact of national education policies on language teacher education 88	
	Moving beyond the colonial legacy: alternative pedagogy and curricular models of language education 93	
	Teachers' pedagogy, invisibility, voice, and agency 96	
	Developing teacher agency and pedagogical practice 98 Restructuring English language teacher education: new initiatives 99 Conclusion 101	
5	English medium private schools: teaching bilingual and multilingual students in the context of inequality	108
	Language teaching in Karnataka private schools: linguistic and cultural contexts 110	
	Language of instruction: helping those who struggle 113 English language teaching in classroom contexts 115 Conclusion 119	
6	L2 English language acquisition: dyslexia and learning inequalities in private schools	122
	Dyslexia: the language difference vs learning disorder debate 122 Dyslexia and English literary acquisition in the Indian school context Learning disabilities, dyslexia, and disadvantage 126 The implications for disadvantaged learners in English medium private schools 134 Conclusion 135	124

189

Index

About the authors

Padmini Bhuyan Boruah, PhD is Professor and Head of the Department of English Language Teaching (ELT) at Gauhati University, India. A Fulbright Teaching and Research Fellow at the University of San Diego, California (2019–2020), her interests and publications center around ELT pedagogy, materials development and teacher education. Her work includes developing an ELT Diploma for primary English teachers sponsored by Commonwealth of Learning, Canada (2013–2014) and a British Council ELT research project award (2016) to investigate teacher agency and development of self-learning materials. She has also investigated the role of meritocracy and English language education in India and Malaysia (2021), and perceptions of South Asian English teachers on multilingualism (2021) with university colleagues from six South Asian countries. Her research publications include book chapters on 'Learning English in a low-cost semi-urban English-medium school in India' (2017) and 'English medium education in India: The neoliberal legacy and challenges to multilingual language policy implementation' (2022).

Maya Kalyanpur is Professor in the Department of Teaching and Learning at the University of San Diego having received her PhD in Special Education from Syracuse University. In 2020, she was awarded the American Educational Research Association (AERA) Multicultural/Multiethnic Education Carlos J. Vallejo Memorial Award for Lifetime Scholarship. She has conducted research on the intersections of culture, international development and disability studies, with a specific focus on international inclusive education policy and practice. Her books include Disability studies in South Asia: Redefining boundaries and extending horizons (2015), co-edited with Dr. Shridevi Rao, which presents an alternative analysis to disability appropriate to South Asia, and Development, education and learning disability in India (2021), on English language instruction and the labeling of low-income children as learning disabled in India. The latter is based on a study conducted while she was a Fulbright Foundation Senior Research Fellow to India.

Sarina Chugani Molina serves as Associate Professor in the Department of Learning and Teaching in the School of Leadership and Education Sciences at the University of San Diego. She has authored a book on working with multilingual users of English based on socioculturally salient pedagogical practices entitled Linguistics for teaching English in multilingual classrooms: An introduction to fundamental concepts with practical strategies (2013), a textbook on English language teaching entitled, Teaching English in local and global contexts: A guidebook for beginning teachers in TESOL (2014), and co-authored a book on Family, school, community engagement and partnerships (2015) with colleagues. She has published numerous articles in the areas of language education, lesson study, action research, and teacher development from constructive-developmental, socio-cultural, ecological and critical perspectives. She teaches courses in the PhD in Education for Social Justice program and foundational and research courses in the TESOL program.

Sunaina Shenoy is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Special Education at the University of New Mexico. She earned a Ph.D. in Special Education from the University of California, Berkeley and completed her postdoctoral work at the Florida Center for Reading Research at Florida State University. She teaches in the Educational Diagnosis Certificate Program at the University of New Mexico, specializing in courses related to the assessment and identification of students with disabilities. Her research interests are in assessment; early identification of reading disabilities in bilingual and multilingual populations; reading acquisition and dyslexia; bilingual special education; second language acquisition; and international special education. She has published several articles in her areas of specialization. Her latest research publications include Identifying students at-risk for reading difficulties in the Indian context (2022) and Examining the technical adequacy and efficacy of FABLe to identify students at-risk for reading difficulties in India (2022).

Figures and tables

Figure			
2.1	Population by mother tongue	46	
Tab	les		
		40	
2.1	Language status and definitions	42	
3.1	English in Indian language education policy frameworks	68	
5.1	Comparison of student performance on L1 Kannada and		
	L2 English between low-, middle-, and high-cost schools	112	
5.2	Comparison of low-, middle-, and high-cost schools based		
	on a classroom observation checklist	118	
6.1	Demographic data for schools and students in the sample	128	
6.2	Home language (L1) data for students in the sample	129	
6.3	Percentage of students identified as being at-risk for dyslexia	132	

Abbreviations

AAE African-American English AAL African-American Languages

AAVE African-American Varieties of English (aka Ebonics)

AINET Association of English Teachers
ASER Annual Status of Education Report

BE Black English

BJP Bharatiya Janata Party

BRAC Building Resources Across Communities
CABE Central Advisory Board on Education
CALP Cognitive Academic Language Teaching
CBSE Central Board of Secondary Education

CBSE-ELT Central Board of Secondary Education's English Language Teach-

ing Project

CLT Communicative Language Teaching

CoP Community of Practice

CPD Continuing Professional Development

CSP Culturally Sustaining Pedagogy

DIBELS Dynamic Indicators of Basic Early Literacy Skills DIKSHA Digital Infrastructure for Knowledge Sharing

D.El.Ed. Diploma in Elementary Education easyCBM Easy Curriculum Based Measures EEC Education for Ethnic Children

EFA Education for All

ELT English Language Teaching

ELTAI English Language Teachers Association on India

ESL/EFL English as a foreign or second language

ESOL English as a Second Language, English to Speakers of Other

Languages

FLI Forum for Language Initiatives

IATEFL International Association of Teachers of English as a Foreign

Language

ITM Indigenous, Tribal and Minority

Ll first language

xviii Abbreviations

L2 second language LFP low fee paying

MLE Multilingual Education

MTB-MLE Mother Tongue Based Multilingual Education

NCERT National Council of Educational Research and Training

NCF National Curriculum Framework

NCTFE National Curriculum Framework for Teacher Education

NCTE National Council for Teacher Education

NEP/NPE National Education Policy/ National Policy on Education

NPST National Professional Standards for Teachers

NGO non-governmental organization

ORF Oral Reading Fluency

RELO Regional English Language Office

RTE Right to Education for All

SCERT State Council of Educational Research and Training

SD standard deviation

SDG Sustainable Development Goal SEC Secondary Education Commission

SEDG Socio-Economically Disadvantaged Groups

SES socio-economic status

SOAP Subjective narration, Objective data and observation, Assessment

and Planning

SWAYAM Study Webs of Active learning for Young Aspiring Minds

TESOL Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages

TLF Three Language Formula

TOEFL Test of English as a Foreign Language

TOSREC Test of Silent Reading Efficiency and Comprehension

UEC University Education Commission

UN United Nations

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Culture

Organization

Acknowledgements

This extraordinary journey began during my Fulbright fellowship at the University of San Diego (USD), California in 2019–2020. Thank you Maya Kalyanpur for starting the journey, and for your amazing friendship. Sarina Chugani Molina – my Fulbright Faculty Associate and dear friend – working with you has been a privilege and honor. Sunaina Shenoy, it has been an absolute pleasure traveling on this road with you. My colleagues and students of the Department of English Language Teaching and Department of Linguistics, Gauhati University, thank you for your unwavering support. My sons – Mon and Meet, you have been my constant source of support and joy. You are truly your father's and my miracles. Maa, Pori, and Papori, you have always made me believe I can do anything. I must be the luckiest daughter and sister. And finally, Bobon (Samrat Chakravarty), my best friend – you dared me to dream. Without your support, none of this would have happened.

Padmini Bhuyan Boruah

This work would not have been possible without the years of teaching and learning interactions I have had with English learners in schools, community colleges, language academies and community programs within the U.S. system and abroad. I have learned much from my very own English learners whom I have had the opportunity to teach over the last 30 years and from my teacher candidates who spend countless hours considering ways in which to improve our practice in working with English learners from a critical, decolonial lens. I am most appreciative of my collaborators on this book, Maya Kalyanpur, Padmini Boruah, and Sunaina Shenoy, who provided invaluable feedback and brought light to spaces that honored my lived experiences. Of course, none of this would have been possible without the support of my loving husband, Larry Molina, my father, Gobind Ghanshamdas Chugani, and my two beloved children, Mina and Sai Molina, who continue to embrace me with their love and understanding.

Sarina Chugani Molina

Chapter 5 is from my doctoral work and I would like to thank my doctoral dissertation chair, Dr. David Pearson from University of California Berkeley,

xx Acknowledgements

who is the most prolific researcher and literacy expert in the field, as well as the best role model and advocate for his students. Chapter 6 is from my post-doctoral work and I extend my thanks to my postdoctoral supervisor, Dr. Richard Wagner from the Florida Center for Reading Research who is a rock star in the field, but the most humble person I have ever met. I would also like to recognize the support I have received from my Special Education department at the University of New Mexico, especially from our chair, Dr. Ruth Luckasson, my program coordinator, Dr. Margo Collier and my other colleagues, who have whole-heartedly supported my research efforts. Finally, a special thanks to Maya Kalyanpur who invited me to work on this book with other scholars in the field. For the first time, I have found "my group" of researchers with whom I do not have to explain my positionality, and I look forward to future discussions, collaborations and continued friendship with my co-authors.

Sunaina Shenoy

I would like to thank my sisterhood of co-authors who have accompanied and stuck with me on the writing of this book well past the initial timeline. Thank you for your steadfastness, your willingness to draft and re-draft, your insights that allowed me to grow in my analysis and advocacy, and for your friendship. I am sure our lively discussions at our monthly meetings across three time zones are only precursors to what will happen at an actual in-person meeting when that occurs!

I thank Madeleine Arnot, our series editor, for her extraordinarily detailed feedback and guidance, and the production team at Routledge. I am also grateful to the Fulbright Foundation for awarding me a senior research fellowship, which contributed to the development of this book.

Maya Kalyanpur

Prologue

Our language stories

All the authors of this book have been significantly impacted in personal ways by language. We share our stories here and in subsequent chapters. The themes that emerged from our personal experiences reflect the dilemmas and challenges that present themselves at a global level. It is, perhaps, not a coincidence that all four of us are of Indian origin, although we met in the U.S. Among us, and because of India's rich multilingual heritage, we know several languages – Assamese, Hindi, Japanese, Kannada, Konkani, Malayalam, Sindhi – some being our mother tongue languages, other being languages we learnt in the regions in which we grew up. Yet, the one language that all of us are the most fluent in for reading, writing and speaking, and is common to all of us is English. All four of us have been impacted by postcolonial linguistic imperialism as English has gradually become the global *lingua franca* within our current context of globalization and neoliberal economics (Canagarajah, 2006; Phillipson, 1992).

Our experiences of losing our own languages as we became less literate in our regional or mother tongue languages, or linguicide, is a result of the perception of a hierarchy of languages where local languages are considered inferior to a national or a global language (see Alim, Rickford, & Ball, 2016). The Indian Constitution recognizes Hindi as the official language, and all states are encouraged to teach it at school as part of the Three Language Formula policy (discussed in more detail in Chapter 3). However, none of us spoke Hindi at home and were introduced to it either in school as another subject to study, as another language in the local environment or through Bollywood films, Sunaina recalls having to undergo painful years of private tuition in Hindi during her school years and resisting being forced to learn it. "I watched Bollywood movies, I understood Hindi," she explained, "why did I have to study it?" Our mother tongues were either not taught to us at all in school or taught as a second, even a third, language. Padmini regrets allowing her literacy in her mother tongue, Assamese, to slide. While she struggled to read in Assamese, she enjoyed reading and writing in English, which was the medium of instruction at school, and in time, began to author short stories and poems in English. Sarina attended an American English medium school in Japan, where there were no opportunities to learn her native language, except through listening in on conversations between her parents and elders in the community. She was also

DOI: 10.4324/9781003125488-1