

ANGLO-NORMAN STUDIES



XLIV

Proceedings of the Battle Conference 2021

Edited by S. D. Church

ANGLO-NORMAN STUDIES XLIV
PROCEEDINGS OF THE BATTLE CONFERENCE
2021

This volume has a particular focus on the interrelations between the various parts of north-western Europe. After the opening piece on Lotharingia, there are detailed studies of the relationship between Ponthieu and its Norman neighbours, and between the Norman and Angevin dukes and the other French nobility, followed by an investigation of the world of demons and possession in Norman Italy, with additional observations on the subject in twelfth-century England. Meanwhile, the York massacre of the Jews in 1190 is set in a wider context, showing the extent to which crusader enthusiasm led to the pogroms that so marred Anglo-Jewish relations, not just in York but elsewhere in England; and there is an exploration of poverty in London, also during the 1190s, viewed through the prism of the life and execution of William fitz Osbert. Another chapter demonstrates the power of comparative history to illuminate the norms of proprietary queenship, so often overlooked by historians of both kingship and queenship. And two essays focusing on landscape bring the physical into close association with the historical: on the equine landscape of eleventh- and twelfth-century England, adding substantially to our understanding of the place of the horse in late Anglo-Saxon and early Anglo-Norman societies, and on the Brut narratives of Geoffrey of Monmouth, Wace, and *Lazamon*, arguing that they use realistic landscapes in their depiction of the action embedded in their tales, so demonstrating the authors' grasp of the practical realities of contemporary warfare and the role played by landscapes in it.

S. D. CHURCH is Professor of Medieval History at the University of East Anglia.

ANGLO-NORMAN STUDIES

ISSN 0954-9927

Editor

S. D. Church

Editorial Board

Laura Cleaver (School of Advanced Study, University of London)

Lindy Grant (University of Reading)

Mark Hagger (Bangor University)

Leonie V. Hicks (Canterbury Christ Church University)

C. P. Lewis (Institute of Historical Research, University of London)

Elisabeth van Houts (Emmanuel College, Cambridge)

ANGLO-NORMAN STUDIES

XLIV

PROCEEDINGS OF THE BATTLE CONFERENCE

2021

Edited by S. D. Church

THE BOYDELL PRESS

© Editor and Contributors 2021, 2022

All Rights Reserved. Except as permitted under current legislation
no part of this work may be photocopied, stored in a retrieval system,
published, performed in public, adapted, broadcast,
transmitted, recorded or reproduced in any form or by any means,
without the prior permission of the copyright owner

First published 2022
The Boydell Press, Woodbridge

ISBN 978-1-78327-713-1 hardback
ISBN 978-1-80010-631-4 ePDF

ISSN 0954-9927
Anglo-Norman Studies
(Formerly ISSN 0261-9857: Proceedings of the Battle Conference
on Anglo-Norman Studies)

The Boydell Press is an imprint of Boydell & Brewer Ltd
PO Box 9, Woodbridge, Suffolk IP12 3DF, UK
and of Boydell & Brewer Inc.
668 Mt Hope Avenue, Rochester, NY 14620-2731, USA
website: www.boydellandbrewer.com

A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library

The publisher has no responsibility for the continued existence or accuracy of
URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and
does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate
or appropriate

CONTENTS

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS AND TABLES	vi
EDITOR'S PREFACE	viii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	ix
'Avalterre' and 'Affinitas Lotharingorum': Mapping Cultural Production, Cultural Connections and Political Fragmentation in the 'Grand Est' (The Allen Brown Memorial Lecture) <i>Lindy Grant</i>	I
The Perspective from Ponthieu: Count Guy and His Norman Neighbour (The Des Seal Memorial Lecture) <i>Kathleen Thompson</i>	19
Wild, Wild Horses: Equine Landscapes of the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries (The Christine Mahaney Memorial Lecture) <i>Robert Liddiard</i>	35
Demons and Incidents of Possession in the Miracles of Norman Italy (The Marjorie Chibnall Essay Prize) <i>Amy Devenney</i>	55
Rulership, Authority, and Power in the Middle Ages: The Proprietary Queen as Head of Dynasty <i>Anaïs Waag</i>	71
Crusaders and Jews: The York Massacre of 1190 Revisited <i>Christoph T. Maier</i>	105
Poverty in London in the 1190s: Some Possibilities <i>Alan Cooper</i>	121
Landscapes of Concealment and Revelation in the Brut Narratives: Geoffrey of Monmouth, Wace, and Layamon <i>Leonie V. Hicks and Michael D. J. Bintley</i>	137
The Twelfth-Century Norman and Angevin Duke-Kings of England and the Northern French Nobility <i>Heather J. Tanner</i>	153

ILLUSTRATIONS AND TABLES

Lindy Grant, 'Avalterre' and 'Affinitas Lotharingorum': Mapping Cultural Production, Cultural Connections and Political Fragmentation in the 'Grand Est'

Fig 1. Lotharingia and its western border zones in the High Middle Ages 2

Kathleen Thompson, The Perspective from Ponthieu: Count Guy and his Norman Neighbour

Fig. 1. North-eastern France showing places mentioned in the text.
Copyright: Paul Stayt. 20

Fig. 2. Genealogy of the counts of Ponthieu c. 1000–1105. Copyright:
Kathleen Thompson. 23

Robert Liddiard, Wild, Wild Horses: Equine Landscapes of the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries

Fig. 1. Distribution map of principal equine place-names down to the early
thirteenth century. (Robert Liddiard) 37

Fig. 2. View over the Risborough gap in the northern Chilterns towards
Horsendon, 'Horsa's hill or valley'. In the thirteenth and
fourteenth centuries Risborough was also the site of a major royal
horse stud. (Robert Liddiard) 40

Fig. 3. Locations in which Domesday Book records horses in south-west
England. (Robert Liddiard) 45

Anaïs Waag, Rulership, Authority, and Power in the Middle Ages: The Proprietary Queen as Head of Dynasty

Table 1. Royal heiresses 72

Fig. 1. Urraca of León: the Jiménez Dynasty (León). 76

Fig. 2. Melisende of Jerusalem: the Rethel Dynasty. 85

Fig. 3. Empress Matilda: the Norman Dynasty. 90

Fig. 4. Petronila of Aragon: the Jiménez Dynasty (Aragon). 96

The publishers are grateful to the Allen Brown Memorial Trust
for the generous provision of financial support towards the costs of this volume.

EDITOR'S PREFACE

The forty-fourth Battle Conference of Anglo-Norman Studies again took place in the virtual sphere, and we owe a vote of thanks to the School of History at the University of East Anglia for allowing us to use their Zoom account. I would also like to record my gratitude for the enthusiasm with which the Battle community embraced the online platform. The format of substantial papers coupled with time to discuss them worked because those who attended embraced the opportunity to be involved fully in the conference. A notable success was the poster session for early career researchers, organized by Dr Leonie Hicks: all the participants were welcomed, and this contributed immensely to the good atmosphere which pervaded the three days of the conference.

I also want to record my personal thanks and the thanks of the Allen Brown Memorial Trust to Professor Lindy Grant, who has stepped down from the Trust after more than two decades of service, most recently as its Chair. We have all benefited enormously from her expertise and her good sense, and also from her abiding friendship. Dr Laura Cleaver has kindly agreed to become a Trustee.

Stephen Church
January 2022

ABBREVIATIONS

AD	Archives départementales
ANS	<i>Anglo-Norman Studies</i>
ASC	Anglo-Saxon Chronicle, cited by year (corrected in square brackets if necessary) and manuscript; unless otherwise stated the edition is <i>Two of the Saxon Chronicles Parallel</i> , ed. Charles Plummer, 2 vols, Oxford 1892–9
ASC, trans. Swanton	<i>The Anglo-Saxon Chronicle</i> , trans. and ed. M. J. Swanton, London 1996
ASE	Anglo-Saxon England
BAR	British Archaeological Reports
BL	London, British Library
BM	Bibliothèque Municipale
BnF	Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France
<i>Carmen</i>	<i>The Carmen de Hastingae Proelio of Guy, Bishop of Amiens</i> , ed. and trans. Frank Barlow, Oxford 1999
CBA	Council for British Archaeology
Dugdale, <i>Monasticon</i>	William Dugdale, <i>Monasticon Anglicanum</i> , new edn by Henry Ellis and Bulkeley Bandinel, 6 vols, London 1817–30
Eadmer, <i>HN</i>	Eadmer, <i>Historia novorum in Anglia</i> , in <i>Eadmeri Historia novorum in Anglia, et Opuscula duo; De Vita Sancti Anselmi et quibusdam miraculis ejus</i> , ed. Martin Rule, RS 81, London 1884
EEA	<i>English Episcopal Acta</i>
EETS	Early English Text Society
EHR	<i>English Historical Review</i>
EME	<i>Early Medieval Europe</i>
<i>English Lawsuits</i>	<i>English Lawsuits from William I to Richard I</i> , ed. R. C. van Caenegem, 2 vols, Selden Society, 106–7, London 1990–1
Freeman, <i>Norman</i>	Edward A. Freeman, <i>The History of the Norman Conquest of England, its Causes and its Results</i> , 6 vols, 1st edn, Oxford 1867–79, revised edn, New York 1873–6

- GDB Great Domesday Book, followed by the folio number, a or b (for recto or verso), cited from *Domesday Book, seu Liber Censualis Willelmi Primi*, 2 vols, London 1783, I, or from *Great Domesday Book: Library Edition*, ed. Ann Williams and R. W. H. Erskine, Alecto Historical Editions, London 1986–92; followed in parentheses by the abbreviated county name and the entry number (substituting an oblique for a comma between the first and second parts) used in *Domesday Book*, ed. John Morris and others, 34 vols, Phillimore, London 1974–86
- Gesetze* *Die Gesetze der Angelsachsen*, ed. Felix Liebermann, 3 vols, ed. Liebermann, Halle 1903–16
- GND *The Gesta Normannorum ducum of William of Jumièges, Orderic Vitalis, and Robert of Torigni*, ed. and trans. Elisabeth M. C. van Houts, 2 vols, Oxford 1992–5
- Harmer, *AS Writs* F. E. Harmer, *Anglo-Saxon Writs*, 2nd edn, Stamford 1989
- Howden, *Chronica* *Chronica Rogeri de Houedene*, ed. William Stubbs, 4 vols, RS, 51, London 1868–71
- Howden, *Gesta* *Gesta Regis Henrici Secundi* [now attributed to Roger of Howden], ed. William Stubbs, 2 vols, RS, 49, London 1867
- HSJ *Haskins Society Journal*
- Huntingdon Henry, Archdeacon of Huntingdon, *Historia Anglorum: The History of the English People*, ed. and trans. Diana Greenway, Oxford 1996
- IE *Inquisitio Eliensis*, in *Inquisitio Comitatus Cantabrigiensis [and] Inquisitio Eliensis*, ed. N. E. S. A. Hamilton, London 1876
- JEH *Journal of Ecclesiastical History*
- JL *Regesta pontificum romanorum ab condita ecclesia ad annum post Christum natum MCXCVIII*, ed. Philipp Jaffé, Wilhelm Wattenbach, S. Loewenfeld, and others, 2 vols, Leipzig 1885–8
- JMH *Journal of Medieval History*
- John of Worcester *The Chronicle of John of Worcester*, ed. R. R. Darlington and P. McGurk, II–III, Oxford 1995–8
- KCD *Codex Diplomaticus Aevi Saxonici*, ed. J. M. Kemble, 6 vols, London, 1839–48 – cited by charter number
- LDB Little Domesday Book, followed by the folio number and a or b (for recto or verso), cited from *Domesday Book, seu Liber Censualis Willelmi Primi*, 2 vols, London 1783, II, or from *Great Domesday Book: Library Edition*, ed. Ann Williams and R. W. H. Erskine, Alecto Historical Editions, London 2000; followed in parentheses by the abbreviated county name and the entry number (substituting an oblique for a comma between the first and second parts) used in *Domesday Book*, ed. John Morris and others, 34 vols, Phillimore, London 1974–86

<i>Letters of Lanfranc</i>	<i>The Letters of Lanfranc, Archbishop of Canterbury</i> , ed. and trans. Helen Clover and Margaret Gibson, Oxford 1979
Malmesbury, <i>Gesta pontificum</i>	William of Malmesbury, <i>Gesta pontificum Anglorum: The History of the English Bishops</i> , ed. and trans. M. Winterbottom and R. M. Thomson, 2 vols, Oxford 2007
Malmesbury, <i>Gesta regum</i>	William of Malmesbury, <i>Gesta regum Anglorum: The History of the English Kings</i> , ed. and trans. R. A. B. Mynors, M. Winterbottom and R. M. Thomson, 2 vols, Oxford 1998–9
Malmesbury, <i>Historia novella</i>	William of Malmesbury, <i>Historia novella: The Contemporary History</i> , ed. Edmund King, trans. K. R. Potter, Oxford 1998
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica
ODNB	<i>Oxford Dictionary of National Biography</i> , usually cited from online edn (www.oxforddnb.com/view/article/), with article number and date accessed
OED	<i>Oxford English Dictionary</i>
OMT	Oxford Medieval Texts
RADN	<i>Recueil des actes des ducs de Normandie de 911 à 1066</i> , ed. Marie Fauroux, Mémoires de la Société des Antiquaires de Normandie 36, Caen 1961
Orderic	<i>The Ecclesiastical History of Orderic Vitalis</i> , ed. and trans. Marjorie Chibnall, 6 vols, Oxford 1969–80
<i>P & P</i>	<i>Past & Present</i>
PL	<i>Patrologia cursus completus, series Latina</i> , ed. J.-P. Migne, 221 vols, Paris 1844–65
Poitiers	<i>The Gesta Guillelmi of William of Poitiers</i> , ed. and trans. R. H. C. Davis and Marjorie Chibnall, Oxford 1998
PR	<i>The Great Roll of the Pipe for [regnal year, king]</i> , Pipe Roll Society; except for 2–4 <i>Henry II</i> , ed. Joseph Hunter, London 1844; 1 <i>Richard I</i> , ed. Joseph Hunter, London 1844; 26 <i>Henry III</i> , ed. Henry Louis Cannon, London 1918
<i>Proc. Brit. Acad.</i>	<i>Proceedings of the British Academy</i>
<i>Regesta</i>	<i>Regesta Regum Anglo-Normannorum, 1066–1154</i> , 3 vols, I, ed. H. W. C. Davis, Oxford 1913; II, ed. Charles Johnson and H. A. Cronne, Oxford 1956; III, ed. H. A. Cronne and R. H. C. Davis, Oxford 1968
<i>Regesta: William I</i>	<i>Regesta Regum Anglo-Normannorum: The Acta of William I (1066–1087)</i> , ed. David Bates, Oxford 1998
Robertson, <i>AS Charters</i>	A. J. Robertson, <i>Anglo-Saxon Charters</i> , Cambridge 1939
RS	Rolls Series (Chronicles and Memorials of Great Britain and Ireland during the Middle Ages, Published under the Direction of the Master of the Rolls)

Sawyer, <i>AS Charters</i>	P. H. Sawyer, <i>Anglo-Saxon Charters: an Annotated List and Bibliography</i> , London 1968, and with a revised and updated version largely edited by S. E. Kelly, available at www.esawyer.org.uk/
SS	Scriptores (in Folio) [in MGH]
<i>s.a.</i>	<i>sub anno, annis</i> ('under the year, years')
<i>s.v.</i>	<i>sub verbo, verbis</i> ('under the word, words')
<i>Tabularia</i>	<i>Tabularia: Sources écrites de la Normandie medieval</i> [online journal: www.unicaen.fr/mrsh/craham/revue/tabularia/]
<i>Telma</i>	<i>Chartes originales antérieures à 1121 conservées en France</i> , ed. C. Giraud, J.-B. Renault and B.-M. Tock, Nancy 2010: www.cn-telma.fr/originaux/
Torigni ed. Delisle	<i>Chronique de Robert de Torigni: Abbé du Mont-Saint-Michel</i> , ed. L. Delisle, 2 vols, Rouen, 1872–3
Torigni ed. Howlett	<i>Chronicles of the Reigns of Stephen, Henry II, and Richard I</i> , ed. R. Howlett, 4 vols, Rolls Series, London, 1884–9, volume iv
Torigni ed. Bisson	<i>The Chronography of Robert of Torigni</i> , 2 vols, ed. Thomas N. Bisson, Oxford 2020
TRE	<i>tempore regis Eadwardi</i> ('in King Edward's time')
TRHS	<i>Transactions of the Royal Historical Society</i>
TRW	<i>tempore regis Willelmi</i> ('in King William's time')
VCH	<i>The Victoria History of the Counties of England</i> [with county name], in progress
<i>Vita Eadwardi</i>	<i>The Life of King Edward who Rests at Westminster; Attributed to a Monk of Saint-Bertin</i> , ed. and trans. Frank Barlow, 2nd edn, Oxford 1992
Wace, trans. Burgess	<i>The History of the Norman People: Wace's Roman de Rou</i> , trans. Glyn S. Burgess, Woodbridge 2004
Whitelock, <i>AS Wills</i>	D. Whitelock, <i>Anglo-Saxon Wills</i> , Cambridge 1930
x	[The form 1066 x 1087 indicates an uncertain date within the range]

**‘AVALTERRE’ AND ‘AFFINITAS LOTHARINGORUM’:
MAPPING CULTURAL PRODUCTION, CULTURAL
CONNECTIONS AND POLITICAL FRAGMENTATION
IN THE ‘GRAND EST’**

Lindy Grant

When Abbot Suger wanted the best goldsmiths for the great gold cross to stand before the shrine-altar at Saint-Denis, he found them in Lotharingia, probably the Meuse Valley.¹ Suger’s view of Lotharingia was ambivalent. Politically, he saw it as threatening. The great and sprawling Roucy/Marle family he regarded as particularly dangerous, because like the other lords of those parts, they were related to the lords of Lotharingia: the danger was their ‘lotharingorum affinitas’.² A century later, in the early 1240s, Isabelle, princess of France, refused to go through with an arranged marriage to the heir of the Emperor Frederick II, and fell seriously ill. In despair, her mother, Blanche of Castile, sent for advice to a holy woman in distant Avalterre – perhaps Nivelles in Brabant, where Blanche exercised some religious patronage. The holy woman’s advice was wise, though probably unwelcome: don’t pressure your daughter to marry against her will.³

These are two examples, a century apart, of those at the centre of Capetian France reaching out to a distant land – Avalterre, Lotharingia – for important cultural and religious capital. The term Avalterre or Avauterre occurs often in vernacular literature. It indicated the Lower Meuse Valley in northern Lotharingia, but, as in the will of Blanche of Castile’s nephew, Peter of Alençon, it might encompass neighbouring Hainault and comital Flanders. The peoples of Avalterre, Hainault and Flanders were often lumped together. A contemporary Flemish account of the Battle of Bouvines talks of ‘li Hainuier et li Flamenc et li Avalois’, coming from ‘Avalterre, et de Flandre et de Hainault et d’Artois et d’Ostrevant et d’Aroaise’.⁴

¹ *Abbot Suger on the Abbey Church of St-Denis and its Art Treasures*, ed. and trans. by Erwin Panofsky, 2nd edition by Gerda Panofsky-Soergel, Princeton, NJ 1979, 58/9. I would like to thank Professor Frederique Lachaud and Professor Tom O’Donnell for their helpful suggestions and discussion, and Gordon Thompson for providing the accompanying map. Most of the research for this essay was done in Covid conditions, with less than ideal access to libraries.

² *Suger, Vie de Louis le Gros*, ed. Henri Waquet, Paris 1964, 28/9; Lindy Grant, *Abbot Suger: Church and State in Early Twelfth-Century France*, Harlow 1997, 123–4.

³ Sean L. Field, *Courting Sanctity: Holy Women and the Capetians*, Ithaca, NY 2019, 1–2, 4, identifying what used to be read as ‘Nanterre’ as ‘Avauterre’.

⁴ Testament of Peter of Alençon, Paris, AN J403, no. 10, see Field, *Courting Sanctity*, 2–3, n.5. Charles Petit-Dutaillis, ‘Fragment de l’histoire de Philippe-Auguste Roy de France, Chronique en français des années 1214–1216’, *BEC*, 1926, 98–141, at 118, 130. See also John Baldwin, *Aristocratic Life in Medieval France: The Romances of Jean Renart and Gerbert de Montreuil, 1190–1230*, Baltimore, MD 1999, 41, and below, n. 70.



Fig. 1 Lotharingia and its western border zones in the High Middle Ages.

Lotharingia and Flanders were indeed hot-houses for religious, cultural and intellectual ferment and production in the High Middle Ages. They were important generators and disseminators of religious and cultural innovation, within Capetian and, indeed, Anglo-Norman orbits. Many specialists – in literature, language, art history, religious history, and chivalric culture – have investigated this rich cultural production, but the approach has rarely been interdisciplinary. Where it has been interdisciplinary, it has been limited in topographical or temporal scope, emphasizing Lotharingia around the year 1000, and Lower Lotharingia/Avalterre/Flanders in the later twelfth century.⁵ This essay explores aspects of this multifarious cultural production, and the multiple cultural connections of an area where polities were shifting and notoriously difficult to map, over the *longue durée* of the High Middle Ages.

⁵ *Religion et Culture autour de l'an mil : Royaume Capétien et Lotharingie*, ed. Dominique Iogna-Prat and Jean-Charles Picard, Paris 1990; *Une Renaissance : L'art entre Flandre et Champagne, 1150–1250*, Paris 2013.

The area in question comprises the ghost of the Carolingian kingdom of Lotharingia.⁶ But, as with the elastic Avalterre, it is never just a matter of Lotharingia by itself. Historians of political and ecclesiastical institutions, and of societies and familial structures, have all found that observed phenomena cannot be confined to Lotharingia. Historians talk about 'l'aire' or 'l'espace lotharingienne' or 'lotharingisches raum' spilling over into Lotharingia's western border zones, that is lands within the medieval kingdom of France – Champagne, northern Picardy, the Thiérache, Flanders, including Artois – the area that French historians call the 'Grand Est'.⁷ In an attempt at topographical definition, a collection of essays on this inchoate area was published under the title *Francia Media*.⁸

Lotharingia and the western border zone were politically interlinked. The county of Hainault formed a political hinge between the county of Flanders and Lower Lotharingia. It was in Lower Lotharingia, and from 1076 a direct fief of the bishop of Liège. As a result of intermarriage, the counties of Flanders and Hainault were held jointly from 1191 until 1278. The extent of familial intermarriage between Lotharingia and its western borders, from the North Sea to the Vosges, emerges clearly in the Chronicle of Gilbert of Mons.⁹ Suger was correct in noting the interrelationship between the aristocracy of the Thiérache, Champagne and Lotharingia – as demonstrated in a genealogy produced at the abbey of Foigny in the 1160s.¹⁰ As for ecclesiastical institutions, the diocese of Cambrai was in the Empire, within Lower Lotharingia, but was a suffragan of Rheims, and was a double see with Arras in Flemish Artois until 1093. Important 'French' abbeys, like Saint-Remi at Reims and Saint-Bertin at Saint-Omer, had lands in the diocese of Liège.¹¹

⁶ Simon Maclean, 'Shadow Kingdom: Lotharingia and the Frankish World c. 850–c.1050', *History Compass* 11, 2013, 443–57.

⁷ Jens Schneider, 'La Lotharingie était-elle une région historique?', in *Construction de l'espace au moyen âge : pratiques et représentations*, Paris 2007, 425–33. Thomas Bauer, *Lotharingien als Historisches Raum: Raumbildung und Raumbewusstsein in Mittelalter*, Cologne 1997. J.-F. Nieuws, 'Entre Flandre et Champagne : Cadres Politiques, économiques et religieux 1150–1200', in *Une Renaissance*, 14, 'axe-Flandre-Champagne grossi de ses flancs mosan et français'. Charles West, *Reframing the Feudal Revolution: Political and Social Transformation Between Marne and Moselle, c.800–c.1100*, Cambridge 2013, 11–13, 228–54. Dominique Barthélemy, *Les deux âges de la seigneurie banale : pouvoir et société dans la terre des sires de Coucy (milieu XIe- milieu XIIIe siècles)*, Paris 1984, 69, 'une zone interstitielle'.

⁸ *De la mer du Nord à la Méditerranée : Francia media, une région au cœur de l'Europe (c.840–c.1050)*, ed. Michèle Gaillard et al., Luxembourg 2011, especially Michel Parisse, 'Quelques réflexions à propos de la terminologie et de la géographie', *ibid.*, 1–7 : Michel Margue, '«Nous ne sommes ni de l'une ni de l'autre mais les deux à la fois», Entre France et Germanie, les identités Lotharingiennes en question(s)', *ibid.*, 395–427.

⁹ Gilbert of Mons, *Chronicle of Hainault*, trans. Laura Napran, Woodbridge 2005, esp. 3–8, nos 2–7; 40, no. 35; 72, no. 89; 80, no. 100. See also Michel Parisse, *Noblesse et chevalerie en Lorraine médiévale : les familles nobles du XIe au XIIIe siècle*, Nancy 1982, 197–8, 223–26, and Michel Parisse, 'Les hommes et le pouvoir dans la Lorraine de l'an mil', *Religion et Culture*, 259–66, esp. 262–3.

¹⁰ 'Genealogiae Scriptoris Fusniacensis', MGH, SS, XIII, 253–56; see Barthélemy, *Les deux âges*, 126–8.

¹¹ Jean-Louis Kupper, *Liège et l'Église impériale aux XIe–XIIIe siècles*, Liège 1981, 378, n. 22: see also Bauer, *Lotharingien*, 312, 539.

Hydrography, landscape and communications blurred edges further. The meandering River Scheldt marked the north-eastern border between Imperial Lower Lotharingia and the kingdom of France, but provided no serious divide between the counties of Flanders on one side and Hainault on the other.¹² The area had excellent communications. The Rivers Meuse and Moselle provided arteries from the kingdom of France to the Rhine. There were good roads, most of them Roman, notably the road system leading from Italy to the short crossing of the English Channel, through Burgundy, Champagne, Artois and Flanders, just skirting Lotharingia. But the landscapes were diverse. The flatter northern lands were distinguished by early urbanization and industrialization, whichever side of the Scheldt they lay. The more southerly lands were forested, accidented – the ‘needy Ardennes’, according to Abbot Wibald of Stavelot – less urbanized, more focused around scattered abbeys and aristocratic courts, and in that similar to adjacent areas of the French kingdom, the Thierache, and eastern Champagne.¹³ Recent commentators on ‘space’, since the ‘topographical turn’, have dismissed Braudelian insistence on the importance of geophysical elements in the construction of identity as structural determinism.¹⁴ But the impact of thick forests, steep gorges and marshes, on both the actuality of mobility and the imagination should not be underestimated.¹⁵

The Lotharingian edge lies along and across the linguistic border zone between French and Germanic languages. Around 800, this border lay between the River Canche and Lille, but it shifted gradually east and north during the High Middle Ages.¹⁶ The editors of the collection of essays on *Francia Media* observed that the shadow of Lotharingia and its margins still hung over Western Europe in the later twentieth century, when the European Union recognized precisely this arc as an area of economic potential and problems, and dubbed it ‘the blue banana’ – a metaphor that was not available to medieval commentators.¹⁷

Contemporaries found definition as difficult as historians. In 1258, the pope declared that there was no clear border between the kingdom of France and the Empire.¹⁸ In 1309, the scholar John of Saint-Victor struggled to explain that Lotharingia used to mean the region from Brabant to the Rhine, and from the edges (the

¹² Bauer, *Lotharingien*, 542–4.

¹³ Kupper, *Liège et L'église*, 77–105; Gérard Sivery, *L'économie du Royaume de France au siècle de Saint Louis*, Lille 1984, 264–97. For Wibald's comment, *Das Briefbuch Abt Wibalds von Stablo und Corvey*, MHG, *Die Briefe der deutschen Kaiserzeit IX*, ed. Martina Hartmann, Heinz Zatschek and Timothy Reuter, Hanover, 2012, vol. 1, 24–5, no. 13 (J62).

¹⁴ Schneider, ‘La Lotharingie était-elle une région historique’, 422–26, 432.

¹⁵ Isabelle Guyot-Bachy, *La Flandre et les Flamands au miroir des historiens du royaume Xe-XVe siècle*, Villeneuve d'Ascq 2017, 19; Isabelle Guyot-Bachy, ‘Quand et comment l'espace flamande s'est-il imposé aux chroniqueurs du royaume de France (XIe–XIVe siècles)’, in *Construction de l'espace*, 131–45.

¹⁶ L. Milis, ‘The French Low Countries: Cradle of Dutch Culture’, in *Religion, Culture, and Mentalities in the Medieval Low Countries*, Turnhout 2005, 339–42, and L. Milis, ‘The Linguistic Boundary in the County of Guines: A Problem of History and Methodology’, *ibid.*, 353–68. Serge Lusignan, ‘L'espace géographiques et langues : les frontières du français picard’, in *Construction de l'espace*, 263–74. Wolfgang Haubrichs, ‘La structuration linguistique de l'espace : Du bilinguisme à l'émergence des frontières’, in *De la mer du Nord*, 41–68, esp. 55–8.

¹⁷ Alain Dierkins, Michelle Gaillard and Michel Margue, ‘Avant-propos’, in *De la mer du Nord*, vii.

¹⁸ LTC, iv, no. 5439 : Jean Schneider, ‘Lotharingie, Bourgogne ou Provence? L'idée d'un

'fines') of Champagne to Liège, but that it now meant 'from Vaucouleurs on one side, and from the Meuse towards France until the beginning of the diocese of Trier' – not a description easily reduced to a map.¹⁹ From the later twelfth century, the Capetians tried to bring northern Lotharingia, especially Hainault and Brabant, within their sphere of influence: in which they were countered by the kings of England. From the later thirteenth century, the kings of France attempted to annex uncertain western edges of the shadow kingdom into the kingdom of France.

The political structures in the area were unstable and changing. By the early eleventh century, the emperors had shifted their attention from Lotharingia to the Middle Rhine and Saxony, not least because the early Capetians, unlike the late Carolingian kings of West Francia, had no intention of expanding to the east. Lotharingia itself had been separated into the dukedoms of Upper Lotharingia and Lower Lotharingia by 1048. The dukes of Upper Lotharingia, later known as Lorraine, had little political heft. The dominant political institutions there were the great bishoprics – the archbishopric of Trier, and its suffragans, Metz, Toul and Verdun. In the later twelfth century, the counts of Bar became increasingly prominent, helped, but ultimately hindered, by the uncertainty as to whether the county formed part of the Empire or the kingdom of France.²⁰ In 1106, the emperor bestowed the title of duke of Lower Lotharingia on the counts of Louvain. They never succeeded in dominating their fellow Lower Lotharingian counts of Hainault, Namur and Luxembourg, and by 1200 usually called themselves dukes of Brabant.²¹ The bishopric of Liège was as weighty an institution as these lay polities, though between 1167 and 1238 it was held by affiliates of the Flanders-Hainault-Namur dynasty.²² The dioceses of Liège and Utrecht were suffragans of Cologne. Imperial Cambrai, with Flemish Thérouanne and Tournai, were suffragans of Reims. Historians have noted, throughout Lotharingia and its fringes, a deeper familial relationship between the church and the aristocracy than in Capetian France.²³

The counts of Flanders and the counts of Champagne were princely dynasties which in the later twelfth century outshone the kings of France in wealth and cultural capital.²⁴ Philip of Alsace, count of Flanders from 1168 to 1191, came close to building a dynastic 'imperium' in north-east France and Avalterre, comprising the counties of Flanders, Hainault, Boulogne and Vermandois, with Brabant closely linked, though it all fell apart when he died without offspring. In 1180, he had married his niece,

Royaume d'Entre-Deux aux derniers siècles du moyen âge', in *Liège et Bourgogne*, Paris 1972, 24.

¹⁹ E. A. R. Brown, 'Philippe le Bel s'est-il posé la question des frontières du royaume?', in *Lyon 1312. Rattacher la ville au Royaume ?*, ed. Alexis Charansonnet, Jean-Louis Gaulin and Xavier Hélary, Lyon 2020, 39–42.

²⁰ Kupper, *Liège et L'église*, 166.

²¹ Nicholas Ruffini-Ronzani, 'The Counts of Louvain and the Anglo-Norman World, c. 1100–c. 1215', *ANS* XLII, 2020, 135–9; G. Croenen, 'L'entourage des ducs de Brabant au XIII^e siècle', in *A l'ombre du pouvoir : les entours princiers au Moyen Âge*, ed. J.-L. Kupper and A. Marchandisse, Liège/Geneva 2003, 277–93, and idem., 'Regions, Principalities and Regional Identity in the Low Countries: The Case of the Nobility', in *Regions and Landscapes: Reality and Imagination in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe*, ed. Peter Ainsworth and Tom Scott, Oxford 2000, 139–53.

²² Kupper, *Liège et L'église*, 185.

²³ Parisse, 'Les hommes et le pouvoir', 264; West, *Reframing the Social Revolution*, 242–53.

²⁴ Nieu, 'Entre Flandre et Champagne', 13–19.

Isabelle of Hainault, to the young French king Philip Augustus, giving southern Flanders as her dowry. A series of succession crises brought most of comital Flanders under direct or indirect Capetian control in the early thirteenth century.

This did not suit the Angevin kings of England. The wool trade engendered strong economic ties between England and Flanders, and the English kings had often, if not always, pursued alliances with the counts. From the later twelfth century, the French and English kings vied for the support of the competitive aristocracy of Flanders, the Thiérache and Avalterre – the Counts of Boulogne, Guînes, Saint-Pol, the lords of Béthune and Coucy, the counts of Hainault, Louvain/Brabant, and Namur. Between 1197 and 1218 the imperial succession was at issue. The English kings, Richard and then John, supported their nephew, Otto of Brunswick as emperor, while Philip Augustus supported the claims of the infant Frederick II. The lords, lay and ecclesiastical, of Lower Lotharingia, enticed with much English money, tended to support Otto of Brunswick. But the formidable Angevin alliance was defeated at the Battle of Bouvines in 1214.²⁵ The elites of Lotharingia and its western fringes played from the start a prominent role in the Crusading movement, with Godfrey of Bouillon, nephew of the Duke of Lotharingia, regarded as the leader of the First Crusade.

Religious and intellectual culture

The earliest monastic reforms of the central Middle Ages – those of Gerald of Brogne at Gorze and Saint-Maximin at Trier in the earlier tenth century, and of Richard of Saint-Vanne at Verdun in the early eleventh – occurred in Lotharingia.²⁶ In the early twelfth century, Lower Lotharingia and its western margins were a centre of Augustinian canonical reform, notably the Premonstratensian and Arrouaisian orders.²⁷ St Norbert, the founder of the Premonstratensian order, came from Avalterre, the lower Meuse, and learnt French while studying at Laon. Although the Premonstratensian mother house was near Laon, at Premontre, where local French and German (Lotharingian) masons vied in building the church, the order's centre of gravity lay in Lower Lotharingia, with major houses at Averbode and Floreffe, the necropolis for the counts of Namur.²⁸ In the early thirteenth century, the beguine movement emerged in Lower Lotharingia and neighbouring Flanders, eventually, as we have seen, attracting the attention of Blanche of Castile.²⁹

²⁵ Eljas Oksanen, *Flanders and the Anglo-Norman World 1066–1216*, Cambridge 2012, 45–53; John W. Baldwin, “‘Once there was an Emperor’”. A Political Reading of the Romances of Jean Renart, in *Jean Renart and the Art of Romance*, ed. Nancy Vine Durling, Gainesville, FL 1997, 45–83; Baldwin, *Aristocratic Life*, 32–46; Ruffini-Ronzani, ‘The Counts of Louvain’, 144–9; Gabrielle Spiegel, *Romancing the Past: The Rise of Vernacular Prose Historiography in Thirteenth-Century France*, Berkeley, CA 1993, 14–54.

²⁶ John Nightingale, *Monasteries and Patrons in the Gorze Reform, Lotharingia c. 850–1000*, Oxford 2001; Kupper, *Liège et L’église*, 359–61; Jean-Pol Evrard, ‘Verdun au temps de l’évêque Haymon (988–1024)’, in *Religion et Culture*, 273–8.

²⁷ Kupper, *Liège et L’église*, 366–72.

²⁸ ‘Vita Norberti’, MGH, SS, 12, 670–706, esp. 681, 682, 685 for the masons at Premontre, ‘quidam Teutonici erant, quidam Gallici’.

²⁹ Walter Simons, *Cities of Ladies: Beguine Communities in the Medieval Low Countries, 1200–1565*, Philadelphia, PA 2001, 2–48; John van Engen, ‘The Religious Women of Liège at the Turn of the Thirteenth Century’, in *Medieval Liège at the Crossroads of Europe: Monastic*