BRITISH HOUSES IN LATE MUGHAL DELHI

SYLVIA SHORTO



British Houses in Late Mughal Delhi

WORLDS OF THE EAST INDIA COMPANY

ISSN 1752-5667

Series Editor
H. V. Bowen (Swansea University)

Editorial Board
Andrew Cook (British Library)
Rajat Datta (Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi)
P. J. Marshall (King's College, London)
Nigel Rigby (National Maritime Museum)

This series offers high-quality studies of the East India Company, drawn from across a broad chronological, geographical and thematic range. The rich history of the Company has long been of interest to those who engage in the study of Britain's commercial, imperial, maritime and military past, but in recent years it has also attracted considerable attention from those who explore art, cultural and social themes within an historical context. The series will thus provide a forum for scholars from different disciplinary backgrounds, and for those whose have interests in the history of Britain (London and the regions), India, China, Indonesia, as well as the seas and oceans.

The editors welcome submissions from both established scholars and those beginning their career; monographs are particularly encouraged but volumes of essays will also be considered. All submissions will receive rapid, informed attention. They should be sent in the first instance to:

Professor H. V. Bowen, Department of History, Swansea University, Swansea SA2 8PP. Email: h.v.bowen@swansea.ac.uk

Previously published titles are listed at the back of this volume

BRITISH HOUSES IN LATE MUGHAL DELHI

Sylvia Shorto

© Sylvia Shorto 2018

All Rights Reserved. Except as permitted under current legislation no part of this work may be photocopied, stored in a retrieval system, published, performed in public, adapted, broadcast, transmitted, recorded or reproduced in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of the copyright owner

The right of Sylvia Shorto to be identified as the author of this work has been asserted in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988

First published 2018 The Boydell Press, Woodbridge

ISBN 978-1-78327-208-2

The Boydell Press is an imprint of Boydell & Brewer Ltd PO Box 9, Woodbridge, Suffolk IP12 3DF, UK and of Boydell & Brewer Inc. 668 Mt Hope Avenue, Rochester, NY 14620–2731, USA website: www.boydellandbrewer.com

A CIP catalogue record for this title is available from the British Library

The publisher has no responsibility for the continued existence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate

This publication is printed on acid-free paper

Typeset by Fakenham Prepress Solutions, Fakenham, Norfolk NR21 8NN

This book is dedicated to my husband, Gavin, and my son, Hamish.

CONTENTS

List of Illustrations	ix
Preface and Acknowledgements	xii
Abbreviations	xvi
Glossary	xix
Chapter 1 Knowledge of Delhi: The Eighteenth Century	1
Chapter 2 Hybrid Accommodations: David Ochterlony, the First Residency and the Mubarak Bagh	25
Chapter 3 A Lovely Wilderness: Charles Metcalfe and the Garden Houses at Shalimar	55
Chapter 4 Truly Fairy Palaces: Robert Smith in Delhi and in Europe	81
Chapter 5 The World Displayed: William Fraser and his House on the Hill	111
Chapter 6 A Tomb with View: Thomas Theophilus Metcalfe's Dilkusha	139
Chapter 7 Dreaming of Home	175
Bibliography	189
Index	202

ILLUSTRATIONS

Plates

1	Robert Tytler (1818–72) and Harriet Tytler (1828–58), The Road in	
	Front of the Magazine at Delhi (1858). Albumen print from calotype	
	negative. Photo 193(3) from the Tytler Album © The British	
	Library Board	31
2	John Murray (1809–98), The College, Delhi, c.1859. The building	
	was the first Residency. Print from calotype negative. Photo	
	52/(10) © The British Library Board	36
3	Anonymous (Indian), Auspicious Plan of General David Ochterlony's Garden	
	outside Shah Jehanabad c. 1825 (Mubarak Bagh). Transparent and	
	opaque watercolour on paper, sheet size 72 × 126 mm. Museum	
	purchase, 1979.2.25 © Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco	50
4	Sita Ram (fl. c.1810–22), Charles Metcalfe's Establishment at the	
	Shalimar Gardens North of Delhi, 1815. Inscribed 'Residency at	
	Shalimar'. Watercolour on paper, 322 × 520 mm, from the	
	Hastings Albums, Add.Or.4806 © The British Library Board	65
5	George Hutchinson (1793–1852), A Palladian Garden House, Delhi	
	(Shalimar). Inscribed: 'G. Hutchinson. Dehlee. May 1820'.	
	Watercolour on paper, 338 × 565 mm, WD3825 © The British	
	Library Board	67
6	Robert Smith's Delhi House. Photograph by the author, 2017	82
7	Robert Smith (1787–1873), Baronne near Luknow. Nov. 1814. Pencil	
	drawing from Robert Smith's sketchbook, WD312, f.12' 13' © The	
	British Library Board	96
8	Robert Smith (1787–1873), The Kila Kona Masjid, Purana Qila, Delhi,	
	c.1825. Oil on canvas, 74.9 × 106 cm, Paul Mellon Collection,	
	B1976.7.74 © Yale Center for British Art	100
9	Esther Boise van Deman (1862–1937), Villa Mills on top of the Domus	
	Augustana, 1907. Taken at the time of its demolition. Photograph,	
	catalogue # 82743 (van Deman 717) © The American Academy	
	in Rome	104
10	Unknown photographer, Le 'Château de l'Anglais' en construction au	
	Mont-Boron, c.1860 (detail)	108

11	Company School, <i>Ludlow Castle, Delhi</i> . Mid-19 th century. Watercolour on paper, 91 × 422 mm, 1920, 0917,0.252 © Trustees	
	of the British Museum	119
12	Robert Tytler (1818–72) and Harriet Tytler (1828–58), <i>Hindu Rao's</i>	
	House, 1858. Albumen print, 508 × 370 mm, photo 193/(9) © The	
	British Library Board	129
13	Attributed to Mazhar 'Ali Khan (fl.1840s), A View from the Rocky	
	Heights above the Military Cantonment Looking Toward the city of Delhi,	
	c.1845. Water-colour and body-colour on ivory, 105 × 210 mm,	
	Add Or 5476 © The British Library Board	132
14	Sketch of proposed alterations to William Fraser's house, 1821. In a letter	
	from George Hutchinson to William Fraser, B 430, Fraser of	
	Reelig papers	133
15	Mazhar 'Ali Khan (fl.1840s) and studio, The Principal Taikhana of	
	Metcalfe House, c.1844. Opaque watercolour, from the Metcalfe	
	Album, Add.Or.5475, f. 85(a) © The British Library Board	143
16	Mazhar 'Ali Khan (fl.1840s) and studio, Plan of the House at Dehlee	
	(Metcalfe House). Opaque watercolour, from the Metcalfe Album,	
	Add.Or.5475, f. 84 © The British Library Board	147
17	Robert Mabon (d. 1789), Ground Plan of a Bungaloe. Watercolour	
	and graphite with pen and black ink, sheet 58.4×29.8 cm, Paul	
	Mellon Collection, 7599-B1977.14.22429 © Yale Center for	
	British Art	154
18	Unknown photographer, <i>Dilkusha</i> , c.1865. Albumen print.	
	Hardcastle papers, Templehouse, Co. Sligo, courtesy Debonnaire	
1.0	Perceval	163
19	Mazhar 'Ali Khan (fl.1840s) and studio, The Tomb of Muhammad	
	Quli Khan as Converted to a Residence by Sir Thomas Theophilus	
	Metcalfe (Dilkusha), c.1844. Opaque watercolour, from the Metcalfe	1.05
20	Album, Add.Or.5475, f.82 © The British Library Board	165
20	Reelig House. Photograph by the author, c. 2015	180
Fig	pures	
1	The First Delhi Residency and Gardens	34
	Robert Smith's House	94
	Robert Smith's Taikhana	97
4	Redcliffe Towers	106
	The Tomb of Muhammad Ouli Khan (Dilkusha)	162

Map

Map of Delhi, c. 1853. Drawn by Rami Saab

xxiv

Genealogical Tables

1	The Family of David Ochterlony (1758–1825)	xxvi
2	The Families of Charles Metcalfe (1785–1846) and Thomas	
	Theophilus Metcalfe (1795–1853)	xxviii
3	The Family of Robert Smith (1787–1873)	XXX
4	The Family of William Fraser (1794–1835)	xxxi

The author and publishers are grateful to all the institutions and individuals listed for permission to reproduce the materials in which they hold copyright. Every effort has been made to trace the copyright holders; apologies are offered for any omission, and the publishers will be pleased to add any necessary acknowledgement in subsequent editions.

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

During the years I have been gathering material for this book, I have seen extraordinary changes take place in the city of Delhi. To be sure, the city and its surrounding countryside have always been in flux, with observers ready to express concern about how the future might differ from the past. In a letter written in 1821, for instance, William Linnaeus Gardner, who had married into the Mughal aristocracy, worried about proposed British modifications to local land settlements and about how the excessive taxes and rigid tenancy regulations then being introduced by the agents of the East India Company would 'ruin and destroy the old hereditary families'.¹ His was just one voice in the longer stream of time, and his voice was ignored. Yet nothing from that period in history can compare to the rapid changes that a post-Independence Delhi is experiencing in the twenty-first century, making accurate narration of the many histories of this great city all the more important in the present moment.

Land and houses are inextricably linked. This book is about houses built by a group of East India Company officials between 1803 and 1853, during the transitional period when the Company first arrived in Delhi. It is about how houses were planned and built, and how the land for building them was acquired. It is about the ways the houses both related to and resisted established architectural conventions, both those in the city of Delhi and those in the minds of the incoming Company officials who would now use building to help secure their power. It is about meaning in the location of these houses.

The book straddles disciplines. In one sense, it is a work of architectural history, and as such it draws on early studies in the field that considered formal or functional variations to European precedent and assumed transplanted versions of an architectural core into an Indian periphery. It also references more recent critical texts, including interpretive work on architecture as material culture, not yet applied to building in early-nineteenth-century Delhi. But facts and interpretation must be in accord if interpretation is to have lasting value. When we examine a house closely, it can tell us a great deal about the mentalities of the people who built, owned or lived in it. My focus in preparing this book has been first to return to archival sources and then to consider critically how any new information uncovered might help us

¹ National Army Museum (hereafter NAM), Gardner papers, letter 88.

understand lives and social practices, both at the time of building and as use changed over time. In the analyses of Henri Lefebvre, architecture gives a physical frame to the way people interrelate with those who share their space. Both builders and planners shape physical environments that embody sets of socially accepted rules that they themselves endorse, whether consciously or unconsciously. Users then make these environments real by acting in and on them and by altering them for their own benefits. But how might these ideas be transposed to help us understand historical urban landscapes that were subverted or adapted after conquest? And how are distinctions, the differences between everyday practices and the social and political structures within which they exist, played out in an occupied city by a specific group of individuals? No society is static. If pre-existing buildings within neighbourhoods bear the imprint or mental map of the past, what might they tell us when they are adapted to suit the different and changing social needs of individuals from an incoming or over-powering group? How does the location of new building link to these changes?

In another, interrelated sense, the book is a group biography. Individual lives are an important window onto the past, and scholars are now beginning to consider the roles that personal, family and collective micro-stories can provide in wider historical frameworks when charting the rise of early modern Britain from mercantile to imperial power. If a private house and its contents define the boundaries of the self, then by writing about houses I am inevitably also writing about the individuals who built them. My narrative here is limited to the interconnected 'lives in building' of five Company officials - David Ochterlony, Charles Metcalfe, Robert Smith, William Fraser and Thomas Theophilus Metcalfe – and to the fifty-year period between the British conquest of Delhi and the death of the second Metcalfe, four years before the Revolt of 1857. But though there is a strong biographical dimension to this study, I hope it will not be read as an uncritical celebration of Scotsmen riding around with multiple wives on gaily caparisoned elephants. All the five life stories have proved to be far more complex than that.

The building activities of these five men have had to be carefully pieced together. Many local records were lost during the Revolt, and no single major source or group of sources provides authoritative information on British houses in the city in this period, either directly or indirectly. In returning to archival records to seek out new facts, I have had in mind an underlying set of questions, the foremost being to question how the knowledge they contain was constructed. The documentary resources I have used include private papers as well as official, public accounts, and I give equal consideration to both and - subject to my language limitations - to both British and Indian accounts. Official records are limited in their scope, but informal, private papers, particularly the letters and notebooks of women, give narratives of a different reality, full of observations about domestic detail that would otherwise be lost

xv

to us. While the accounts of individuals are always held to be more subjective than official accounts, they reveal far more freely the complexities of colonial culture within specific contexts than do bureaucratic texts with their conventional formats and codified language. Private papers give us glimpses of lived experience, and they are invaluable fragments of archaeological evidence of otherwise undocumented discourses and beliefs. They can help us understand the experience of home life, revealing social, economic, technical, material and emotional concerns. Diaries, letters and travel journals are all used here to help reconstruct the domestic experience of the five men. Of particular interest have been the Fraser of Reelig papers, which have not been used before to narrate Delhi's buildings. The Gardner papers, the Canning papers, the Monson papers, the Lawrence papers and the Templehouse papers have also been consulted. In different measure they help clarify the sequences of building and the lives, ambitions and motivations of the individual builders. They all advance our overall understanding of life in Delhi in the early nineteenth century. But this, it turned out, was not enough. Information from archival sources has had to be cross-referenced against other types of record including visual representations – paintings, drawings, maps and photographs made for a variety of patrons - to try to fill gaps in our knowledge. Each provided its own perspective on building in Delhi, and each put up something of a struggle to be analysed within the terms of its own discipline, resulting in a richer and more detailed picture of changing British responses to the Mughal polity they gradually displaced.

Combining these varied sources, the book examines the houses built by the five East India Company officials in early-nineteenth-century Delhi. An introductory chapter outlines how we know what we know of Delhi in the eighteenth century – its social and physical topography immediately before conquest in 1803. The book is then organised into five chapters that focus on the lives of each of the five officials and their building (and collecting) activities, through a methodological dialogue between texts and surviving material culture. The study of Robert Smith has been particularly productive, as he not only built extensively but was also himself a painter. As Garrison Engineer in Delhi after 1822, Smith is known to have been involved in designing a number of monumental public buildings and in the restoration and conservation of several others. In the book I attribute houses to him on stylistic grounds through evidence in his drawings. Houses designed and lived in by Smith in England and in France after his departure from Delhi support these attributions. Considered as a group, these five lives demonstrate a shift from the initial embrace of Indian living to a manipulation of that way of life for political ends, as attitudes towards the country hardened before the outbreak of the inevitable Revolt in 1857. A concluding chapter reflects on the always present, semi-conscious desires of my subjects to return to live in houses in Britain. As an entry in Hobson-Jobson tells us, 'Nobody calls India home – not even those who have been here thirty years or more, and are never likely to return.'2

Cities are the most intricate texts of all. As palimpsests, they embody layered information about the age in which they were built and the social and political circumstances of the generations who used and changed them. The city of Delhi still remains the most important primary source for its own study. Patterns of use can be imagined from those quarters where historic fabric still remains. But this must be augmented by secondary sources to try to explain parts of the urban fabric that are no longer there to see. Much of Delhi's early-nineteenth-century built heritage simply does not exist any longer. Houses have long since crumbled and their bricks been reused, and what remains is fast being obliterated by other pressures, often more immediate than preservation. As Delhi expands into what now seems to be an almost limitless global megacity, and as its population burgeons and its middle classes swell, traces of a past that were once palpable, both in physical remains and in social practices, are quickly sinking below the surface, pushed down by time and relentless outside influences that do not abate. A new archaeological layer is being formed that will be very hard to excavate in the future. But embedded in change there is a discontinuous understanding of the past through the fragments of continuity, and this can give a narrative structure to histories. A chronological order does not quite work for my narrative, but perhaps neither does the one that I have chosen to use, of individual lives through their building. But whatever it still lacks, this book needs to be published now. The only constant is change, and even in the very near future a different book would surely have been the result, for that is the condition of our time.

In addition to the scholars whose work I have tried to build on, many friends and colleagues helped me during the course of researching this book. I would like to single out Kathy Fraser, whose own book on the lives of the five Fraser brothers was being written at the same time. I also thank Cathy Asher, Tim Barringer, Clive Cheesman, Andrew Cook, Ned Cooke, Abir El Tayeb, Narayani Gupta, Alireza Korangy, Marius Kociejowski, Rami Saab, R.C. Sharma, Richard Saumarez Smith, Nalini Thakur, Jim Wescoat and Ahmad Yehya for being generous with their time and their wide-ranging realms of expertise. William Dalrymple very kindly shared his transcriptions of the letters of William Linnaeus Gardner and of the Wak Kani letters. The archivists who helped me in Nice, Rome and Venice were consistently supportive despite my terrible French and Italian, enabling me to fill some of the voids in what we know of Robert Smith's life. Essential financial support came from the American Institute of Indian Studies, the American University of Beirut, and from the Paul Mellon Foundation in the form of a Senior Fellowship and an Author Publication Grant. I am very, very grateful.

Letters from Madras, 1837, cited in Henry Yule and A.C. Burnell, Hobson-Jobson: a Glossary of Colloquial Anglo-Indian Words and Phrases ... (London and Calcutta, 1886), p. 421

ABBREVIATIONS

IOR India Office Records, British Library

NAI National Archives of India NAM National Army Museum TNA The National Archives, Kew

GLOSSARY

akhbār newsletter or bulletin almirah cupboard or wardrobe

bangla vernacular Bengali house type

baoli step well

baradari garden pavilion

bībī beloved

bigha measure of land varying from a third of an acre to

an acre, depending on yield and productivity

begum lady of rank bundh closure or sluice

chabutra raised viewing platform

chandni white cloth spread over carpet to designate special

area

chārbāgh formal Persianate garden divided by water

channels into quadrants

chhaja broad projecting eave

chhatri raised domed pavilion; an umbrella

chobdar usher or attendant

chowrie a fly-whisk

chunam fine polished lime plaster resembling marble dak relay postal system; a post station or traveller's rest

house

dālān a veranda or peristyle dargāh Sufi shrine or burial place

deohri public hallway of a house, often approached via a

dog-leg bend to ensure visual privacy

dhobi washer-man

dīvān chief minister; minister responsible for fiscal

administration

dīwānī fiscal agency; revenue doab land between two rivers

durbar ceremonial public reception; also an audience

chamber

firmān official decree

ghazal Persian verse form composed of couplets

godown store room

guldasta pinnacle topped with a flower form

hajj annual pilgrimage to Mecca

ḥammām bath complex

hasht bihisht literally, eight paradises. A formal Persian-derived

plan with eight chambers surrounding a central core

hauz man-made water tank or reservoir

haveli mansion

howdah ceremonial seat for riding on an elephant,

sometimes with a canopy

hukkah water pipe hurkaru running footman imām Muslim religious leader

īvān vaulted hall open on one side to face a room, court

or garden

jagir revocable land assignment, or grant of income

from such land

jharna fountain

jharoka small projecting covered balcony

jhil seasonal freshwater lake kārkhāna artisanal workshop

khānabāgh domestic garden inside a residential complex kharīf or khurīf seasonal crops harvested in the autumn khilʿat robe of honour or other honorific gift

kincob rich silk fabric with patterns woven in a weft of

gold- and silver-wrapped thread

kos a variable measure of distance of 2,600 'ordinary

paces' or approximately 2 miles

kotla fortress

kutcheri court premises

lakh one hundred thousand

lakhauri brick flat thin rectangular indigenous brick

mahal house or palace, in particular its inner, women's

apartments

maḥalla neighbourhood mahout elephant handler

mansabdar member of the non-hereditary imperial

bureaucracy of the Mughal Empire, commander

of an army

magbara mausoleum, tomb

maund variable unit of measurement by volume. The

measure was standardized by the British in Bengal

in 1833 at 82.28 lbs (100 Troy pounds). 1 maund

= 40 seers = 1,200 dams

minar tower
mohur gold coin
mu'āf rent-free land
munshī scribe, translator
musāfirkhāna a lodging for pilgrims
mushā'ara poetry assembly
musnud a bolster for reclining

muthamman bagdhadi square plan with canted corners

nagārkhāna ceremonial drum room

nautch performance by professional dancers navvāb Mughal viceroy or holder of rank; later an

independent ruler

nazr ceremonial gift presented to a superior nujīb informal infantryman or militiaman

nullah watercourse for drainage

palankin covered litter carried on horizontal poles
palkee a palanquin; by extension, in procession
pankah canvas-covered swinging fan suspended from a

ceiling; a fan

parganah unit for the collection of revenue consisting

of a group of villages and their surrounding

countryside

pīr Sufi holy man

pukka a permanent or brick-built structure purdah veil; cloth screening women's quarters

qasīda panegyric verse

qil'a fort

rajput military caste of Northern India, traditionally

landholders

rang mahal women's quarters; literally, coloured palace

sadr law

sarkar government

sepoy a native foot soldier

serai lodging for travellers and their animals;

caravanserai

shahr āshob lament for a city shikār ceremonial hunt

shish mahal mirrored room or apartment suba/ subahdār province/provincial governor

tahsīl administrative sub-district for collection of village

revenue

xxii Glossary

taḥṣīldār collector of revenue for a sub-district

taikhāna suite of subterranean rooms for the hot weather

takhallus literary pen-name

talwar a curved sword with a broad tip

tatti woven screen

toshkhāna treasury; strong room for the receipt of ceremonial

gifts

'umarā nobility

urs death anniversary vazīr principal minister

zamīndār holder of a patrimonial rental estate; landowner

zanāna accommodation for women

