THE
SACRED
SPACE

OF THE VIRGIN MARY IN MEDIEVAL HISPANIC LITERATURE

from Gonzalo de Berceo to Ambrosio Montesino

LESLEY K. TWOMEY

THE SACRED SPACE OF THE VIRGIN MARY IN MEDIEVAL HISPANIC LITERATURE

LESLEY K. TWOMEY

THE SACRED SPACE OF THE VIRGIN MARY IN MEDIEVAL HISPANIC LITERATURE

FROM GONZALO DE BERCEO TO AMBROSIO MONTESINO

TAMESIS

To Derry, for a lifetime of support and love

Contents

Spaces of Protection

Illustrations

Acknowledgements

I began the study of how the Immaculate Conception was expressed in literature about fifteen years ago. While studying manifestations of the doctrine, I was aware that I had neither the time nor the resources to look at one important aspect of the way in which the Church's doctrine had been transmitted: the offices and Masses offered daily in its cathedrals, churches, monasteries, and convents. What was heard and sung in church must have impacted on poets' thinking on the doctrine.

I was, therefore, very grateful to be accorded by the Arts and Humanities Research Board, as it then was, the means to undertake the research which underpins this book. Without its assistance, this study could never have been undertaken, and the history of the liturgical development of the doctrine would have remained unwritten. Travel around the dioceses of Spain was additionally supported by a Small Research Grant from the British Academy. Their generosity permitted me to travel extensively and to create a database to store the results of the project. Thus began the exciting task of seeking out what the poets and authors heard when they went to Mass, or when they read or heard the daily office in their palaces, in their religious houses, or in their local community.

I am grateful to colleagues who have listened patiently at different conferences over the years and to those who have made helpful comments on presentations of various chapters, particularly at AHGBI conferences, where several chapters have been given as papers. My thanks too to Dr Barry Taylor for giving me the opportunity to present my work on so many occasions. I presented the chapter on fountains as an invited seminar paper at MIMSS at Oxford University and a section of the chapter on the Temple at the Cork Golden Age symposium. Questions and comments at all these conferences assisted me in developing my thinking. Particularly, I wish to thank Professor Anthony Lappin, Professor Terence O'Reilly, Professor Joseph Snow, and Dr Edward Cooper, for their painstaking and kind comments on drafts of chapters and for the pertinent suggestions they made.

Abbreviations

ACMRS	Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies
AZMRTS	Arizona Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies
BH	*Bulletin Hispanique*
BHS	*Bulletin of Hispanic Studies*
BRAE	*Boletín de la Real Academia Española*
CSIC	Centro Superior de Investigaciones Científicas
CUP	Cambridge University Press
HR	*Hispanic Review*
HSMS	Hispanic Seminary of Medieval Studies
JHP	*Journal of Hispanic Philology*
MEV	Museu Episcopal de Vic
MLN	*Modern Language Notes*
MNAC	Museu Nacional de Art de Catalunya (Barcelona)
NG	National Gallery (London)
NJB	New Jerusalem Bible
NM	*Neuphilologische Mitteilungen*
NRFE	*Nueva Revista de Filología Española*
OUP	Oxford University Press
RAE	Real Academia Española
RFE	*Revista de Filología Española*
PMHRS	Papers of the Medieval Hispanic Research Seminar
PMLA	*Papers of the Modern Languages Association*
PL	Patrologia Latina
SEMYR	Seminario de Estudios Medievales y Renacentistas
TWAS	Twayne World Authors Series
V&A	Victoria and Albert Museum (London)

Introduction

Sacred Spaces and Places: Constructing the Virgin Mary in Hispanic Literature

> The supreme essence […] is in no place and time because it has no place and time. It is in every place and time because it is absent from none.[1]

Interest in understanding the Virgin Mary among British and North American scholars is growing, as a recent spate of books on aspects of the Virgin Mary reveals.[2] Yet, in many ways, there has always been a place for Marian studies, and interest in the Virgin has never dissipated among European scholars.[3] Mary

---

[1]   Anselm of Canterbury, *The Major Works (including Monologion, Proslogion, and Why God Became Man)*, ed. Brian Davies and G. R. Evans (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), p. 39. Sections of this book form part of the research produced for 'La literatura hagiográfica catalana: fuentes, ediciones y estudios', FF12017–83950–P.

[2]   This is how Miri Rubin begins her introduction to *'Gaude Virgo Gloriosa': Marian Miracle Literature in the Iberian Peninsula and France in the Middle Ages*, ed. Juan-Carlos Conde and Emma Gatland, PMHRS, 69/Publications of the Magdalen Iberian Medieval Studies Seminar, 2 (London: Department of Iberian and Latin American Studies, 2011), pp. 9–14; see, for example, Donna Spivey Ellington, *From Sacred Body to Angelic Soul: Understanding Mary in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Washington, DC: Catholic University of America Press, 2001); Sarah-Jane Boss, *Mary* (London: Continuum, 2004); Sarah-Jane Boss (ed.), *Mary: The Complete Resource* (London: Continuum); Miri Rubin, *Mother of God: A History of the Virgin Mary* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2009); Amy G. Remensnyder, *La Conquistadora: The Virgin Mary at War and Peace in the Old and New World* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014). Studies of the Virgin in the context of the Passion also abound, most recently Cynthia Robinson, *Imagining the Passion in a Multiconfessional Castile: The Virgin, Christ, Devotions, and Images in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2013**).** Anne Winston-Allen addresses the Virgin in the context of the rosary and hence principal events in her life equating to her feast-days. Anne Winston-Allen, *Stories of the Rose: The Making of the Rosary in the Middle Ages* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2005).

[3]   Classic studies of the Virgin include Hilda Charlotte Graef's scholarly study *Mary: A History of Doctrine and Devotion*, 2 vols (London: Sheed & Ward, 1963–65); Marina Warner's more approachable *Alone of All her Sex: The Myth and Cult of the Virgin Mary* (London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 1976); and Jaroslav Pelikan's study of Mary and doctrine as represented in art, *Mary through the Centuries: Her Place in the History of Culture* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1996). European scholars' studies of the Virgin over the last century include Matthias

is the 'nurturant', 'omnipotent' other, the mother figure whose cult has never diminished and whose all-enveloping power lies in her 'self-abnegation, suffering, intercession, and virginity'.[4]

The principal aim of this book will be to re-examine typology about place for what it tells us about the Virgin Mary. To do so, I will seek to draw close to major trends in theological thinking, but also to give importance to place, as authors chose the places they believed best represented aspects of the Virgin's nature: garden, fountain, Temple, dwelling, or fortified stronghold. I will do this by re-evaluating how those metaphors are used in vernacular literatures, setting my findings alongside those from liturgy, to determine whether there was any influence from liturgy upon poets and, if so, how it might operate.[5] In this I build on the work of James W. Marchand and his study of the hymns of Gonzalo de Berceo and their Latin origins, although without examining localized variants of the hymns that he studies.[6]

There were strong literary traditions in both Castile-Leon and Aragon by the fifteenth century, and study of religious prose and poetry will not only provide further evidence of the way in which the newest Marian feast, the Conception, was becoming embedded in the kingdoms but will also evaluate what ordinary clerics or lay people understood about the various doctrines celebrated in the range of Marian feasts in the calendar: the Purification, the Annunciation, the Visitation, the Assumption, and the Nativity.

Joseph Scheeben, *Mariology*, trans. Thoedore Leonard Marie Jerven Geukers, 2 vols (St. Louis: Herder, 1946–47); Max Thurian, *Mary, Mother of the Lord: Figure of the Church*, trans. Neville B. Cryer (London: Faith, 1963); Stefano de Fiores, and Salvatore Meo, *Nuevo diccionario de mariología*, 2nd edn, trans. A. Ortiz García, E. Requena Clavo and J. Mª Corzo (Madrid: San Pablo, 1988); Antonio Royo Marín, *La Virgen María: teología y espiritualidad marianas*, 2nd edn (Madrid: Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos, 1997). René Laurentin's studies also span the last century: 'The Immaculate Conception', in *Theological Investigations*, ed. Karl Rahner, trans. Cornelius Ernst (Baltimore, MD: Helicon Press, 1961), I, 201–27; *Court traité sur la Vierge Marie*, 5th edn (Paris: Lethielleux, 1968); and *Marie, mère du Seigneur* (Paris: Desclée, 1984).

   [4]   Nancy Frey Breuner, 'The Cult of the Virgin Mary in Spain and Southern Italy', *Ethos*, 20 (1992): 66–95, at pp. 87–8.

   [5]   One such study was carried out by S. F. Ryle, although without particular reference to Spain: 'The Sequence: Reflections on Literature and Liturgy', in Francis Cairns (ed.), *Papers of the Liverpool Latin Seminar, 1976: Classical Latin Poetry, Medieval Latin Poetry, Greek Poetry*, Classical and Medieval Texts, Papers, and Monographs, 2 (Liverpool: University of Liverpool, 1977), pp. 171–82. For an understanding of medieval liturgy and its setting in churches, cathedrals, or monastic houses, see John Harper, *The Forms and Orders of Western Liturgy from the Tenth to the Eighteenth Century: A Historical Guide and Introduction for Students and Musicians* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991), especially pp. 73–126 on the divine office and its constituent parts: sung antiphons, versicles and responses, lessons or chapters. See also on books for the liturgy, pp. 58–72: books of information and instruction, books for use in the office, and books for use in the Mass.

   [6]   James W. Marchand, 'The Hymns of Gonzalo de Berceo and their Latin Sources', *Allegorica: A Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Literature*, 3 (1978): 105–25.

This book has a secondary, but equally important, purpose. It is the fruit of a desire to arrive at a deeper understanding of aspects of the beliefs about Mary that poets and authors absorbed, in the late medieval period, from the way religion was practised in public worship or through private devotion. Marchand studied three hymns regularly found in the liturgy and commented on Gonzalo de Berceo's translation of them; particularly relevant is the study of the *Ave maris stella*.[7]

At the same time, I seek to address the increasing lack of exposure to Christian tradition among scholars and students of religious poetry. Experienced critics can easily be misled when commenting on the lyrical power and emotion contained in certain medieval verses, which depend entirely for their structure on the sermon tradition.[8] The same is likely to be true of the liturgy. Even for those who ascribe to organized religion, necessary changes in liturgy and doctrine mean that what was taken for granted or what provided a universal cultural reference in the fifteenth century has been lost in the twenty-first.

My literary corpus ranges from the 1250s with the great Marian works of Gonzalo de Berceo (1195?–c.1252?), including his *Loores de Santa María* and his *Milagros de Nuestra Señora*, and Alfonso X (1221–84), King of Castile and Leon from 1252 to 1284, known as the Wise. It includes Marian poetry across the medieval period from the *cuaderna vía* poets such as Juan Ruiz, the Archpriest of Hita (c.1330) or Pedro López de Ayala, Lord Chancellor of Castile (1332–1407).[9] It includes poets with works collected in the *cancioneros* from the late fourteenth and through to the early sixteenth centuries.[10] *Cancioneros* copied or printed works by many of the Castilian religious poets, such as Alfonso Álvarez de Villasandino (1345–1425), Íñigo López de Mendoza, Marqués de Santillana (1398–1458), fray Ambrosio Montesino (1440?–1514?), Lucas Fernández (c. 1474–1542), and Juan del Encina (1468–1529/30), or Valencian ones such as

7   Marchand, 'The Hymns of Gonzalo de Berceo', pp. 107–8.

8   Siegfried Wenzel, *Preachers, Poets, and the Early English Religious Lyric* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1986), p. 3.

9   These poets belonged to the 'mester de clerecía' or cleric's craft. For studies of the *mester de clerecia*, see Francisco Rico, 'La clerecía del mester', *HR*, 53 (1985): 1–23; Isabel Uría Maqua, *Panorama crítico del mester de clerecia* (Madrid: Castalia, 2000); Julian Weiss, *The 'Mester de Clerecía': Intellectuals and Ideologies in Thirteenth-Century Castile* (Woodbridge: Tamesis, 2006). On Gonzalo's craft, see Gaudioso Giménez Resano, *El mester poético de Gonzalo de Berceo* (Logroño: Servicio de Cultura de la Exma. Diputación Provincial, 1976). On dating Juan Ruiz as Arcipreste de Hita, see Louise M. Haywood, 'Juan Ruiz and the *Libro de Buen Amor*: Contexts and Milieu', in Louise M. Haywood and Louise O. Vasvari (eds), *A Companion to the Libro de Buen Amor* (Woodbridge: Tamesis, 2004), pp. 21–38, at p. 38.

10   For a study of the genesis and major themes in *cancionero* scholarship, see E. Michael Gerli and Julian Weiss (eds), *Poetry at Court in Trastamaran Spain: From the Cancionero de Baena to the Cancionero General*, AZMRTS, 181 (Tempe, AZ: Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies, 1998).

Jaume Roig (†1478) or Joan Roís de Corella (1435–1497).[11] There is currently no study considering the earlier Marian poets in comparison with *Cancionero* poets, apart from Helen Boreland's.[12]

It also includes some of the great Hispanic prose works about the Virgin Mary, such as Isabel de Villena's (1430–90) *Vita Christi*. The case of Juan Manuel (1282–1348), who wrote a treatise about the Assumption of the Virgin, shows how interested secular authors became in Marian doctrine, and how they sought to engage in its defence, often at the request of members of their family or of patrons.[13]

Yet this is principally a book about place and sacrality, which recognizes that sacred space has elicited much interest in recent scholarship, particularly with reference to burial sites and its place in urban history.[14] Sacred space is also of prime interest within both theological and literary studies.[15]

The question of sacred space can alternatively be set within the bounds of textual study.[16] The sacred has been situated in the sights and sounds of a

[11]   Comparative study of certain of these poets, Ambrosio Montesino and Íñigo de Mendoza, was carried out by Keith Whinnom, 'El orígen de las comparaciones religiosas del siglo de oro: Mendoza, Montesinos, y Román', *Revista de Filología Española*, 46 (1963): 263–85. Julio Rodríguez Puértolas compares Francesc Eiximenis with Íñigo de Mendoza in his 'Eiximenis y Mendoza: literatura y sociedad en la baja edad media hispánica', *Revista Valenciana de Filología*, 7 (1963–66): 139–74. Religious poetry from the late fifteenth century was the subject of Jane Yvonne Tillier's thesis, 'Religious Poetry in the Cancioneros', unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Cambridge, 1986.

[12]   Helen Boreland, 'Two Medieval Marian Poets: Aspects of the Work of Gonzalo de Berceo and Ambrosio Montesino', unpublished doctoral thesis, University of London, 1981.

[13]   Don Juan Manuel, *Tractado en que se prueba por razón que Sancta María está en cuerpo et alma en parayso*, in *Escritores en prosa anteriores al siglo XV*, ed. Pascual de Gayangos, Biblioteca de autores españoles desde la formación de la lengua hasta nuestros días, 51 (Madrid: Rivadeneyra, 1860), pp. 439–42; the treatise has been published in a modern edition: Don Juan Manuel, *Tratado de la Asunción de la Virgen*, in *Obras completas*, ed. Carlos Alvar and Sarah Finci (Madrid: Fundación José Antonio de Castro, 2007), pp. 1001–7.

[14]   The ground-breaking study on sacred space was that of Mircea Eliade, *The Sacred and the Profane. The Nature of Religion* (New York: Harcourt, Brace, and Jovanovich, 1959). Sacred space in the ancient world has been studied; see Susan E. Alcock and R. Osborne (eds), *Placing the Gods: Sanctuaries and Sacred Space in Ancient Greece* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998). For sacred space in the context of the Reformation, see Will Coster and Andrew Spicer (eds), *Sacred Space in Early Modern Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005); Arie L. Molendijk, 'The Notion of the Sacred', in Paul Post and Arie L. Molendijk (eds), *Holy Ground: Reinventing Ritual Space in Modern Western Culture* (Leuven: Peeters, 2010), pp. 55–89. Similarly, although he is looking principally at modern phenomenology of religion, Ninian Smart examines some useful aspects of sacred space, such as its height but also its transcendence. See Ninian Smart, *Dimensions of the Sacred: An Anatomy of the World's Beliefs* (London: HarperCollins, 1996), pp. 139–46.

[15]   Fiona Darroch (ed.), 'Sacred Space', special edition of *Literature and Theology: An International Journal of Theology,* 21.3 (2007): 241–344, at p. 242. Contemporary theologians' interest in sacred space is also revealed by John Inge, *A Christian Theology of Place*, Explorations in Practical, Pastoral, and Empirical Theology (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003).

[16]   Darroch (ed.), 'Sacred Space', p. 242.

French city and in the activities of those who live there.[17] Meanwhile in the modern world, sacred space has become increasingly associated with Feng Shui, as well as spiritual health and well-being and, since 9/11, it has been applied to 'Ground Zero'.[18] Approaches to environmental studies may begin by discussing the 'interconnectedness' of people and nature as experienced in a particular place.[19]

Sacred space for Jews and Christians is closely allied to the presence of God in certain numinous locations.[20] The presence of God, his *Shekinah*, from the Hebrew word meaning 'dwelling' or 'indwelling', is transcendent but can also be associated with the physical place that it hallows, such as the Temple, as well as the Ark within it.[21] One of the other Hebrew names of God is HaMakom, literally the place.[22]

Each of the types of the Virgin will be contextualized within the spatial bounds of medieval Spain as well as within biblical and theological typology. Interest in place has come to the fore in a myriad disciplines, including philosophy, cultural history, anthropology, environmental studies, theology, human geography, architectural theory, and contemporary literature.[23] Some scholars believe that this is due to postmodern restlessness and failure to put down roots, and that it

[17] Natalie Zemon Davis, 'The Sacred and the Body Social in Sixteenth-Century Lyon', *Past & Present*, 90 (1981): 40–70.

[18] Will Coster and Andrew Spicer, 'The Dimensions of Sacred Space in Reformation Europe', in Coster and Spicer (eds), *Sacred Space*, pp. 1–16, at p. 1; Pamela Schaeffer, 'Open Places, Sacred Spaces', *Health Progress*, 91.2 (2010): 36–40; among a cluster of books focusing on the semi-religious nature of well-being and the energy properties of sacred space are Denise Linn, *Sacred Space: Cleaning and Enhancing the Energy of Your Home* (London: Rider, 1996); Daniela da Silva, *Sacred Spaces: Transform Any Space into a Sanctuary for Relaxation, Inspiration, and Rejuvenation* (Avon, MA: Adams Media, 2004).

[19] Andrea Olsen, *Body and Earth: An Experiential Guide* (Lebanon, NH: University Press of New England, 2002), p. 8.

[20] Seth Kunin, 'Judaism', in Jean Holm with John Bowker (eds), *Sacred Place*, Themes in Religious Studies Series (London: Pinter, 1994), pp. 115–48: 'The sacredness of the space is due to God's presence there', p. 128.

[21] Kunin, 'Judaism', p. 129.

[22] Tacita Dean and Jeremy Millar, *Place* (London: Thames and Hudson, 2005), p. 15.

[23] See, for example, a co-edited book with editors from the fields of psychiatry, archeology, sociology and cultural history: David L. Carmichael, Jane Hubert, Brian Reeves and Uadhild Schanche (eds), *Sacred Sites, Sacred Places*, One World Archeology, 23 (London: Routledge, 1994), with particular reference to Jane Hubert, 'Sacred Beliefs and Beliefs of Sacredness', in Carmichael et al. (eds), *Sacred Sites*, pp. 9–19. Space, whether urban or rural, is increasingly studied in its relationship to medieval literature; see, for example, Albrecht Classen, *Urban Space in the Middle Ages and Early Modern Age* (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2009), and Albrecht Classen (ed.), *Rural Space in the Middle Ages and Early Modern Age: The Spatial Turn in Premodern Studies* (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2012); and in its relationship to medieval Spanish studies, see Connie Scarborough, *Inscribing the Environment: Ecocritical Studies in Medieval Spanish Literature* (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2013).

correlates to an unresolved longing to find a spiritual home.[24] Writing of the Old Testament story of exile and return to the land God has given them, Brueggemann believes that longing for a place is 'a human hunger', which has wider implications for the New Testament than exile and homecoming. He also contends that 'a sense of place is a primary category of faith'.[25] If he is right, then defining the Virgin Mary as a space or place has some key theological concepts enshrined within it.

Yet place and space have not always been so well defined or distinguished each from the other. Place is 'something we humans make. A place is made when we take an area of space and intentionally bound it.'[26] Place is space in which vows have been exchanged, promises have been made, and demands have been issued.[27] For, when places are imagined as a way of 'seeing, knowing, and understanding the world', they have much to say about relations between people.[28] Place is the physical location in which important words are spoken which establish identity, define vocation, and envision destiny. Placing bounds on space creates a location which can have historical meanings, where some things have happened, which are now remembered, and which provide continuity and identity across generations. Place can, therefore, build identity, enable recuperation of memory, and be a point of entry for those outside.[29] Place has an inherent duality about it because it holds a discourse about the Other, excluded and beyond its bounds.[30] In anthropological terms, place might be defined as 'relational', 'historical', and 'concerned with identity'.[31] Place, in cultural geography, also implies discourse about power, for power defines place, imposing a dominant ideology upon it.[32] Place has been defined by power struggles throughout history. Its bounds are besieged and its strategic locations battered by siege engines, cannon, or shells,

---

[24]   Walter Brueggemann, *The Land*, Overtures to Biblical Theology (London: SPCK, 1978), p. 1; Philip Sheldrake, *Spaces for the Sacred: The Hulsean Lectures 2000* (London: SCM Press, 2001), p. 2.

[25]   Brueggemann, *The Land*, p. 4.

[26]   Richard David Sack, 'Place-making and Time', in Tom Mels (ed.), *Reanimating Places: A Geography of Rhythms* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2004), pp. 243–53, at p. 243.

[27]   Brueggemann, *The Land*, p. 5.

[28]   Tim Cresswell, *Place: A Short Introduction* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2009), p. 11.

[29]   For definitions of space, place, and landscape in modern Spanish cultural contexts, see Ann Davies, *Spanish Spaces: Landscape, Space, and Place in Contemporary Spanish Culture*, Contemporary Hispanic and Lusophone Cultures, 6 (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2012), pp. 12–14.

[30]   James Duncan, 'Sites of Representation: Place, Time, and the Discourse of the Other', in James Duncan and David Ley (eds), *Place, Culture, Representation* (London: Routledge, 1993), pp. 39–56, at p. 39.

[31]   Marc Augé, *Non-Places: Introduction to an Anthropology of Supermodernity*, trans. John Howe (London: Verso, 1995), p. 63, cited also in Davies, *Spanish Spaces*, p. 12. Augé, while defining the concept of non-place, also defines what constitutes place.

[32]   Jon Anderson, *Understanding Cultural Geography: Places and Traces* (London: Routledge, 2010), pp. 54, 56; see also William Norton, *Cultural Geography: Environments, Landscapes, Identities, Inequalities*, 2nd edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), p. 293.

as territorial disputes rage. It is in discussion of control and its impact on place that the idea of place as 'layering of other places' takes shape.[33]

For medieval people, place expressed much of what they understood about the world around them because, unless they went away to fight or on religious pilgrimage, most people remained in one location from birth to death.[34] Places were experienced with what can be called 'rootedness'.[35] Similarly, for cultural geographers, places 'are where cultures, communities, and people root themselves and give themselves definition'.[36] Thus, for cultural geographers at least, places are spaces that human beings have occupied.[37]

Place would often be defined by the great landmarks standing there or by the castles, monasteries, or palaces around which villages or towns huddled. It would also be defined by the sense of who belonged and who did not. It was when the frontiers of Christianity were rolled back across the Iberian Peninsula, following the Islamic invasion in the early Middle Ages, that people began to build the great monasteries of the Benedictine and, later, the Cistercian Orders. The huge complexes, closed off by high walls, dominated the landscapes where they stood. For the people, whether originally Islamic inhabitants or Christian settlers, they represented the power of God's presence on earth. They told a story about the hierarchy of the Church and the majesty of the divine expressed in architectural terms.

Space, on the other hand, can be distinguished as a 'place of freedom without accountability'. It embodies a 'kind of emptiness waiting to be filled by our choosing'.[38] This definition has much of the last century about it. For scholars working in those times, space was the great unknown, the final great frontier to be explored. Space may 'recall the realm of the dead or the chaos of simultaneity or multiplicity' and this again accords space a kind of stasis.[39] However, more recent scholarship has emphasized the 'dynamism' of space.[40] Meanwhile, the notion of space as abstract and uniform reduces place in scope and it then becomes the merest point on a grid.[41]

---

[33]   Dean and Millar, *Place*, p. 126.
[34]   Contemporary interest in landscape as space and place which captures something of the essence of Spanishness, whether identity, community or nationality, imagines landscape as a cultural construct. See Davies, *Spanish Spaces*, p. 4.
[35]   Cresswell, *Place*, p. 39.
[36]   Anderson, *Understanding Cultural Geography*, p. 37.
[37]   Norton, *Cultural Geography*, p. 334.
[38]   Brueggemann, *The Land*, p. 5.
[39]   Doreen Massey, *Space, Place, and Gender* (Cambridge: Polity, 1996), pp. 1, 6–7. Massey here disputes Foucault's conceptualization of space as 'the dead, the fixed, the undialectical, the immobile'. Michel Foucault, *Power/Knowledge* (Brighton: Harvester, 1980), p. 149.
[40]   Massey, *Space, Place, and Gender*, p. 4.
[41]   Tom Mels, 'Lineages of a Geography of Rhythms', in Mels (ed.), *Reanimating Places*, pp. 3–42.

It has been argued that space and place were less differentiated because human activity was centred in a single location:

> In pre-modern societies, space and place largely coincided, since the spatial dimensions of social life are, for most of the population […] dominated by 'presence', by localised activity […] Modernity increasingly tears space away from place by relations between 'absent' others, locationally distanced from any given situation of face-to-face interaction.[42]

However, in our times, space has rather more positive connotations. It is not just a void but a place of intimacy and an interior essence of being in which the recuperation of the individual can occur. Space provides a sense of well-being and a place of refuge to seek personal fulfilment and identity. Space to think or space to be are what people seek in days spent away from the humdrum round of work tasks, on spa visits, hotel breaks or yoga weekends, or even in more overtly spiritual experiences, such as retreats. In this book, I use space to provide historical place with a spiritual intimacy, which Brueggemann had deliberately excluded when he defined it. Space in this new conceptualization is where the human reaches out to the immanent.

Space and Place in Medieval Spain

'Late medieval Europe has long been seen as a landscape filled and defined by points of access to the holy.'[43] Yet in late medieval Spain, different conceptions of sacred space intersect in a way that has not been addressed. As the centres of power and commerce of the Islamic kingdoms were adapted as cities in Christian kingdoms, their great mosques were destroyed or changed allegiance, as they were consecrated to the Christian God. Conquest of former Islamic strongholds in the Peninsula was, therefore, epitomized by the conversion of Islamic to Christian space. The dominant structures of one faith became those of another. Christian victors took minarets as church towers for Seville's and Valencia's cathedrals, and they dedicated holy places where Allah had previously been worshipped to the Virgin Mary, such as the Catedral de Santa María de la Sede, Cathedral Church of St Mary, in Seville, and the Catedral de Santa María, Cathedral Church of St Mary, housed in the magnificent converted mosque in Córdoba. Localization of

---

42   Anthony Giddens, *The Consequences of Modernity* (Cambridge: Polity, 1990), p. 18, cited in Massey, *Space, Place and Gender*, p. 6.

43   Coster and Spicer, 'The Dimensions of Sacred Space in Reformation Europe', p. 3.

holy places, which had been slow to emerge as part of Christianity, was in full flow by the Middle Ages.[44]

Elsewhere, the spires and towers of newly dedicated Gothic cathedrals, like that of Leon, soared above the city. In Spain, many cathedrals were designed and built by Islamic architects and craftsmen. They were and became the *imago mundi*, yet the world view the buildings represented was that of the defeated other.[45] Tranquil Islamic gardens and pools for ritual bathing now became part of cathedral complexes. Christianity absorbed the sacred places of the other religion. The Islamic urban spaces were Christianized in conquest.

In Spain's cities, as in other European towns, the great medieval churches tended to be built on high ground and were rivalled for position only by the town's fortress, which gave its protection to the inhabitants and surrounding area. Castle and church occupy the highest ground in many towns, such as Montblanc, in the kingdom of Aragon, where the castle of Santa Bárbara (now in ruins) occupied the highest vantage point, with the tower of the church of Santa María just below it on the hillside, dominated and shielded by it from enemy forces. This has been termed a landscape haunted by the Church, with shrines, chapels, and churches pre-eminent.[46]

In the wake of the conquest, monastic orders began to establish sites in the territory which had now come under Christian rule. One of the earliest monasteries, founded in 887, was Sant Joan de les Abadesses, St John of the Abbesses, in the Pyrenees. It was intended to provide the education of Wilfred the Hairy's daughter, Emma, who became its abbess. The Cistercians established monasteries in the newly conquered territory south of the Pyrenees and often dedicated the monasteries they established to Mary, such as the Real Monasterio de Santa Maria, the Royal Monastery of St Mary, at Vallbona in Urgell, or the Monasterio de Santa Maria at Poblet. The Benedictines established the famous monastery of Santa Maria de Ripoll as well as the abbey dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat, which continues to dominate the Catalonian landscape, a Benedictine foundation still famed for its choral singing in praise of the Virgin.

During this same period, medieval theologians across Europe reflected on the nature of the divine and found that their understanding of God's

---

[44] For the slow emergence of localization in Christian belief, see Konstantin Klein, 'The Politics of Holy Space: Jerusalem in the Theodosian Era (379–457 CE)', in Julian Weiss and Sarah Salih (eds), *Locating the Middle Ages: The Spaces and Places of Medieval Culture* (London: King's College London, Centre for Late Antique and Medieval Studies, 2012), pp. 95–107.

[45] For the *imago mundi*, see Eliade, *The Sacred and the Profane*, p. 45.

[46] Henri Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, trans. D. Nicholson-Smith (Oxford: Blackwell, 1991), p. 254, cited in Coster and Spicer, 'The Dimensions of Sacred Space in Reformation Europe', p. 4.

relationship to place defined certain characteristics constituting it. They talked of God's omniscience, omnipotence, immanence, and immutability, and at the same time they thought of his omnipresence.[47] They tried to grasp how God might be omnipresent and believed that he transcended time. St Anselm (1033–1109) wrestles with God's ability to exist in time and place as well to transcend both in his *Monologion* and assumes that, in the end, because God is truly eternal, all is possible with him:

> Well, perhaps there is a way for the supreme nature to exist in place and time. Perhaps it can exist as a whole in individual places and times, without there being lots of wholes, and without its life span (which is nothing other than true eternity) being divided into past, present, and future.[48]

Yet the paradox at the heart of the Trinity is that of relating the omnipresence of the Father and the Spirit to the presence, in one place and in a specific time-frame, of the Son. Some of the doctrines about Mary are place-specific, such as the Annunciation, which is set in Nazareth, or the Presentation of the child Jesus, which takes place in the Temple in Jerusalem. The Annunciation, which took place in a particular town in Israel at a specific time in history, meant that the early Church recognized the body of Mary as significant in time and space. For, in that special moment, the omnipresent became accessible to humanity in a single space, Mary's womb, since the crux of the Incarnation is the encounter of God and man in the body of a woman and the mystery of how the eternal could be contained within a womb. To explain that event, theologians often had recourse to Old Testament figures, using them to express the presence of the divine within human spaces. Sometimes these spaces were cultivated ones, such as the paradise garden, where the Lord God walked in the cool of the day (Gen. 3.8); sometimes they were points of encounter, such as the sanctuary (Lev. 16.2), where the Lord announced how his people were to prepare to meet him. Sometimes they were constructed places which permitted meetings with God, such as David's instruction to Solomon to build a house for God to hold the Ark of the Covenant (1 Chron. 22.19).

---

[47] G. R. Evans, *The Medieval Theologians: An Introduction to Theology in the Medieval Period* (Oxford: Blackwell, 2001), pp. 11–14, 117–19, 170–3.

[48]   Anselm, *The Major Works*, p. 37. 'Ergo unum totum non potest esse simul in diversis locis totum. Ergo per singula loca, singula sunt tota. Ergo si summa natura est tota simul in diversis locis, quot singular loca esse possunt, tot singulae sunt naturae summae. Ergo ipsa non est tota simul in omnibus locis. Sic nec ipsa est in singulis temporibus; cum ipsa tempora non simul sint: nec est tota simul in singulis temporibus ; alioquin ejus aeternitas, que ipsa ejus essentia, heberet partes, praesens, praeteritum, ac futurum.' Anselm, *De divinitatis essentia Monologium*, ed. J.-P. Migne (Paris, 1844–64), PL 158, cols 141–224, at col. 171. For a short study of God's omnipresence in Anselm's thinking, see Christopher H. Conn, 'Anselmian Spacetime: Omnipresence and the Created Order', *Heythrop Journal*, 52 (2010): 260–70.

From time immemorial, people have been finding God in specific places for prayer, for silence, for healing, and they often dedicate their lives to him in holy places, becoming monks, nuns, or hermits. The places they chose and, often, continue to choose, become imbued with a sense of holiness and these places are sought out in subsequent generations. They become sites of healing, renewal, and pilgrimage, as well as places for celebrating life events. These acts of dedication might be called 'devotional labour', which is offered to the Virgin in sacred places and which can include pilgrimage, prayer, song, dance, and other activities. In this way, adherents connect to sacred spaces, preserving, serving, and sanctifying both them and their histories and traditions.[49] Further, just as in literary itineraries, writing about a place creates an aura for it. Just as modern travel narratives 'provide a window on how culturally knowledgeable individuals experience the world', so literary celebration of sites of pilgrimage, such as miracles about them or poems to celebrate them, drove and constructed sacrality.[50] Many such pilgrim sites were dedicated to the Virgin, such as Guadalupe, Salas, or Montserrat.[51]

Some Marian doctrines, however, have no link to place, and the most important of these is the Assumption. It is a doctrine that takes its very roots in the belief that Mary's grave was unimportant, for she was lifted from the earth body and soul. All this is deepened by the 'placeness' of the sacred. Where it was absent, it was invented, or, as with the Assumption, a narrative developed to explain why it was missing.[52]

Mary's body, which holds God's within it, at a point in time, can be prefigured by other Old Testament places, frequently those where the Shekinah rested at particular moments. Mary's body, thus, became the most important locus for authenticating Christ's real presence in the world as Man and God. Proving that Christ was 'born of a woman' was a means of countering dualistic heresies for many of the Fathers of the Church.

While the Old Testament tradition enshrined the physical presence of God in the Temple, the New Testament personalized and particularized the individual

[49] Elaine A. Peña, *Performing Piety: Making Space Sacred with the Virgin of Guadalupe* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2011), p. 10. Although Peña is writing about a phenomenon occurring in the colonial and post-colonial period in the United States, her concept of sacred space and how it can be further sanctified by its devotees is a valuable one.

[50] See Martyn Smith, 'How to Build Places with Words', in Martyn Smith, *Religion, Culture, and Sacred Space* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), pp. 1–37, at p. 15. Smith discusses sacred sites from different cultures, including the temple of Osiris at Abydos.

[51] On how monks and monarchs conspired to construct Guadalupe as a place of royal significance, see Remensnyder, *La Conquistadora*, pp. 67 and 82–3.

[52] Ann Marie Yasin, *Saints and Church Spaces in the Late Antique Mediterranean: Architecture, Cult, and Community* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), p. 15.

Christian's body as a temple.[53] However, the holy place where God was worshipped and where the body of believers met had many attributes directly imitated from the Temple, replicating 'its physical vocabulary'.[54] Particularly relevant is the separation of the priest from the people in Gothic churches, which were constructed so that the chancel walls served as a boundary between the sacred, or priestly, and the profane, or lay. Those boundaries had something important to say about the Virgin Mary.

Because the Church was universal and was visible to believers through its presence in towns and villages, Christianity maintained an uneasy tension between the individual temple of the body of the believer, where God the Spirit dwelled, and the church building, the sacred place where believers were encouraged to meet with God the Son, present to them on the altar in the sacrament of the Eucharist.

People of the eleventh and twelfth centuries were encouraged to create a hierarchy of place, while they continued to maintain the importance of the human body as a location of sanctity.[55] Mary's body is the first among Christians to hold Christ's body within it and her unique relationship to Christ is the key to her holiness. Following her example, all Christians consume and contain the body of Christ, present in the Eucharist, within their bodies, an action that is central to their place as saints. The Eucharist also acts as a 'space of *transitus* when there is a passing over between worlds'.[56] Because the Eucharist takes place in a specific location, amid a specific community and at a specific time, it draws that place, community, and time into the universal, immutable, and immanent.

People believed that the virginal body-temple and the constructed Temple of the Church were allied in the medieval period. There are parallels in the cleaning rituals for buildings and individuals. Aspersion aims to use holy water to ward off evil from a holy place to signal holy ground, keep it holy, and exclude unclean spirits.[57] Baptism, with its rite of immersion to open the path to salvation, stems from the same desire to cleanse human beings of sin or evil and mark as holy.

Naming Places

Mary, perhaps more than other saints, was frequently worshipped under different names and with emphasis on different characteristics. She became the Virgin of Rocamadour, the Virgin of Montserrat, or the Virgin of Guadalupe, just as

---

53   Dawn Marie Hayes, *Body and Sacred Place in Medieval Europe, 1100–1389*, Medieval History and Culture, 18 (New York: Routledge, 2003), p. 3.

54   Joan Rebekah Branham, 'Sacred Space in Ancient Jewish and Early Medieval Architecture', unpublished doctoral thesis, Graduate Institute of the Liberal Arts, 1993, p. 65.

55   Hayes, *Body and Sacred Place*, p. 9.

56   Sheldrake, *Spaces for the Sacred*, p. 89.

57   Hayes, *Body and Sacred Place*, p. 12.

today her characteristics are distinguished by place names, the Virgin of Lourdes or of Fatima. Those in trouble could call upon her, even if they were nowhere near the shrine, and she would respond.

These holy places, where the Virgin began to be celebrated locally, each began to draw their own cluster of pilgrims. The saint and perceptions of a particular manifestation of holiness thus became 'closely intertwined with a particular community that above all had a territorial dimension'.[58] But the Virgin also supported particular communities.[59] In Iberia, she appeared in battle against the Islamic invaders and was part of warrior kings' self-fashioning.[60] Localizing the territory is key in Marian and other miracle collections, where place is vital to the recording, transmitting, and fomenting of belief in the miracle. The places where miracles occur are often named, because this anchors the event for those hearing or reading the miracle and gives it greater authenticity.

Recipients of miraculous interventions are often instructed to go on pilgrimage to specific sites. Many respond voluntarily, out of gratitude for their cure or restored health, by making such pilgrimages. In these centres of devotion and medieval pilgrimage, individual Marian liturgies developed and hymns were written.[61] Sometimes miracle collections were also written, such as at Montserrat. Perhaps this was done with the aim of drawing in pilgrims and promoting the virtues of the particular shrine or perhaps the cult of the Virgin inspired those who lived there. The *Llibre vermell de Montserrat* contains only the songs and miracles relevant to the Virgin of Montserrat.[62] Some holy places were celebrated in vernacular songs, which in turn enhanced the devotion of those visiting the shrine. Alfonso X, on the other hand, celebrates many different cults of Mary in the pages of the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*.

Miracles in the *Cantigas* take place within the bounds of Alfonso's kingdom, setting his own kingdom on the map for pilgrimage.[63] Small towns, whether Vila-Sirga or Castroxeriz, become places of devotion, of pilgrimage, and sites where the Virgin intervenes in human affairs, equivalent to the better-known pilgrim sites.[64]

---

[58] Sheldrake, *Spaces for the Sacred*, p. 45.

[59] Rubin, *Mother of God*. She was, for example, Mary of the Franks, pp. 100–5; or of the British Isles, pp. 105–12.

[60] See, for example, Remensnyder, *La Conquistadora*, p. 43.

[61] For early development of Marian liturgy, see Stephen J. Shoemaker, 'Marian Liturgies and Devotion in Early Christianity', in Boss (ed.), *Mary: The Complete Resource*, pp. 130–45.

[62] *Llibre vermell de Montserrat*, Montserrat MS 1.

[63] See also Santiago Disalvo on Marian shrines and sanctuaries in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*: *Los monjes de la Virgen: representación y reelaboración de la cultura monacal en las* Cantigas de Santa María *de Alfonso X* (Newark, DE: Juan de la Cuesta, 2013), pp. 59–60.

[64] Devotion to the Virgin was not confined to Castile. King James the Conqueror was also devoted to her; see Vicent Sorribes Gramatge, *Salve Sancta Parens: en Jaume el Conqueridor i sa devoció a la Verge Maria* (Valencia: Lletres Valencianes, 1954).

He writes of appearances of the Virgin at local shrines, which he was likely to have visited or knew personally. He writes, for example, of Santa Maria de Vila-Sirga (Villalcázar de Sirga, Palencia) and of Santa Maria de Castroxeriz (Castrojeriz, Burgos) in his own realm, of Santa Maria d'Albeça (Lerida), and of Santa Maria de Salas (Huesca), and of Santa Maria de Terena 'no reino de Portugal', in the neighbouring kingdoms of Aragon and Portugal respectively.[65] When shipwrecked sailors called upon St Mary of Vila-Sirga in the *Cantigas*, they were saved.[66] The Virgin sought to take responsibility for protecting each church dedicated to her and its treasures. The Virgin of Montserrat 'decobriu un furto que se fez na sa esgleja' [discovered a robbery that was taking place in her church] (Cantiga 30).[67]

Alfonso includes miracles from all the major medieval sites of Marian pilgrimage known to him, whether in Spain or abroad, such as Rocamadour in France and Montserrat in Catalonia, or Terena in Portugal.[68] They might also take place in towns and cities that are further afield, and even with a cachet of exoticism, such as Toulouse, in Germany, or in Alexandria.[69] Miracles may take place in locations of strategic importance for his crusading mission, such as those at Puerto de Santa Maria.[70] Devotion to the Virgin and to her Castilian shrines spread through Spain and the names were even known in France at Rocamadour.

Urban growth in the high Middle Ages in other parts of Europe began to channel the notion that the city should be understood as a holy place. Towns had a concentration of religious buildings, one or more churches, and sometimes one or more religious foundations.[71]

Miracles might also take place on holy ground. This might be, for example, in the church in a named location, such as 'na eigreja de Salas', in the church at Salas (Cantiga 43), or in the 'abadia de Tolosa', in the abbey in Toulouse

---

65   Afonso X, *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, ed. Walter Mettmann, 4 vols (Coimbra: Acta Universitatis Conimbrigensis, 1959–64), henceforth *Cantigas*: Terena: Cantigas 199, 224, 275, 283, 333, 334, in *Cantigas*, II, pp. 252, 309, III, pp. 62, 80, 203, 206; Vila-Sirga: Cantigas 217, 234, 243, 253, 301, 313, 355, in *Cantigas*, II, pp. 295, 333, 360, III, pp. 7, 125, 155, 258; Albeça: Cantiga 146, in *Cantigas*, II, p. 126; Castroxeriz: Cantigas 242, 266, in *Cantigas*, II, p. 358, III, p. 41; Salas: Cantigas 114, 161, 163, 164, 167, 168, 172, 176, 178, 179, 247, in *Cantigas*, II, pp. 112, 158, 162, 164, 170, 172, 181, 191, 195, 197, 371.

66   Cantiga 313, in *Cantigas*, III, p. 155.

67   *Cantigas*, III, p. 127.

68   Rocamadour: Cantigas 147, 153, 343, in *Cantigas*, II, pp. 130, 142, 230. Montserrat: Cantigas 113, 302, 311, in *Cantigas*, II, p. 113, III, pp. 127, 148.

69   Toulouse: Cantigas 78, in *Cantigas*, I, p. 121; Germany: Cantiga 42, in *Cantigas*, I, p. 121; Alexandria: Cantigas 145 and 155, in *Cantigas*, II, pp. 123, 146.

70   Joseph T. Snow, 'A Chapter in Alfonso X's Personal Narrative: The Puerto de Santa Maria Poems in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*', *La Corónica*, 8 (1979–80): 10–21.

71   Sheldrake, *Spaces for the Sacred*, pp. 151–2.

(Cantiga 195).[72] A specific site within the holy place may be designated a place of healing. Even those seeking to do wrong by pilgrims to Montserrat, such as robbers, were, by implication, forgiven their sins and healed in front of the altar there (Cantiga 56).[73] Miracles might also take place in places of transition, such as aboard ship or in other dangerous locations.

Pilgrimage in honour of Mary can then function as an after-effect. It might be a response to or thanksgiving for the miraculous event. Those affected by the activity of the Virgin in their lives often make a personal response to the miraculous vision by going on pilgrimage or *romería* to one of the shrines. The knight released from prison is instructed to go to Rocamadour.[74] In others, the Virgin assists those seeking to build a church in her honour and to enhance the practice of her cult.[75]

While the miracles and praises of Alfonso X are strongly place-orientated, his work is not the only one to ally the Virgin to a specific location, where her cult is strong. The Marqués de Santillana also dedicates a poem to the Virgin of Guadalupe, after going there on pilgrimage to the shrine in 1455.[76]

Liturgy and Place

Historians in many disciplines have begun to evaluate the sacred spaces where liturgies were performed and they have also begun to study the sacred objects in those spaces, such as their wall paintings or altarpieces, considering the performance of religious devotion as a physical and spatial phenomenon.[77] It is my intention to consider how liturgy was performed but also to examine it as a mediator between those performance spaces and the courtly ones it inspired. This book will seek to establish how what was heard and sung in the offices and Masses offered daily in specific places, cathedrals, churches, monasteries, and convents impacted on poets' desire to celebrate Marian doctrine in the

---

72   *Cantigas*, I, p. 125; II, p. 242, lines 90–1.
73   *Cantigas*, I, pp. 160–5.
74   Cantiga 158, in *Cantigas*, II, p. 153.
75   Cantiga 309, in *Cantigas*, III, p. 143, lines 20–3, 70–3; Cantiga 356, in *Cantigas*, III, p. 264.
76   Íñigo López de Mendoza, Marqués de Santillana, *Poesías completas*, ed. Maxim P. A. M. Kerkhof and Ángel Gómez Moreno, Clásicos Castalia, 270 (Madrid: Clásicos Castalia, 2003), pp. 579–82; also copied in Hernán del Castillo's *Cancionero general*, ed. Joaquín González Cuenca, 5 vols, Nueva Biblioteca de Erudición y Crítica, 26–30 (Madrid: Castalia, 2006), I, pp. 394–6.
77   Beth Williamson, 'Altarpieces, Liturgy, and Devotion', *Speculum*, 79 (2004): 341–406, at p. 341. On sacred space in liturgy, see also John Craig, 'Psalms, Groans, and Dogwhippers: The Soundscape of Worship in the English Parish Church, 1547–1642', in Coster and Spicer (eds), *Sacred Space*, pp. 104–12; and Christian Grosse, 'Places of Sanctification: The Liturgical Sacrality of Genevan Reformed Churches, 1535–1566', in Coster and Spicer (eds), *Sacred Space*, pp. 60–80. Although both Grosse and Craig are writing of a later period, some of their conclusions are insightful.

vernacular and influenced the way they did so. More importantly, it gave them particular reference points and meant that they might be influenced by certain sacred spaces they knew and wished to re-create through the attributes they used to describe Mary. They sought to make the Marian doctrines they were constructing visible and understood in their local environment.

Many scholars have also examined how Latin religious lyric influenced the development of romance lyric, although they may not have paid attention to doctrinal development. Ernst Curtius studies the interdependence of Latin lyric and the burgeoning romance lyric in the medieval period, yet he indicates that their symbiotic relationship occurred in spite of the Bible being as remote from the faithful as liturgical books or the writings of the Fathers. These were read only by the intellectual elite among the secular and regular clergy.[78] However, the hymn tradition provided the missing link, providing insight into doctrines about the Virgin, whereby ordinary priests and lay Christians could hear and grasp some of the current theological ideas.[79]

Most studies of the 'inherited tradition' that Latin lyric provided for religious poets focus on Middle English, although many of the conclusions remain valid for Spain.[80] Forms, genres, and structures owed a debt to medieval Latin lyric, according to a study of liturgical tropes and sequences and their impact on vernacular poetry.[81] The rise of European religious lyric has been traced in a classic study, examining the influence of Latin metres on the developing metre of vernacular poetry.[82] Latin religious lyric has also been examined and set in the context of how major vernacular poetic genres developed within the vast array of European lyric. Spain's *cantiga de amigo*, or song about a male friend, is set within the rise of genres such as the dawn song, the *alba*.[83]

Spain's religious poetry pre-1500, however, has attracted relatively little attention until recent times, except for certain widely studied individuals,

---

[78]   Ernst Robert Curtius, *European Literature and the Latin Middle Ages*, trans. Willard R. Trask (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1953), p. 260; Peter Dronke, *Medieval Latin Lyric and the Rise of European Love Lyric*, 2 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1968).

[79]   For an overview of Christian Latin poetry, see Frederic James Edward Raby, *A History of Christian Latin Poetry from the Beginnings to the Close of the Middle Ages*, 2nd edn, 2 vols (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1953).

[80]   Douglas Gray, *Themes and Images in the Medieval English Medieval Lyric* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1972), pp. 3–17; see also the introduction to his edited selection, *A Selection of Religious Lyrics*: *Edited with an Introduction, Notes, and Glossary* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1975). See also Rosemary Woolf, *The English Religious Lyric in the Middle Ages* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1968) for important insight into Marian lyric.

[81]   Patrick S. Diehl, *The Medieval European Religious Lyric: An Ars Poetica* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1985).

[82]   F. Brittain, *The Medieval Latin and Romance Lyric to A.D. 1300*, 2nd edn (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1951).

[83]   Peter Dronke, *The Medieval Lyric*, 2nd edn (London: Hutchison, 1978), pp. 32–85, 86–108.

such as Gonzalo de Berceo or Alfonso X the Wise.[84] Some have approached Hispanic Marian poetry while allowing their own views on doctrine to cloud their judgement.[85]

Western liturgy is also an important source of inspiration for poets.[86] In this volume, I examine and develop some of the less well-known Marian prefigurations, only mentioned in passing in my earlier book, and I widen my reach from the doctrine of the Virgin's Conception to all aspects of Marian liturgy.[87] I became interested in the impact that Marian liturgy might have on poets many years ago, paying particular attention to liturgies constructed to celebrate a doctrine such as the Immaculate Conception, which flourished in the late medieval period.[88] I had previously neither the time nor resources to begin such a broad-

[84]   There are, however, a number of classic overarching studies of religious lyric, including a general overview of Spanish lyric by Pierre Le Gentil, *La Poésie lyrique espagnole et portugaise à la fin du Moyen Âge*, 2 vols (Rennes: Plihon, 1949–52); more specifically on religious lyric, see Bruce Wear Wardropper, *Historia de la poesía lírica a lo divino en la cristiandad occidental* (Madrid: Clavileño, 1958); Keith Whinnom, 'The Supposed Sources of Inspiration of Spanish Fifteenth-Century Narrative Religious Verse', *Symposium*, 17 (1963): 268–91; Michel Darbord, *La Poésie réligieuse espagnole des Rois Catholiques à Philippe II*, Thèses, Mémoires, et Travaux, IV (Paris: Centre de Recherches de l'Institut d'Études Hispaniques, 1965); John Esten Keller, *Pious Brief Narrative in Medieval Castilian and Galician Verse: From Berceo to Alfonso X* (Lexington, KE: University Press of Kentucky, 1972). Sometimes studies of religious poetry relate to a single poet. Examples include Marcel Bataillon, 'Chanson pieuse et poésie de dévotion: Fr. Ambrosio Montesino', *BH*, 27 (1925): 228–42; Charles F. Fraker, 'Gonçalo Martínez de Medina, the "Jerónimos" and the Devotio Moderna', *HR*, 34 (1966): 197–217. Kenneth R. Scholberg dedicates a small section of his study of Gómez Manrique (1412–90) to his religious poetry: Kenneth R. Scholberg, *Introducción a la poesía de Gómez Manrique* (Madison, WI: HSMS, 1984). For biographical details of Manrique, see Brian Dutton, with the assistance of Jineen Krogstad (eds), *El cancionero del siglo XV, 1370–1520*, 7 vols, Biblioteca Española del Siglo XV, Serie maior, 1–7 (Salamanca: Diputación de Salamanca, 1990–91), VII, pp. 383–4.

[85]   Those who have done so wrote to celebrate the centenary of the Immaculate Conception, such as Santiago Navarro, 'La Inmaculada en la lírica y épica españolas', *Estudios Marianos*, 16 (1955): 285–328 and Antonio Riera Estarellas, 'La doctrina inmaculista en los orígenes de nuestras lenguas romances', *Estudios Marianos*, 16 (1955): 245–84. A later study arguing that Gonzalo de Berceo was aware of the Immaculate Conception is Juan Carlos Mateos González, 'Cuatro poetas cantan a la Inmaculada: G. de Gonzalo de Berceo, Fr. Luis de León, Lope de Vega, y Calderón de la Barca', *Verdad y Vida: Revista Monino Franciscana de Pensamiento*, 64 (2006): 557–75.

[86]   For a general study of liturgy, see John Harper, *The Forms and Orders of Western Liturgy from the Tenth to the Eighteenth Century: A Historical Guide and Introduction for Students and Musicians* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991).

[87]   I have already published a forerunner to this study, identifying major strands of the arguments in support of the Conception in vernacular poetry and tracing their presence in Hispanic liturgies: Lesley K. Twomey, *The Serpent and the Rose: The Immaculate Conception and Hispanic Poetry in the Late Medieval Period*, Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions, 132 (Leiden: Brill, 2008).

[88]   Edward Dennis O'Connor (ed.), *The Dogma of the Immaculate Conception: Its History and Significance* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1958); Marielle Lamy, *L'Immaculée Conception: étapes et enjeux d'une controverse au Moyen Âge (XIIᵉ–XVᵉ siècles)*,

ranging study. This book, thus, takes its origin in my previous research project but develops its remit. I also became interested many years ago in the synergetic relationship between doctrine and liturgy and how both combined in shaping literature. From the Annunciation and the words spoken by the angel to Mary, for example, there sprang a whole cluster of vernacular Ave Marias, among these Juan Ruiz's.[89]

I began this project with the idea of establishing a corpus of Marian Conception hymns to see how they might have influenced poetry in the Peninsula. My hypothesis that they did so is reinforced by strong evidence of Marian devotion expressed in altarpieces and art in many areas of the Peninsula. From studies undertaken by previous hymnologists, such as Josef Szövérffy, I thought it likely that there would be hymns, both *prosas* and *verbetas*, embedded in a variety of liturgies, particularly in breviaries and missals, and that these might not all have been discovered.[90] I also expected that a variety of hymns might be incorporated into texts intended for private devotion, such as books of hours. Once I began my fieldwork, I became aware that my initial vision of the source field was too limited. I realized almost immediately, because of the way Marian hymns were moved from one feast day of the Virgin to another, that I would have to widen my remit from a study of Conception hymns. The close relationship between the Nativity office and the Conception office meant that there was a need to expand my study of hymns to include Nativity offices. Hymns belonging to the tradition of honouring St Anne, mother of the Virgin, could not be left out either, because, in some dioceses the faithful still kept the tradition of venerating Mary's Conception by celebrating the feast day of her mother. In some cases, the office of St Anne had such prestige that it seems to have been the only focus for celebrations of Mary's Conception. In one Franciscan breviary, the Nativity of the Virgin is illustrated with a miniature of St Anne holding the baby Virgin on her knee, thus obviating any need for the messier parts of birth.[91] In other dioceses, the office of the Assumption was so important that Marian hymns for all other offices mention it. I therefore catalogued not only the Conception hymns and offices but also the offices and hymns for the Nativity

Collection des Etudes Augustiniennes, Série Moyen Âge et Temps Modernes, 35 (Paris: Institut d'Etudes Augustiniennes, 2000); Sarah Jane Boss, 'The Development of the Doctrine of the Immaculate Conception', in Boss (ed.), *Mary: The Complete Resource*, pp. 207–35.

[89]   See, for example, Pierre Le Gentil's classic study of Juan Ruiz's Ave Maria: 'L'Ave Maria de l'Arcipreste de Hita', in *Fin du Moyen Âge et Renaissance: Mélanges de philologie française offerts à Robert Guiette* (Anvers: De Nederlandsche Boekhandel, 1961).

[90]   Josef Szövérffy, *Iberian Latin Hymnody: Survey and Problems*, 2nd edn (Leyden: Classical Folia, 1998). On verbetas in Cataluña, see Francesc Bonastre i Bertrán, *Estudis sobre la verbeta: la verbeta a Catalunya durant els segles XI–XVI* (Tarragona: Diputación de Tarragona, 1982).

[91]   *Breviarium franciscanum*, Escorial, MS d.IV.12, fol. 424r.

and for St Anne, as well as for the Assumption, and these are included in an appendix to this study. The liturgies give vital clues as to how the Conception began to be celebrated in the kingdoms of Aragon and Castile-Leon. Some manuscripts include the feast in the calendar only and make no further reference to it in the proper of the saints. Often an entry in the calendar for the Conception feast should be taken as a shorthand way of indicating that it was to be celebrated using the Nativity liturgy. On occasion, the calendar may be from a different manuscript and have been added at the time of binding.

There is very little evidence from liturgies to indicate that Spain was developing Conception offices before the late thirteenth century, although there may be two late thirteenth-century offices being celebrated, one from Seville and one from Barcelona. In neither of these is the date certain and both could date from the early fourteenth century. The number of liturgies older than the fourteenth century consulted is small, fifty-six manuscripts in all from a total of two hundred and sixty-one.[92] It can be concluded that the feast of the Conception of Mary had been adopted in the majority of dioceses in the Kingdom of Aragon by the mid-fourteenth century, even though the manner in which it was celebrated took different forms.

In some liturgical books, the entry in the proper of saints for the Conception feast clearly shows that the order for the Nativity was to be used. In others, the word 'Conception' or 'conceived' is simply written above Nativity or born, wherever they occur in the Nativity feast.[93] As an interim stage in development of an independent liturgy for the feast, there may be a set of collects or readings for use in conjunction with it. Up until 1478 dioceses had their own local offices in place for celebration of the Conception. The office written by the Franciscan, Leonardo de Nogarola, and approved by the Franciscan Pope, Sixtus IV (1414–84), began to replace the use of the Nativity office in some areas after that. By the mid-sixteenth century, the situation began to change and difference in practice across the dioceses came to an abrupt end. Up until the Council of Trent (1545–1563), with the Church's obsessive move to eliminate local autonomy in the name of the centralized eradication of heresy, there had been no attempt to regularize practices, and dioceses had had a free hand to develop offices according to their own taste and requirements. From 1570, standardized Roman missals and breviaries were obligatory and many older local breviaries were destroyed or were added to lists of banned books. In some dioceses, it was

---

[92] In addition, four manuscripts have been dated in the catalogues as thirteenth to fourteenth century.

[93] A good example of this practice is found in a thirteenth-century manuscript, possibly from the convent of Bon Repos, dated around 1256 by Janini, *Catálogo*, I, p. 225, and held in the Tarragona Public Library. *Breviario cisterciense*, Biblioteca Pública de Tarragona, MS 45.

common practice for such liturgical books to be burnt.[94] Nevertheless, the approval of Nogarola's office should be interpreted as an early move towards promoting a single centrally approved office. The Pope granted it indulgences as an incentive to using it. What is surprising in Spain is that, even after Pope Sixtus officially recognized Nogarola's office, there is evidence that locally approved liturgical books were still being copied and printed, still in use.[95] The rest of the panoply of liturgical texts, such as the *consueta* or the *ordinaria*, were not affected by the standardization process and continued to reflect local practices. At the time of the Counter-Reformation, the Nogarola Conception office was approved for use throughout the Roman Church. It was subsequently reproduced in printed and manuscript form across the two kingdoms.[96]

In dioceses such as Vich, where there was no indigenous Conception office, evidence suggests that Nogarola's office had already been adopted.[97] The case of the Toledo diocese is also interesting. Three copies of the Nogarola office are present in the cathedral archives, suggesting that it was in use. It had also been adopted in Zaragoza, although evidence is too sparse to give any conclusions about how exclusively it was used.

Despite there being no standard practice for how the feast was to be celebrated, there is remarkable similarity in the offices. The Segovia breviaries have close connections with the Toledo office.[98] Links can also be made between Segovia and the neighbouring diocese of El Burgo de Osma. There are marked similarities between the way the feast was celebrated in Huesca

---

[94]   Cabano Vázquez and Díaz Fernández, *Missale Auriense*, p. 40.

[95]   See *Breviarium urgellense*, Arxiu Capitular de la Seu d'Urgell, Incunable 147, printed in Venice in 1487, for use in the Urgell diocese.

[96]   The following fifteenth-century breviaries have Nogarola's office: *Manuscrit miscel·lani*, Barcelona, Biblioteca de Catalunya, MS 1043; *Oficio de la Inmaculada Concepción*, Archivo de Capitular de Toledo, MS 9.8; *Breviario romano para el uso de San Agostín*, Archivo Capitular de Toledo, MS 33.13; *Matutinario*, Archivo Capitular de Toledo, MS 34.5; *Breviarium*, Escorial, MS Vitrina 3; *Misal del Cardenal Mendoza*, Seville, Biblioteca Colombina, MS Vitrina s/s. Archivo Capitular de Toledo, MS 33.13 was written in Italy for the Augustinian Order. Printed copies of the office include a Zaragoza breviary. See Zaragoza, Biblioteca de la Universidad de Zaragoza, incunable 60 and the *Breviarium vicense*, Arxiu Episcopal de Vic, authorized by Bishop Acisclus Moia de Contreras in 1557 (the initial pages of the edition are missing, as are the details of the printer). This volume has been identified as corresponding to the T. Paganus edition published in Lió in 1557, a copy of which is in the University of Barcelona. See Jordi Torra Miró, 'Els llibres impresos de la Biblioteca de la Universitat de Barcelona', *Miscel·lania Litùrgica Catalana*, 8 (1997): 179–95.

[97]   The evidence comes from the 1557 *Breviarium vicensis* printed before the Church introduced standard missals and breviaries, as well as the fifteenth-century *Consueta vicense*, Arxiu Episcopal de Vic, MS 31-18.

[98]   Archivo de la Catedral de Segovia MSS B288 and B272; *Breviarium per totum annum secundum consuetudinem ecclesie toletane*; *Breviarium toletanum* and *Breviario de Toledo*, Archivo Capitular de Toledo, MSS 33.6, 33.7, 33.9; and *Breviario de Toledo*, Biblioteca Balaguer, MS 2.

and in neighbouring Lerida. The overall shape of the responses and antiphons is similar in the majority of offices from Castile, including those written for the Hieronymite Order and the Order of Santiago, although the offices show variance in choice of readings and occasionally of antiphon. The offices developed for use in Gerona were completely different to the offices used elsewhere in the Kingdom of Aragon.

In the first instance, the main impulse behind the development of the liturgy for the Conception feast was in the hands of supporters of the new doctrine, the Franciscans. Of the breviaries, *diurnales*, or day-time offices containing the Conception office, only a small number were for use in Franciscan convents and monasteries. By the fifteenth century, a Franciscan breviary with no dedicated Conception office is a rarity. Their influence was enormous. Huesca inaugurated a solemn procession from the cathedral to the Franciscan convent. The development of the Conception office was, to a lesser extent, in the hands of those Orders, like the Hieronymites and the Cistercians, which gave support to it.

The early extant breviaries of the Order of Preachers never include the Conception office, and it is only occasionally that they record the Sanctification feast, which the Order purported to defend. This lack of interest is only to be expected, since it was the principal opponent to the spread of the new doctrine and to the feast day. The Dominicans, maintaining their distance from the doctrine, and refusing to acknowledge its presence, failed to influence development of the liturgy.

Aragon has the earliest liturgies but these show no standardization, with neighbouring dioceses such as those of Vich or Gerona presenting very different approaches to the level of solemnity accorded to the Conception. No move towards uniformity can be detected within the Tarragona archdiocese and this is no doubt because the Conception was such a new entrant to the array of Marian feasts. Practice varies enormously. Across the spectrum of practice are dioceses, such as Seu d'Urgell, where all Marian feasts were brought into line, and the feast was accorded a vigil and octave like the Assumption, and others where the feast was given an inferior status. In Toledo, the Assumption and the Nativity are the most important of the Marian feasts, accorded a vigil and octave, and the Conception was originally celebrated with neither.

The feast of the Conception ranks alongside Marian feasts, such as the Annunciation (25 March), the Expectation (18 December), the Assumption (15 August), and the Nativity of the Virgin (8 September) in some dioceses. Within the many different types of office, there exist a few dedicated hymns to the Virgin. A small number of these are dedicated to the Conception.

Once I began visiting the cathedral archives of the Peninsula, I became aware that my initial vision of the source field was too limited in another way.

Fieldwork needed to be widened to include the vast array of liturgical books available to clergy in the Middle Ages.[99] Evidence is, therefore, drawn from processionals or books containing all the liturgy pertaining to processions, whether inside or outside the church, sacramentaries or books containing the Common of the Mass and the shorter prayers for the Proper of the Mass within a particular diocese (*sacramentales*), the second part of the breviary which provided the proper of offices for the saints (*sanctorales*), consuetudinals or books outlining how the offices and Masses for holy days were to be celebrated (*consuetudines*), as well as books outlining how different ceremonies not included in the breviary or missal were to be celebrated in particular churches. These might include prayers for the churching of women, prayers for the dead, and rites of purification (*rituales*).[100] The history of the Peninsula made it likely that the Conception doctrine would develop very differently in each of its kingdoms. Discerning any variation in practice forms an important element of the study I undertake.

To begin my study of Spanish Conception hymns, I looked to the monumental nineteenth-century hymn collection, *Analecta Hymnica* (AH), researched, transcribed, and edited by Guido Maria Dreves, and completed by Clemens Blume; to Ulysse Chevalier's standard work, *Repertorium Hymnologicum* (RH); and to Franz-Joseph Mone's *Lateinische Hymnen*.[101] In AH, only one volume is entirely dedicated to hymns from Iberia, with a second devoted to Hispanic Mozarabic tropes. Dreves and Blume scatter other hymns found in Spanish manuscripts throughout the remaining volumes. AH contains a small number of Conception hymns, which the editors indicate are from Spain, but it is not the editors' practice to list every manuscript in which such hymns are found, nor even the exact reference for each. I was curious as to why relatively few Spanish Marian hymns were present in the collection, and why early examples of common hymns were only rarely catalogued in Spanish manuscripts. This

---

[99] My experience is similar to that of José Janini, who also found that he had to take account of a wider range of liturgical books than originally envisaged when preparing his catalogue of liturgical manuscripts in Spanish archives and libraries. See, for example, José Janini and José Serrano, with Anscario M. Mundó, *Manuscritos litúrgicos de las bibliotecas de España*, 2 vols (Burgos: Aldecoa, 1977–80), I, p. 7.

[100] For an outline of all the types of liturgical book and their purposes, see Jeanne E. Kochalis and E. Ann Matter, 'Manuscripts of the Liturgy', in Thomas J. Heffernan and E. Ann Matter (eds), *The Liturgy of the Medieval Church* (Kalamazoo, MI: Western Michigan University, 2001), pp. 433–72.

[101] Guido M. Dreves and Clemens Blume, *Analecta Hymnica Medii Aevi* (Leipzig: Altenburg, 1886–1922); Ulysse Chevalier, *Repertorium Hymnologicum: Catalogue des chants, hymnes, proses, séquences, tropes en usage dans l'église latine depuis les origines jusqu'à nos jours*, 6 vols (Louvain/Brussels: Lefever/Société des Bollandistes, 1892–1920); Franz-Joseph Mone, *Lateinische Hymnen des Mittelalters aus Handschriften herausgegeben und erklärt* (1854), 3 vols (repr. Freiburg: Herder'sche Verlagshandlung, 1964).

is no doubt because Spanish hymns were hidden away in less accessible collections than is generally the case for other countries.

Even after numerous visits to Spain over a number of years during the course of researching this project, I found some archives permanently closed. One important archive, that of Tortosa, opened only in 2012, after a number of years of closure. It opens now for two hours on three mornings a week, if the archivist can manage to be there. Huesca Cathedral archive opens only late in the afternoon, when a committed archivist working full time in local government can manage to facilitate access after work. This is by special personal arrangement. Although I arranged many times by prior contact to see the archives at Tarazona Cathedral, I never gained entry.

The question of why there was such a lack of attention paid to peninsular sources in nineteenth-century hymn studies was a strange one, although it may be that European scholars simply found Spain impenetrable in the nineteenth century. There were certainly a number of wars, as well as revolutions, and these may have prevented scholars from travelling to the Peninsula to visit cathedral archives. The Peninsular War and the Civil War each played their part in scattering and destroying Church archives.[102]

Peninsular scholars, each working in contiguous, specialist fields, have long called for the Iberian context to be recognized. Higinio Anglès Pàmies dedicated his life's work to the transcription and study of Spanish medieval music, publishing in English, Castilian, Catalan, and German, and making a major contribution to developing knowledge of the Spanish musical tradition, both religious and secular. One of his most important contributions remains his edition and critical study of the codex found at Las Huelgas.[103] A number of

---

[102] For an overview of the state of archives in the Kingdom of Aragon, see T. Domingo Pérez, *Estado actual de los archivos con fondos catedralicios aragoneses*, Primeras Jornadas de Archivos (Madrid: Ministerio de Cultura, Dirección General de Bellas Artes y Archivos, 1981).

[103] Higinio Anglès's contribution to musicology is honoured in the special collection in the Biblioteca de Catalunya dedicated to his memory. See, for example, his studies of court music, liturgical music, and more general studies of music and its development in Catalonia and the Kingdom of Aragon from the twelfth to the fourteenth centuries: Higinio Anglès Pàmies, *El còdex musical de las Huelgas*, 3 vols (Barcelona: Institut d'Estudis Catalans, 1931); 'Història de la música a Catalunya' (Barcelona: Arts Gràfiques, 1931) (Extret del *Anuari de l'Institut d'Estudis Catalans*, VII); 'Die Spanische Liedkunst im 15 und 16 Jahrhunderts', in *Festschrift Theodor Kroyer zum sechzigsten Geburtstag am 9 September 1933* (1933), pp. 62–8; *La música a Catalunya fins al segle XIII*, Publicacions del Departament de Música, 10 (Barcelona: Biblioteca de Catalunya, 1935); 'La música anglesa del segles XIII–XIV als Països Catalans', *Analecta Sacra Tarraconense*, 11 (1935): 219–34; 'El músic Jacomí al servei de Joan I i Martí I durant les anys 1372–1404', in *Homenatge a Antonio Rubió i Lluch: Miscellània de textos literaris, històrics, i lingüístics*, 3 vols (Barcelona: Casa de Caritat Atenes, 1936), I, pp. 613–25; 'La música medieval en Toledo hasta el siglo XI', *Spanische Forschungen*, 7 (1st series) (1938): 1–68; 'La música sagrada de la Capilla Pontificia de Avignon en la Capilla Real aragonesa durante el siglo XIV', *Anuario Musical del Institución Española de la Musicología del CSIC* (1957) (Separata); 'Marie dans le chant liturgique

studies of how medieval music developed in the Peninsula, particularly with reference to patronage at the courts, have been undertaken recently.[104] Miquel S. Gros has also been indefatigable in his critical editorial work on early liturgical manuscripts from his native Catalonia, making an important contribution to the availability of early texts to scholars.[105] Szövérffy responded to limited study of the Iberian Peninsula by examining its contribution to hymnody; however, there is little space given to Marian hymns.[106] In one of his other major studies of European hymnody, however, Szövérffy examines Marian hymns but without much attention to Iberia.[107] He mentions a small number of hymn-writers but his emphasis is less on particular collections than on establishing principal themes found in Marian hymnody. In his wider-ranging studies of European hymnody, he does redress the balance. He not only incorporates study of Spanish Mozarabic hymns but also recognizes the contribution to European religious lyric of peninsular hymnodists.[108] Despite Szövérffy's efforts, a corpus of Iberian

et dans la poésie lyrique chanteé du Moyen Age', in *Congressus Mariologici-Mariani in Civitate Lourdes*, 3 vols (Rome: Academia Mariana Internationalis, 1960), III, pp. 331–42; 'Die Sequenz und Verbetas im Mittelalterlichen Spanien', in *Särtyrik ur Studien tillägnade Carl-Allan Moberg* (Stockholm: Marcus Boktr., 1961), pp. 37–47; 'La música en la corte real de Aragón y de Nápoles durante el reinado de Alfonso V el Mágnanimo', *Cuadernos de Trabajos de la Escuela Española de Historia y Arqueología en Roma*, 11 (1961): 81–142; 'Fra Eiximenis (1340–1409) i la música del seu temps', *Estudis Romànics*, 10 (1962): 189–208; 'La música a la Corona de Aragón durant els segles XII–XIV', in *VII Congreso de Historia de la Corona de Aragón (1–6 octubre)*, 4 vols (Barcelona: n.p. [Tall. de Viuda de Fidel Rodríguez Ferrán], 1962), III: *Comunicaciones*, pp. 279–89 (Separata); *Early Spanish Musical Culture and Cardinal Cisneros' Hymnal of 1515* ([New York]: Norton, 1966); *Historia de la música medieval en Navarra* (Pamplona: Aranzadi, 1970); 'Sakraler Gesang und Musik in den Schriften Gregors des Grossen', in Jack Westrup (ed.), *Essays presented to Egon Wellesz* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1966), pp. 33–42.

    104 María del Carmen Gómez Muntané, *La música en la casa real catalano-aragonesa durante los años 1336–1432* (Barcelona: Antoni Bosch, 1979), I: *Historia y documentos*; *La música medieval* (Barcelona: Dopesa 2, 1980); 'El MS M.971 de la Biblioteca de Catalunya (Misal de Barcelona)', *Butlletí de la Biblioteca de Catalunya*, 10 (1984–86): 159–213; *La música medieval en España* (Kassel: Reichenberger, 2001).

    105 See, for example, Miquel S. Gros, 'El "Missale parvum" de Vic', *Hispania Sacra*, 21 (1968): 41–2, 313–77; 'Els processoners de la Catedral de Vic: Vic Mus. Episc. MS 117 (CXXIV)', *Miscel·lània litúrgica catalana*, 2 (1983): 73–130; 'El col·lectari-capitulari de la Catedral de Vic – Vic Mus. Epis., MS 99 (LXIV)', *Miscel·lània Litúrgica Catalana*, 5 (1994): 107–73; 'El *Liber Consuetudinum vicensis ecclesie* del Canonge Andreu Salmúnia – Vic Museu episcopal, MS 134 (LXXXIV)', *Miscel·lània Litúrgica Catalana*, 7 (1996): 175–292; *Els prosers-tropers de la Catedral de Vic: estudi i edició*, Bibliotheca Liturgica Catalana, 2 (Barcelona: Institut d'Estudis Catalans, 1997); 'El Missal de Sant Ruf-Tortosa, Arx. cap., MS 11', *Miscel·lània Litúrgica Catalana*, 9 (1999): 199–308.

    106 Szövérffy, *Iberian Latin Hymnody*.

    107 Josef Szövérffy, *Marianische Motivik der Hymnen: ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der marianischen Lyrik im Mittelalter*, Medieval Classics: Texts and Studies, 18 (Leyden: Classical Folia, 1985).

    108 Szövérffy, *Marianische Motivik*, pp. 13–28; Josef Szövérffy, *A Concise History of Medieval Latin Hymnody: Religious Lyric between Antiquity and Humanism,* Medieval Classics: Texts and Studies, 19 (Leyden: Classical Folia, 1985).

Marian hymns has never been made available to scholars, and this study takes the first steps towards righting that omission. The appendix to this volume includes transcriptions of peninsular hymns dedicated to the Virgin Mary and her principal feast days.

Research for this book has been a celebration of place from beginning to end. It meant visiting the principal medieval dioceses of the kingdoms of Castile, Navarre, and Aragon in order to catalogue hymns and offices. While undertaking the fieldwork, I felt conscious of retracing the journey undertaken by the Villanuevas, whose visit to all the eastern dioceses took place in the early nineteenth century (1821–50). They consulted sources in cathedral archives, university libraries, monastery libraries, as well as in national and regional libraries in Spain. Some of the sources they catalogued were destroyed during the Civil War, but many were saved and can still be consulted, sometimes in different libraries or archives.

To these great hymn collectors and travel writers of the nineteenth century, I acknowledge an enormous debt. At each step of research, I was able to correlate findings with their catalogues and editions and so establish whether a hymn had been discovered. José Janini's catalogue of extant manuscripts in Spanish archives also proved of enormous assistance. Arrival at any archive with the Janini catalogue references to hand immediately opened doors and marked me out as a serious scholar.[109]

Allegories of Place in Peninsular Works about the Virgin Mary

The book's various chapters are each closely associated with the place of Mary in the Church's devotion in a particular liturgy, with each architectural allegory contributing to a different way of constructing the Virgin's identity. Some sixty years after the end of the fifteenth century, the point of closure of this study, the reforms of the Council of Trent, introduced because of a determination to unify practice across the whole of the Roman Church, meant that both the missal and the breviary became standard. Following accusations of superstitious practices, presented by Protestants at the Reformation, the Catholic Church sought to eradicate local autonomy in the Mass and in the daily office. After

---

[109] José Janini and José M. Marqués, *Manuscritos de la Colegiata de S. Félix de Gerona* (1962) (Extracto: *Hispania Sacra*, 15); José Janini and Ramón Gonzálvez, with Anscario M. Mundó, *Catálogo de los manuscritos litúrgicos de la Catedral de Toledo*, Publicaciones del Instituto Provincial de Investigaciones y Estudios Toledanos, series 3, Estudios Catálogos Repertorios, 11 (Toledo: Diputación Provincial, 1977); Janini and Serrano, *Manuscritos litúrgicos*; José Janini, *Manuscritos litúrgicos de la Biblioteca Nacional*, 2nd edn (Madrid: Dirección General de Archivos y Bibliotecas, 1980); José Janini, *Liber Missarum de Toledo y libros místicos*, 2 vols (Toledo: Instituto de Estudios Visigótico-Mozárabes, 1982).

the sixteenth century, any differing local practices were retained outside those two main liturgical books and remained visible only in the *Consueta* or books of custom and practice, processionals, and other minor liturgical books. Taking a snapshot of liturgical practice in the Peninsula prior to standardization will increase understanding of the impact the changes were to have, particularly through how this one office spread and developed.

I first examine the importance of place in the miracle stories written about the Virgin Mary in Hispanic liturgy. The names and places in the miracles were unusual to Hispanic ears and I trace how liturgists dealt with those names and places which in other parts of Europe had become associated with the Conception.

After this, I begin to examine a series of liturgical themes drawn from a range of Marian offices. Liturgists, theologians, and poets associated Mary's body with a number of different spaces, both spiritual and secular. Many of these were constructed places, with various types of architectural features. Some were objects associated with particular holy places. I will examine what these places and objects imply for the Church's thinking about women, as they objectify Mary's body. I also consider the rich vein they provide for the study of lyric. In each chapter, I seek to show how the liturgy for each Marian feast helps to deepen understanding of the literature written in honour of Mary in the Peninsula. I begin by examining the garden space in Marian liturgy and literature, as a way for poets to express the Virgin Mary's genealogy and Nativity. I blend a number of different sources to give insight into the nature of medieval gardens. This chapter sets devotion to Mary in the context of devotion to her holy birth. It examines her genealogy through the trope of the '*flos campi*', the flower of the field, favoured in Nativity offices of the Virgin. Added to this, the idea of land, strong in the Jewish tradition as something held in the gift of God, was not lost on a medieval society seeking to conquer lands held by an Islamic invader.[110] These insights assist in re-exploring how Old Testament garden and field prefigurations would be imagined in the medieval period, but also in looking afresh at how poets depict Mary, beginning with the most famous verdant space in Hispanic literature, Gonzalo de Berceo's allegorical 'prado' or meadow in the *Milagros de Nuestra Señora*.[111] Landscape was mostly a rhetorical tool, used to create, as in Gonzalo de Berceo's work, an allegorical representation of the soul, of the hereafter, of the Virgin Mary.[112]

---

[110] For land as a gift of God, see Walter Brueggemann, *The Land: Place as Gift, Promise, and Challenge in Biblical Faith* (Philadelphia, PA: Fortress Press, 1977).

[111] My approach to uses of the Bible draws on Alan Deyermond, *Poesía figural: usos de la Biblia en la literatura medieval española*, SEMYR: Homenaje, 9 (Salamanca: SEMYR, 2015).

[112] Sarah Salih, 'Lydgate's Landscape History', in Weiss and Salih (eds), *Locating the Middle Ages*, pp. 83–92. Salih begins from the premise that landscape is a rhetorical trope to show how Lydgate's manuscript reveals a landscape where history and ethnicity interact, p. 83.

This chapter is more than a study of liturgy, as it discerns synergies between real garden spaces in medieval Spain and the various uses made of them. How gardens were planted during different phases of the Middle Ages and what is known about Bible gardens, walled or not, also provides insights into poetic garden images. The melding of a Song of Songs' hinterland of tropes with experienced and lived landscapes to apply to the Virgin takes account of and further builds on Gordon Rudy's discussion of theological and spiritual uses of the Song of Songs as a 'book of experience'.[113] These chapters show how authors' interpretations of those tropes, not only the flower of the field but also the fountain of the garden, might be honed and shaped by lived experience of the world around both writers and readers or auditors.

The importance of the spring and flowing water in poetry, liturgy, and theology is addressed next. I examine a range of water sources and their uses in biblical and patristic sources as well as in towns in the Middle Ages. Water and its importance in civic spaces enables me to approach afresh various poems and pieces where the Virgin was prefigured by biblical water sources, particularly the fourfold paradise spring created in Genesis.

In the next chapter, a single element of the garden, its fountain, becomes my focus, most particularly the fountain of the Song of Songs. I sift out examples of fountain construction from relevant sources. I also find it fruitful to determine how secular poets wrote about fountains in literary landscapes, particularly as meeting points for lovers. The fountain serves to prefigure the meeting of the human and the divine at the Incarnation. Insights drawn from re-examining miniatures of well-known fountains may well deposit extra layers of meaning on allusions to Old Testament fountains, such as the one best known to poets, the sealed fountain from the Song of Songs. Fountains provided a space for refreshment. Their shape is a nourishing bosom, spilling forth water, not milk. Fountains, with their wide-bellied basins, take on the function of holding Christ, mediating his presence in the world, or offering him as the water of life.

Opening and closing is the focus of a chapter examining the gate of Ezekiel and the closed door of the furnace and the locked lions' den in the Book of Daniel. These enclosed spaces provide new ways of examining the laws of nature overridden for the Virgin Birth.

Because Mary's womb contained Christ for nine months during pregnancy, as sung in the *Salve, sancta parens*, sung at the start of the Mass of the Virgin Mary, theologians and liturgists turned to biblical sacred vessels to symbolize her function and her nature:

---

[113] Gordon Rudy, *The Mystical Language of Sensation in the Later Middle Ages* (New York: Routledge, 2002), p. 20.

Hail, holy one with child, pure one bearing the king who rules over heaven and earth forever. Mother of God and Virgin, he, whom the whole earth cannot hold, is held in your womb and becomes man.[114]

The art historian Yrjö Hirn has drawn attention to Mary's condition of being the sacred vessel, which, like the Ark of the Covenant, was incomprehensibly the bearer of the true God.[115] Modern-day living tends to provide examples of disposable containers, but this was not the case in the early Church, where vessels, such as the font or the paten and chalice used at the Eucharist, are infused with holiness and become objects of piety in their own right: 'All these things are holy objects in themselves, because of the precious contents which they may bear.'[116] The same infusion of holiness takes place in the case of the Virgin Mary, as though she were a sacred vessel, because of the sacred contents her womb held for nine months. Yet the holy maternity of the Virgin Mary relates both to vessels and to the building that contained them.

Each of the sacred vessels was held in a constructed sacred space, whether in the Church or the Temple, the place where God comes down to his people to be present in the Holy of Holies or in the sacrament of the Eucharist. The Temple stands as a figure whose principal function is to serve as a meeting point between the human and the divine. However, its links to paradise and to sacred place cannot be forgotten.

By the early sixteenth century, the Temple had become a central component in depictions of the Immaculate Conception, where artists depict it as one of the sacred objects encircling the Virgin. The Temple had not yet made its transition to the Conception doctrine in the thirteenth century. It was an edifice built to draw God closer to humanity; however, for the early Church Fathers, it also represented the Church and even the individual soul. Once it began to represent Mary's body, it became a point of entry for the divine into human affairs and a point of entry for humans into paradise. The Temple could depict the mystery of the Incarnation where the divine was contained in a human space. I trace the Temple trope in Conception liturgy and then in vernacular writing both from the early and the later medieval periods.

Since Christ was also King, he needed a royal dwelling. Mary's body became a palace, which I trace in liturgy and in vernacular writing. I will draw in this

---

114 'Salve, sancta parens, enixa puerpera regem, qui celum terraque regnat in secula seculorum. Virgo dei genitrix quem totus non capit orbis in tua se clausit uiscera factus homo.' BL Add. 18193, fol. 14r.

115 Yrjö Hirn, *The Sacred Shrine: A Study of the Poetry and Art of the Catholic Church* (London: Macmillan, 1912).

116 Sarah Jane Boss, *Empress and Handmaid: On Nature and Gender in the Cult of the Virgin Mary* (London: Cassell, 1999), p. 26.

chapter on medieval medical writing to show how dwellings were to be carefully prepared to ensure the well-being of the inhabitants and to safeguard the monarch whose body was also the body of the state. I trace palace imagery in its connection to the history of salvation and I trace both temporary and permanent royal dwellings as well as places within the palace walls in medieval art, liturgy, theological writing, and lyric. Mary's body, as a seat of royal might, also becomes a site where pre-eminence and power is visible and manifest on earth.

Kings could also inhabit castles and I examine the architecture of castles and fortified towns, setting both alongside fortress imagery, drawn from liturgy and theological writing. In this chapter, I examine the Virgin's advocacy with God, because of her motherhood as well as how she operates as a protective space for all Christians. I then discuss how fortified spaces represent virginity and virtue but also how they link back to Jewish concepts of fertility and the holy city.[117]

Perfume, which is stored in sacred objects, such as the censer, which can be used to enhance liturgy, creates a new association in medieval poetry between Mary and perfumed vessels and holy objects that hold sacred substances. The perfumer is another vessel particularly appropriate to the Virgin's sacred body because of its sacred contents. In this chapter, I will examine scents, particularly in Assumption liturgies. The Assumption, one of the most important feast days of the liturgical year in Spain, is founded on a doctrine about the sacred matter of which Mary's body is made. It also expresses concerns about the eventual resting place of that sacred substance. Flowers and sacred scents mingle to depict the holy body of the Virgin, redolent of perfumes, diffused from within gardens, vineyards, bridal chambers, and other spaces. Sacred scents prefigure Mary's sanctity and they open sacred spaces to all the senses.

Most of the Marian images examined in this study have been previously identified by Marian scholars such as Marina Warner or Jaroslav Pelikan, although subtle changes in meaning between the early and later Middle Ages, and their connection to a range of differing Marian doctrines and feasts, have not always been recognized. Such shifts in meaning influence how Marian images should be individually and collectively interpreted. More importantly, they impact on how even the most traditional of Marian themes must be viewed, when they appear in non-theological texts.

As I was undertaking the fieldwork for this project, I met with incredulity from Spanish friends with whom I often stayed as I criss-crossed Spain. I owe a debt of gratitude to the Álvaro family. They urged me to write a different book. 'Why don't you write the story of the journey around the archives – that would be much

---

[117] On the links between rebuilding of the holy city and the land's abundance, see, for example, Walter Brueggemann, *To Build, to Plant: A Commentary on Jeremiah 26:52* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1991).

more interesting than anything else.' Most Spaniards regarded my travels as a slightly eccentric pastime. Most responded with incredulity to the idea that there might be liturgies dating from the medieval period dedicated to the Conception of the Virgin; after all, it had only been defined in the nineteenth century. Few have any idea of the wealth of liturgies, offices, and songs that Iberian public libraries and Church archives hold. Finding them and making their influence more widely known has been one of the primary aims of this study.

Yet it has proved to be the study of the interrelating themes surfacing in all the Marian feasts celebrated in the Peninsula that has most captured my attention and become the backbone of this book. The liturgical offices examined here have not been considered together before, except as a catalogue. Their existence, although not totally unknown, has been ignored for the purpose of comparative study with vernacular literatures. The Latin in which offices are written has become a greater barrier as the centuries go by. Added to this, travel is difficult and expensive, which has generally precluded studying liturgies from beyond the bounds of a single region or even from more than one archive. Even Janini, who undertook a vast overview of all the manuscripts in Spanish archives, and who frequently pointed out unusual saints' days in the calendars of the manuscripts he examined, never analysed the content of each liturgy, much less compared that content with literary texts. The two appendices to this volume contain a collection of all the Marian hymns, including Conception hymns, found in the Peninsula, and also a record of the offices found in pre-sixteenth-century liturgical books. In the appendix, I have edited, for the benefit of readers, a collection of those Marian hymns I found in peninsular liturgies.

There is a story of the journey from archive to archive and the different relationships built in each of the places, with some generously allowing me to come back in the afternoon and study for full days and others not available, for important reasons, even after arrangements had been made. That story is not one I have chosen to write, at least yet. Some day it may be a story to tell. I hope, nevertheless, that the story I have chosen to present proves interesting, to some at least.

Much of the Hispanic poetry I examine is now readily available online via the *Cancionero* corpus in the Liverpool project (http://cancionerovirtual.liv. ac.uk), via the Oxford *Cantigas de Santa Maria* project (http://csm.mml.ox. ac.uk), or in modern critical editions.[118] I have translated all literary and historical

---

[118] See, for example, Gonzalo de Berceo, *El duelo de la Virgen; los himnos; los loores de Nuestra Señora; los signos del juicio final: Estudio y edición crítica*, ed. Brian Dutton, Monografías, A18 (London: Tamesis, 1975); *Los Milagros de Nuestra Señora: Estudio y edición crítica*, ed. Brian Dutton, 2nd edn, Monografías, A15 (London: Tamesis, 1980); *Gonzalo de Berceo: Milagros de Nuestra Señora*, ed. Fernando Baños, Estudio preliminar, Isabel Uría Maqua, Biblioteca Clásica, 3 (Barcelona: Crítica, 1997); *Los milagros de Nuestra Señora*, ed. Claudio García Turza

texts to ensure that they can be followed by readers who may be interested in medieval literature on the subject of the Virgin but who are not sufficiently well versed in medieval Castilian or Catalan to read them in the original. The translations are not intended to be poetic but functional.

(Logroño: Colegio Universitario de La Rioja, Servico de Publicaciones, 1984); *Milagros de Nuestra Señora*, ed. E. Michael Gerli (Madrid: Cátedra, 1992); *Milagros de Nuestra Señora*, with preliminary study by Isabel Uría Maqua, ed. Fernando Baños, Biblioteca Clásica, 3 (Barcelona: Crítica, 1997); *Milagros de Nuestra Señora*, ed. Juan Carlos Bayo and Ian Michael, Clásicos Castalia, 288 (Madrid: Castalia, 2005); López de Mendoza, *Poesías completas*, ed. Kerkhof and Gómez Moreno; Julio Rodríguez Puértolas (ed.), *Cancionero de Fray Ambrosio Montesino* (Cuenca: Diputación de Cuenca, 1987); Antoni Ferrando Francés (ed.), *Els certàmens poètics valencians del segle XIV al XIX*, Institut de Literatura i Estudis Filològics, Institució Alfons el Magnànim (Valencia: Diputació de Valencia, 1983). The 1474 edition of the *Trobes en laors de la verge Maria* has been edited on a number of occasions since the nineteenth century: Francisco Martí i Grajales, *Les trobes en lahors de la Verge Maria* (Valencia: Librería de Pascual Aguilar, 1894); and in a 500th anniversary facsimile edition by M. Sanchís Guarner, Bernat Fenollar, *Les trobes en lahors de la Verge Maria* (Valencia: Caixa d'Estalvis i Mont de Pietat de València, 1974); it was also edited to mark the same anniversary by Lluís Guarner, *Les trobes en lahors de la Verge Maria: Edició facsímil del único ejemplar conocido. Prólogo y versiones de Lluís Guarner. El primer incunable español* (Valencia: Instituto Nacional del Libro, 1974).

LITURGY AND PLACE

A Feast of Miracles: Foreign Places, Foreign Spaces in Hispanic Miracle Collections

Two of the earliest vernacular miracle manuscripts in the Iberian Peninsula are Gonzalo de Berceo's *Milagros de Nuestra Señora* or Miracles of Our Lady, and Alfonso X's *Cantigas de Santa María* or Songs of Our Lady, both dating from the mid-thirteenth century. Each is directed at a different audience. Berceo's collection springs from clerical circles and promotes the role of the secular clergy.[1] Some have seen in Berceo's work a desire to instruct or entertain pilgrims to the monastery of San Millán de la Cogolla.[2] Alfonso's *Cantiga*s, on the other hand, mark the level of devotion to the Virgin Mary within court circles with miracles about members of his own family, such as Cantiga 221 (King Fernando is Healed) or Cantiga 256 (Queen Beatrice is Healed).[3] In one Cantiga (235, The Virgin's Favours to King Alfonso), Alfonso is healed by the good offices of the Virgin.[4] Alfonso worked with a team of *juglares* to compile his *Cantigas* in honour of the Virgin Mary. They are miracles performed by the Virgin, interspersed with songs of praise to her. Some believe he dictated his poems to

---

[1]   Critical discussion includes Annette Grant Cash's study of several miracles in order to emphasize how they are adapted for different audiences: 'Holy Mary Intervenes for the Clergy in the *Cantigas* of Alfonso X and in the *Milagros* of Berceo: Observations Concerning the Implicit Audience', *Cantigueiros*, 8 (1996): 38.

[2]   On Gonzalo de Berceo's propaganda work as an instrument for teaching the faithful, see Fernando Baños Vallejo, 'Hagiografía en verso para la catequesis y la propaganda', in Jane E. Connolly, Alan Deyermond, and Brian Dutton (eds), *Saints and their Authors: Studies in Medieval Hispanic Hagiography in Honor of John K. Walsh* (Madison, WI: HSMS, 1990), pp. 1–11. Anthony Lappin shows convincingly that mythification of Berceo's connection to San Millán is not borne out by cartulary evidence. He argues that Berceo, though educated in San Millán, was a member of the secular clergy at Berceo. Lappin, *Gonzalo de Berceo*, pp. 3, 9–14.

[3]   I identify each miracle by the titles in the Oxford *Cantigas de Santa Maria* database, http://csm.mml.ox.ac.uk/index.php?p=poem_list [accessed 21 January 2014]; *Cantigas*, II, pp. 302–4; III, pp. 18–19. See also Remensnyder's articulations of Alfonso's deliberate intertwining of devotion to the Virgin Mary with the conquests of his father in *La Conquistadora*, p. 52. Connie Scarborough, *A Holy Alliance: Alfonso X's Political Use of Marian Poetry* (Newark, NJ: Juan de la Cuesta, 2009), also addresses political positioning of the *Cantigas*.

[4]   *Cantigas*, II, pp. 335–8. See Kirsten Kennedy, 'In Sickess and in Health: Alfonso X, the Virgin Mary and Cantiga 235', *The Galician Review*, 1 (1998): 27–42.

the *juglares*, while others argue that he was a compiler and director of others' work.[5] More recent scholarship has painstakingly revealed how Alfonso, and his fellow-poets, worked and reworked the songs and miracles.[6]

The widespread preservation of these early Marian miracles shows their popularity and their ubiquity. There are vernacular miracles and songs to the Virgin in the distinctive *Llibre vermell de Montserrat*, copied at Montserrat, a sacred place of Marian pilgrimage in Catalonia, with its shrine for the Black Madonna.[7] The Peninsula produced yet another contemporary collection, the *Liber Mariale*, by Juan Gil de Zamora, or Aegidius de Zamora (1240–1316 or 1318), a near-contemporary of Alfonso X.[8] It is, therefore, perhaps not so surprising to find that miracles form a staple element in Hispanic breviaries, and in this chapter I will examine those that occur in Marian offices in dioceses in Spain.

The places that pilgrims visit become sacred because something miraculous happened there, and many collections contain miracles pertaining to one sacred place.[9] Because of this, pilgrim sites and shrines 'are imbued with power'.[10] Pilgrimage places an everyday reality in a sacred dimension, uniting heaven

---

[5]   See, for example, Ramón Menéndez Pidal, *Poesías juglarescas y los orígenes de las literaturas románicas: problemas de historia literaria y cultural* (Madrid: Instituto de Estudios Políticos, 1957), pp. 180–3, his reworking of his *Poesía juglaresca y juglares: aspectos de la historia literaria y cultural de España*, Publicaciones de la *RFE*, 7 (Madrid, Publicaciones de la Revista de Filología Española, 1924); Roger D. Tinnell, 'Authorship and Composition: Music and Poetry in *Las Cantigas de Santa Maria* of Alfonso X el Sabio', *Kentucky Romance Quarterly*, 28 (1981): 189–98, at pp. 193–4; Laura Fernández Fernández, 'Los manuscritos de las *Cantigas de Santa Maria:* definición material de un proyecto regio', *Alcanate: Revista de Estudios Alfonsíes*, 8 (2013): 79–115.

[6]   Stephen Parkinson, 'Editions for Consumers: Five Versions of a Cantiga de Santa María', in Benigno Fernández Salgado (ed.), *Actas do IV Congreso Internacional de Estudios Galegos, Universidade de Oxford, 26–28 Setembro 1994* (Oxford: Centre for Galician Studies, 1997), pp. 57–75.

[7]   *Llibre vermell de Montserrat*, Arxiu de la Abadia de Montserrat, MS 1.

[8]   See, for example, the opening paragraphs of Richard McNabb's article, 'To Father John, with Love, Bishop Alexander: Juan Gil de Zamora's Medieval Art of Letters', *Rhetoric Review*, 23 (2004): 103–20. The relationship of Berceo's miracles collection to Latin miracles in MS Thott and BN MS 110 has been much studied. See, for example, Richard Becker, *Gonzalo de Berceos Milagros und ihre Grundlagen mit einem Anhange: Mitteilungen aus der Kopenhagen Thott Lat. MS 128* (Strasburg: Universitäts Buchdruckerei, 1910); Jaime Ferreiro Alemparte, 'Las versiones latinas de la leyenda de San Ildefonso y su reflejo en Berceo', *BRAE*, 50 (1970): 233–76; Richard Kinkade, 'A New Latin Source for Berceo's *Milagros*: MS 110 of Madrid's Biblioteca Nacional', *Romance Philology*, 25 (1971): 188–92; and, more recently, E. Michael Gerli's introduction to Berceo, *Milagros de Nuestra Señora*, Letras Hispánicas, 224, 6th edn (Madrid: Cátedra, 1992), pp. 24–31; Juan Carlos Bayo, 'Las colecciones universales de milagros de la Virgen hasta Gonzalo de Berceo', *Bulletin of Spanish Studies*, 81 (2004): 849–71.

[9]   Douglas Davies, 'Christianity', in Holm and Bowker (eds), *Sacred Place*, pp. 33–61, at p. 44.

[10]   David Frankfurter (ed.), *Pilgrimage and Holy Space in Late Antique Egypt*, Religions in the Graeco-Roman World, 134 (Leiden: Brill, 1998), p. 18.

and earth in one space.[11] Pilgrimage sites can function, therefore, in some ways as liminal or 'liminoid' spaces, because they are places of transition and of personal transformation. They certainly permit the profane to open to the sacred.[12] Like the archetypal Christian journey from birth to death, pilgrimages have an initiation and an end ritual and, because they are 'mass movements, they tend to accrete rich superstructures of legend, myth, folklore, and literature'.[13]

Elsinus and Authoritative Beginnings for the Conception Feast

Scholarly work on European miracle collections over a century ago showed that, from the twelfth century onward, a particular Conception miracle was included in major collections.[14] That miracle was the story of Elsinus, sometimes also called Aelsi or Helsin, abbot of Ramsey. Scholars remarked upon the close association of the Elsinus miracle with Conception offices across Europe, regarding it as an anomalous feature of certain central European breviaries.[15]

Study of miracles in liturgical collections is limited. Conception miracles spread by the mid-twelfth century from England to France, occurring in breviaries in Verdun, Rouen, and Saint Martial.[16] The many French pilgrim sites dedicated to

[11]   Mark R. Wynn, 'Pilgrimage and the Differentiated Religious Significance of Space', in Mark R. Wynn, *Faith and Place: An Essay in Embodied Religious Epistemology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), pp. 135–72. Wynn discusses pilgrimage as a microcosmic journey, involving encounter with God, p. 165.

[12]   Seth D. Kunin, 'Pilgrimage', in Seth D. Kunin, *God's Place in the World: Sacred Space and Sacred Place in Jerusalem* (London: Cassell, 1998), pp. 64–91, at p. 65. For the 'liminoid', see Victor Turner and Edith Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture: Anthropological Perspectives* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1978), pp. 1–38.

[13]   Turner and Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage*, p. 23.

[14]   A. Mussafia, 'Studien zu der Mittelalterlichen Marienlegenden', *Sitzungberichte der Kaiserlichen Akademie der Wissenschaften* (Vienna: K. Gerold, 1886–98), 113, pp. 917–94; 115, pp. 5–93; 119, pp. 1–66; 123, pp. 1–85; 139, pp. 1–74.

[15]   Edmund Bishop, 'On the Origins of the Feast of the Conception of the Virgin Mary', *The Downside Review* (1886), repr. in Edmund Bishop (ed.), *Liturgica Historica* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1904), pp. 238–59.

[16]   See Marielle Lamy, *L'Immaculée Conception: étapes et enjeux d'une controverse au Moyen Âge (XIIᵉ–XVᵉ siècles)*, Collection des Etudes Augustiniennes, Série Moyen Âge et Temps Modernes, 35 (Paris: Institut d'Etudes Augustiniennes, 2000), pp. 90–3, for a summary of the details of the origins of the legend. For defence of the English origins of the legend, see Bishop, 'On the Origins', pp. 238–59; Mussafia, 'Studien'; Evelyn Faye Wilson (ed.), *The Stella Maris of John of Garland edited together with a Collection of Various Mary Legends Made in Northern France in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries*, Mediaeval Academy of America, 45 (Cambridge, MA: Mediaeval Academy of America, 1946); and Alberic Stacpoole (ed.), *Mary's Place in Christian Dialogue: Occasional Papers of the Ecumenical Society of the Blessed Virgin Mary* (Middlegreen: St Paul Publications, 1982), pp. 217–31. The miracle was recorded among Anselm's writings but is now counted among those writings attributed to him. St Anselm (Eadmer), *Miracula de Conceptione Sanctae Mariae*, ed. J.-P. Migne (Paris, 1844–64), PL 159, cols 323–6. It originated among Anselm's disciples and is attributed to Osbert of Clare.