

Freedom of Information and the Developing World

The citizen, the state and models of openness

Colin Darch and Peter G. Underwood



Freedom of Information and the Developing World

CHANDOS
INFORMATION PROFESSIONAL SERIES

Series Editor: Ruth Rikowski
(email: Rikowskigr@aol.com)

Chandos' new series of books are aimed at the busy information professional. They have been specially commissioned to provide the reader with an authoritative view of current thinking. They are designed to provide easy-to-read and (most importantly) practical coverage of topics that are of interest to librarians and other information professionals. If you would like a full listing of current and forthcoming titles, please visit our web site www.chandospublishing.com or email info@chandospublishing.com or telephone +44 (0) 1223 891358.

New authors: we are always pleased to receive ideas for new titles; if you would like to write a book for Chandos, please contact Dr Glyn Jones on email gjones@chandospublishing.com or telephone number +44 (0) 1993 848726.

Bulk orders: some organisations buy a number of copies of our books. If you are interested in doing this, we would be pleased to discuss a discount. Please email info@chandospublishing.com or telephone +44 (0) 1223 891358.

Freedom of Information and the Developing World

*The citizen, the state and
models of openness*

COLIN DARCH
AND
PETER G. UNDERWOOD



Chandos Publishing
Oxford • Cambridge • New Delhi

Chandos Publishing
TBAC Business Centre
Avenue 4
Station Lane
Witney
Oxford OX28 4BN
UK
Tel: +44 (0) 1993 848726
Email: info@chandospublishing.com
www.chandospublishing.com

Chandos Publishing is an imprint of Woodhead Publishing Limited

Woodhead Publishing Limited
Abington Hall
Granta Park
Great Abington
Cambridge CB21 6AH
UK
www.woodheadpublishing.com

First published in 2010

ISBN:
978 1 84334 147 5

© C. Darch and P. G. Underwood, 2010

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the prior written permission of the Publishers. This publication may not be lent, resold, hired out or otherwise disposed of by way of trade in any form of binding or cover other than that in which it is published without the prior consent of the Publishers. Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The Publishers make no representation, express or implied, with regard to the accuracy of the information contained in this publication and cannot accept any legal responsibility or liability for any errors or omissions.

The material contained in this publication constitutes general guidelines only and does not represent to be advice on any particular matter. No reader or purchaser should act on the basis of material contained in this publication without first taking professional advice appropriate to their particular circumstances. All screenshots in this publication are the copyright of the website owner(s), unless indicated otherwise.

Typeset by Domex e-Data Pvt. Ltd.
Printed in the UK and USA.

Contents

| | |
|---|-------------|
| <i>List of figures and tables</i> | <i>ix</i> |
| <i>About the authors</i> | <i>xi</i> |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | <i>xiii</i> |
| <i>List of acronyms and abbreviations</i> | <i>xv</i> |
| 1 Introduction | 1 |
| 2 Developing countries and freedom of information | 13 |
| The claims for freedom of information | 13 |
| Freedom of information and economic development | 15 |
| Freedom of information and its impact on democratic practice | 25 |
| Freedom of information and the elimination of corruption | 35 |
| The protection of other rights | 43 |
| 3 The diffusion problem and the semantic shift | 47 |
| Introduction: the dynamic of diffusion | 47 |
| The diffusion of social and legal norms | 56 |
| Historicising freedom of information: Anders Chydenius and the Swedish Age of Liberty | 64 |
| Historicising freedom of information: Article 19 and semantic shift | 72 |
| Information access rights in the wider context | 85 |
| 4 Compliance and the impulse to secrecy | 91 |
| Bureaucracy, information and power | 91 |
| Sociological accounts of bureaucracy | 93 |
| Surveillance and privacy | 98 |
| Politicians, bureaucracy and ignorance | 104 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Material and ideological pre-conditions | 109 |
| Are models of compliance useful? | 114 |
| Covering the tracks: pre-emptive destruction | 122 |
| 5 Freedom of information as a human right | 127 |
| The 'rights' nature of access to information | 127 |
| The object of the freedom of information claim | 130 |
| Characteristics of human rights | 134 |
| Form and function in a freedom of information right | 137 |
| Ideology and struggle in rights discourse | 142 |
| The Claude Reyes case: a turning point? | 146 |
| The state's duty to respect, protect and fulfil | 150 |
| 6 Struggles for freedom of information in countries in transition | 155 |
| The relationship between access rights and other virtues | 155 |
| The Philippines: case law and access to information | 163 |
| Transparency to stimulate investment: Guangzhou and Shanghai | 171 |
| Freedom of information in a different America: Guatemala, Bolivia and Brazil | 182 |
| Russia: access rights in a transitional authoritarian society | 197 |
| Conclusion | 203 |
| 7 Struggles for freedom of information in Africa | 205 |
| Zimbabwe: through the looking glass | 210 |
| A prolonged struggle: secrecy and corruption in Nigeria | 215 |
| Oil, secrecy and law in Angola | 221 |
| Mozambique: the development of 'informal' access rights | 226 |
| South Africa: an incomplete transformation | 233 |
| African countries are not 'basket cases' | 243 |
| 8 From adversarialism to FoI 2.0 | 247 |
| The way we live now | 247 |
| Direct action against authoritarian states | 251 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Developing a culture of access: 'Fol 2.0' | 254 |
| Information warfare as a threat to Fol 2.0 | 257 |
| List of sources | 261 |
| Index | 307 |

This page intentionally left blank

List of figures and tables

Figure

- 5.1 Molecular diagram of freedom of information relations 141

Tables

- 2.1 Developing countries with freedom of information legislation: scores and rankings on other freedom measures, 2006–2009 19–20
- 4.1 The Roberts–Snell compliance categories expanded 119
- 5.1 Hohfeldian rights and duties 138
- 6.1 Freedom of information legislation in Africa, Asia and the Americas, 2009 157
- 6.2 Developing countries in the process of adopting freedom of information (FoI) legislation in 2006 162
- 7.1 African countries and the adoption of freedom of information legislation, as of September 2008 208

This page intentionally left blank

About the authors

Colin Darch has been a senior information specialist in the African Studies Library at the University of Cape Town since October 2000. He was university librarian at the University of the Western Cape from 1992 to 1997.

Over the past four decades, he has worked variously as a librarian, lecturer and researcher at academic institutions in Ethiopia, Tanzania, Mozambique, Zimbabwe and Brazil. He has published extensively in both English and Portuguese on information issues as well as African history and bibliography.

He has a Ph.D. in social and economic analysis from the University of Bradford. His current research interests include the political economy of intellectual property, and he was a founder member of the CopySouth research network, in which he remains active. He may be contacted at colin.darch@gmail.com.

Peter G. Underwood is Professor of Librarianship at the University of Cape Town, having occupied this position since 1992. Prior to this he spent 20 years as lecturer in the Department of Information Studies, University College of Wales, Aberystwyth, United Kingdom.

He is the author of *Managing Change in Libraries and Information Services: A Systems Approach* and *Soft Systems Analysis and the Management of Libraries, Information Services and Resource Centres*, and co-author of *Basics of Data Management for Information Services*.

He is a graduate of the Cranfield School of Management, having completed an MBA there in 1980, and a Fellow of the Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals (CILIP). He is also a member of the Library and Information Association of South Africa and of the Association of Southern Africa Indexers and Bibliographers. He may be contacted at Peter.Underwood@uct.ac.za.

This page intentionally left blank

Acknowledgements

Authors never really work alone, but usually build on the work of earlier commentators and, most importantly, always rely on the support of their communities, whether intellectual, social, familial or even virtual. We are no exception, and we happily acknowledge that we owe a huge debt of gratitude to colleagues, friends and relatives who have helped us through the researching and writing of this book in many different ways. They have read and criticised multiple drafts of different chapters, they have helped us to track down obscure references, and they have generously provided us with copies of hard-to-find works, including a film, from around the world. They have suggested new ideas and concepts, and corrected some of the more glaring factual errors. They deserve a significant part of the credit for such virtues as this book may possess.

We should therefore like to gratefully acknowledge the varied contributions that the following people have made to the creation of this text: Patricia Alvarez; Luís de Brito (for his critique of the section on Mozambique); Richard Calland (for reading a late draft and for his helpful comments on the importance of the Claude Reyes decision); Paola Carrasco; Father Andrew Cox (for guiding us towards the significance of the hermeneutics of suspicion); Tayamikila Darch; Ajira Darch-Sharp; Karin de Jager (for her critical reading of several chapters); Jacques Depelchin; Georgi Derluguian (for several concrete and theoretical suggestions); Archie Dick; Irina Filatova (for her critique of the section on Russia); Joe Hanlon (for his critique of the section on Mozambique); Judith Head (for her always sharply critical editorial eye); Pertti Hyttinen (for generous help with our account of Chydenius); Al Kagan (for his critique, especially of the African case studies); Lisa Kane; Jonathan Klaaren (for his critique of our foray into legal analysis); Mary Lennox (for compiling the index); Fatima Lesay (for correcting some of our misconceptions about the Philippines); Lawrence Liang (for help with Indian sources); Gary Littlejohn (for reading early draft chapters); Nadja Manghezi (for help with Danish sources); Mary-Ann Mbewe; Marcelo Mosse (for his critique

of the section on Mozambique); Christina Murray; Laura Neuman; Luis Oporto Ordóñez (for his critique, and for invaluable assistance in identifying information on Bolivia); Gargy Sen (for donating a film); Sandy Shell; and Wendy Simmons (for reading early draft chapters).

Rick Snell of the University of Tasmania, and his graduate students Rhys Stubbs and Xiao Weibing, went to extraordinary lengths to provide us with a detailed and supportive critique of the penultimate draft. Anita Visser and the staff of the Inter-Library Loans Department at the University of Cape Town libraries (Rosie Watson, Russel Williams, Mogamat Philemon and Zukile Vusani) were models of efficiency in obtaining sources of all kinds for us, and we thank them warmly.

We also thank our publisher, Dr Glyn Jones of Chandos Publishing (Oxford), who was both patient and unflaggingly supportive as deadlines regularly arrived – and just as regularly went. Gay O’Casey, copy editor, has drawn our attention to the many inconsistencies and errors that build up in the course of a long writing project: we are grateful for her eagle eyes and gentle sense of humour. Our partners, Agnes and Jennie, supported us in myriad ways – both intellectual and domestic – throughout the entire project, for which we are and will always remain deeply thankful.

All errors, defects and omissions are of course entirely and completely our own joint responsibility.

Colin Darch and Peter Underwood
Cape Town, 3 July 2009

List of acronyms and abbreviations

| | |
|---------|--|
| A2I | Access to Information |
| A2K | Access to Knowledge |
| AGSAEMP | Archivos Generales y Servicios de Apoyo a la Presidencia de la República del Estado Mayor Presidencial (Guatemala) |
| AIDS | Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome |
| AIPPA | Access to Information and Privacy Protection Act (Zimbabwe) |
| ANC | African National Congress (South Africa) |
| ATIN | Access to Information Network (The Philippines) |
| BBC | British Broadcasting Corporation |
| BC | Before Christ |
| BCE | Before the Common Era |
| BP | British Petroleum |
| CD | Compact Disc |
| CDDRL | Centre on Democracy, Development, and the Rule of Law (United States of America) |
| CDR | Call Detail Record |
| CE | Common Era |
| CEA | Centro de Estudos Africanos (Mozambique) |
| CEGES | Centre d'Études et de Documentation «Guerre et Sociétés Contemporaines» (Belgium) |
| CHRI | Commonwealth Human Rights Initiative |
| CIA | Central Intelligence Agency (United States of America) |
| CIE | Comité de Inversiones Extranjeras (Chile) |

| | |
|--------|--|
| CLO | Civil Liberties Organisation (Nigeria) |
| CPRC | Chronic Poverty Research Centre (United Kingdom) |
| CPTech | Consumer Project on Technology (United States of America) |
| CSVr | Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation (South Africa) |
| DVD | Digital Video (or Versatile) Disc |
| EEB | European Environmental Bureau |
| EFW | Economic Freedom of the World |
| EITI | Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative |
| EMP | Estado Mayor Presidencial (Mexico) |
| EU | European Union |
| FBI | Federal Bureau of Investigation (United States of America) |
| fMRI | functional Magnetic Resonance Imaging |
| FoI | Freedom of Information |
| FOIA | Freedom of Information Act |
| FW | Freedom in the World |
| FXI | Freedom of Expression Institute (South Africa) |
| GDF | Glasnost Defence Foundation (Russian Federation) |
| GDP | Gross Domestic Product |
| GMA | Global Media Arts |
| GNI | Gross National Income |
| HDI | Human Development Indicator |
| HIV | Human Immunodeficiency Virus |
| HRC | Human Rights Commission |
| IEF | Index of Economic Freedom |
| IFI | International Financial Institutions |
| IIFD | Institute for Information Freedom Development |
| IMF | International Monetary Fund |