CREATING
MENTORING & COACHING
PROGRAMS

In Action

Jack J. Phillips | Linda Kyle Stromei
Series Editor | Editor

ASTD Press

Table of Contents

Introduction to the
In Action Series

L ike most professionals, the people involved in human resource
development (HRD) are eager to see practical applications of
models, techniques, theories, strategies, and issues relevant to
their field. In recent years, practitioners have developed an intense
desire to learn about the firsthand experiences of organizations im-
plementing HRD programs. To fill this critical void, the Publishing
Review Committee of the American Society for Training & Develop-
ment established the *In Action* casebook series. Covering a variety of
topics in HRD, the series significantly adds to the current literature
in the field.

The *In Action* series objectives are:

- *To provide real-world examples of HRD program application and implementation.*
  Each case describes significant issues, events, actions, and activities.
  When possible, actual names of organizations and individuals are
  used. Where names are disguised, the events are factual.

- *To focus on challenging and difficult issues confronting the HRD field.*
  These cases explore areas where it is difficult to find information
  or where processes or techniques are not standardized or fully de-
  veloped. Emerging issues critical to success are also explored.

- *To recognize the work of professionals in the HRD field by presenting best
  practices.* Each casebook represents the most effective examples avail-
  able. Issue editors are experienced professionals, and topics are
  carefully selected to ensure that they represent important and time-
  ly issues. Cases are written by highly respected HRD practitioners,
  authors, researchers, and consultants. The authors focus on many
  high-profile organizations—names you will quickly recognize.

- *To serve as a self-teaching tool for people learning about the HRD field.*
  As a stand-alone reference, each volume is a practical learning tool
  that fully explores numerous topics and issues.

- *To present a medium for teaching groups about the practical aspects of HRD.*
  Each book is a useful supplement to general and specialized HRD
  textbooks and serves as a discussion guide to enhance learning in
  formal and informal settings.

These cases will challenge and motivate you. The new insights you gain will serve as an impetus for positive change in your organization. If you have a case that might serve the same purpose for other HRD professionals, please contact me. New casebooks are being developed. If you have suggestions on ways to improve the *In Action* series, your input is welcomed.

Jack J. Phillips, Ph.D.
Series Editor
Performance Resources Organization
Box 380637
Birmingham, AL 35238-0637

Preface

The gift of the mentor is one that continues to give. The true essence of mentoring is to capitalize on the power of one. *Each one teach one, each one reach one* is the mantra of many mentoring programs. The mentoring and coaching programs described in this book are based on that one-on-one mentor to protégé relationship that has its origins in Greek mythology.

Most organizations today have some type of mentoring program for their employees. Since the 1970s, mentoring has experienced a rebirth, both as a way of transferring knowledge and skills and as a retention tool for employees. As organizations search for ways to stem the knowledge drain expected once the baby boomers start to retire, mentoring programs appear to fit the need.

Through this casebook, we hope to provide information about mentoring and coaching programs in a variety of organizations and educational applications that can be used as models and guides for others to follow.

Need for This Book

The true definition of *mentoring* has been debated for many years, and many authors have provided numerous working definitions. This case book provides numerous examples of mentoring programs in diverse applications. One basic premise remains constant in all of the applications; the mentoring lifestyle is one in which people share their time and knowledge with those who are willing to perform the work to become successful. Mentoring involves two willing participants, the mentor and the protégé, and each benefits from the relationship.

Coaching has become an important organizational tool for developing people. As illustrated by the cases in this book, it is used to improve both personal and organizational skills.

The primary purpose of this book is to illustrate the various mentoring and coaching applications in a broad sampling of organizations around the world. The lessons learned from these applications

can be used to build a framework for a mentoring or coaching application in any organization.

Target Audience

Human resource managers and training and development specialists will find the information in this book helpful in planning new programs in their organizations or in strengthening and expanding their existing development programs. External and internal knowledge management consultants will be able to point to the techniques of some of the knowledge management pioneers to design programs to preserve the knowledge and skills for the next generation of workers. Team leaders and coaches will find successful coaching techniques and activities.

In human resource development classes at universities and colleges, these cases can be the basis of discussion of best practices.

The Cases

The most difficult part of developing this publication was in deciding which cases to use. Because mentoring is such a wide-reaching topic with both corporate and educational applications, we received cases from both areas. We tried to provide a variety of applications to appeal to all audiences. Coaching, though different from mentoring in its approach and application, is the same in spirit and success. We have included cases that illustrate coaching usage and success in both personal and corporate applications.

Case Authors

The case authors for this book represent a wide spectrum of knowledge and expertise in the field of mentoring, consulting, education, and coaching. Some are widely known in the field of mentoring, and you will immediately recognize those names. Some are newer contributors to the field, and are being mentored themselves. Some are well-known in other areas of HRD, yet their chapters make valuable contributions to this popular and fast-growing field.

Collectively these authors represent a stunning amount of talent, knowledge, and expertise, which they have willingly shared with us in their cases. All are experienced practitioners, as you will see once you read their cases.

It has been a great pleasure for me to work with all of these case authors, some old friends and colleagues and others new friends and colleagues. I am proud to work with them all.

Acknowledgments

How to Use This Casebook

The cases in this book present a variety of approaches to mentoring and coaching programs. Five of the cases describe formal mentoring programs in organizations, three discuss mentoring applications in the educational setting, three cases deal with coaching, and one case describes how to evaluate a formal mentoring program. Each case describes different strategies and approaches to improving human performance and promoting lifelong learning. The cases present a wide range of settings, including national laboratories, universities, government agencies, petroleum companies, manufacturing, and private individuals. The cases represent practices of leading consultants, educators, coaches, practitioners, and researchers in the fields of mentoring and coaching. Table 1 provides an overview of the cases in this book with descriptions of the cases in the order in which they appear. It should be useful as a quick reference source for readers.

These cases were prepared by practitioners in the field and are a rich source of information in the field of mentoring and coaching. Each case does not specifically represent the ideal approach to each situation. Part of the lifelong learning process is continuous reflection and improvement. Each case presents teaching questions designed to stimulate discussion and encourage the reader to analyze the cases, understand the issues, and suggest improvements. The final case addresses the issue of continuous quality improvement with evaluation as a key component. Many of these cases represent programs that have undergone quality improvements since their first implementation.

Using the Cases

There are several ways to use this book. The book will be helpful to anyone interested in mentoring and coaching. This applies to HRD consultants, practitioners, organizational managers, educators, and researchers. As they read the cases, they can analyze the processes in each application and choose which pieces would be helpful in their own work.

Table 1. Overview of the case studies.

Lead Author	Title	Industry or Company	Main Focus	Target Audience
Engstrøm, T.	Knowledge Mentoring in Practice	Scandinavian Offshore Tools	Formal mentoring program, knowledge management	HRD and other professionals in business, industry, and government
Frey, B.A.	Mentoring as an Instructional Intervention	United States Department of Defense	Formal mentoring program, intellectual capital	HRD and other professionals in government, business, and industry
Strosinski, J.L.	Coaching the Art of Life	Constructive Choices	Personal coaching	HRD and other professionals in business and industry
Boverie, P.E.	Who Mentors the Boss?	University of New Mexico	Executive coaching	HRD and other professionals in business, industry, and education
Mulligan, D.R.	Coaching Through the Use of Leadership Competencies	Sandia National Laboratories	Executive development using coaching and mentoring	HRD and other professionals in government, business, and industry
Weinstein, M.B.	Mentoring Adult Students	DePaul University	Mentoring in education	HRD and other professionals in education
Boyle Single, P.	When Email and Mentoring Unite: The Implementation of a Nationwide Electronic Mentoring Program	MentorNet	Mentoring in education, electronic mentoring	HRD and other professionals in education, business, and industry

Author	Title	Organization	Focus	Audience
Aragon, S.R.	Creating Success for Minority Students Through Mentoring	University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign	Mentoring in education and connecting with business	HRD and other professionals in education, business, and industry
Ratcliff, W.	Building a Sustainable Mentoring Process	MMHA The Managers' Mentors, Inc.	Facilitated mentoring process, formal mentoring program	HRD and other professionals in business and industry
Harbison, A.M.	Turning Mentoring Upside-Down: Innovative Retention and Advancement Strategies	Procter & Gamble U.S. Advertising	Mentoring program for retention and advancement	HRD and other professionals in business, industry, and government
Fromm-Lewis, M.	Using Mentoring to Enhance Technical Knowledge Transfer	Sandia National Laboratories	Formal mentoring program, knowledge management	HRD and other professionals in government, business, and industry
Stromei, L.K.	Measuring Mentoring Programs	LINCO, LLC	Evaluation of mentoring programs	All HRD practitioners and educators

This book will be useful in training sessions, with the cases serving as a basis for discussion. HRD professionals will find these cases useful for comparison of current practices in mentoring programs and the different perspectives presented. Because the cases are based on real life situations, the outcomes can provide valuable data for program planning.

This book can also be used as a supplement to other training and development textbooks. Each individual case contains discussion questions to optimize its use in a seminar format.

Follow-up

Each case author has suggested questions that can be used to initiate discussion; however, feel free to suggest questions of your own. Each case is unique. What has worked well for one organization may not work well for another. It is not the intention of this book that the readers simply duplicate the approaches presented here. However, the book does provide a rich variety of strategies and suggestions from which to adapt one's own approach.

To provide a variety of cases, the cases may be shorter than both the authors and the editors might prefer. If additional information on a case is needed, the lead author may be contacted directly via the email or street address at the end of each case.

Creating Mentoring and Coaching Programs

Linda Kyle Stromei

Those who seek mentoring will rule the great expanse under heaven.
Those who boast that they are greater than others will fall short.
Those who are willing to learn from others become greater.
Those who are ego-involved will be humbled and made small.

<div align="right">Shu Ching</div>

Introduction

Over the past decade, the term *mentor* and its accompanying definitions have found their way into the training rooms and boardrooms of America. Does this mean we have changed the way we are training our employees, or have we just revived an old term? Mentoring has actually been around for a long time, from the apprenticeships of the early trade guilds to the formal programs offered for beginning teachers in the early 1970s. Most successful people acknowledge having a mentor at some point in their lives.

The term *mentor* has its roots in ancient Greek mythology. The story of Mentor comes from Homer's (1962) *Odyssey*. Odysseus, king of Ithaca, prior to going to fight in the Trojan War, appoints a guardian for his young son, Telemachus. The guardian, Mentor, was actually the goddess Athena, daughter of Zeus, who disguised herself as a man for this job. The relationship was based on the idea that Telemachus would emulate Mentor to learn the skills he would need. Because Mentor served as trusted advisor, teacher, friend, and nurturer, the term came to be associated with those qualities. The relationship between the wise Mentor and the young Telemachus is repeated in the mentor-protégé relationships today.

Seeking a Definition

What exactly is mentoring? It depends on whom you ask. Mentoring appears to mean one thing to developmental psychologists, another thing to business people, and a third thing to those in academic settings. Part of the discrepancy in the literature on the reported successes and failures of mentoring stems from the different definitions that writers use. Some have claimed that the phenomenon of mentoring is not clearly conceptualized, leading to confusion as to just what is being measured or offered as an ingredient in success. It has been called a process in which an experienced veteran helps to shape or guide a newcomer. Some describe a mentor as someone who helped or gave assistance in one's career. Others have described a mentor as someone who helps another person become what he or she wants to be. Often the concept of mentoring is described metaphorically as an angel who will take you by the hand, catch you when you fall, and eventually give you wings to fly alone.

While it is true that a mentor is a wise and trusted advisor, Hadden (1997) uses an umbrella analogy to describe the all-encompassing nature of a mentor:

> Imagine a large umbrella with the word "mentor" emblazoned on the fabric stretched over the ribs. Each rib represents one of the mentor's roles: advisor, sponsor, tutor, advocate, coach, protector, role model, and guide. (p. 17)

Contemporary definitions of mentoring vary, although most capture elements of nurturing and guiding characteristics. Mentors are sometimes referred to as guides to lead us along the journey of life. They can cast light on our path, warn us of dangers in the road, and advise us of pleasures along the way. Others take a more career-oriented view of mentors by explaining that mentoring involves an intense caring relationship in which persons with more experience work with less experienced persons to promote both professional and personal development. Figure 1 lists definitions of *mentor* and related terms that will appear in this chapter and throughout this book.

The role of mentoring has been examined and explained over the years in literature from the fields of medical education, educational development, and business. Much of what has been written has focused on a definition of what mentoring is and the factors or elements of established mentoring programs. Yet there has been little work done on the theoretical basis of mentoring. It is clear that mentoring tends to work in the development of new, as well as experienced,

Figure 1. Coaching and mentoring terminology.

Career-related benefits and functions: Those aspects of the relationship that primarily enhance career advancement.

Formal mentoring: A specifically designed process or program created to set up the deliberate pairings of individuals of differing skill levels to guide the development of those individuals in the enhancement of skills, to provide assistance in the structure of the training, and to evaluate the results for the benefits of the participants and the organization.

Informal mentoring: The natural pairing of individuals who come together, not in an official program, for the purpose of enhancing their career and psychosocial development.

Mentor: A person at a higher level of responsibility in the organization, who agrees to act as a wise or trusted counselor, leader, and role model to a person who seeks to grow and develop professionally.

Mentoring: A complex, interactive process in which two individuals of differing levels of experience and expertise are paired for the agreed-upon goal of having the lesser skilled person grow and develop specific competencies. The process incorporates interpersonal or psychosocial development, career or educational development, or both, and socialization functions into the relationship. This one-to-one relationship is developmental and proceeds through stages that help determine the outcomes of the process.

Pairing: The placing together of the mentor and protégé in a mentoring relationship.

Protégé: From the French verb, *proteger,* "to protect," it has come to mean the recipient of the mentor interest, the one whose protection and development is the primary goal of the mentor.

Psychosocial functions: Those aspects of the relationship that primarily enhance sense of competence, clarity of identity, and effectiveness in the managerial role.

---

personnel. The difficulty is finding literature on the underlying theoretical rationale for the success stories (Willbur, 1987).

Finding a Theoretical Base

"Learning always occurs within a social context and the learner is also to some extent a social construct, so learning should be regarded as a social phenomenon as well as an individualistic one" (Jarvis, 1987, p. 15). Social learning theory posits that people learn from observing other people, and what they observe must then be imitated and reinforced (Merriam, 1983). Jarvis appears to agree: ". . . it is the way in which the person experiences the social situation that affects the learning process" (p. 63). Social learning theory can be used as the groundwork for developing mentoring relationships. Lan and Repman (1995) found that "social cognitive theorists have proposed the variable of modeling . . . and that people can acquire knowledge, skills, strategies, beliefs and attitudes by observing and imitating models" (p. 55).

Bandura (1976) brought social learning theory from a behaviorist orientation and focused more on the cognitive processes involved in the observation than on the behavior. He observed that one could learn

from observation without having to imitate. "Virtually all learning phenomena resulting from direct experiences can occur on a vicarious basis through observation of other people's behavior and its consequences for the observer" (Bandura, 1976, p. 392). Because people can learn what to do through first observing the behavior of others, they save time and costly mistakes from trial and error. Bandura's triadic reciprocality describes the relationship of behavior, person, and the environment as a three-way reciprocal learning process in which all interlock.

According to Bandura (1986), people can acquire cognitive representations of behavior by observing models. *Observational learning* means that observers can acquire cognitive skills and new patterns of behavior by observing the behavior of others. The learning may take varied forms, including new behavior patterns, judgmental standards, cognitive competencies, and generative rules for creating behaviors. "Observational learning is shown most clearly when models exhibit novel patterns of thought or behavior which observers did not already possess but which, following observation, they can produce in similar form" (p. 49). Modeling influences teach component skills and provide rules for organizing them into new structures of behavior. An observer is more likely to reproduce behavior for which a model has received rewards than behavior that has been punished or ignored, and he or she is more likely to exhibit modeled behavior if it results in valued outcomes. After the protégé has observed the mentor exhibit a behavior, he or she must practice that behavior for complete learning to occur.

Observational learning is influenced by attention, retention or memory, behavioral rehearsal, and motivation. The information that is observed is compared with one's own actions, and stored until needed for future use. Social learning theories highlight the importance of social context and explicate the processes of modeling and mentoring (Merriam, 1983). Therefore it is reasonable to conclude that role modeling is a central quality of mentoring. Mentors need to make themselves available to protégés as role models and to understand how their modeling can stimulate perspective, style, and a sense of empowerment within the protégé.

An increasing emphasis today is being given to situating learning in the workplace in a manner like that of the apprenticeship method of the trade guilds. The apprenticeship method involved modeling. In modeling, an expert executes a task so learners can observe and build a conceptual model of the processes required to accomplish

tasks successfully. The expert provides hints, feedback, clues, and tricks of the trade to assist the learners achieve the desired outcomes.

Developmental Influences

One of the most important studies, perhaps the most extensive, on the mentoring relationship and its importance in adult development was done by Levinson, Darrow, Klein, and McKee (1978). They described the mentoring relationship as often taking place in the work setting, but they defined *mentoring* "not in formal roles but in terms of the character of the relationship and the functions it serves" (p. 98).

Levinson and others (1978), based on interviews with 40 men, concluded that the mentor relationship is one of the most complex, and developmentally important, a man can have in early adulthood. The mentor may act as a teacher, enhancing skills and intellectual development; as a sponsor, facilitating the young man's entry and advancement; and as a host and guide, welcoming the young man into the occupational and social world and acquaint him with its values and customs. The mentor, through his own virtues and achievements, becomes an example for the protégé to admire and emulate, provides counsel in times of stress, and is a "transitional figure," in between the protégé's parents and peers.

In a 1977 study of 95 Harvard graduates, Vaillant found (as did Levinson) the importance of mentoring in adult development. He found that the presence of a mentor was extremely important to these men in their early adult careers, and that the most successful went on to become mentors themselves. This ability to give to the next generation is reminiscent of Erikson's middle-age period of adult development in which the psychosocial task for midlife is to resolve the issue of generativity versus stagnation. Generativity is a concern for an interest in guiding the next generation: children, products, ideas, and works of art. Mentoring is one manifestation of this midlife task. It is a powerful emotional interaction between an older and younger person, a relationship in which the older member is trusted and lovingly helps shape the growth and development of the protégé.

Gender Issues

While Levinson wrote of mentors in the male gender exclusively, he commented that one of the great problems for women is that female mentors are scarce, especially in the world of work. In her 1976 book, Passages, Sheehy laments the lack of mentors for women, finding from her research that most of the males who had mentors were

successful. Likewise, Kanter in her 1977 book, *Men and Women of the Corporation,* writes that sponsors are absolutely essential for women, citing the need for the signs of influence and access to real power afforded by a sponsor. Things have changed since the 1970s, and many organizations today use mentoring as a development tool for women and minorities. In my work, I find that most women have no particular preference for a mentor of the same gender. Rather, they choose a mentor on the basis of the position and the skills he or she has to offer.

As a matter of fact, Korn/Ferry International found in 1992 that just 15 percent of women had been mentored by another woman during their careers. Hermania Ibarra of the Harvard Business School sees the lack of available women mentors as a problem, stating that "the high potential women were getting very concrete, gender-related career advice from the senior women that they just didn't get from men" (Saltzman, 1996, p. 50). She feels that because of the special struggles women face in trying to balance work and family, they are more likely to seek a female mentor they can relate to both personally and professionally.

Cross- or mixed-gender relationships may experience less interpersonal comfort and face barriers relating to the risk of sexual involvement or unfound rumors of sexual relationships. Because of this risk some men are reluctant to mentor women and some women are afraid to approach men for fear that it would be misconstrued as a sexual advance by either the potential mentor or others in the organization. Therefore, females matched with a male mentor may attempt to minimize rumors by limiting social interactions, which in turn constrains the degree of interpersonal comfort and minimizes the psychosocial benefits. These factors can be minimized by a structured mentoring program with a qualified facilitator.

It is important for women to be involved in both informal and formal mentoring relationships. Informal mentoring happens through mutual discovery of common interests and relationship building. Formal mentoring is generally sponsored by an organization and focused on recruitment, retention, succession planning, and organizational change efforts.

Mentoring appears to be a relationship near the middle of a continuum that runs from professional relationships to intimate relationships. It is sometimes described as "professional intimacy," which involves a professional element with the added element of a close friendship. The mentoring relationships that tend to be the most successful are those in which the mentors and protégés have similar backgrounds, educa-

tion, knowledge, or interests. It is rare to find a successful mentoring relationship composed of individuals who have little in common.

As part of an evaluation of a large formal mentoring program in 1998, I conducted interviews with mentoring pairs. The interviews revealed those pairs that reported the greatest satisfaction and success shared common interests and values, and that it was important to them that their mentoring partner actually share their same values. The values they articulated were integrity, work ethic, family, and loyalty.

Functions of Mentoring

In a typical mentoring relationship today, each partner has a role. Mentors demonstrate, explain, model, share, and facilitate, while their protégés observe, question, and explore. In order to ensure a successful mentoring relationship, protégés must be proactive in seeking what they need. A mentor's role is to promote intentional learning, yet mentors should share more than just the right way to do something. Mentors should be willing to share their experiences, their successes, and their failures with their protégés. This type of communication is helpful in developing the rapport necessary for the professional intimacy that is present in successful mentoring relationships. The protégés benefit from the experience, wisdom, and counsel of their mentors. The mentors gain the satisfaction of knowing they have given something back to their profession and, possibly, have gotten recognition in their field. The teaching that mentors do allows them to better define their own ideas, another example of the dual benefit of mentoring.

What role do mentors play in the development of their protégé's life? Is their role solely related to the tasks and skills of the workplace? A good mentoring relationship should be an important part of a protégé's life. Mentorship serves two functions: career related and psychosocial. Career-related functions included providing sponsorship, exposure, visibility, coaching, protection, and challenging assignments, which directly relate to the protégé's career development. These functions assist the protégé in learning the ropes of organizational life and prepare him or her for advancement opportunities in the organization. Psychosocial functions include providing role modeling, acceptance, confirmation, counseling, and friendship, all activities that influence the protégé's self-image and competence. Other traditional training methods normally do not address the psychosocial aspect.

Willbur (1987), in his study of 300 male managers, found that for the careers of men, mentors also provided assistance in two ways:

They provided career counseling, and they encouraged or support-
ed their protégés. He reported that "protégés could rely on their men-
tors for support during times of stress and uncertainty" (p. 40).

Orpen (1995), in his survey of 97 employees in a British firm,
found that the personal mentoring received by each of the surveyed
employees was associated with greater career success. Other re-
searchers who surveyed protégés in business settings similarly reported
success in both career advancement and psychosocial benefits for pro-
tégés (Dansky, 1996; Dreher and Ash, 1990; Stromei, 1998; Zey, 1984).

Much has been written about the stages or phases of mentoring
relationships. In 1983, Kram explained that the career functions emerge
first as the mentor provides challenging assignments, exposure, pro-
tection, and sponsorship, and then, as the interpersonal bond
strengthens with time, the psychosocial functions emerge. Often the
only psychosocial functions experienced are modeling and acceptance,
and confirmation. If the relationship gains greater intimacy, coun-
seling and friendship will emerge. While the career functions depend
on the mentor's organizational rank, tenure, and experience, the psy-
chosocial functions are dependent on the degree of trust, mutuali-
ty, and intimacy that characterize the relationship. My research shows
that this is sometimes dependent on the gender of the mentor. In
my studies both mixed and same gender pairs report receiving psy-
chosocial benefits, but the psychosocial scores of the same gender
pairs are slightly higher. While having a mentor of the same gender
is ideal, having a mentor of the opposite gender is better than hav-
ing no mentor at all.

Mentoring relationships appear to provide these dual functions
in educational settings as well as organizational settings. A 1988 study
of teachers found that the mentors provided both career and psychosocial
functions, although the psychosocial benefits were significantly
greater for this group than were the career-related benefits. Older
protégés reported receiving significantly more career functions, yet
spent less time with their mentors than did younger protégés.
Women reported receiving significantly more psychosocial benefits
from their mentors than did men.

Mentoring relationships are seen as essential for developing job-
related skills in managers. Many of the skills that managers need, such
as organizing, planning, decision making, leadership, communication,
and listening, are not necessarily best taught in a classroom atmos-
phere. For this reason, mentoring is an excellent method to trans-
fer these skills. Think of protégés as student pilots. No amount of