

Pergamon Frontiers of Anthropology

THE SORCERER'S APPRENTICE

An Anthropology of Public Policy

CYRIL S. BELSHAW

Professor of Anthropology, University of British Columbia, Canada



Pergamon International Library of Science, Technology, Engineering and Social Studies

PERGAMON INTERNATIONAL LIBRARY
of Science, Technology, Engineering and Social Studies

*The 1000-volume original paperback library in aid of education,
industrial training and the enjoyment of leisure*

Publisher: Robert Maxwell, M.C.

The Sorcerer's Apprentice

An Anthropology of Public Policy



—**Publisher's Notice to Educators**—

**THE PERGAMON TEXTBOOK
INSPECTION COPY SERVICE**

An inspection copy of any book published in the Pergamon International Library will gladly be sent without obligation for consideration for course adoption or recommendation. Copies may be retained for a period of 60 days from receipt and returned if not suitable. When a particular title is adopted or recommended for adoption for class use and the recommendation results in a sale of 12 or more copies, the inspection copy may be retained with our compliments. If after examination the lecturer decides that the book is not suitable for adoption but would like to retain it for his personal library, then our Educators' Discount of 10% is allowed on the invoiced price. The Publishers will be pleased to receive suggestions for revised editions and new titles to be published in this important International Library.

PERGAMON FRONTIERS OF THE ANTHROPOLOGY SERIES

Editor: CYRIL S. BELSHAW, *University of British Columbia, Canada*

Other Titles in the Series

BURRIDGE, K. O. L. *Encountering Aborigines*

McFEAT, T. *Small-Group Cultures*

Other Books of Interest

BARANSON, J. *Technology for Underdeveloped Areas*

EISENSTADT, S. N. *Readings in Social Evolution and Development*

HALPERN, F. *Survival: Black/White*

HARRIS, C. C. *Readings in Kinship in Urban Society*

JANSEN, C. J. *Readings in the Sociology of Migration*

KRUPINSKI, J. and STOLLER, A. *The Family in Australia*

MERHAV, M. *Technological Dependence, Monopoly and Growth*

RICHMOND, A. H. *Readings in Race and Ethnic Relations*

RIVKIN, S. *Technology Unbound*

STACEY, M. *Methods of Social Research*

SUTHERLAND, E. *Elements of Human and Social Geography—Some Anthropological Perspectives*

TEELING-SMITH, G. *Science, Industry and the State*

The terms of our inspection copy service apply to all the above books. Full details of all books listed and specimen copies of journals listed will gladly be sent upon request.

The Sorcerer's Apprentice

An Anthropology of Public Policy

CYRIL S. BELSHAW



PERGAMON PRESS INC.

New York · Toronto · Oxford
Sydney · Paris · Braunschweig

U.K.	Pergamon Press Ltd., Headington Hill Hall, Oxford OX3 0BW, England
U.S.A.	Pergamon Press Inc., Maxwell House, Fairview Park, Elmsford, New York 10523, U.S.A.
CANADA	Pergamon of Canada, Ltd., 207 Queen's Quay West, Toronto 1, Canada
AUSTRALIA	Pergamon Press (Aust.) Pty. Ltd., 19a Boundary Street, Rushcutters Bay, N.S.W. 2011, Australia
FRANCE	Pergamon Press SARL, 24 rue des Ecoles, 75240 Paris, Cedex 05, France
WEST GERMANY	Pergamon Press GmbH, D-3300 Braunschweig, Postfach 2923, Burgplatz 1, West Germany

Copyright © 1976 Cyril Belshaw

All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means: electronic, electrostatic, magnetic tape, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without permission in writing from the publishers

First edition 1976

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Belshaw, Cyril S

The sorcerer's apprentice.

(Pergamon frontiers of anthropology; 4)

1. Applied anthropology. 2. Social policy.

I. Title.

GN320.B46 1975 309.1 74-22325

ISBN 0-08-018313-1

ISBN 0-08-018312-3 pbk.

To Betty

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

The Author	ix
Acknowledgments	xi
Perspectives	xiii

Part I Policy and Anthropology

1 The Challenge of Policy	3
2 Anthropology as Social Science	15

Part II A Structure of World Society

Prologue to Part II	35
3 Analysis of the Village Universe	37
4 Policy in the Village Universe	49
5 The Village Extended	65
6 The Urban Contribution	83
7 Elements of the Nation-state	96
8 International Connections	108
9 Supra-nation	126

Part III Movement in the Social System

Prologue to Part III	153
10 Innovation and the Genesis of Ideas	155
11 Resources and Their Management	170
12 Of Change, Conflict, and Resistance	183

Part IV
Styles of Action

Prologue to Part IV	201
13 The Process of Technical Assistance	205
14 Working Close to the Community	224
15 Of Politics and Conflict	239
16 Politician as Sorcerer; Social Scientist as Apprentice	255
17 On the Mastery of Judgment	275
18 The Social Sciences Organized	288

Part V
Values and Options

19 Values, Choice, and the Problem of Science	309
Index	337

The Author

CYRIL S. BELSHAW (Ph.D., London School of Economics) is Editor, *Current Anthropology*, and Professor of Anthropology, University of British Columbia. Dr. Belshaw's field studies over the past several years have taken him to New Guinea, Fiji, Solomon Islands, New Hebrides, New Caledonia, and British Columbia. He was a member of the United Nations Economic and Social Council team to evaluate the effects of technical assistance to Thailand in 1965 and on various occasions has acted as a consultant for the Bureau of Social Affairs of the United Nations, and for UNESCO. He is on the Executive Committee of the International Social Science Council and the International Union of Anthropological and Ethnological Sciences and is Chairman of the Pacific Science Council's Committee for the Social Sciences and Humanities, and the IUAES Commission on Ethnocide. His previous books are in the fields of economic anthropology, applied anthropology, and university affairs. Dr. Belshaw is also the author of several social and cultural anthropology books.

The Sorcerer's Apprentice reflects his interest in examining the role of anthropology, and its relevance to world society.

This page intentionally left blank

Acknowledgments

THE preparation of this book was made possible by the award of a Canada Council Leave Fellowship, and a leave of absence from the University of British Columbia in 1972–3.

The theme has, however, been gestating ever since my entry into anthropology in the late 1940s, and perhaps even before. It has obviously been influenced by personal experience, as a colonial civil servant concerned with administration and development during World War II, as a student and young man influenced by my father's economics and by his international career with the Institute of Pacific Relations and with FAO, as a scholar drawn into some of the activities of the United Nations family, as a fieldworker talking with people caught up in the impact of world events upon village life, and as an administrator of a university department, discussing the profession of anthropology with colleagues in North America, Europe, Asia, and Latin America. Friends in all these contexts have influenced my thought and reading and, even more, have opened opportunities to see events at first hand and to obtain a variety of experiences that would otherwise have been denied me. It is to these friends, in many walks of life, from humblest villager concerned with his family's uncertain future to international civil servant on a dizzying pinnacle of world responsibility, that I owe my perspective. I know that those of them who will read the book will recognize their influence, and will understand that my statements do not intend to supplant their deeper knowledge, but are intended to lead to further conversation.

In all that has gone before, my family has played a special role. It is symbolic that my children have celebrated birthdays in five countries, in thatch huts and Swiss villas—a situation not uncommon for anthropologists. My wife has not only shared the long-term fieldwork, contributing her knowledge and understanding, but has helped live through the production of the earlier studies which, in various ways, have paved the way for this one. And for all of them, including this, her steadfast editorial sense has saved me many an embarrassment.

I wish to thank the following publishers for permission to make extensive quotations: Messrs. Weidenfeld and Nicolson for the passage from P. T. Bauer, *Dissent on Development*, quoted on pp. 184–5; the Society for Applied Anthropology for the passage written by Nancy Oestreich Lurie quoted on p. 229; Random House, Inc., for the passage from Charles A. Reich, *The Greening of America*, quoted on p. 312; the *Daily Californian* for the quotation from the letter by R. W. Rader on p. 318; and *The Times* of London for the passage from the article by Jeffrey Gray quoted on p. 319.

Les Mischabels, Montana, Valais, 1973
Vancouver, 1973–4

CYRIL S. BELSHAW

Perspectives

WHEN I made my decision to study anthropology, in the 1940s, my choice was affected by concerns that remain with me today. Even though anthropology was then a far less voluminous body of writing than it is now, with fewer well-developed subfields, it nevertheless seemed to offer perspectives which could add subtly to our understanding of man's condition. The comparison of social and cultural systems, and the analysis of function and conflict, were but two of the many important themes that carried lessons largely ignored by policy makers and by scholars in other disciplines. Anthropology needed not only to hone its tools but to offer the fruits of its labors to others.

Thirty years of work by innumerable scholars in many countries have increased data and knowledge. But we are still only partially applying ourselves to the real issues. Books on applied anthropology tend to deal with "exotic" culture. The time has come to make the link between our knowledge of other parts of the world and the issues that face industrialized society. Some anthropologists have indeed made the connection—Margaret Mead and Jules Henry, to name two. These beginnings must be strengthened. We should not be content with philosophizing comment drawn from subjective experience. Our research approaches social exchange, the function of myth, religious experience, and a host of other topics in special small-scale settings. We can follow through such topics with important results if we apply the same methods to studies of our own society, and we shall alter our view of our own world if we do so. Too few of us try.

The result is, in part, that the general public, and particularly the policy makers, regard anthropology as a curious discipline, containing many unreadable books, and a few which delight because of the quaint unreal worlds they seem to describe. This is to misrepresent the force and idea of anthropology. But it is the fault of the profession for not thinking out the wider implications of its work and for being unadventurous in speculating

beyond the customary bounds. This book attempts to make part of the link. In doing so, it will infuriate some, because it deliberately ranges widely. I stray beyond my proper discipline and will therefore make mistakes. But it is important to me to run that risk. Mistakes can always be corrected. But I am trying to create an overall perspective which will suggest disagreement, provoke research in fields new to anthropology's tradition, and awaken scholars and some interested members of the public to a few of the issues, the dangers, and the promises of an anthropology of public policy.

We are often regarded as people who study other humans who live in villages in other countries. There is truth in this stereotype. In this book, however, I am going to devote very little space to the village world as such. Marshall McLuhan's concept of "the global village" is ear-catching, and somewhat suspect as an intellectual gimmick. We certainly do not have to be committed to the superficialities of that approach to recognize the more complex and deeper reality. The population of the world lives within *one* social system.

It is a simple, banal idea. But like so many other simple truths, it is difficult to put to work. The world social system is so complex that it cannot be grasped at one time in its totality. We must think about it in different ways, and often bit by bit. I try in this book to use a few of the ideas developed by anthropologists in their treatment of the village world, and to extend and amend them into the more complex analysis of a world social system.

This differs from the traditional anthropological approach, which is to see a community in "ecological" perspective—that is, to treat it as a system in symbiotic interaction with an immediate environment. Such an approach is a necessary part of the scene, but I want to go further and at least to raise questions (but seldom provide answers) about the global system in which we all live. And in taking this step, building upon abstract notions of social transactions, cultural systems, and the like, I find that we are inhibited, in analysis and in applied practice, by the ambiguous but powerful notion of nationalism. Time and again I have found myself faced with the necessity of accounting for it, clarifying it, and drawing implications about its effects. As I moved from the village to the wider world, the anthropological significance of nationalism became inescapable.

One of my long-standing complaints about anthropology has been that although its business is to look at the empirical reality of what might be termed alternative cultures, it does not speculate about what might be. As good objective scientists we note what is. But society is creative. It

consists of men and women who are striving. David McClelland makes the untenable assumption that some people want to achieve and others don't. My perspective is that we *all* achieve. In an ultimate sense, society is itself policy making.

If we accept this simple premise, the way is open to us as anthropologists to ask some of the kinds of questions that are asked with less inhibition in other social sciences, more particularly economics and political science. We can ask, what do particular societies achieve? I have worked out the theoretical implications of this question, around the idea of comparative social performance, elsewhere. In this book, I want to bring the theory down to earth, but in minimizing jargon I hope I have not lost sight of some of the logical problems contained in the question.

And we can go on. What could societies achieve, if they did things somewhat differently? How much do we still need to find out in order to comment sensibly on alternatives? What are the logical traps in setting them out?

To invade such territory is to expose our intellectual troops to the possibility of glittering booty. Sensibly, many colleagues have been suspicious of such an enterprise. The power of influencing decisions can be heady, the rewards can look more real than they are, and we are tempted to convey our subjective values as objective or dogmatic truth. The advice of social science, and especially of anthropology, can be wrong-headed, falsely founded, and improperly motivated. It is of the greatest importance that anthropologists address themselves to world issues. It is also of the greatest importance that both the public and scholars themselves be reasonably aware of the possibilities and limitations of an anthropology of public policy. There have been too many false claims to success and wisdom. They have been counterproductive, inhibiting the evolution of innovative creativity. The theme runs through the whole of this book and is treated at length when I talk of the modes of action and advising. When I write for scholars, I hope some members of the public will be alerted. When I write in more general terms, I hope that specialist scholars will relate their interests and experience to the public need.

And, above all, I desperately hope that students, looking to their future, whether or not they are to be professional anthropologists, will take up some of the challenges that I am deliberately laying down.

Purists will accuse me of mixing my reading public. I make no excuses. The issues I raise are at what our scientific colleagues call the "interface" of the concerns and interests of scholars and the public. I believe that

scholars must see, outside the confines of ideological rhetoric, the public implications of what they do, and that the public must be in a position to watch them doing it, with understanding. This book is an attempt to move in that direction.

PART I

Policy and Anthropology