## BECKETT AT 100 REVOLVING IT ALL

EDITED BY LINDA BEN-ZVI AND ANCELA MOORJANI

## Beckett at 100

This page intentionally left blank

## Beckett at 100 Revolving It All

Edited by

Linda Ben-Zvi and Angela Moorjani





Oxford University Press, Inc., publishes works that further Oxford University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship, and education.

Oxford New York Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Copyright © 2008 by Oxford University Press, Inc.

Published by Oxford University Press, Inc. 198 Madison Avenue, New York, New York 10016

www.oup.com

Oxford is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior permission of Oxford University Press.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Beckett at 100 : revolving it all / edited by Linda Ben-Zvi and Angela Moorjani.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-19-532547-8; 978-0-19-532548-5 (pbk.)

1. Beckett, Samuel, 1906–1989—Criticism and interpretation. I. Ben-Zvi, Linda. II. Moorjani, Angela PR6003.E282Z5716 2007

848'.91409—dc22 2007011366

987654321

Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper

## For Ruby Cohn



This page intentionally left blank

### Contents

#### CONTRIBUTORS ix

INTRODUCTION, LINDA BEN-ZVI 3

#### IMAGES. FOR RUBY COHN

Still for Ruby, PETER GIDAL 15

Beckett the Tourist: Bamberg and Würzburg, JAMES KNOWLSON 21

#### PART I. THINKING THROUGH BECKETT

Apnea and True Illusion: Breath(less) in Beckett, HERBERT BLAU 35

From Contumacy to Shame: Reading Beckett's Testimonies with Agamben, DAVID HOUSTON JONES 54

Projections: Beckett's *Krapp's Last Tape* and *Not I* as Autobiographies, CARLA LOCATELLI 68

"I Am Not a Philosopher," H. PORTER ABBOTT 81

Recovering Beckett's Bergsonism, S. E. GONTARSKI 93

"No Body Is at Rest": The Legacy of Leibniz's *Force* in Beckett's Oeuvre, NAOYA MORI 107

#### PART II. SHIFTING PERSPECTIVES

"Just Looking": Ne(i)ther-World Icons, Elsheimer Nocturnes, and Other Simultaneities in Beckett's *Play*, ANGELA MOORJANI 123
Beckett's Romanticism, ENOCH BRATER 139 *Film* and *Film*: Beckett and Early Film Theory, MATTHIJS ENGELBERTS 152
Beckett's Theater: Embodying Alterity, ANNA MCMULLAN 166 Beckett's *Posture* in the French Literary Field, JÜRGEN SIESS 177
The Spear of Telephus in *Krapp's Last Tape*, IRIT DEGANI-RAZ 190
Re-Figuring the Stage Body through the Mechanical Re-Production of Memory, ANTONIA RODRÍGUEZ-GAGO 202

#### PART III. ECHOING BECKETT

- Words and Music, ... but the clouds..., and Yeats's "The Tower," MINAKO OKAMURO 217
- Beckett—Feldman—Johns, CATHERINE LAWS 230
- Ontological Fear and Anxiety in the Theater of Beckett, Betsuyaku, and Pinter, MARIKO HORI TANAKA 246
- The Midcentury *Godot*: Beckett and Saroyan, MARY BRYDEN 259
- Beckett, McLuhan, and Television: The Medium, the Message, and "the Mess," LINDA BEN-ZVI 271
- Beckett and Caryl Churchill along the Möbius Strip, ELIN DIAMOND 285
- Beckett and Paul Auster: Fathers and Sons and the Creativity of Misreading, JULIE CAMPBELL 299

Staging Sam: Beckett as Dramatic Character, HERSH ZEIFMAN 311

INDEX 319

### Contributors

**H. PORTER ABBOTT** is professor emeritus of English at the University of California, Santa Barbara. He has written numerous articles and two books on Beckett, most recently *Beckett Writing Beckett: The Author in the Autograph*. In 2002, he published *The Cambridge Introduction to Narrative* and is currently preparing a second edition.

**LINDA BEN-ZVI** is professor of theater studies, Tel Aviv University, where she edits *Assaph: Studies in Theatre.* She is currently serving a second term as president of the Samuel Beckett Society, and since 1996 she has headed the Beckett Working Group of the International Federation of Theatre Research. Her Beckett books include *Samuel Beckett, Women in Beckett*, and *Drawing on Beckett.* Her biography of the American playwright Susan Glaspell, *Susan Glaspell: Her Life and Times*, won the George Freedley Special Jury Prize of the Theatre Library Association of America in 2006.

**HERBERT BLAU** is currently Byron W. and Alice L. Lockwood Professor of the Humanities at the University of Washington. He has also had a parallel career in the theater, as cofounder and codirector of the Actors' Workshop of San Francisco, then codirector of the Repertory Theater of Lincoln Center in New York, and as artistic director of the experimental group KRAKEN. His most recent books are *The Dubious Spectacle: Extremities of Theater, 1976–2000; Nothing in Itself: Complexions of Fashion;* and *Sails of the Herring Fleet: Essays on Beckett.* He is currently working on *As If: An Autobiography.* 

**ENOCH BRATER** is the Kenneth T. Rowe Collegiate Professor of Dramatic Literature and professor of English and theater at the University of Michigan. His studies of Beckett and other modern and contemporary playwrights have been translated into Japanese, Spanish, French, Portuguese, Polish, and Italian and have been published in book form and journals and

periodicals, including the *Nation, American Theatre*, and the *New Republic*. His Beckett studies include *Beyond Minimalism: Beckett's Late Style in the Theater; The Drama in the Text: Beckett's Late Fiction; Why Beckett; The Essential Samuel Beckett; The Theatrical Gamut: Notes for a Post-Beckettian Stage;* and *Beckett at 80/Beckett in Context*.

**MARY BRYDEN** is professor of French studies at the University of Reading, where she has served in the past as codirector of the Beckett International Foundation. Her previous post was as a professor of European literature at Cardiff University. A recent president of the Samuel Beckett Society, she has been a Visiting Fellow at Magdalen College Oxford and an Andrew W. Mellon Foundation Fellow at Harry Ransom Humanities Research Center, University of Texas at Austin. Her authored or edited books include *Women in Samuel Beckett's Prose and Drama: Her Own Other; Samuel Beckett and the Idea of God; Samuel Beckett and Music; Deleuze and Religion;* and *Gilles Deleuze: Travels in Literature*.

**JULIE CAMPBELL**, lecturer in literature and drama at the University of Southampton, UK, has written widely on Samuel Beckett's fiction and drama. Recent publications include "'There is no more ...': Cultural Memory in *Endgame*," and "The Entrapment of the Female Body in Beckett's Plays in Relation to Jung's Third Tavistock Lecture," in *Historicizing Beckett/Issues of Performance*, vol. 15 of *Samuel Beckett Today*/*Aujourd'hui*.

**IRIT DEGANI-RAZ** lectures in the Multidisciplinary Program of the Arts, Tel Aviv University. Her doctorate from the Cohen Center for the Philosophy and History of Science and Ideas, Tel Aviv University, was on the topic "Theatrical Possible Worlds" and examined logic and uncertainty in Beckett's works as a case study of a general theory of theater. Her recent major publications include "Beckett's Worlds as Thought Experiments," in *Drawing on Beckett*; "Possible Worlds and the Concept of 'Reference' in the Semiotics of Theatre," *Semiotica* 147.1/4; and "Theatrical Fictional Worlds, Counterfactuals, and Scientific Thought Experiments," *Semiotica* 157.1/4.

**ELIN DIAMOND** is professor of English at Rutgers University. She is the author of *Unmaking Mimesis: Essays on Feminism and Theater* and *Pinter's Comic Play* and editor of *Performance and Cultural Politics*. Her essays on drama, performance, and feminist theory have appeared in *Theatre Journal, ELH, Discourse, TDR, Modern Drama, Kenyon Review, Art and Cinema,* 

*Maska, Cahiers Renaud-Barrault,* and numerous anthologies in the United States, Europe, and India. She is currently at work on a book on modernism and performance and is coeditor of the forthcoming *Cambridge Companion to Caryl Churchill.* 

**MATTHIJS ENGELBERTS** is based at the University of Amsterdam, where he is a member of the Amsterdam School for Cultural Analysis. His current research is centered on the relations between different media in the arts. Among his publications are eight edited or coedited volumes of the annual bilingual review *Samuel Beckett Today/Aujourd'hui* (*SBT/A*); articles on Beckett, Tardieu, Duras, Molière, surrealist theater, and theater sports; and *Défis du récit scénique* on the relation between narrative and theater, mainly in Beckett. He has been a member of the editorial board of *SBT/A* since its inception.

**PETER GIDAL** is an experimental filmmaker and writer on aesthetics. His 16mm films include *Volcano*, *No Night No Day*, *Assumption*, *Flare Out*, *Guilt*, and the earlier *Room Film 1973*, *Up-Side Down Feature*, and *Clouds*. His books include *Materialist Film*; *Andy Warhol: Films and Paintings*; and *Understanding Beckett: Monologue and Gesture*. He lives and works in London.

**S. E. GONTARSKI** is Sarah Herndon Professor of English at Florida State University, where he is general editor of the *Journal of Beckett Studies*, Journal of Beckett Studies Books, and Journal of Beckett Studies E-books. He has edited *Samuel Beckett: The Complete Short Prose*, *1928–1989*; and *Endgame* and *The Shorter Plays*, volumes 2 and 4 of The Theatrical Notebooks of Samuel Beckett series. Recent books include *The Grove Companion to Samuel Beckett* and *The Faber Companion to Samuel Beckett*, both written with C. J. Ackerley, and *Beckett after Beckett*, coedited with Anthony Uhlmann. He is currently editing *The Blackwell Companion to Samuel Beckett*.

**DAVID HOUSTON JONES**, lecturer in French at the University of Exeter, UK, completed a Ph.D. on Samuel Beckett and Jean Genet at the University of Cambridge and subsequently taught at the University of Paris VIII (St. Denis), St. John's College, Oxford, and the University of Bristol. His publications include *The Body Abject: Self and Text in Jean Genet and Samuel Beckett; Jean Genet: "Journal du voleur";* and a critical edition of François Tanazacq, *La suprême abjection de la passion du Christ.* 

**JAMES KNOWLSON** is emeritus professor of French at the University of Reading, where he established the Beckett Archive, now the Beckett International Foundation, and founded the *Journal of Beckett Studies*. He wrote a biography of Beckett, *Damned to Fame: The Life of Samuel Beckett*, and is the author or editor of ten other books on Beckett. The general editor of The Theatrical Notebooks of Samuel Beckett, he edited *Krapp's Last Tape* and coedited *Waiting for Godot* for that four-volume series. Most recently, he published *Images of Beckett* (with John Haynes) and *Beckett Remembering Remembering Beckett* (with Elizabeth Knowlson).

**CATHERINE LAWS** is associate director of music at Dartington College of Arts, UK, and a pianist specializing in contemporary music. Much of her research focuses on the musical quality of Beckett's work, composers' responses to his texts, and related issues in the relationship between music, language, and meaning. She has published a range of articles on these topics and is currently completing a book on Beckett and music. Other research interests include the relationship between postmodern theory and contemporary musicology, contemporary music performance practice, and gender and music.

**CARLA LOCATELLI**, professor of theory and comparative literature and vicerector for international relations and research at the University of Trento, Italy, is also associated on a visiting basis with the English department at the University of Pennsylvania. She is the author or editor of fourteen books, including *Unwording the World: Beckett's Prose Works after the Nobel Prize.* She has published more than 150 articles and contributions to volumes, many of which relate to the Beckett canon.

**ANNA MCMULLAN** is chair in drama at Queens University Belfast, Northern Ireland. She is author of *Theatre on Trial: The Later Drama of Samuel Beckett* and numerous articles on Beckett in collections such as *Palgrave Advances in Samuel Beckett Studies, Samuel Beckett: A Casebook,* and *The Cambridge Companion to Samuel Beckett. Performing Embodiment in Samuel Beckett's Theatre and Media Plays* will be published by Routledge in 2007.

**ANGELA MOORJANI** is professor emerita of modern languages and linguistics (French) at the University of Maryland–UMBC. Her poststructural study, *Abysmal Games in the Novels of Samuel Beckett*, and, more recently, *The Aesthetics of Loss and Lessness* and *Beyond Fetishism* reflect on

the aesthetic and ethical effects of melancholy in literature and the arts. Coeditor of several collections of articles on Beckett, she serves on the editorial board of *Samuel Beckett Today/Aujourd'hui*. Her recent essays investigate gaze deixis, cultural ghosts, and multitiered effects in Beckett.

**NAOYA MORI** is professor of English at Kobe Women's University, Japan. He is a coeditor of *Beckett Taizen (Beckett A to Z)*, and a cotranslator of James Knowlson's *Damned to Fame* into Japanese. Among his recent essays focusing on Beckett and philosophy, specifically Leibniz's monadology, are "Beckett's Windows and 'the Windowless Self,'" in *Samuel Beckett Today/ Aujourd'hui* 14, and "Korogaru Ishi no Mita Yume" ("The Dream a Rolling Stone Dreamt"), in *Samuel Beckett no Vision to Undo (Samuel Beckett's Vision and Movement*).

**MINAKO OKAMURO**, professor of theater and film arts at Waseda University, Tokyo, coedited *Beckett Taizen (All about Beckett)*. She has published a number of articles in Japanese on Beckett and recently translated *Endgame* into Japanese. Her essays in English include "Alchemical Dances in Beckett and Yeats," *Samuel Beckett Today/Aujourd'hui* 14, and "The Cartesian Egg: Alchemical Images in Beckett's Early Writings," *Journal of Beckett Studies* 9.2. She was the general director of the 2006 International Samuel Beckett Symposium in Tokyo: "Borderless Beckett," held at Waseda University.

**ANTONIA RODRÍGUEZ-GAGO** is profesora titular of English literature at the University Autónoma of Madrid, Spain, where she teaches English Renaissance and Jacobean drama and contemporary Anglo-American theater. *Rockaby, Ohio Impromptu,* and *Catastrophe* were premiered in Spain in 1985 using her authorized translations. She is currently preparing the fifth edition of her annotated bilingual edition of *Happy Days.* Her recent Beckett essays include "Translating and Adapting *Company* for the Screen," in *Samuel Beckett Today/Aujourd'hui* 11; "Beckett's Performances in Spain," published in Italian translation in *Drammaturgia: Beckett in Scena*; and "Memory (and Forgetting) in Beckett's Late Women's Plays," in *Drawing on Beckett.* 

**JÜRGEN SIESS** retired recently as professor of comparative literature from the University of Caen, France. His principal fields of research are correspondence, theater, eighteenth-century fiction, and intercultural communication, with his work on Beckett focusing mainly on the theater and other media. Among his recent publications are the edited and coedited volumes: *Rilke, images de la ville, figures de l'artiste; Qu'est-ce que la tolérance? Perspectives sur Voltaire;* SEMEN 20—*Le rapport de places dans l'épistolaire; L'épistolaire au féminin*; and the essay "The Actor's Body and Institutional Tensions: From *Act without Words I* to *Not I*," in *Drawing on Beckett*.

**MARIKO HORI TANAKA**, professor at Aoyama Gakuin University, Japan, has published on British and American theater. Her articles on Beckett include "Special Features of Beckett Performances in Japan," in *Beckett On and On...;* "The Legacy of Beckett in Contemporary Japanese Theatre," in *Drawing on Beckett;* "Postmodern Stagings of *Waiting for Godot*" and "Elements of Haiku in Beckett," in *Samuel Beckett Today/Aujourd'hui* 6 and 11; and "'Hidden Voices' in Samuel Beckett's Late Work," in *The Harp*, the International Association for the Study of Irish Literature, Japan Bulletin. She has also coedited *Beckett Taizen* and cotranslated James Knowlson's *Damned to Fame* into Japanese.

**HERSH ZEIFMAN**, professor of English and drama at York University, Toronto, has published widely on contemporary British and American drama. Formerly a script reader for London's National Theatre, coeditor of the journal *Modern Drama*, and president of the Samuel Beckett Society, he is the coeditor of *Contemporary British Drama* and the editor of *David Hare: A Casebook*.



This page intentionally left blank

### Introduction

#### LINDA BEN-ZVI

SAMUEL JOHNSON, in making the claim for the greatness of Shakespeare, argued that "a test of literary merit" can be determined by whether a writer has "outlived his century" (qtd. in Quinault 304). If any proof were needed for the greatness of Samuel Beckett, the 2006 outpouring of events around the world marking the centenary of his birth—stage and media performances; conferences and lectures; new editions of his writings; gala concerts; and art, film, and photography exhibits—indicate that he too has "outlived his century."

"I am not sure what a centenarian Samuel Beckett would have made of these effusions in the country of his birth," his nephew and executor Edward Beckett wrote in the official catalogue for the Dublin festival, alluding to his uncle's well-known dislike of any celebrations in his name, "but I am proud to witness what his country is making of him" (2). Unlike James Joyce, whom his biographer Richard Ellmann claims, "thought about his centenary long before it occurred to his readers to do so" (par. 1), Beckett tried assiduously to avoid such occasions. In response to one planned in Paris to mark his seventy-fifth birthday, he confided to his friend and scenic designer Jocelyn Herbert: "I dread the year now upon us and all the fuss in store for me here, as if it were my centenary. I'll make myself scare while it lasts, where I don't know. Perhaps the great Wall of China, crouch behind it till the coast is clear" (qtd. in Knowlson 671). "Damned to fame," he jotted in his notebook at the time, the phrase his biographer James Knowlson chose as the title of his book. Yet, even China-a country still primarily wedded to Ibsen and O'Neill realism and which officially ignores its own

Beckett-influenced, Nobel Prize–winning writer Gao Xingjian<sup>1</sup>—would have provided little anonymity in 2006, given the considerable number of Beckett events held there.<sup>2</sup>

While the centenary frenzy might have troubled Beckett, it has served a purpose. It has brought new audiences and readers to his writing; it has also provided opportunities for scholars and theater practitioners to rethink traditional readings, theories, and stagings of his works; consider new contexts and approaches for future research and productions; and generally reassess Beckett's place in his own century and his legacy to the postmillennial world. The purpose of this collection—the first to be published after the centenary year—is to offer a wide range of essays reflecting these directions and illustrating what contemporary scholarship is "making of" Beckett and his writing 100 years after his birth and 19 years after his death.

The majority of the essays were first presented at Trinity College Dublin, Beckett's alma mater, in the Samuel Beckett Working Group symposium, which served as the academic component of the Dublin centenary celebration in April 2006. Thirty-eight participants from fourteen countries gave papers; of those, fourteen are published here, along with eight others, most by previous Working Group members.<sup>3</sup> We have divided them into three broad categories: Thinking through Beckett, Shifting Perspectives, and Echoing Beckett. Like most of Beckett's plays, in this book too images precede words. The book opens with experimental filmmaker and scholar Peter Gidal's selection of stills from his *Room Film 1973* whose "ill-seen" fragments resonate with Beckett's attacks on the authority of eye and "I." And James Knowlson offers never-before-published descriptions excerpted from Beckett's 1936–1937 Germany travel diary, with permission from the Beckett Estate.

These selections and the essays that follow are dedicated to Ruby Cohn, charter member of the Working Group and the most consistent and influential voice in Beckett scholarship from its inception. Ruby published her first Beckett essay in 1959, undeterred by an editor who informed her, "We like your criticism, but we don't feel your author merits publishing space" (*Canon* I); and for nearly 50 years she has been illustrating the "merits" of "her author." Her meticulous scholarship laid the foundations of Beckett studies; her lucid writing, elegant and always to the point, nourished it; and her great generosity of spirit provided the model

for the collegiality that has developed among Beckett scholars. All those who study Beckett are familiar with her work. Most in the field know her personally. Some have maintained friendships with her that go back decades—mine thirty years. Angela Moorjani tells of hoarding Ruby moments ever since Édouard Morot-Sir invited Beckett scholars to muse over his "art of rhetoric" two years before Beckett's seventieth birthday. For us Ruby is more than a respected critic; she is our intellectual conscience, our ideal reader. I remember my Colorado colleague Rubin Rabinovitz—a fine scholar whose early, tragic death impoverished our field—telling me that when he wrote on Beckett, he wrote for one person: Ruby Cohn. I knew exactly what he meant. To write "for Ruby" means to write clearly, without cant or pomposity, and, most important, to be faithful to Beckett's work, no matter from what critical direction you approach it.

*Revolving It All*, the subtitle of this book, relates to Cohn's work. The phrase is taken from *Footfalls*, where it is descriptive of the central image of that play, the "revolving walker," herself a semblance of those continuously revolving, mutable characters, places, and themes that pervade Beckett's writing and evade fixity. These tenacious traces of presence, desiccated though they may be, are still attached to the physical world of bodies, things, and places, whether unnamed, variously named, or misnamed. Cohn described this condition in the first lines of her first Beckett study, *Samuel Beckett: The Comic Gamut* (1962):

On Samuel Beckett's planet, matter is minimal, physiography and physiology barely support life. The air is exceedingly thin, and the light exceedingly dim. But all the cluttered complexity of our own planet is required to educate the taste that can savor the unique comic flavor of Beckett's creation. Our world, "so various, so beautiful, so new," so stingily admitted to Beckett's work, is nevertheless the essential background for appreciation of that work. (3)

Her own work on Beckett over the years has consistently focused on the here and now of the texts, and the theatereality—her coined word (*Just Play* 30–31)—of his stage world, a practice shaped by what she admits is "my habitual search for meaning" (*Canon* 383) and sustained by her abiding excitement about theater, "the most perishable of goods" (*Modern Shakespeare* 393). In criticism never cut to fit the particular fashion of the

time, she has elucidated the links between Beckett's writing and lived experience, between the challenging complexities of the plays, fiction, and poetry and the complexities of modern life that gave rise to them and continue to shape the powerful and personal reactions of readers, audiences, and critics over time. Cohn's title for her reading of the Beckett oeuvre, *A Beckett Canon*, reflects her awareness that every reading is *a* reading not *the* reading, hers "personal, after long immersion" (2).

On the first page of that book she declares, "I flaunt the label that has sometimes been scornfully affixed to me—humanist" (I). After a period in which some theoretical approaches have omitted lived experience from the parameters of their discussions, a growing number of centenary studies seem to have come back to Cohn and her basic starting point, paraphrased by Steven Connor in a lecture at the 2006 Tokyo symposium: "the unencompassibility of the here and now, that is possible of access only in the here and now" (5), this presentment of presence the locus of Beckett's writing, no matter how "parched, patched, [and] penurious" (7) it may be. "In such a world that's all I can manage, more than I could," Beckett told Alan Schneider (qtd. in Harmon 24); and "in such a world" palpable, present, but ultimately unknowable, unnamable, and unencompassible, Cohn's criticism, like Beckett's writing, is grounded. So too in different ways, are the essays that follow.

Despite a personal predilection toward explication, I forgo the extensive parsing that is part of traditional introductions to essay collections. The subtlety and complexity of the essays, their arguments, language, and style-what has always marked the best of Beckett criticism-are lost in paraphrase. What I do want to point out, however, are some emerging themes and approaches that run through a number of these centenary studies. I will begin by using a technique William Saroyan employed in his sleeve note review for the recording of the Broadway premiere of Waiting for Godot, unearthed and discussed by Mary Bryden in her essay: mentioning what is not included as a way of pointing to what is. In these essays there are no comprehensive readings of the Beckett canon or even one specific work, as might be expected given the centenary opportunity for account-taking. Nobel Prize-winning novelist J. M. Coetzee, whose doctoral dissertation was on Beckett's early fiction, chose as the title for his public lecture at the Tokyo conference "Eight Ways of Looking at Samuel Beckett," each way a discrete form and approach, the aggregate producing multivocality much like Beckett's with no attempt to impose thematic unity.

If there is no "clear autobahn through Beckett's works"—as poet Paul Muldoon admitted at the end of his lecture at the Dublin conference in which he attempted to explicate references in *Watt* in order to arrive at a unified reading of the novel—some routes earlier traveled are no longer being taken. For example, feminist readings have either run their course or are so self-evident that they need not be pursued. The same goes for studies of the body; to use Beckett's words, there is "not another crumb of carrion left" (*Ill Seen* 59), at least concerning descriptions of Beckett's decrepits. Readings exclusively based on specific poststructuralist thinkers have become rarer as their works become successfully incorporated into broader readings, as illustrated in a number of studies that follow.

Those are some of the subjects not included. The major trends emerging from the centenary and presented in this book can be divided roughly into five categories that generally traverse the book's tripartite division.

#### 1. Historicizing and Particularizing

One striking trend is the acceleration in the number of studies that have looked at Beckett's works through multifocal lenses correcting for the historical as well as the metaphysical or universal. In his personal, powerful essay Herbert Blau notes the "political immediacy" he found in the Beckett plays he directed in the 1960s—more political than those of Brecht—and argues their relevance to our contemporary world that has learned nothing from the past. Blau, David Houston Jones, Anna McMullan, and Mariko Hori Tanaka all point to concrete images related to Beckett's experiences in World War II and the Holocaust, which some earlier critics tended to universalize or overlook: the barbed wire that encircles the Krap apartment and the family's indifference to it in *Eleutheria*; the corpses and skeletons in the "charnel-house!" of Waiting for Godot; the stink of death hovering over *Endgame*; and those unnamed but ubiquitous torturers and tortures that run through the entire canon.<sup>4</sup> As Blau argues, while Beckett's people curse their birth, their words also point to Beckett's "undeluded awareness of those corporeal bodies out there, or once there, but incinerated, or buried too, some of them, not where death came with birth, but where, dead, yes dead, imagine, they've never yet been found, or in a mass grave, among the multitudinous dead" (48). An important intertext for connecting the ontological and the historical, Jones and Hori Tanaka suggest, is

*Remnants of Auschwitz*, Giorgio Agamben's exploration of the possibilities of testimony after the Holocaust, in which he argues that only the absent, silent dead, the corpses, or those living-dead—the *Muselmann* of the concentration camps—can testify, speaking "only on the basis of the impossibility of speaking" (164), an awareness that lies at the heart of Beckett's work<sup>5</sup> and is reflected, Jones indicates, in Beckett's linguistic displacements and the multiple naming that point to the impossibility of ever claiming the subject position. In a variation of the argument, Carla Locatelli suggests that a chain of images, rather than names, can be substituted for agency, as illustrated in *Krapp's Last Tape* and *Not I*, reflective of both the impossibility of autobiography and the desire for it by audiences and readers who assign agency to Beckett as unitary author of his work in order to assuage their own sense of lost subjectivity in the contemporary world.

#### 2. Contesting Isms

If Beckett's writings can be historicized and particularized as well as universalized, then the question arises: where is he—and who is he—when he is home? McMullan calls his writing exilic, marked by an alterity that denies fixed classification of any kind, such as the recent Irish trend toward Hibernianization of Beckett and his works, a process she claims exchanges one "we" for another, and which Beckett warned against in "The Capital of the Ruins." On the other hand, Jürgen Siess argues that in cultivating the stance, or *posture*, of outsider and decentered writer, Beckett was paradoxically looking for an entry into the Parisian literary field he found when he arrived there in the late 1930s.

Nationalism, like any other ism or defining belief system, was anathema to Beckett; therefore, as Porter Abbott suggests, he repeatedly denied that he was a philosopher, since "the philosopher's trade [...] is to make a system with noncontradictory parts" (85), whereas art, Beckett understood, was predicated on "letting go," renouncing control of any sort. That is not to deny the part that philosophy has played in Beckett's writing. Over the years, numerous studies have explored the subject. In this current collection, Stan Gontarski suggests the importance of the theories of Henri Bergson, whom Beckett discussed in his 1931 lectures on modern literature

at Trinity College; and Naoya Mori probes Gottfried Wilhelm Leibniz's theories of motion that he argues parallel those employed by Beckett.

#### 3. Coupling the Arts

The relation between Beckett's works and other art forms has gained critical attention in recent years, prompted by the biography of James Knowlson and studies such as Lois Oppenheim on art and Catherine Laws on music. Almost every centenary event included exhibits of paintings influencing or influenced by Beckett; concerts featuring the works of composers who set music to Beckett texts, including Morton Feldman, Philip Glass, Heinz Holliger, Earl Kim, György Kurtág, and Marcel Mihalovici; and tapes of Beckett's film, radio, and television productions. In this collection, Laws's essay typifies this interdisciplinary approach, detailing the ways in which the techniques of Beckett, Feldman, and Jasper Johns have points of complementarity, indicated by their similar nonreferential frames of reference. Beckett's fascination with music's simultaneities and his dazzling blend of artistic allusions-from ancient Egypt's underworld to Adam Elsheimer's boundless space-are the focus of Angela Moorjani's essay on the multitiered and destabilizing effects of Play. Two essays discuss Beckett's work related to film and television: Matthijs Engelberts's study suggesting the importance of film criticism, particularly the writing of Rudolph Arnheim, on Beckett's Film; and my essay reading selected Beckett television plays through the theories of media guru Marshall McLuhan, a new name in Beckett studies, whose own writing references Beckett.

#### 4. Selecting a Text for the Times

Critics in specific periods have tended to focus on certain Beckett writings that most directly illustrate contemporary concerns. In the 1960s and 1970s in drama it was *Waiting for Godot* or *Endgame;* in the 1980s *Happy Days* or *Not I;* in this decade, judging from these centenary essays and other recent research, it is *Krapp's Last Tape.*<sup>6</sup> Carla Locatelli, Enoch Brater, Irit Degani-Raz, and Antonia Rodríguez-Gago all discuss it. Brater elucidates Beckett's strain of romanticism, most powerfully and evocatively evidenced in Krapp's recorded memory of the girl in the punt. Degani-Raz argues that Beckett's use of the tape recorder can be understood as a modern reversal of the myth of Telephus—what wounds can heal—since rather than "healing human longing for a paradise that has been lost" by preserving memories, it actually distorts and corrupts, illustrating the destructive aspects of technology in the process (191). Rodríguez-Gago focuses on the performative construction of Krapp as both speaker and listener, interacting with the mechanical recorder, a theme Locatelli also explores, describing both the contrapuntal discrepancies between speaking and listening to oneself speak and the "arbitrary and fragmented nature of self-portraiture based on memory, especially when played ironically against willed intention" (73).

#### 5. Tracing Influences and Impacts

Beckett's influence on other playwrights and novelists, and theirs on him, has been a constant theme over the years. The centenary studies in this collection, however, rather than confining themselves to delineating specific, shared similarities, tend to show the complexities, challenges, and dangers of literary legacies as well as benefits. Julie Campbell's essay on Paul Auster's debt to Beckett highlights the burden and anxiety of influence Auster felt and his means of overcoming it.7 Mariko Hori Tanaka adds Japanese post–World War II playwright Minoru Betsuyaku to the list of followers, illustrating the ways in which his post-Hiroshima plays are inspired by Beckett's images of pain and torture, just as Pinter's plays are as well. Mary Bryden pairs Beckett with William Saroyan, pointing to their surprising thematic connections, despite stylistic and linguistic differences, while Elin Diamond, although not suggesting influence, suggests the ways in which Caryl Churchill's plays, like Beckett's, create strong emotional responses despite the spareness of the texts. Beckett's own debt to Yeats has often been discussed, but in her essay Minako Okamuro cites the ways in which the poet's interest in the occult influenced Beckett's ... but the clouds... and Words and Music, as did Yeats's romanticism, a topic also taken up by Brater in his essay.

The final essay of the collection, by Hersh Zeifman, stands alone. It illustrates how Samuel Beckett, as well as *Waiting for Godot*, has become a cultural icon, and how the creator and his creations are being absorbed into popular culture around the world. To illustrate the tendency, Zeifman offers examples of Beckett citings in a number of recent plays: Justin Fleming's *Burnt Piano* (1999), Sean Dixon's *Sam's Last Dance* (1997), and Michael Hastings's *Calico*  (2004). What Fleming's work points to, and Zeifman underlines, is that "the only Beckett that truly exists for us is the one we create by responding to his work" (318). What has most strongly emerged from Beckett's centenary year and is reflected in the essays in this book is how rich, powerful, and varied these responses continue to be as we move into Beckett's second century.

#### Notes

I. Gao Xingjian's 1983 play *The Bus Stop* has obvious parallels to *Waiting for Godot*, in its ironic, yet politically charged, tale of people waiting ten years for the right bus to arrive.

2. Beckett events in China included a workshop held at the Central Academy of Drama in Beijing led by Dublin director Sarah Jane Scaife; a festival of his short plays presented in Shanghai; and two versions of *Waiting for Godot*, one in Chinese opera style, the other the celebrated Dublin Gate Theatre production, directed by Walter Asmus, which had sold-out runs in both Shanghai and Beijing.

3. An additional group of essays from the Dublin Working Group will appear in *Samuel Beckett Today/Aujourd hui (SBT/A)* 18 (forthcoming 2007).

4. In addition to Beckett biographies, a number of works have explored the subject of Beckett and World War II and the Holocaust. See, for example, Blackman, Lamont, Moorjani, Perloff, and Uhlmann.

5. Russell Smith also reads Beckett through Agamben in his essay in *Samuel Beckett Today*/*Aujourd'hui (SBT/A)* 18 (forthcoming, 2007).

6. The 2005 Beckett Working Group also chose *Krapp's Last Tape* for its central text. The members, writing about the work, found that they had barely uncovered its possibilities.

7. Auster was not alone; Jonathan Kalb's article querying twelve American playwrights about the influence of Beckett clearly shows this anxiety. David Mamet, for example, refused to respond, remarking only, "He was a great kisser," while Tony Kushner, after calling Beckett "that matzo of a playwright," as opposed to himself, more the lasagna type, spoke seriously of the influence, "so powerful that it threatened paralysis for a playwright [...] because his voice is so overwhelmingly persuasive and influential." See also Auster's and Edward Albee's comments in *Beckett Remembering/Remembering Beckett* (Knowlson and Knowlson 229–34), which discuss the dangers that Beckett's bogey creates.

#### Works Cited

Agamben, Giorgio. *Remnants of Auschwitz: The Witness and the Archive.* Trans. Daniel Heller-Roazen. New York: Zone Books, 1999.

Beckett, Edward. "A Message from Edward Beckett." Beckett Centenary Festival: A Commemorative Programme. Dublin: Department of Arts, Sport, and Tourism, 2006. 2.

- Beckett, Samuel. The Collected Shorter Plays. New York: Grove, 1984.
  ———. Ill Seen Ill Said. New York: Grove, 1981.
- Blackman, Jackie. "Beckett Judaizing Beckett: 'a Jew from Greenland' in Paris." (Forthcoming in SBT/A 18, 2007).
- Coetzee, J. M. "Eight Ways of Looking at Samuel Beckett." Borderless Beckett Symposium, Tokyo, 30 Sept. 2006. (Forthcoming in *Borderless Beckett*, vol. 19 of SBT/A, 2008.)
- Cohn, Ruby. A Beckett Canon. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2001.

. Just Play. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1980.

. Modern Shakespeare's Offshoots. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1976.

. *Samuel Beckett: The Comic Gamut.* New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1962.

- Connor, Steven. "'On such and such a day... in such a world': Beckett's Radical Finitude." Borderless Beckett Symposium, Tokyo, 1 Oct. 2006. 7 July 2007. <a href="http://www.bbk.ac.uk/english/skc/finitude/finitude.pdf">http://www.bbk.ac.uk/english/skc/finitude/finitude.pdf</a>>. (Forthcoming in *Borderless Beckett*, vol. 19 of *SBT/A*, 2008.)
- Ellmann, Richard. "Joyce at 100." *New York Review of Books* 18 Nov. 1982. 7 July 2007 <a href="http://www.nybooks.com/articles/6404">http://www.nybooks.com/articles/6404</a>
- Gao, Xingjian. The Bus Stop. Trans. Kimberly Besio. Theatre and Society: An Anthology of Contemporary Chinese Drama. Ed. Haiping Yan. New York: Sharpe, 1998.
- Harmon, Maurice, ed. No Author Better Served: The Correspondence of Samuel Beckett and Alan Schneider. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998.
- Kalb, Jonathan. "You Must Go On after Beckett. I Can't Go On after Beckett. Go On." New York Times 26 Mar. 2006: Arts Sec., 4.
- Knowlson, James. Damned to Fame: The Life of Samuel Beckett. London: Bloomsbury, 1996.
- Knowlson, James, and Elizabeth Knowlson, eds. Beckett Remembering/Remembering Beckett. London: Bloomsbury, 2006.
- Lamont, Rosette. "Samuel Beckett's Wandering Jew." *Reflections of the Holocaust in Art and Literature*. Ed. Randolph L. Braham. Boulder, CO: Social Science Monographs, 1990. 35–53.
- Moorjani, Angela. "Diogenes Lampoons Alexandre Kojève: Cultural Ghosts in Beckett's Early French Plays." *Drawing on Beckett*. Ed. Linda Ben-Zvi. Tel Aviv: Assaph Books, 2003. 69–88.
- Muldoon, Paul. "Watt Ho: On Being Taken Aback by *Watt.*" Beckett Centenary Symposium. Trinity College Dublin. 7 Apr. 2006.
- Perloff, Marjorie. "'In Love with Hiding': Samuel Beckett's War." Iowa Review 35 (2005): 76-103.

Quinault, Roland. "The Cult of the Century, 1784–1914." Historical Research 71 (1998): 303–23.

Uhlmann, Anthony. *Beckett and Poststructuralism.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.

## Images

## FOR RUBY COHN

This page intentionally left blank

# Still for Ruby

### PETER GIDAL



from Room Film 1973









