

t&tclark

NOT SPARING THE CHILD

Human Sacrifice
in the Ancient World
and Beyond

Studies in Honor of Professor Paul G. Mosca

T&T CLARK BIBLICAL STUDIES



Edited by
V. DAPHNA ARBEL, PAUL C. BURNS,
J.R.C. COUSLAND, RICHARD MENKIS,
and DIETMAR NEUFELD

B L O O M S B U R Y

NOT SPARING THE CHILD

NOT SPARING THE CHILD

Human Sacrifice in the Ancient World and Beyond

Studies in Honor of Professor Paul G. Mosca

Edited by

**V. Daphna Arbel, Paul C. Burns, J. R. C. Cousland,
Richard Menkis, and Dietmar Neufeld**

**Bloomsbury T&T Clark
An imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc**

B L O O M S B U R Y
LONDON • OXFORD • NEW YORK • NEW DELHI • SYDNEY

Bloomsbury T&T Clark
An imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc

Imprint previously known as T&T Clark

50 Bedford Square	1385 Broadway
London	New York
WC1B 3DP	NY 10018
UK	USA

www.bloomsbury.com

**BLOOMSBURY, T&T CLARK and the Diana logo are trademarks
of Bloomsbury Publishing Plc**

First published 2015
Paperback edition first published 2016

© V. Daphna Arbel, Paul C. Burns, J. R. C. Cousland, Richard Menkis
and Dietmar Neufeld, 2015

V. Daphna Arbel, Paul C. Burns, J. R. C. Cousland, Richard Menkis and Dietmar Neufeld
have asserted their rights under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act, 1988, to be
identified as Editors of this work.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or
by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information
storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publishers.

No responsibility for loss caused to any individual or organization acting on or
refraining from action as a result of the material in this publication can be
accepted by Bloomsbury or the authors.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN: HB: 978-0-56765-485-4
PB: 978-0-56766-958-2
ePDF: 978-0-56735-263-7

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Not sparing the child : human sacrifice in the ancient world and beyond : studies in
honor of professor Paul G. Mosca / edited by V. Daphna Arbel, Paul C. Burns,
J.R.C. Cousland, Richard Menkis, and Dietmar Neufeld.
pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-567-65485-4 (hardback)

1. Human sacrifice. 2. Child sacrifice. I. Arbel, Vita Daphna, editor. II. Burns, Paul C.,
editor. III. Cousland, J. R. C., editor. IV. Menkis, Richard, editor. V. Neufeld,
Dietmar, editor. VI. Mosca, Paul G., honouree.

BL570.N68 2015
230'.420937—dc23

2014031532

Typeset by Forthcoming Publications (www.forthpub.com)
Printed and bound in Great Britain



*Paul G. Mosca
(and friend)*

CONTENTS

Abbreviations	ix
Contributors	xiii

INTRODUCTION	xv
--------------	----

Part I HISTORY, RITUAL, ARCHEOLOGY

CHILD SACRIFICE AS THE EXTREME CASE AND CALCULATION Mark S. Smith	3
---	---

HUMAN SACRIFICE IN PRE- AND EARLY DYNASTIC EGYPT: WHAT DO YOU WANT TO FIND? Thomas Hikade and Jane Roy	18
--	----

GOD'S INFANTICIDE IN THE NIGHT OF PASSOVER: EXODUS 12 IN THE LIGHT OF ANCIENT EGYPTIAN RITUALS Thomas Schneider	52
---	----

A LATE PUNIC NARRATIVE ABOUT DISRUPTED SACRIFICE? HR. MEDEINE N 2 Philip C. Schmitz	77
---	----

Part II TEXTUAL, CULTURAL AND SOCIAL ASPECTS

IS THE LANGUAGE OF CHILD SACRIFICE USED FIGURATIVELY IN EZEKIEL 16? Peggy L. Day	91
--	----

MOCKING BOYS, BALDNESS, AND BEARS: ELISHA'S DEADLY HONOUR (2 KINGS 2.23-24) Dietmar Neufeld	114
---	-----

DEATH AND THE MAIDEN: HUMAN SACRIFICE IN EURIPIDES' <i>ANDROMEDA</i> C. W. Marshall	131
---	-----

Part III
THEOLOGY AND RECEPTION

CHILD SACRIFICE: A POLYVALENT STORY IN EARLY EUCHARISTIC PIETY Paul C. Burns	141
--	-----

<i>DEUS NECANS</i> : JESUS IN THE INFANCY GOSPEL OF THOMAS J. R. C. Cousland	165
--	-----

LIVING SACRIFICE: RETHINKING ABRAHAMIC RELIGIOUS SACRIFICE USING FIELD NARRATIVES OF EID UL-ADHA Michel Desjardins and Aldea Mulhern	190
---	-----

JOHN MILTON'S POETICS FOR CHRIST VERSUS MOLOCH Lee Johnson	211
---	-----

Index of References	233
Index of Authors	241

ABBREVIATIONS

AB	Anchor Bible
ABDAIAK	Archäologische Veröffentlichungen / Deutsches Archäologisches Institut, Abteilung Kairo
AcA	Antike christliche Apokryphen
ANF	Ante-Nicene Fathers
AOAT	Alter Orient und Altes Testament
AOTC	Abingdon Old Testament Commentaries
ATD	Das Alte Testament Deutsch
<i>BASOR</i>	<i>Bulletin of the American Schools of Oriental Research</i>
BDB	Brown, F., S. R. Driver, and C. A. Briggs. <i>A Hebrew and English Lexicon of the Old Testament</i> . Oxford, 1907
BETL	Bibliotheca ephemeridum theologicarum lovaniensium
<i>BibInt</i>	<i>Biblical Interpretation</i>
BibOr	Biblica et orientalia
BJS	Brown Judaic Studies
<i>BN</i>	<i>Biblische Notizen</i>
BZAW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
BZNW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
<i>CAD</i>	<i>The Assyrian Dictionary of the Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago</i> . Chicago, 1956–
<i>CBQ</i>	<i>Catholic Biblical Quarterly</i>
CBQMS	Catholic Biblical Quarterly Monograph Series
CCSA	Corpus Christianorum. Series Apocryphorum
<i>CIS</i>	<i>Corpus inscriptionum semiticarum</i>
<i>CJ</i>	<i>Classical Journal</i>
<i>CLUC</i>	Halayqa, I. K. H. <i>Comparative Lexicon of Ugaritic and Canaanite</i> . Münster, 2008
CSEL	Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum
DID	Didascaliae
<i>DNWSI</i>	<i>Dictionary of the North-West Semitic Inscriptions</i> . J. Hoftijzer and K. Jongeling. 2 vols. Leiden, 1995
<i>DUL</i>	Del Olmo Lete, G., and J. Sanmartín. <i>A Dictionary of the Ugaritic Language in the Alphabetic Tradition</i> . Leiden, 2004
FAT	Forschungen zum Alten Testament
FC	Fathers of the Church. Washington, D.C., 1947–
FOTL	Forms of the Old Testament Literature

FRLANT	Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments
HALOT	Koehler, L., W. Baumgartner, and J. J. Stamm. <i>The Hebrew and Aramaic Lexicon of the Old Testament</i> . Translated and edited under the supervision of M. E. J. Richardson. 4 vols. Leiden, 1994–99
HB	Hebrew Bible
HDR	Harvard Dissertations in Religion
HSM	Harvard Semitic Monographs
HTKAT	Herders theologischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
IEJ	<i>Israel Exploration Journal</i>
JAOS	<i>Journal of the American Oriental Society</i>
JBL	<i>Journal of Biblical Literature</i>
JHS	<i>Journal of Hebrew Scriptures</i>
JQR	<i>Jewish Quarterly Review</i>
JSJSup	Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic, and Roman Periods: Supplement Series
JSOT	<i>Journal for the Study of the Old Testament</i>
JSOTSup	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament: Supplement Series
JSS	<i>Journal of Semitic Studies</i>
KAI	<i>Kanaanäische und aramäische Inschriften</i> . H. Donner and W. Röllig. 2d ed. Wiesbaden, 1966–69
KTU	<i>Die keilalphabetischen Texte aus Ugarit</i> . Edited by M. Dietrich, O. Loretz, and J. Sanmartín. AOAT 24/1. Neukirchen-Vluyn, 1976. 2d enlarged ed. of <i>KTU: The Cuneiform Alphabetic Texts from Ugarit, Ras Ibn Hani, and Other Places</i> . Edited by M. Dietrich, O. Loretz, and J. Sanmartín. Münster, 1995 (= CTU)
KUSATU	<i>Kleine Untersuchungen zur Sprache des Alten Testaments und seiner Umwelt</i>
LCL	Loeb Classical Library
LIMC	<i>Lexicon iconographicum mythologiae classicae</i> . Edited by H. C. Ackerman and J.-R. Gisler. 8 vols. Zurich, 1981–97
LSJ	Liddell, H. G., R. Scott, H. S. Jones, <i>A Greek–English Lexicon</i> . 9th ed. with revised supplement. Oxford, 1996
LXX	Septuagint
MDAIK	<i>Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts Kairo</i>
MT	Masoretic text
NIBC	New International Biblical Commentary
NIV	New International Version
NovT	<i>Novum Testamentum</i>
NRSV	New Revised Standard Version
NTTS	New Testament Tools and Studies
OBO	Orbis biblicus et orientalis
OCD	<i>Oxford Classical Dictionary</i> . Edited by S. Hornblower and A. Spawforth. 3d ed. Oxford, 1996
OLA	Orientalia lovaniensia analecta
OTL	Old Testament Library

<i>OTP</i>	<i>Old Testament Pseudepigrapha</i> . Edited by J. H. Charlesworth. 2 vols. New York, 1983
<i>PPG</i> ³	Friedrich, J., and W. Röllig. <i>Phönizisch-punische Grammatik</i> . 3d ed. Edited by M. G. Amadasi Guzzo and W. R. Mayer. <i>Analecta Orientalia</i> 55. Rome, 1999
RSV	Revised Standard Version
SBLDS	Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series
SBLRBS	Society of Biblical Literature Resources for Biblical Study
SBLSP	Society of Biblical Literature Seminar Papers
SBLSymS	Society of Biblical Literature Symposium Series
SBLWAW	Society of Biblical Literature Writings from the Ancient World
<i>SEL</i>	<i>Studi Epigrafici e Linguistici sul Vicino Oriente Antico</i>
SHR	Studies in the History of Religions (supplement to <i>Numen</i>)
STAC	Studien und Text zu Antike und Christentum
SubBib	Subsidia biblica
<i>TrGF</i>	<i>Tragicorum Graecorum Fragmenta</i>
<i>UF</i>	<i>Ugarit-Forschungen</i>
<i>VT</i>	<i>Vetus Testamentum</i>
WBC	Word Biblical Commentary
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
<i>ZAW</i>	<i>Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft</i>

CONTRIBUTORS

Paul C. Burns is Emeritus Associate Professor in the Department of Classical, Near Eastern and Religious Studies at the University of British Columbia.

J. R. C. Cousland is Associate Professor of Early Christianity and Greek Religion and Mythology in the Department of Classical, Near Eastern and Religious Studies at the University of British Columbia.

Peggy L. Day is a Professor of Hebrew Bible in the Department of Religion and Culture at the University of Winnipeg.

Michel Desjardins is Professor of Religion and Culture, and Associate Dean: Research and Curriculum, in Wilfrid Laurier University's Faculty of Arts.

Thomas Hikade was tenured Assistant Professor of Egyptian Archaeology and History at the University of British Columbia, Vancouver, until 2012, and is currently working in Australian politics.

Lee Johnson is Professor Emeritus of English, the University of British Columbia.

C. W. Marshall is Professor of Greek at the University of British Columbia in Vancouver, Canada.

Aldea Mulhern is a Ph.D. candidate in the Department for the Study of Religion at the University of Toronto.

Dietmar Neufeld is Associate Professor in the Department of Classical, Near Eastern and Religious Studies at the University of British Columbia, Canada.

Jane Roy taught Near Eastern and Egyptian archaeology and world prehistory at the University of British Columbia and Simon Fraser University between 2005 and 2011, and is currently working as a publisher in Australia.

Philip C. Schmitz is a Professor in the History and Philosophy Department at the Eastern Michigan University.

Thomas Schneider is Professor of Egyptology and Near Eastern Studies at the University of British Columbia, Vancouver.

Mark S. Smith is Skirball Professor of Bible and Ancient Near Eastern Studies, New York University.

INTRODUCTION

We find that the German word *Festschrift* is a very apt designation for this volume dedicated to Paul Mosca. As the word *Fest* suggests, it is at once festive and celebratory—festive in that it acknowledges his 66th year and happy retirement, celebratory in that it allows his colleagues, students, and other friends and admirers to commemorate his achievements as a scholar, educator, colleague, and friend.

Since Paul is among other things a noted authority on child-sacrifice in Phoenicia and Carthage, and his research in this area has been and continues to be extremely influential, it seemed only fitting for us to celebrate his achievements as scholar, colleague, and educator with a volume devoted to his research topic. *Not Sparing the Child: Notions of Human Sacrifice in Ancient Worlds and Beyond* addresses infant sacrifice in its ancient Mediterranean contexts, and also considers the various ramifications of this concept as it expanded across social, geographical, and temporal boundaries. Our book sets out to illumine aspects of infant sacrifice through nuanced examinations of ancient ritual and detailed exploration of the meanings that infant sacrifice held for antiquity. These analyses are followed by studies of the concept of infant sacrifice as it came to be refracted through various cultures up to the time of the modern world. We not only present fresh insights into the social and religious meanings of this practice in its varied biblical landscapes and contexts, but also demonstrate how human sacrifice vividly captured the imagination of later writers who used its diverse cultural and religious implications to construct their own views and ideologies. All told, therefore, *Not Sparing the Child* sets out to provide valuable insights into key cultural, theological, and ideological dimensions of infant sacrifice, as well as its related associations with scapegoating, self-sacrifice, and martyrdom through biblical, post-biblical, and modern times.

It is a long way from Brooklyn to Carthage, and Paul's educational journey between the two places did not follow a direct route. Two factors helped to set Paul on his path as a scholar and educator. One was the enthusiastic support of his parents for a broadly based humanistic education; the other was his attendance at the Jesuit-run Brooklyn Preparatory

School, which he describes as the best four years of education that he had in his life. Although the teachers there were close to being uniformly excellent—introducing the students to off-Broadway theater and French cinema, museums and concerts, poetry and madrigals, even to a very young Joan Baez—it was Fr. Jack Alexander, S.J., his Latin instructor, who ultimately proved to be most influential. He immediately recognized Paul's natural aptitude for languages and his distaste for 9 a.m. classes, and by a clever exchange soon had him working his way through the first six books of the *Aeneid* in their entirety, while the rest of the class did only four. Although Paul had been contemplating doing mathematics, the regularity of Latin grammar, especially when juxtaposed with its glaringly perverse irregularities, won him over and he chose to study Classics (Latin and Greek) at Fordham.

Once at Fordham, his academic career took a further turn when he was invited to register for a summer class in Hebrew. His father urged him to take advantage of the opportunity, and here again he came under the tutelage of a gifted linguist, Fr. George Glanzmann, S.J. It was Glanzmann who sparked Paul's passion for Semitic languages and Ancient Near Eastern Studies, a passion that eventually resulted in Paul's acceptance at Harvard to pursue Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations.

At Harvard, he was to profit a third time from the instruction of a brilliant linguist, in this case, Thomas Lambdin. It was not simply that Lambdin's grammars were of an exceptional quality and thoroughness, but that he also knew how to structure a language class logically and sequentially—a skill that Paul was not slow to make his own. Paul then went on to study Northwest Semitic Epigraphy with Frank Moore Cross, developing a life-long fascination with Carthage and the Punic language. As a Pfeiffer Travelling Fellow in Biblical Archaeology (1969–70), Paul had the opportunity to spend six months in Jerusalem, three months in Beirut, and finally three months in Tunis (near Carthage). This was later followed by a productive year in Rome as a Fulbright Scholar.

Paul's friend and contemporary (and contributor to this volume), Larry Stager, provides a vivid evocation of these times:

Back in the late 70s, Paul and I would head to the dig in Carthage, where Frank Moore Cross and later Philip King were Principal Investigators. I was Field Director, and Paul was Epigrapher. Whenever possible, Paul and I would try to 'sandwich' the excavations between stopovers in Rome for a few days. We would often go around Rome with our friend the Rev. Mitchell Dahood, an American Jesuit who taught Bible and Semitic Studies at the Pontifical Biblical Institute, was an authority on food, church architecture, the Boston Red Sox, and opera. He gave Paul and me tickets to the opera in Spoleto. There we had a memorable evening

attending a great performance of *La Traviata*. From Rome we flew to Tunis and then traveled on to its suburb Carthage, where we excavated in the infamous Tophet from 1975–79, a huge burial ground of cremated human and animal remains, traditionally interpreted as sacrificial offerings. This was the topic of Paul's classic thesis, entitled *Child Sacrifice in Canaanite and Israelite Religion*, written at Harvard under the direction of the renowned professor of Biblical and Near Eastern studies, Frank Cross.

In many ways, Cross was an ideal supervisor for Paul. Not only was he a brilliant and insightful scholar; he was also, in Paul's words, 'the kindest scholar I have ever met'. As one of William Albright's students, Cross had inherited much of Albright's breadth of expertise, but had also developed an overriding fascination for the intricacies of North East Semitic Epigraphy. This fascination he passed on to Paul. The result was Paul's 1975 dissertation, which substantiated Eissfeldt's insight that there was no god Moloch as such in the Hebrew Bible. Rather, the term *mlk* denoted human sacrifice by kings of their own children to their divine royal overlord(s). This practice was characteristic of the Phoenicians and came to be pervasive throughout the Phoenician settlements of the central Mediterranean, especially Carthage. As various contributions in this volume attest, Paul's dissertation has had enduring impact, and helped to frame and contextualize the ongoing debates associated with infant sacrifice.

Nor has the matter proved uncontroversial. Professor Stager relates that,

At various international Phoenician conferences Paul and I had been challenged more than once by a well-known Semitist from France, whose self-regard was inestimable, but whose estimation of American philologists, especially of Professor Cross and his students, was negligible. At one of the sessions at a Phoenician conference in Sicily, where this scholar was presiding and denigrating one presentation after another, Paul was about to give his paper. The Semitist began his introduction of Mosca with a long gratuitous diatribe against our mentor Frank Cross, who wasn't even present at the colloquium. Meanwhile Paul was altering his introductory remarks: as he went to the podium he opened his lecture by dedicating it to Frank Moore Cross and in an eloquent statement praised his scholarship, his openness to students' ideas, and his fairness in all of these matters. Many stood and applauded Paul's eloquent tribute, while the Semitist sat stone-faced.

Perhaps, however, the most eloquent tribute that Paul has made to his mentor is the extent to which he has himself embodied Cross's very same characteristics—the openness, the fairness and unparalleled kindness, and the deep respect and enduring passion for true scholarship.

For Paul, true scholarship has much to do with philology, and it comes as no surprise that for a number of years Paul had a citation of Julius Wellhausen posted on his door that read, 'Philology takes revenge on those who treat it with disdain'. This passage says a great deal about Paul both as a scholar and an educator. His scholarly interests were always marked by an enviable breadth and catholicity, with numerous articles appearing in journals as wide-ranging and diverse as *AASOR*, *JBL*, *CBQ*, *Biblica*, *Maarav*, *Ugarit-Forschungen*, and *Epigraphica Anatolica*—the majority display a pronounced philological component. The ones focusing on Phoenician-Punic inscriptions, for instance, are especially concerned to explicate anomalous features of the texts, and increase what is known about the language and the store of its remaining inscriptions.

The provenance of these inscriptions could be surprising. On one notable occasion he only had to walk across the courtyard between Religious Studies and Classics. A colleague from Paul's (and our) now joint department, Jim Russell, was in possession of an inscription with an unfamiliar script that he'd found in his surface explorations of southern Turkey, and he wanted help deciphering it. This inscription turned out to be Phoenician, and it resulted in a jointly written article. Other occasions, however, saw Paul having to travel a bit further afield, as when he visited Sardinia to investigate inscriptions from Nora and Tharros. Once one of the local Sardinian newspapers had found out what he was there for, he was instantly lionized in a major article—a fate not normally experienced by roving philologists. Nor, for that matter, are Semitic philologists usually called upon to write documents in Aramaic for mainstream television shows—but Paul was. In the heyday of the X-Files, one of its epigones needed a 'genuine' Aramaic document, which Paul gladly wrote for them (though rather puckishly he made it a message from Mulder to Scully!).

It goes without saying that Paul's scholarly service extended well beyond such bagatelles. He became Acting Head and then Head of UBC's Department of Religious Studies at a critical juncture in its history, and had contributed to the success of the department for decades. These responsibilities extended to graduate studies and curriculum, and he proved instrumental in Religious Studies' highly successful merger in 1995 with the Department of Classics. Along with Paul Burns and Lee Johnson (both contributors to this volume) he was also pivotal both in

the formation and the oversight of the innovative program at UBC entitled Religion, Literature, and the Arts. In addition to extensive committee work, including President's Committee on Lectures, he also served on the UBC Senate, as well as the Senate Admissions Committee. His contributions in all these capacities can hardly be overestimated. Whenever the political and administrative vicissitudes of a large university threatened to harm his colleagues or department, he could always be counted upon to act as an unshifting bulwark, especially for those who were treated unjustly or otherwise overlooked. Above all, he was a calm voice of reason and commonsense when these qualities seemed to be otherwise lacking.

Paul's commitment to philology was also manifest in his teaching career, particularly in his enduring commitment to the instruction of Hebrew. He was determined that his students get the firmest foundation possible, as painlessly as possible, and to this end he was constantly revising and polishing his teaching techniques. He was equally determined that advanced students get as much language as they possibly could, and over the course of his career he would regularly offer classes in advanced Hebrew and Aramaic over and above his regular teaching load. It is not surprising, then, that his efforts have borne considerable fruit, and not a few biblical scholars owe their own grounding in Semitic languages to him.

One of them, Timothy Lim, now a world authority on the Dead Sea Scrolls, relates that,

I was in several of Paul's classes as an undergraduate, and it was in one of his classes that I first learned about the Dead Sea Scrolls. Later, I also read portions of the Great Isaiah Scroll with him in an intermediate Hebrew course. Paul's teaching was marked by thoroughness and learning. As with his unpublished, but widely read, dissertation, his teaching reflected the urbane outlook of a man of letters. I congratulate Paul on reaching a significant milestone.

Not a few contributors to this volume could also attest to the impact his teaching has had on their own careers.

Nor was his teaching confined to philological matters; his courses on Job, Death and the Afterlife, and Archaeology and the Bible were hugely popular with students, not least because of the complexity of the issues that Paul addressed in them. Students would regularly comment in the same breath about how challenging the classes were and yet how very much they were enjoying them and profiting from Paul's insights. Testimony to his mastery of teaching came in various forms. Canada's weekly newsmagazine, *Maclean's*, in its 1996 annual guide to Canada's

universities singled him out as a ‘notable professor’ at UBC. This recognition was followed by a UBC Killam Teaching prize in 1998–99, where Professor Barry McBride, UBC’s Provost and Vice President Academic, declared him a ‘simply outstanding’ teacher. The *UBC Report* of May 1999 added that, ‘Paul Mosca is known to turn his students into disciples by the sheer force of example with his charismatic teaching’.

Yet Paul’s exceptional pedagogy wasn’t limited to his students—it also extended to his colleagues, especially his junior colleagues. Whether it involved attending their fledgling conference papers, reading drafts of their articles, or acting as a discerning sounding-board for their ideas, he was unstinting in his time and encouragement. Most of all, he was an exemplar of good scholarship. He had no patience for ‘bulk publications’ or the recycling of tired ideas. To be worth publishing, an article needed to make a significant contribution to the discipline and embody long-standing traditions associated with academic excellence. It is no surprise, therefore, that Paul was invited to serve as an Associate Editor for the *Catholic Biblical Quarterly* from 1990 to 1995.

Yet once all of Paul’s teaching and scholarship have been accounted for, a large part of his person remains unaccounted for, and this can only be described as his *megalopsychia*—his greatness and generosity of spirit. Like the penumbra of pipe smoke that typically surrounds him, his great-heartedness suffuses all that he does and all his interactions with people. As Markus Bockmuehl, a friend of many years, aptly puts it, using good Semitic idiom, ‘Paul has always struck me as a wonderfully genuine *mensch* with a heart of gold’. As his colleagues, students, friends and admirers over many years, we have had the privilege and great good fortune of being able to ‘travel much in these realms of gold’, and we present this volume to Paul with thanks for the rich legacy he has bequeathed to us all.

Daphna Arbel
Paul C. Burns
J. R. C. Cousland
Richard Menkis
Dietmar Neufeld

Part I

HISTORY, RITUAL, ARCHEOLOGY

CHILD SACRIFICE AS THE EXTREME CASE AND CALCULATION

Mark S. Smith

1. Introduction

In the second half of the twentieth century, no one achieved more than Paul G. Mosca in advancing the discussion of child sacrifice in the textual sources.¹ Following Otto Eissfeldt's 1935 interpretation of BH **molk* as a sacrificial term,² Mosca's 1975 dissertation added fresh Punic evidence to the discussion as well as further analysis and evaluation of the biblical and classical sources. At the same time, the archaeological evidence was being engaged in a new way, thanks to excavations in Punic Carthage. For example, the evidence from this site was been thought to confirm the widespread practice of child sacrifice,³ although

1. Paul G. Mosca, 'Child Sacrifice in Canaanite and Israelite Religion: A Study in *Molk* and מֹלֶךְ' (Ph.D. diss., Harvard University, 1975).

2. Otto Eissfeldt, *Molk als Opferbegriff im Punischen und Hebräischen und das Ende des Gottes Moloch* (Beiträge zur Religionsgeschichte des Altertums 3; Halle: Max Niemeyer, 1935). Eissfeldt's work also received broad acceptance within Spanish scholarship. His book appeared in Spanish as *El Molk concepto Sacrificio Punico y Hebreo y final del Dios Moloch* (ed. Carlos C. Wagner and Luis Ruiz Cabreo; Madrid: Centre de Estudios Fenicios y Punicos, 2002), together with articles on the subject by Enrico Acquario, Maria Giulia Amadasi, Antonia Ciasca, and Edward Lipiński. The Phoenician evidence for the *mlk*-sacrifice has been treated by Luis Alberto Ruiz Cabreo, 'El Sacrificio Molk entre los fenicio-punicis: Cuestiones demografías y ecológicas' (Tesis, Departamento de Historia Antigua, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2007); reference courtesy of the author.

3. See Lawrence E. Stager, 'The Rite of Child Sacrifice at Carthage', in J.G. Pedley (ed.), *New Light on Ancient Carthage* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1980), pp. 1-11; idem, 'Carthage: A View from the Tophet', in Hans Georg Niemeyer (ed.), *Phönizier im Westen* (Mainz am Rhein: Philipp von Zabern, 1982), pp. 155-66; and Lawrence E. Stager and Samuel Wolff, 'Child Sacrifice at Carthage: Religious Rite or Population Control? Archaeological Evidence Provides Basis for a New Analysis', *Biblical Archaeological Review* 10.1 (1984), pp. 30-51.

there was dissent.⁴ More recent archaeological discussions have gone back and forth over the issue, with one side reaffirming the picture of child sacrifice at Punic Carthage and another questioning it.⁵

Mosca's work remains a cornerstone of research on the textual sources. His overall perspective on child sacrifice in Israelite religion, that it was no less a practice as elsewhere in the eastern Mediterranean, has gained widespread acceptance; it may be said to represent the general view today in critical biblical scholarship.⁶ Mosca's textual work is a model of close reading, informed by a judicious use of comparative evidence and advanced by penetrating insights. Indeed, his scholarship, not to mention his warmth and humor, has inspired me. I am honored to offer a contribution to this volume in his recognition, by way of some reflections on child sacrifice as the extreme case in the historiography of 2 Kings and as an extreme calculation in the narratives of Genesis 22 and Judges 11. Before turning to these texts, two discoveries appearing in print since Mosca's early work deserve mention.

2. Evidence at the Western and Eastern Ends of the Mediterranean

Since Mosca's important 1975 study, information from either end of the Mediterranean thought to pertain to child sacrifice has been published. A relief carved on stones, discovered at Pozo Moro in Spain in 1971, was published in 1983.⁷ This relief includes the depiction of a figure, which has been described in these terms:

4. For example, H. Benichou-Safar, 'A propos des ossements humains du tophet de Carthage', *Rivista di Studi Fenici* 5 (1981), pp. 5-9.

5. This view has been questioned by J. H. Schwartz, F. Houghton, R. Macchiarelli, and L. Bondioli, 'Skeletal Remains from Punic Carthage Do Not Support Systematic Sacrifice of Infants', *PLoS ONE* 5.2, e9177. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0009177 (published February 17, 2010). See the robust refutation by P. Smith, G. Avishai, J. A. Greene, and L. E. Stager, 'Aging Cremated Infants: The Problem of Sacrifice at the Tophet of Carthage', *Antiquity* 85 (2011), pp. 859-75. Cf. the fairly meager response by J. H. Schwartz, E. D. Houghton, L. Bondioli, and L. Macchiarelli, 'Bones, Teeth, and Estimating Age of Perinates: Carthaginian Infant Sacrifice Revisited', *Antiquity* 86 (2012), pp. 738-45.

6. See Jon D. Levenson, *The Death and Resurrection of the Beloved Son: The Transformation of Child Sacrifice in Judaism and Christianity* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), esp. pp. 3-17.

7. Martin Almagro-Gorbea, 'Pozo Moro: El monumento orientalizante, su contexto socio-cultural y sus paralelos en la arquitectura funeraria ibérica', *Madriditer Mitteilungen* 24 (1983), pp. 197-201. The most detailed study is Fernando López

The monster has a human body and two heads, one above the other. The heads have open mouths with lolling tongues. In its left hand it holds the rear leg of a supine pig lying on a banquet table in front of it. In its right hand, it holds a bowl. Just over the rim of the bowl can be seen the head and feet of a small person. In the background, a figure in a long garment raises a bowl in a gesture of offering. Opposite the monster is the mutilated image of a third figure. It is standing and raising in its right hand a sword with a curved blade. Its head is in the shape of a bull or horse. Its left hand is touching the head of a second small person in a bowl on a second table or a tripod near the banquet table.⁸

The double-maw of the monstrous figure recalls the monstrous figure of Death (*mt*), who likewise has '[a lip to ea]rth, a lip to heaven, [...a to]ngue to the stars' (*KTU* 1.5 II 2-3).⁹ The two enthroned Goodly Gods (*KTU* 1.23) likewise 'set a lip to earth, a lip to heaven' (*KTU* 1.23.61-62).¹⁰ While neither is explicitly named in association with child sacrifice, these descriptions comport with the ravenous figure depicted in the Pozo Moro relief, perhaps the divine recipient of a child offering. It is apparent from other sources, as noted below, that any number of gods could be the recipient of such an offering. Without further context, it is difficult to provide specific interpretation.¹¹ Still, the association with the West Semitic practice of child sacrifice has been reaffirmed.¹²

An eighth-century Assyrian–Luwian–Phoenician trilingual inscription discovered at Injirli in Turkey in 1993 includes lines in Phoenician that

Pardo, *La torre de las almas: Un recorrido por los mitos y creencias del mundo fenicio y orientalizante a través del monumento de Pozo Moro* (Anejo 10; Madrid: Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2006), pp. 145-82.

8. John S. Runding, 'Pozo Moro, Child Sacrifice, and the Greek Literary Tradition', *JBL* 123 (2004), pp. 425-47, here 426. A good picture appears in López Pardo, *La torre de las almas*, p. 147; and Mark S. Smith, *The Sacrificial Rituals and Myths of the Goodly Gods, KTU/CAT 1.23: Royal Constructions of Opposition, Intersection, Integration and Domination* (SBLRBS 51; Atlanta, GA: Society of Biblical Literature; Leiden: Brill, 2006), p. 112.

9. Smith, *The Sacrificial Rituals*, pp. 110-13.

10. See Charles Kennedy, 'The Mythological Reliefs from Pozo Moro, Spain', in *SBL Seminar Papers 1981* (SBLSP 20; Chico, CA: Scholars Press, 1981), pp. 209-16; and Smith, *The Sacrificial Rituals*, pp. 110-13. For a different reading, see López Pardo, *La torre de las almas*, pp. 154-77.

11. For further discussion of this scene, see in addition to the references above the contribution of Peggy L. Day to the present volume. For the broader impact of Phoenicians in Spain, see Michael Dietler and Carolina López-Ruiz (eds.), *Colonial Encounters in Ancient Iberia: Phoenician, Greek, and Indigenous Relations* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009).

12. Runding, 'Pozo Moro, Child Sacrifice', pp. 428-32, and esp. 440-41.